The Goat Stays: Wise Investments in Future Neighbors: Recruitment Deterrence, Human Agency and Education

Maureen W. McClure and Gonzalo Retamal 2007

About the Ford Institute for Human Security

The mission of the Ford Institute for Human Security is to conduct research that focuses on a series of transnational threats to the human rights of civilian populations. The Institute's purpose is to generate independent research, disseminate policy papers, and advocate nonpartisan policy proposals available to both domestic and international policymakers.

In today's increasingly globalized world, there has been a shift from traditional threats focused on the territorial integrity of nations to global threats that center on the safety of individuals. The Ford Institute for Human Security at the University of Pittsburgh recognizes the critical importance of these emergent problems in human security.

This working paper is a product of the Ford Institute's working group, "Child Soldiers Initative: Building Knowledge about Children and Armed Conflict". The Child Soldiers Initiative is an ongoing network of scholars, policymakers and representatives of civil society engaged in promoting and developing policy proposals addressing the recruitment and reintegration of child soldiers.

The Goat Stays: Wise Investments in Future Neighbors: Recruitment Deterrence, Human Agency and Education

Maureen W. McClure and Gonzalo Retamal

The child is usually defeated by the superior strength of the adult, but the defeat does not remain without consequences; it would seem to activate a tendency to overcome defeat by doing actively what one was forced to endure passively: to rule when one had to obey; to beat when one was beaten; in short, to do what one was forced to suffer, or to do what one was forbidden to do. ¹

Human security is emerging as a sophisticated and compelling strategy to address the extreme problems of children in contemporary wars. The child soldier is increasingly seen as an icon of 'new' wars – transformed from a young person into a weapon.² Whether as members of local militias or as suicide bombers, child soldiers are children growing up among failed adults in failed communities. Some not only fail to learn to read or write, they also fail to learn the humanity they need to be successful neighbors and parents.

Turning children into weapons is an act of generational destruction.³ Failed adults are more likely to make failed neighbors and failed parents. The cycle can continue for generations. Thus the real costs of war cannot be tallied for years, for decades, for generations....

Child soldiers reveal the genocidal aspects of contemporary wars. Child soldiers are, explicitly or tacitly, direct attacks on the generational transitions of communities. The cruelty of new wars reveals major gaps in educational policy frameworks currently in use by the international community. Education policy today focuses thinking about education as a civil rights problem. This leads to concerns for access to the 'provision' of institutional services. Developed during the post World War II period, education was constructed as a neutral, technical process complete with generic experts who taught and generic students who learned.

Their classrooms were ordered around literacy and numeracy. Their ends were national economic growth.⁴ Little attention was paid to security issues and their consequences, either shorter or longer term.

This approach to development, while admirable, is insufficiently compelling to drive today's strategic operations in the brutal, even genocidal face of 'cultural identity' wars and their aftermath. Under these conditions, when civil societies are threatened to their generational core, traditional classrooms and curriculum are no longer sufficient. The problem is no longer one of civil rights. It has become a much larger problem of generational survival.

This paper suggests that the emerging human security frameworks, while still mired globally in failing narratives, may offer the best direction for future work. Emerging human security narratives focus on the protection of local populations, especially children. They require defense against the forced recruitment of child soldiers. These new narratives center on the protection of generational agency. They mobilize local and external communities to actively secure safe places for children to grow and develop as normally as possible.

How then should scholars and strategists examine the practical questions of deterrence? What appears to be working on the ground in new wars?

Against the allure of muscular and violent warriors stands a small group of internationals working side by side with caring local parents and neighbors desperate to defend their children. Together they have constructed an emerging strategy of local community protection that places at its center, the protection of children's agency in the face of those who seek its annihilation. This paper examines the problems of research and data collection under these conditions, turning to 'fugitive literature' and strategic desk reviews. It briefly surveys general, large-scale responses to recruitment deterrence in Bosnia, Albania, Ingushetia, Sierra Leone, Colombia and

Panama. It concludes that while causal claims may not be advisable, scholars can at least begin to map the strategic intent of the institutions involved. Beyond that, more work is needed to map the political and cultural economies that either threaten or defend children.

Most contemporary work in the area of education and child soldiers has been either based on child rights advocacy (getting governments and their oppositions to refrain from the use of child soldiers) or on programs for the rehabilitation of child soldiers in the demobilization process.

The research literature in the area of institutional responses to the complex emergencies that include child soldiers, while still small, has grown exponentially over the last decade. Today there is a very large and growing body of program assessment, planning and other technical documents that are helping to inform internal institutional policy as donors lurch from one catastrophe to the next. Some of these materials are used to drive advocacy and marketing. Others are used to drive field operations.

These latter documents can help scholars understand how institutions frame their responses to conditions on the ground. Some materials can be quite helpful in understanding how problems are framed and how narratives are constructed to drive strategy. International education scholars also map both highly complex political economies and their culturally diverse interpretations. ⁷

Prior to the extensive use of pdf files, locally generated reports were rarely distributed beyond a few internal and local copies.⁸ The headquarters of both bi-lateral and multi-lateral agencies rarely collected and archived field-generated documents.⁹

As the Internet became more accessible, field-generated reports began to provide strategists with access to the timbre of ongoing operations. They often translated 'truth to

power' by describing high action environments to lower action environments in distant headquarters. This high-low context division was especially visible in international relief agencies torn between successful action on the ground and donor compliance at headquarters. ¹⁰

Large international agencies and NGOs working in education, such as UNICEF and Save the Children, eventually began developing searchable on-line databases and making more extensive use of *institutional desk reviews*. These reviews distilled the deluge of documents into lumps of lessons learned or emerging themes, such as a special focus on girl soldiers. ¹¹ These reviews often were integrated into the institutional planning process.

Unfortunately, fugitive literature can rarely answer causal research questions about the impact highly specified activities had on highly specified groups of children. There are two principal reasons for this structural messiness. First, protective strategy requires rapid large-scale coverage of populations through highly leveraged *integrated services*. Second, rapid, large-scale coverage is *intentionally inclusive*. Grounded in human rights, relief operations throw wide safety nets to ensure the highest survival rates. Programmatic boundaries are blurred by design. The best scholars can do is shed light on a few interwoven threads in a much larger cloth.

What the fugitive literature CAN address is how scarce institutional resources were allocated. It can help us map the strategic terrain and provide glimpses into the complex political economies out of which deterrence policy can emerge. Measures of success need to be framed in terms of institutional investment. Did things work well enough that the investment strategy was used again in other settings and/or under different conditions?

Fugitive literature helps form institutional perceptions. These can help reveal the organizational stories that both drive and limit operations. The fugitive literature never lets us forget that institutions are rough beasts from the past slouching toward the present to be born.

Thus recruitment deterrence policy today is most likely to be based on successful historical institutional responses. For example, UNHCR's policies framed recruitment deterrence as a problem of local communities. They focused on security through demobilization and reintegration into civil communities. UNICEF framed its emergency policies with a strategic narrative of child protection. This drove strategy toward the creation of safe spaces for learning for children and their caregivers. The World Bank and UNESCO framed recruitment problems in terms of access to social sector services. This drove strategy toward institutional capacity building and back-to-school campaigns.

Beginning almost two decades ago, a small number of education and humanitarian policy researchers and strategists began collecting grey or fugitive literature (Honduras, Afghanistan, the Horn of Africa). ¹² In the early days, the emphasis was on collecting documents and materials that had been created in the field, especially education packages and kits designed to help people reduce major threats to their survival. These materials covered topics such as avoiding cholera and landmines. ¹³ They also included trauma identification in children with simple activities for parents and teachers. Later, UNHCR led the introduction of peace education into the post-conflict re-integration processes, particularly in Africa. ¹⁴

For example, early work on child soldiers by Neil Boothby in Mozambique generated program narratives that drove successful demobilization strategy toward greater attention to adolescent development, trauma healing and local community safety. ¹⁵ His work was widely distributed through UNHCR and other venues and led to the development of more complex child soldier-centered program tools over time.

In the mid-1990s the *Global Information Networks in Education (GINIE)* project was designed by USAID, UNESCO and UNICEF to work with the Ministry of Education in Bosnia

and Herzegovina after the war. Its purpose was to create virtual spaces where high quality knowledge and expertise could be rapidly captured, analyzed and widely shared. Early listservs populated by globally-based practitioners, researchers and headquarters staff, created, for the first time, both a professional and institutional living memory that remained continuously alert and helpful as crises broke out.

The project first focused on the collection of supplemental educational materials: mine awareness, cholera prevention, HIV/AIDS, education for peace, etc. These materials were tested and produced in the different emergency settings. They were made publicly available and ready for adaptation into the next crisis. From its inception, youth policy and recruitment deterrence was a local concern.

For example, in Bosnia and Herzegovina after-school sports clubs were seen as fertile grounds for recruitment of youth into the black markets run by ethno-paramilitary groups. There were some local discussions, particularly in Travnik, about the need to break with tradition and integrate long-standing independent sports clubs for youth into secondary school after-school activities as a means of recruitment deterrence.¹⁶

Other novel deterrents were after-school Internet clubs organized to promote civil society. UNESCO's Associated Schools Project (ASP) in Germany helped organize youth groups to create on-line magazines. The most famous youth project was Radio Zid, a youth-operated radio station founded in Sarajevo during the war. The station's civic engagement messages greatly boosted morale for the city's adults. The listening audience was estimated to be above 80% of households. 18

After Rwanda and Bosnia, humanitarian education workers soon realized that the brutality of the new wars meant that many children and youth were repeatedly exposed to violent

trauma. Early supplemental programs for trauma healing met with limited success, especially with young people who had been exposed to both intense and repeated trauma. Traditional pedagogy often failed and new methods were needed. Many children couldn't sit still, couldn't concentrate and couldn't control their emotional responses. Teachers were sometimes put at risk by children who had lost control of their anger.¹⁹

The very high risks to children's survival during and after new wars meant that educational training and materials had to be quickly grasped and easily understood. Educational programs and materials were created not only in local languages, but also embedded in local cultural sense-making. Alas, the nuanced responses to success in local conditions often proved to be problematic to headquarters staff embedded in corporate cultures of consistency.

For example, one of the authors, visiting UNHCR headquarters, overheard a program manager speaking on the phone to someone in accounting. The gist of the conversation went something like this ... yes, I am afraid so... there really was a goat in the program budget. Yes there had to be a goat in the budget. A former child soldier needed to offer a sacrificial goat in a peace and reconciliation ceremony of reacceptance into his community. Gosh, I really wish I could help you...but I can't...the goat stays.

Over time internationals learned that deterrence strategy appeared to work when rooted in local communities highly engaged in their children's security. Thus, where possible, child soldiers were treated inclusively. They were separated from others in the local community only when their specific conditions warranted it, and then as briefly as possible. Repeated assessments and evaluations have supported this view. It has become an increasingly standard response in many UN-based operations.

As a result, refugee camps were increasingly designed around protective spaces for children. Activities and services for the young were located in the safest areas with the most visibility. For example, sometimes they were located near the water supply. Camp traffic ebbed and flowed past children and youth at play. There was safety in numbers. The scene offered chronically depressed adults a visible, tangible symbol for a brighter possible future.

New wars have at least three major impacts on the life chances of children and youth:

- 1. As attacks on civilian populations for the purpose of *protection denial in local* communities
- 2. With the intent to rule with impunity through cultural identity, the media and perception control
- 3. As predatory economies *control of black markets* and illicit commodities

Together they form vicious political economies that are particularly deadly to young people. Children are vulnerable to attacks. They are vulnerable to adult and media pressure on their identity formation. They are less mobile than most and have more limited access to economic means. ²⁰

The following section primarily focuses on large-scale responses to the problems of recruitment deterrence. Many small scale success stories exist elsewhere. This paper intends to inform rapid large-scale education responses in emergencies and their aftermath. It therefore draws on internal documentation primarily of front-line operations conducted by large scale organizations, specifically UNICEF and its international and local partner NGOs.

The largest international agency with the most experience, UNICEF, consistently invested in recruitment deterrence through locally designed safe places where children could be isolated from predators and through the engagement of youth in building meaningful civil

identities. Youth activities included volunteering to protect younger children by helping them participate in trauma healing activities.

There are several reasons for a focus on UNICEF. First, UNICEF is the designated UN agency for children's rights and welfare. No bilateral agency or NGO is adequately organized to manage large-scale, security-based relief efforts for children. UNICEF's strategy is focused on *child security through the protection of individual human agency – the relationship between child and caregiver*. UNICEF is structured internally to deliver *integrated services* to children in extreme conditions. *It necessarily has a long history of work with security* officials. Its strong structural core, which was built on integrated services and decentralized country-based operations, made it uniquely qualified to generate coherent and compelling strategy in the service of child soldiers.²¹

Second, UNICEF is the only large relief agency with long-term in country offices. The country staff is a mix of locals and internationals. They are on the ground closely connected to local communities before, during and after conflict. They know both the people and the 'terrain.' They are better able to tailor lower cost, higher impact solutions that others because they have the social capital others lack. UNHCR and other relief agencies and most NGOs can't generate the high levels of social capital that UNICEF's continuing ground level operations can.

Third, UNICEF is a founding member of the Inter-Agency Standing Committee (IASC), the primary international mechanism for inter-agency coordination of humanitarian assistance. It is a unique forum involving the key UN and non-UN humanitarian partners. ²² Under the leadership of the Emergency Relief Coordinator, the IASC develops humanitarian policies, agrees on a clear division of responsibility for the various aspects of humanitarian assistance, identifies and addresses gaps in response, and advocates for effective application of humanitarian

principles. Together with Executive Committee for Humanitarian Affairs (ECHA), the IASC forms the key strategic coordination mechanism among major humanitarian actors. ²³

Within this context UNICEF plays the leading agency role in the area both of childhood and youth protection in complex emergencies. Its presence and field coordination is well defined and is based on a clear-cut set of policy and strategic concerns that are legitimized at the level of the IASC. Mission-based concerns for children and youth's well-being have been translated by UNICEF into an increasingly coherent strategy that focuses on childhood protection through the construction of safe environments for generational development and learning.

According to UNICEF policy, integrated services for children must be a core element from the start of an emergency response. UNICEF is joined in this strategy by NGOs such as Save the Children and the International Rescue Committee (IRC). *These spaces integrate fundamental services in security, health, education, and psychosocial development into a single protective environment that is both family-focused and community-based.* Where possible, child soldiers are re-integrated into their communities through trauma healing programs for the community. Where this is not possible, a series of alternative, individualized options are available, such as the formation of veterans or other peer associations.²⁴

The power of UNICEF's protection strategy is in its mobilization capacities. It uses flexible tactics built on compelling narratives of child protection. For example, the 'Return to Happiness' programs designed to help children and adolescents return to a civil life in Mozambique, were agilely translated into protective environment programs in Colombia. Programs that were successful in war zones have been adapted to protect youth from criminal gangs that emerge after natural disasters. Bottom line: these programs work. Or at least a lot of local communities and international agencies and donors think they do.

Top priority in new wars: Protection of human agency

UNICEF's security-based strategy relies on both integrated and inclusive services. Child-friendly service areas create developmentally protective environments within camps and local communities. Local adults are encouraged to actively participate in child protection, for example, helping to walk children to and from school areas safely. Once inside, the classroom not only becomes a place for physical safety, but also for emotional safety and healing. Teachers are drawn from local communities where possible, and trained in recognizing and managing emotional trauma, building on successful and appropriate local practices.

Child soldiers in particular have often been deeply traumatized by the absence of protection from responsible, caring adults who can actually protect them. The normal relationships of generational trust may have been so shattered that learning or re-learning trust is a major challenge. UNICEF's developmental approach is mindful that adolescents need peers. Ex-combatant adolescents who see themselves as adults are likely to want access to adult education, as in Liberia and Sierra Leone. Others may need access to developmentally-related peers, as in Ingushetia.

Albania: Integrated services, Inclusive spaces, Peer support

One of the important lessons of the Bosnian conflict was the importance of peers in the protection of youth. These lessons were remembered in Albania and later in Kosovo and Ingushetia. *Most powerful were activities that helped adolescents actively participate in the defense of civil society.*

In February 1999, negotiations between Yugoslav and Kosovo Liberation Army (KLA) representatives in Rambouillet broke down. OSCE withdrew its mission. On March 24, NATO launched air strikes. Within 72 hours, thousands of Kosovar Albanians, many expelled from their homes, were forced to flee. Between April and May, one million people – about half of the population - took refuge in countries close to Kosovo. Albania alone received approximately 450,000 escaping Kosovo refugees. While many children volunteered to join...

Not all recruitment by the KLA, however, was voluntary. Reports indicated some pressganging, notably among the refugee population. KLA denied the allegations of forced recruitment of children in general although a KLA spokesperson admitted that there might have been some isolated cases of forced recruitment. To guard against such possibilities, UNICEF in close collaboration with the Albanian government, UNHCR, WHO; and other partners or actors, developed the Child-Protection system other known as Child-friendly Spaces Initiative within refugee camps one of the specific aims of which was to lower the risk of sexual exploitation/trafficking.²⁶

These spaces were special tented areas located in heart of the camps, and dedicated to meeting the needs of women, children and young people. The "child friendly spaces" concept balanced a complex range of relationships across physical and emotional security, social and cognitive development, health and nutritional status. This integrated and inclusive development-oriented approach to child protection provided both a concrete focus and an agile strategy for assessment and operational planning.

The package also included flexible spaces, supplies and training activities with clearly set and highly visible boundaries. Minimum standards were established to ensure that sufficient space and equipment was provided for each service. Non-discriminatory protection and access for all to the "space" and its services were guaranteed.

The holistic approach of the Convention [Rights of the Child – 1989] emphasizes the importance of promoting a multi-disciplinary and cross-sectoral perspective when consideration is given to policies, programs or actions in favour of children. The aim is to focus on the whole child and to promote the effective realization of all his or her rights. It is essential, therefore, to foster an increasing synergy amongst the various sectors

which are relevant to the child's life, and prevent fragmented interventions. With a cross-sectoral and inclusive perspective, the value of each specialized sectoral component will be taken into consideration, but a common context will be promoted where complementarily and interrelationship will prevail.²⁷

This inclusive strategy rested on networks of adults and peers who actively provided mobile webs of security for children and youth. The reliance on relationship networks allowed successful deterrence programs and policies to be created across refugee camps as well as dispersed communities.²⁸

The refugees did not stay as long as expected. Within six weeks of the Yugoslav army withdrawal agreement, most refugees had returned home; by August 6, only about 6,667 refugees remained behind in Albania. ¹⁹ UNICEF and UNESCO followed young refugees back to Kosovo, helping with reconstruction. Their emphasis on youth participation in reconstruction through peer-based activities remained a strong current throughout the next few years. A large youth initiative targeted teenagers with opportunities to participate in the re-building of civil society through supervised sports clubs, structured Internet cafes activities and, large innovative rock concerts with civil society messages. ²⁹ The Balkans Sunflower project was formed in 1999 to build on peer volunteer associations with 'global neighbors.' It is still operating. ³⁰

The child-friendly spaces experience was considered so successful that it has since been applied not only to a number of countries affected by war but also extended into regions affected by natural disasters as well. These countries include Turkey, El Salvador, India, Angola, Afghanistan, Colombia, East Timor, North Caucasus and currently in South Asia, the Caribbean and Central America³¹. When civil societies collapse, whether due to conflict or natural disasters, children are at risk for recruitment into predatory economies.

Ingushetia

Ingushetia, or "Galgaachia" in the native tongue, is the smallest constituent republic in the Russian Federation. It is located in the Northern Caucasus. The Ingush and their eastern neighbors, the Chechen, are distinct ethnic groups with distinct languages, histories, and political identities, but are so closely related and so similar that it is convenient to describe them together. Present-day Chechnya and Ingushetia correspond roughly to the traditional territory where, until recent decades, almost all Chechen and Ingush have lived. This complex human geography is the consequence of events of recent decades: mass deportation of both groups to Central Asia from 1944 to 1956.

In late October 1992, tens of thousands of Ingush were forced from their homes in the Prigorodni District of North Ossetia. This refugee crisis became a major problem for the beleaguered government of Ingushetia, already faced with soaring unemployment (as high as 50 percent), a worsening ecological crisis, a high concentration of Russian troops stationed there because of the war in neighboring Chechnya, and a flood of Chechen refugees from that conflict.

Chechen families and their children had not yet recovered from the 1995-1996 civil wars when they were again uprooted from their homes in late August 1999. The bordering Republic of Ingushetia absorbed nearly 200,000 internally-displaced persons (IDPs) from Chechnya. There were almost as many IDPs as Ingushetians. These proportions were phenomenal; the peak figures for Kosovar and East Timorese refugees were about 15%. Prior to the IDP influx Ingushetia was already one of the poorest and most densely populated republics of the Russian Federation.³³

Over 45% of the displaced were below 18 years of age. 34

Fertile ground. In Ingushetia in the displaced camps, there were wide-spread reports of the use of child soldiers on all sides. Insurgents were believed to have especially targeted both IDP camps and dispersed communities. Deterrence was critical. UNICEF/ IRC's Children Affected by Armed Conflict Unit in collaboration with a researcher from the Harvard School of Public Health embarked on a longitudinal study of the impact of the program on Chechen adolescents involved in community work and educational activities with families and children.³⁵

Initial findings indicated that Chechen youth saw the education program as 'helping' by returning young people to their studies as well as giving children a safe and reliable place to go and an emotional space to turn their thoughts towards more age-appropriate concerns. Not only did teens feel that young people needed a place to 'forget about the war', they also needed a place to be 'understood'. ... the education program was seen as providing a place for children to connect to others, gain social support and offer hope for a better future. Many adolescents spoke about the opportunity to study in any form as a means of improving the potential for peace and success within their generation and for the region as a whole. The teens spoke generally about their desire to overcome the ravages of war and have future opportunities to be productive and successful. 37

Sierra Leone

In Rwanda UNICEF and partners' massive response to children and teachers helped to mobilize communities emerging from genocide. This worked because it helped communities to reframe their damaged self-images around healthy protective activities that focused not on often failed, abstract ideologies, but on a concrete, visible future...the children in their midst... What

worked were inclusive strategies for local community healing and rebuilding... what didn't work was trauma healing using individual clinical approaches.

Integrated services and support networks better reshaped emergency aftermath. For most internationals, emergencies were events to be contained, controlled and escaped. For many experiencing emergencies at home, however, escape was not an option. The 'event' never ended. Its consequences persisted for the rest of their lives and into the next generation. Children were not the same after armed conflict in Sierra Leone. A return to traditional schooling was not an option.

Lessons learned in Rwanda and elsewhere later helped to systematize an integrated response in Sierra Leone. The Sierra Leone Ministry of Education (MOYES), UNESCO Institute for Education (UIE), and Plan International created new interventions.³⁸ For the first time a Rapid (response) Education (RapidEd) curriculum included pre and post program assessments to evaluate the impact of cognitive and expressive activities on profoundly traumatized children and child soldiers who were exposed to war-related violence in displaced camps in and around Freetown³⁹.

Complex programs in Sierra Leone paid particular attention not only to the cognitive and psycho-social sides of education, but also to its developmental aspects. Strong peer interaction contributed to a return to normalcy. So did the acceptance of ex-combatants into a community of strong, protective adults. ⁴⁰

A primary focus for education for child soldiers was to unlearn the violence that had become their identity. Ex-combatants needed to relearn how to protect themselves and others from their

own violent impulses. This reclaiming of self became part of the core of a community-based security, healing and deterrence strategy. As reported:

This study demonstrates that providing an opportunity for war affected children to express their bad memories and painful feelings to trained adults in a **safe environment** like the RapidEd schools, can reduce the prevalence of traumatic symptoms while restoring a sense of hopefulness about the future. Finally, it is important to keep in mind that the inclusion of a psychosocial trauma healing intervention within the RapidEd literacy and numeracy education curriculum is an innovative and pioneering effort.⁴¹

Less sophisticated back-to-school campaigns and other rapid educational responses did not confront the ''multigenerational transmission of traumatic re-enactment''. 42 In the past many de-mobilized child soldiers received minimal literacy and skills training without trauma healing and, where possible, community re-integration.

In genocidal wars, that was no longer an adequate response. Ex-combatants sometimes were not only traumatized, they were a very real danger to themselves and to their loved ones. Breaking the cycle of abuse of children (especially child soldiers) meant that *education not only needed to help improve cognitive skills, but also needed to prevent recycling anger and human destructiveness within and across generations.*

It is stunning that this simple understanding has been so lost in the stampede to get child soldiers back to school, into the marketplace or signed up for fund raising activities. Breaking the cycles of abuse within and across generations requires adolescents, adults, neighbors and parents accepting long-term responsibilities for each other. Civil society associations, so popular in some countries, have helped ex-combatants through social crises for many generations. Examples include veterans groups, religious communities and political advocacy and self-help groups. Relatively little is known about their benefits to adolescent veterans.

Colombia

The current heroics of humanitarian intervention treat emergencies as events to be managed by international actors. Contemporary donor funding supports this view. The contemporary culture of philanthropy in humanitarian circles is heavily biased towards the dominance of international agencies and NGOs. It does not and cannot address the central objective of civil societies: learning how to inherit, improve and pass on knowledge, expertise and humanity to the next generation. In strong contrast, the Colombian experience of child protection environments was designed, managed and implemented by local actors. UNICEF's local defensive and preventive strategies were cheaper and substantially more effective and sustainable than international programs elsewhere.

A 40-year insurgent campaign to overthrow the Colombian government escalated during the 1990s. An anti-insurgent army of paramilitaries grew to be several thousand strong in recent years, challenging the insurgents for control of territory and illicit industries such as the drug trade and the government's ability to control oil pipelines in rural areas.

The two main guerrilla groups still active, the Ejército de Liberación Nacional (ELN) and the Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia (FARC), began operating in the mid-1960s.

More than 40,000 people, most of them civilians, have been killed in Colombia as a result of the armed conflict since 1990 alone... More than 1.5 million displaced persons are registered with the Colombian government, but NGOs estimate that the real figure is more than double this. Official sources claim that 74 per cent of the internally displaced are women and children... The vast majority of those displaced are dispersed rather than living in organized camps, and many seek anonymity in the country's big cities. ⁴⁵ It has been estimated that only one in eight internally displaced pupils have returned to school after having been displaced. Displaced girls

are more vulnerable to sexual exploitation and pregnancy than other teenagers.... Displacement has often been an end in itself rather than just a by-product of Colombia's conflict. 46

In some areas, there were *chronic reports of internally displaced young men being* forcibly recruited into irregular armed groups. In the cities, large sections of the population were increasingly being drawn into gang warfare which replicated war allegiances and divisions at the national level, bringing with it intra-urban displacements. Families were displaced two, even three times.⁴⁷

An IDP survey at the time reported that 94% of households were displaced as a result of direct threats to their lives, while 40% resorted to this solution out of a more general fear. Prior to displacement, the vast majority (75%) worked in agrarian activities. After, more than one half (59%) worked primarily in the service sector, mostly in stores or as street vendors.⁴⁸ Some of these displaced persons were teachers.

In Colombia, teachers in the government school system were often directly targeted by armed groups aiming at destroying communities. Clearly, teachers –and schools-- were not perceived as neutral actors. Many of them held public positions in their communities often as the sole government representative. At the time the IDP 2003 Colombia Report stated that "2,900 teachers were forcibly displaced and 82 teachers and school employees were killed during 2002, twice as much than during 2001". ⁴⁹ Furthermore,

...around 290,000 children – equivalent to 3.6 percent of the public education system's primary school students – had to leave school temporarily or permanently due to the forced displacement of [those] 2,900 teachers.

Threats forced many teachers to request transfers to other schools.... As a result, according to information available to the Commission, there is a lack of teaching personnel in some especially violent areas due to the displacement of teachers who were working in those areas. ⁵⁰

Return to Happiness

UNICEF's emergency strategy was *integrated into on-going and locally designed* children-friendly programs. The reports from the field stressed the unequivocal commitment of members of local communities to help children.⁵¹ In addition, the successful experiences of Colombia's on-going high quality rural education program, the *Escuela Nueva*, provided a solid strategic base for rural emergency responses.⁵² Escuela Nueva provided the local know-how for rapid and adequate responses for IDP children and their communities.⁵³

Escuela Nueva differed from traditional schools in the following ways: it was multigrade; it featured flexible and not automatic promotion; special instructional materials were used
such as self instructional textbooks; the curriculum was rural oriented; specially trained teachers
were required; mastery learning or peer instruction was supported; study corners and small
libraries were established; and teachers, students and the community all became active
participants in the school. Students learned democratic behavior by participating in student
government. Most importantly, community responsibility was learned because *older students*tutored younger students. ⁵⁴ UNICEF Colombia decided to reinforce the Escuela Nueva model
with a strategy of education for peace, social mobilization and the psychosocial recovery of waraffected children and adolescents.

The Return to Happiness Program was designed to provide urgent mass psychosocial support to children affected by violence. Its core concept was rebuilding lost generational trust in communities where it had been ravaged. The program encouraged families and community members to actively participate in the recovery process. Parents, teachers, church volunteers, health workers, teachers and community leaders assisted the program as supervisors or trainers, also serving as leaders of self-help groups within the community.

Adolescent volunteers from the community, supervised by teachers, became the 'agents' of psychosocial recovery. They were the key to the program. Young volunteers were trained in "play therapy" and taught how to encourage the trust and hope of younger children through games, art, puppetry, song and story-telling. A "knapsack of dreams" contained materials handmade by members of the community, including rag dolls, puppets, wooden toys, books and songs.

The "Return to Happiness" program brought help to children in their own communities. It broke with the western clinical model of psychosocial therapy by offering a community-based participatory approach. The child-to-child relationship, which was the foundation of the "Return to Happiness" program, helped rebuild the children's trust through play. Through their work as "play therapists' the adolescent volunteers came to serve as role models in their communities. They created a link between families, schools and communities, forming a network of reconstructive peace-building. The simplicity of the program was its cornerstone: children's right to play.⁵⁵

From the start adolescents proved ideal role models for younger children. They consoled and supported each other.

Six of every ten refugees are children. Many of these refugee-children don't go to school... There are at least 6,000 child soldiers in the country, divided between the various armies and troops. Every sixth child soldier has killed someone, and six of ten have seen others kill.⁵⁶

One volunteer, age 17, described his efforts to create a sense of normalcy in the lives of younger children, some of the children have seen terrible things. If it is something very bad, like watching their father be tortured and killed, they find it very difficult to explain what happened. The story comes out in pieces and may take weeks to tell.

Not only did the play sessions create open communication and trust in the relationship between adolescents and younger children, but the sessions also built self-esteem among the adolescent volunteers. Consoling younger children and helping them overcome their distress taught coping skills to the young volunteers and helped them strongly identify with a civil society. Many of these adolescents became internationally famous for their organization of the Children's Movement for Peace, the largest mobilization of children of its kind. "Peace," said one of the child voters, "is most important because without it you cannot have any other right." 57

The Return to Happiness program demonstrated its success through improved relationships between teachers and children, and among the children themselves. The strategy again was to strengthen local communities by strengthening support for children and youth through physical protection and opportunities to build a strong civil identity. This approach was preferred to programs that directly targeted child soldiers exclusively. Targeted programs for child soldiers were developed as needed when they required extra help re-integrating into their communities or moving away from them.

Child Friendly Spaces in Panama for Colombian Refugees⁵⁸

In the northwest of Colombia, refugees fled across the border into Panama, taking refuge in the border province of El Darien. Although humanitarian agencies had access to the refugee communities, there was a *high risk of attack and forced conscription*. In January 2003, attacks were carried out by paramilitary groups, resulting in the death of several indigenous community leaders. The vulnerability of the refugee communities in El Darien left children exposed to fear and violence.

Child protective spaces were integrated into the displaced communities of El Darien. They were designated areas in displacement camps and communities that were set aside as a 'safe haven'. They provided a location for the safe delivery of integrated services, such as infant feeding, nutritional support, hygiene, water and sanitation services, early childhood care, education, recreation and psychosocial support. *Children's protective spaces were informally constructed or simply set up outdoors, and marked with yellow tape*.

Located close to the heart of the community, the child-friendly spaces in El Darien were seen as a kind of interior space, with local and international workers *literally using their own human bodies as a shield*. After only 6 months, more than 500 young people were trained as play therapists in the 'Return to Happiness' program. Although the risk of violence in the refugee communities of El Darien continued, the program contributed to a sense of security and brought new life to the children. On one occasion, when the community was threatened by an armed group, a priest prepared a letter about the situation and the children signed the letter, stating their neutrality. ⁵⁹

How then can civil societies deter forced recruitment and re-recruitment of children in the face of the sociopathic cultures of impunity found in contemporary wars? UNICEF over and over again invested in the protection of communities' human agency through a strategy of child protection. At the core of this strategy is a strengthening of generational identity. It is important to note, because this tacitly assumes that it has been weakened and thus needs to be strengthened. This implies a catastrophic collapse of the civil societies necessary for generational transition. It further implies that the re-establishment of relationships of generational trust require the active agency of all possible adults working directly with child soldiers whose generational trust has

been shattered. They need networks of relationships that can act as 'webs of support.' This is even more difficult than it looks.

One of the most important heuristics that international humanitarian education workers tell each other is that, after wars, the local adults rush to return to the life they had before the war. This inevitably leads to a catastrophic failure in youth policy. *In their rush to rebuild the world the way it was for them before the war, adults failed to recognize that their children are too altered to be able to return to it.* Srebren Dizdar, the Permanent Secretary for Education in Bosnia after the war repeatedly warned his countrymen and the international donors who were listening carefully, to, above all else, avoid "the backward rush to the future." So it is not that difficult, with all the best intentions, to rebuild community education services that are instantly obsolete, perhaps even harmful.

UNICEF's child protection strategy focuses on three human agency-based responses to new war tactics.

- Against attacks on civilian populations *Community Engagement* Mobilized communities Local adults participate in the construction of safe public spaces and provision of integrated for children and youth -close relationships with local and external security forces to physically prevent recruiter access
- 2. Against nihilist appeals to cultural identity through ethnicity, ideology and brute force *Generational identity a 'forward looking project*-"⁶¹ Adolescents are mobilized to actively participate in the construction of a civil identity by defending younger children against the trauma they have faced—shift away from war fatigue and fatalism toward active planning for and construction of less violence-prone futures

26

3. Against predatory economies – Civil economy networks – Agile political

economies....webs of support created by responsible and caring adults locally and

internationally (including diaspora) with security hubs or islands of civility that support

education for the future- teachers and volunteers who can support, teach and mentor

children as they grow up...and offer them viable alternatives to predator economies⁶²

These new security-based, agency-centered narratives drive strategy toward local community

policing. Many caveats need to be included. For example, when wide safety nets are thrown

around populations, predators can not only be permitted into camps, they may begin to control

them. 63 Adults participate in the construction of public safe places for children through their

own resources or with alliances with others. This suggests that the problems of child soldier

deterrence may be better solved through communities' active protection of their young. When

this is not possible, peer networks become critical.

This paper can only address a very small piece of a very complex problem. There are

times when communities cannot come together to defend either themselves or their children.

They may lack the local security partners they need to create safe places for children to play.

The mapping solidly supports Reich and Achvarina's findings that camp placement can be a

problem. The need to isolate children and youth from predatory recruiters either in camps or in

dispersed communities is a chronic problem in many countries. 64 Thus child and youth

protection activities such as UNICEF's integrated and inclusive services are critical components

to recruitment deterrence.

Next Steps: Who Does What?

There is, of course, much work to be done. First, the obligatory statement that one size can't fit all. UNICEF's approach has been widely used and accepted, and they will be the first to acknowledge that there are times when communities are too weak to bear the burdens of responsible parents and neighbors. Child abuse rates climb dramatically in extreme crises when generation survival may be a life and death choice.

It is quite clear that UNICEF and its partners' responses to new wars have, at least in education, focused squarely on the protection of children's human agency through the mobilization of the agency of community adults. This child protection narrative offers a concrete and compelling story to drive action toward community engagement in generational protection activities in alliance with local security forces. This clear appeal to generational identity also helps inoculate civil societies against the ethnic gangster identities of violent exclusion and impunity that can drive the young into new wars. As Martin Shaw has said so artfully:

The new warfare... is above all a political rather than a military challenge. It is about the breakdown of legitimacy, and we need a new ... politics to reconstruct this in the zones of war. ...here is a set of principles and a positive political vision, tied to the rule of law. Cosmopolitans are to be found within the local communities at the heart of the violence-particularly in 'islands of civility' where identity politics has not taken full hold.... Genuine cosmopolitanism does not mean negotiating truces between warring ethnonationalists but building up pluralist democratic politics. 65

Today most international responses to recruitment focus on direct program services. The problem of child soldiers is not an engineering problem to be fixed by technically competent people from Western cultures. It can't be fixed by building more schools or offering more workshops, short-term training programs, educational quality standards or individual therapy. Nor is it a problem of access. Neither government nor market schools nor quality teacher training are likely to loom as important as first strengthening local alliances of parents and

neighbors. Quite simply, local communities are prone to create local social capital better than internationals who parachute in with cameras blazing. The ongoing need to strengthen social and cultural capital formation has been badly neglected in the education literature.

After child soldiers have witnessed the collapse of their lives within civil societies – many must begin again at the very beginning...to re-establish contact, first within and then across the generational divide.... When even this is too painful, they can return to some small experience of happiness by protecting younger children. Ex-combatants suffer deeply because of two massive social failures. The first failure was by capacity – adults who wanted to protect children but couldn't. The second failure was by benevolence – adults on the inside or outside who benefited from their misery or from a larger silence. The first is a technical failure of human security. The second is a moral failing of human agency. Deterrence policies must face both squarely.

The developmental needs of adolescent combatants during generational transitions, however, remain sadly overlooked in the policy literature either for human security or for education. The child soldier problems in new wars are ones of personal safety, cultural identity, community acceptance and access to a civil economy. They remain accustomed to abandonment. Youth need genuine protection from adults claiming the moral high ground of civil society.

Human security as the generational protection of human agency is a relatively new perspective based on fifteen years of field work by education professionals working in large-scale, complex emergencies internationally. This generational protection narrative has been chosen repeatedly over older strategic narratives built on mid-century political ideologies based on civil rights and economic ideologies of neo-liberalism. Brutal new wars need compelling new

strategy with visible moral roots in human rights protection.⁶⁶ New wars are not about contests for public or private control of state apparatus. They have instead shifted the front lines of civilization to the next generation.

Policy scholars need to wake up and smell the coffee. New wars are 'new games' with new rules, or lack thereof. Scholars need to pay much closer attention to how institutions allocate resources to support recruitment deterrence both locally and externally. There is a growing policy dilemma. On one hand, the lessons from the field say over and over again that services integrated at the community level work better than most other options. On the other hand, no multi-lateral or bi-lateral agency in addition to UNICEF is organized to deliver integrated services for children and youth in partnership with local policing and broader regional security.

The current stream of donor resources is channeled through sector-based institutions that have more structural incentives to compete than to cooperate. The challenges created by this bifurcation grow daily and need much more attention. Only by more closely mapping the political economy and cultural identity networks that threaten, as well as feed, house and protect children can we hope to make wiser investments in our future neighbors.

Notes

¹ Erich Fromm, *The Anatomy of Human Destructiveness*. Pimlico, 1997, p.317

² Kaldor et al

³ The term 'childhood' and its protection is used here in a very specific way. It means not only the protection of a child's physical being, it also means the protection of a child's individual human agency. The goal of childhood protection is to ensure that children can to grow up normally in caring communities. UNICEF is the only large scale, operations-oriented international agency of its kind. Its mission has also given rise to a unique operations structure particularly well-suited for the delivery of human security-based strategy through child-centered integrated services.

⁴ McClure

⁵ Child Friendly Spaces/ Environments (CFS/E): An Integrated Services Strategy For Emergencies And Their Aftermath UNICEF December 2004. This paper draws heavily from this report written by a team headed by one of the authors. .

⁶ This includes access to institutional documents such as assessments, plans, budgets, program materials, periodical reports, trip reports, evaluations, coordinating structures, etc...

⁷ Paulston, Spaulding, Adams, etc

⁸ In the early days of the GINIE project, considerable time was spent scanning and rehabilitating the formats of documents that already had been copied too many times.

⁹ UNESCO made the best efforts in education, working with national ministries, but they were hampered by chronic under-funding, due in part to the high costs of scanning and archiving already printed materials. Later, USAID took an early lead in making project documents publicly available on-line.

Culture at Work: Communicating Across Cultures: High and Low Context http://www.culture-at-work.com/highlow.html

¹¹ UNIFFEM, Getting it Right, Doing it Right: Gender and Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration http://www.womenwarpeace.org/issues/ddr/gettingitright.pdf

¹² Grey or fugitive literature primarily consists of locally or internally generated documents, or documents printed in highly limited runs. Seth Spaulding was, for many years, the primary champion of fugitive literature collections in education. Frederico Major, then the Director General of UNESCO and his special assistant, Gonzalo Retamal, took the lead for the UN.

¹³ Retamal, G. RapidEd. UNESCO.

¹⁴ UNHCR materials

- ¹⁵ Boothby, N. Displaced Children: Psychological Theory and Practice from the Field Journal of Refugee Studies 1992 5(2):106-122; doi:10.1093/jrs/5.2.106
 - © 1992 by Oxford University Press http://jrs.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/content/abstract/5/2/106: Miller, K and Rasco, L; in press, Boothby, N. and Arntson, L. "A World Turned Upside Down: Child Soldiers in Mozambique-A Case Study of their Reintegration," From Clinic to Community: Ecological Approaches to Refugee Mental Health,
- ¹⁶ Confidential interview. 1997. http://www.pitt.edu/~mmcclure/BiH/unescobih.html
- ¹⁷ UNESCO ASP German magazine in Sarajevo http://www-gewi.uni-graz.at/csbsc/documentary_report/Bosnia.html

¹⁹ Active learning

- ²¹ UNICEF and its NGO partners with human security their operational core stand in contrast with bilateral responses such as USAID with its weak center and contractor-based NGOs turn responses into strategy-free enterprise zones.
- ²² The IASC was established in June 1992 in response to United Nations General Assembly Resolution <u>46/182</u> on the strengthening of humanitarian assistance. http://www.humanitarianinfo.org/iasc/
- ²³ The main objectives of IASC are:
 - To develop and manage system-wide humanitarian policies
 - To allocate responsibilities among agencies in humanitarian programs
 - To develop and agree on a common ethical framework for all humanitarian activities
 - To advocate for common humanitarian principles to parties outside the IASC
 - To identify areas where gaps in mandates or lack of operational capacity exist
 - To resolve disputes or disagreement about and between humanitarian agencies on systemwide humanitarian issues.
- ²⁵ ¹⁹UNICEF. National Strategy for Children. Republic of Albania, 2001 (www.unicef.org/albania/publications/nationalstrategy.pdf)
- Deng Deng, William. Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan. A Survey of Programs on the Reintegration of Former Child Soldiers 2001

http://www.mofa.go.jp/policy/human/child/survey/profile7.html

- M. Santos Pais. Human Rights Conceptual Framework for UNICEF. UNICEF 1999
- ²⁸ ISPs or internally stuck persons are those who had wars break out in their neighborhoods and they were unable to flee.

²⁹ M. Fatfat

24

³⁰ "Balkan Sunflowers brings volunteers from around the world to work as neighbors and friends in social reconstruction and renewal. By organizing social and cultural activities, we promote

understanding, further non-violent conflict transformation, and celebrate the diversity of the lives and cultures of the Balkan region." http://www.balkansunflowers.org/

³¹ UNICEF, *Child Friendly Spaces Initiative*, Albania, internal document, 1999.

³²Olara A. Otunnu RIGHTS OF THE CHILD: Annual report of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict, submitted in accordance with General Assembly resolution 51/77* UNITED NATIONS Economic and Social Council GENERAL, E/CN.4/2003/77, 3 March 2003

http://www.hri.ca/fortherecord2003/documentation/commission/e-cn4-2003-77.htm

Johanna Nichols 'The Ingush (with notes on the Chechen): Background information' University of California, Berkeley and 'Information on the Chechen refugee situation in Ingushetia' University of California, Berkeley Last update: Sept. 10, 2000

³⁴ OCHA, Relief web. December 1999

- ³⁵ Broughton, B. *Study of the UNICEF Northern Caucasus Emergency Program: November 1999-December 2002*. UNICEF Moscow. August 2003
- ³⁶ Theresa Stichick et al. 'The IRC's Emergency Education Program for Chechen Children and Adolescents ' *FMR*. Pp. 28-29

³⁷ Ibid.

- Full Report on the Plan International /UNESCO Institute for Education experience in http://www.ginie.org/countries/SierraLeone Canadian Cooperation Award 2004: The Education Renewal Project in Sierra Leone. Plan International. In 1999, drawing upon the experiences of earlier programs implemented by UNESCO in Somalia and Rwanda, Foster Parents Plan (Plan) worked with Sierra Leone's Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the Forum of African Women Educationalists (FAWE) to create the Education Renewal project.
- ³⁹ UNESCO Institute for Education//Plan International, Building *a Rapid Educational Response*, Joint UIE /Plan International Project, Freetown, March 2000. The GINIE project sent out requests for information on new research on interventions related to trauma and learning. Within 24 hours several leading scholars (none of them net members) responded.
- ⁴¹ Leila Gupta., *Psychosocial Assessment of Displaced Children Exposed to War Related Violence in Sierra Leone*. Plan International, Freetown, Sierra Leone 25 February 2000. Reference is made also to the IRC experience in Northern Caucasus.

⁴³ Ibid pp. 57-59.

⁴⁵ Almost 40 per cent of the internally displaced have settled in and around the ten largest cities. Without official registration and proper identity documents, internally displaced persons often face difficulty in accessing basic government assistance, employment, healthcare and education.

For many years, both guerrillas and paramilitaries have depopulated rural areas and appropriated the land for political, economic and strategic gain. Upon seizing control of an area, armed groups often kill or displace civilians they suspect of supporting the opposing side. Human rights defenders frequently suffer a similar fate....Although indigenous people represent only 2 to 3 per cent of Colombia's total inhabitants, they make up as much as 8 per cent of the county's internally displaced population. ...

⁴⁷ UNHCR. http://www.unhcr.org/publ/PUBL/4444d3ce20.html

UN Country Team in Colombia, 30 August 2003, Humanitarian Situation Room. OCHA Report Colombia August 2003 [Internet link] Their incomes were not sufficient to meet basic market basket needs. Fifty-three percent of homes stated that their main survival strategy was assistance from neighbors, relatives, friends, the government, or some NGOs.

⁴⁹ Ibid p. 74-79

⁵⁰ Inter-American Commission On Human Rights (IACHR), **Annual Report 2000** Chapter IV Colombia [Internet], p. 79)

⁵¹ Romero, Cesar. Cuestionario Atención Psiocosocial: Respuestas a Questionnaire on Psychosocial Support Intervention(s). Bogota UNICEF n/d also see Atención psicosocial a niños y niñas afectados por el conflicto armado. Bogotá UNICEF n/d

⁵² Colombia's *Escuela Nueva* was created in 1974 and has drawn from and combined various features of progressive education theory and practice. In 1985, the Colombian government

adopted *Escuela Nueva* as a national policy for rural primary schools.

⁵³ Quality of learning in the classroom is conditioned by the "classroom climate". The variables constituting this indicator measure levels of violent or positive environment among students and the quality of teacher student relations in the learning processes. This set of variables is more relevant than other aspects such as physical conditions of the school. A UNESCO /LLECE study showed that against all predictions, Colombian rural schools showed better results than urban schools in the average of Latin America. This is mainly attributed to the quality factors and the school climate created by Escuela Nueva. See: LLECE, First International Comparative Study (Language Mathematics and Associated Factors) UNESCO/OREALC, Santiago de Chile, 2002.

⁵⁴ Daniel Schugurensky Colombia Escuela Nueva A work in progress edited by Department of Adult Education, Community Development and Counseling Psychology, The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto (OISE/UT)

⁵⁵ Play dynamics help kids rediscover attachment. It includes games and recreational components with well-structured objectives as tools to achieve psychological and emotional recuperation in children, significantly increasing the quality of children's communication.

⁵⁶ The World's Children's Prize for the Rights of the Child (WCPRC).

http://www.childrensworld.org/page.html?pid=476

In a child vote in 1996, 2.7 million children voted to choose which of children's rights were most important in Colombia today...In the Children's Peace Movement children help other children who have suffered from violence. Children also contact politicians and demand that, for example, schools and parks shall be designated as peace zones and that children shall be given protection when they walk home from school."

⁵⁸Most of this aspect of the report is based on: Siegrist, Saudamini Colombia Case Study. UNICEF/EMOPS. New York. 24 August. 2003

⁵⁹ The community has used the symbol of the human hand to show their commitment to protect the children from harm. Each finger of the hand is raised in protection and identified with a particular quality associated with peace. These actions have created a local movement that is linked with the broader Colombia Children's Peace Movement, combining psychosocial support with community-based actions for peace.

⁶² This is often the weakest part of international humanitarian intervention strategy. It cannot police itself very well and tends to create 'bubble economies' that burst when the agencies pull out.

66 Becker

⁶⁴ Reich and Achvarina, *International Security*, Vol. 31, No. 1 (Summer 2006), pp. 127–164 ⁶⁵ Martin Shaw, *The contemporary mode of warfare?*

Martin Shaw, *The contemporary mode of warfare?*http://www.sussex.ac.uk/Users/hafa3/kaldor.htm; Mary Kaldor