

'My Name Is Not Natasha'

## **IMISCOE**

### *International Migration, Integration and Social Cohesion in Europe*

The IMISCOE Network of Excellence unites over 500 researchers from European institutes specialising in studies of international migration, integration and social cohesion. The Network is funded by the Sixth Framework Programme of the European Commission on Research, Citizens and Governance in a Knowledge-Based Society. Since its foundation in 2004, IMISCOE has developed an integrated, multidisciplinary and globally comparative research project led by scholars from all branches of the economic and social sciences, the humanities and law. The Network both furthers existing studies and pioneers new research in migration as a discipline. Priority is also given to promoting innovative lines of inquiry key to European policymaking and governance.

The IMISCOE-Amsterdam University Press Series was created to make the Network's findings and results available to researchers, policymakers and practitioners, the media and other interested stakeholders. High-quality manuscripts authored by IMISCOE members and cooperating partners are published in one of four distinct series.

IMISCOE Research advances sound empirical and theoretical scholarship addressing themes within IMISCOE's mandated fields of study.

IMISCOE Reports disseminates Network papers and presentations of a time-sensitive nature in book form.

IMISCOE Dissertations presents select PhD monographs written by IMISCOE doctoral candidates.

IMISCOE Textbooks produces manuals, handbooks and other didactic tools for instructors and students of migration studies.

IMISCOE Policy Briefs and more information on the Network can be found at [www.imiscoe.org](http://www.imiscoe.org).

# **‘My Name Is Not Natasha’**

How Albanian Women in France Use Trafficking  
to Overcome Social Exclusion (1998-2001)

*John Davies*

IMISCOE Dissertations

AMSTERDAM UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cover design: Studio Jan de Boer BNO, Amsterdam  
Layout: The DocWorkers, Almere

ISBN 978 90 5356 707 4  
e-ISBN 978 90 4850 137 3  
NUR 741 / 763

© John Davies / Amsterdam University Press, Amsterdam 2009

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

*To Julie*



# Table of contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| Acknowledgements  | 11        |
| Summary   | 13        |
| Tables and figures  | 15        |
| Acronyms and abbreviations                                  | 17        |
| <b>1 What is trafficking?</b>                               | <b>19</b> |
| 1.1 Trafficking   | 20        |
| 1.2 Research questions and enquiries                        | 22        |
| 1.3 What is trafficking?                                    | 28        |
| 1.3.1 A working definition                                  | 29        |
| 1.4 Conceptualising trafficking                             | 30        |
| 1.4.1 Trafficking as a moral problem                        | 31        |
| 1.4.2 Trafficking as a labour problem                       | 33        |
| 1.4.3 Trafficking as a human rights problem                 | 35        |
| 1.4.4 Trafficking as an organised crime problem             | 37        |
| 1.4.5 Trafficking as a migration problem                    | 42        |
| 1.5 Trafficking harms                                       | 44        |
| 1.6 Stereotypes in trafficking and female migration         | 45        |
| 1.7 Anti-trafficking legislation                            | 49        |
| 1.8 Trafficking as a power contest                          | 50        |
| 1.9 Homogeneous trafficking                                 | 52        |
| 1.10 Understanding and researching trafficking              | 52        |
| 1.10.1 Theoretical lacunae                                  | 53        |
| 1.11 Conclusion   | 54        |
| 1.12 Chapter outlines                                       | 55        |
| <b>2 Research design and methods</b>                        | <b>59</b> |
| 2.1 Irregular migration requires irregular research methods | 60        |
| 2.2 Researching criminalised and vulnerable groups          | 62        |
| 2.3 The research site                                       | 63        |
| 2.3.1 Choosing Lyon   | 64        |
| 2.4 The researched group                                    | 66        |
| 2.4.1 The wives   | 66        |
| 2.4.2 The divorced and other women                          | 68        |
| 2.4.3 '50 per cent contracts'                               | 68        |

|          |  |            |
|----------|--|------------|
|          | 2.4.4 Working locations  | 69         |
|          | 2.4.5 Counting trafficked women: OFPRA                                       | 69         |
|          | 2.5 Research design  | 71         |
|          | 2.6 Using cultural mediators as a research method                            | 75         |
|          | 2.7 Cultural advocacy and participatory conscientisation                     | 79         |
|          | 2.8 Sampling   | 83         |
|          | 2.9 The researched as researchers  | 84         |
|          | 2.10 'Çuna'  | 87         |
|          | 2.11 Other contacts  | 88         |
|          | 2.12 Ethics, confidentiality and consent                                     | 89         |
|          | 2.13 Data analysis   | 92         |
|          | 2.14 Conclusions   | 93         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Understanding trafficking</b>   | <b>95</b>  |
|          | 3.1 Analysing migration orders   | 96         |
|          | 3.2 Problems with trafficking problems                                       | 97         |
|          | 3.3 Overcoming 'demand': prevention, prosecution, protection                 | 97         |
|          | 3.3.1 Prevention   | 99         |
|          | 3.3.2 Prosecution  | 100        |
|          | 3.3.3 Protection   | 101        |
|          | 3.4 Failure to understand problems: 'demand', reverse and repeat trafficking | 102        |
|          | 3.4.1 Reverse trafficking  | 103        |
|          | 3.4.2 Repeat trafficking   | 103        |
|          | 3.5 Analytical trafficking matrix  | 105        |
|          | 3.6 Better conceptualisation   | 107        |
|          | 3.7 Conclusions  | 112        |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Leaving Albania</b>   | <b>115</b> |
|          | 4.1 Where do trafficked women come from?                                     | 115        |
|          | 4.2 Roma and trafficking   | 123        |
|          | 4.3 Which Albanian women are most vulnerable to trafficking?                 | 124        |
|          | 4.4 Poverty  | 125        |
|          | 4.5 Unemployment   | 129        |
|          | 4.6 Education  | 130        |
|          | 4.7 Migrating for marriage   | 133        |
|          | 4.8 Kidnapping   | 136        |
|          | 4.9 Migration decision making  | 143        |
|          | 4.10 Conclusions   | 145        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Arriving in France</b>  | <b>151</b> |
|          | 5.1 Modern migration and Albania   | 152        |



|          |   |            |
|----------|---|------------|
| 5.2      | 'Choosing' trafficking  | 153        |
| 5.3      | The problem of weak networks  | 158        |
| 5.4      | The networks of men and women   | 160        |
| 5.5      | The irregular migration networks  | 161        |
| 5.6      | Feminisation of Albanian migration?                                     | 162        |
| 5.7      | The migrating women   | 163        |
| 5.8      | The migration route   | 165        |
| 5.9      | Trafficking networks and arrival in Lyon                                | 168        |
| 5.10     | 'Wives' and forced labour: when irregular migration becomes trafficking | 171        |
| 5.11     | Controlling 'wives': co-dependency and violence                         | 174        |
| 5.12     | Challenging trafficking constraints                                     | 178        |
| 5.13     | Conclusions   | 179        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Living and working in Lyon</b>                                       | <b>183</b> |
| 6.1      | The sex-work economy in Lyon  | 183        |
| 6.2      | The researched women's experiences of Lyon's sex-work economy           | 184        |
| 6.3      | The importance of marriage  | 188        |
| 6.4      | Marriage and sex work   | 191        |
| 6.5      | Good husbands, bad husbands   | 193        |
| 6.6      | Relationships with the ' <i>Çuna</i> ': contract relationships          | 195        |
| 6.7      | The social contest between wives and whores                             | 196        |
| 6.8      | Clients and <i>Kollovars</i>  | 199        |
| 6.9      | The vice police   | 206        |
| 6.10     | Conclusions   | 209        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Overcoming or accommodating trafficking</b>                          | <b>213</b> |
| 7.1      | Reconnecting to their social networks                                   | 213        |
| 7.2      | Increasing mobility, strengthening social networks                      | 216        |
| 7.3      | The 'whore' is at the door  | 218        |
| 7.4      | Leaving trafficking: divorcing the <i>Çuni</i>                          | 219        |
| 7.5      | Leaving trafficking: absconding   | 222        |
| 7.6      | Leaving trafficking: local marriage                                     | 223        |
| 7.7      | Leaving trafficking: law enforcement                                    | 226        |
| 7.8      | Leaving trafficking: assistance agencies                                | 228        |
| 7.9      | Managing trafficking  | 230        |
| 7.10     | Failing to leave  | 233        |
| 7.11     | The value of trafficking  | 237        |
| 7.12     | Conclusions   | 238        |
| <b>8</b> | <b>Conclusions: explaining trafficking</b>                              | <b>243</b> |
| 8.1      | What needs to be refined  | 244        |
| 8.2      | Dynamics of Albanian trafficking  | 247        |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 8.3   | New economic migrants: understanding trafficked wives      | 248 |
| 8.3.1 | Controlling 'wives'  | 249 |
| 8.4   | Other women different theory                               | 250 |
| 8.4.1 | Women subverting trafficking networks                      | 251 |
| 8.5   | Problems in understanding trafficking                      | 253 |
| 8.5.1 | Conceptualising non-migration-related trafficking problems | 254 |
| 8.6   | Trafficking presumptions and realities                     | 256 |
| 8.7   | Social networks  | 257 |
| 8.8   | Trafficking networks, social networks                      | 258 |
| 8.8.1 | The growth in trafficking networks                         | 259 |
| 8.9   | Trafficking and policy                                     | 260 |
| 8.9.1 | Using policy to subvert Albanian trafficking               | 262 |
| 8.9.2 | Policy and 'demand'  | 264 |
| 8.10  | Limitations and possibilities                              | 264 |
| 8.11  | Conclusions  | 265 |
| 8.12  | Postscript: <i>J'accuse...</i>                             | 267 |
|       | <b>Notes</b>   | 271 |
|       | <b>Appendices</b>  |     |
| A     | Questionnaire and guidelines                               | 277 |
| B     | Cost of sex acts in Lyon                                   | 287 |
| C     | The lamp-post sticker used by the Campaign                 | 288 |
| D     | Advertisements for off-street sex workers                  | 289 |
| E     | Number of transsexual and female prostitutes in Lyon       | 290 |
| F     | Ethical statement  | 291 |
| G     | The researcher's map of Lyon                               | 292 |
| H     | Social matrix of the trafficking order in Lyon             | 293 |
|       | <b>References</b>  | 299 |

## Acknowledgements

Most important among my many advisors and friends who made this work possible are the 58 women who researched this book with me; their insights and understanding of trafficking have clearly shown that trafficked women are the people best able to explain their trafficking experiences. Furthermore, through the knowledge they have produced and shared they have clearly shown that they are also fully aware of how to research and then subvert trafficking. I must also thank Juljana Vullnetari for her outstanding work as the cultural advocate, for without her hard work and endless patience this book could not have been completed.

The writing of this book has been a difficult and complicated task. However, I have been greatly encouraged and assisted in this work by a number of people. Firstly, I would like to thank Richard Black, for his great patience and forbearance in guiding me through this endeavour. I would also like to thank Ron Skeldon and Antony Fielding for their supervision and advice at various times.

In addition, I thank Nigel Harris, Khalid Koser and Phil Marshall for their comments and encouragement. I am indebted to David Hitchin for his help in creating the SPSS tables used in the text. I am grateful to Cabiria for their kindness and cooperation during the research. I would like to thank Max Locker-Marsh and Team 4 of the Surrey Student Finance Team whose substantial support helped me overcome many of the disadvantages associated with my disability. I would also like to thank Yonis Dirie and Kirk Reid for their invaluable support and kindness during a very difficult and demanding episode of my life. In conclusion, I would also like to thank Karina Hof for all of her help with the final proofreading of this book.



## Summary

This book analyses and explains a trafficking crisis experienced by a group of Albanian women in Lyon, France, between 1998 and 2001. The book proposes new theoretical explanations for Albanian trafficking that considers women's experiences of social stigma and exclusion as becoming the main reason for Albanian women being involved in trafficking, after an initial period when young women were mainly deceived into abusive relationships that were then used to coerce them into forced labour. The Albanian trafficking discourse is currently dominated by the idea that Roma and rural women experiencing poverty and social disadvantage are coerced or deceived into trafficking networks that move them across borders and reduce them to sexual slavery because of the 'demand' of men for paid sex. This book argues that the conceptualisation that considers trafficking as being best explained by the 'demand' of men for paid sex and the naivety of the trafficked women is inadequate for explaining many of the trafficking experiences reported by the Albanian women in Lyon.

This book contends that many women were initially deceived into marriage with men who then exploited them; these deceived wives were subjugated through the exploitation of patrilocal marriages that invested in the husband the ability to make non-altruistic household decisions. This meant that their migration could be understood by refining the new economics of migration model and the role of non-altruistic actors who might exploit its processes. Once the nature of trafficking networks became well-known Albanian women increasingly refused to accept such marriages. However, because other Albanian women lacked social networks able to support them in their migration goals, many socially excluded divorced women began to use the trafficking networks as a mobility strategy in pursuit of migration goals beyond prostitution. The book thus argues that many trafficked women were not motivated to migrate because of economic considerations but by a determination to achieve social rehabilitation through foreign marriage. These women wanted to chain migrate but their weak social networks could not sustain their intended migration. Therefore, these women used trafficking as a means to reach destinations where they could build new networks and strengthen their old social networks.

Then they would eventually re-engage with their social networks without being an onerous burden. This is a new analysis based on previously unknown data and so the book is original and adds to our knowledge regarding trafficking as a means to pursue chain migration goals by compensating for inadequate social networks through the use of trafficking networks.

The book concludes that rather than being best explained by 'demand' as a focal problem trafficking can be better understood by considering trafficking as a gendered aspect of crisis in a migration order in transition. This extension of Van Hear's migration order theory is also a new application of the subjective notion of intolerability as being a substantial motivation for migration.

## Tables and figures

### List of tables

|           |  |     |
|-----------|--|-----|
| Table 2.1 | Arrival age of the researched            | 67  |
| Table 2.2 | Marriage status on arrival               | 67  |
| Table 2.3 | Marriage status 2001 cross-tabulation    | 68  |
| Table 2.4 | Number of women in each working location | 69  |
| Table 3.1 | The trafficking crisis matrix            | 108 |

### List of figures

|            |  |    |
|------------|--|----|
| Figure 2.1 | Focus group meeting discussing the work in progress    | 85 |
| Figure 2.2 | Researched group meeting with researcher               | 86 |
| Figure 2.3 | Street-based focus group meeting                       | 86 |
| Figure 2.4 | Researched women socialise after a focus group meeting | 86 |





## Acronyms and abbreviations

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| ACD     | Association for Community Development                      |
| ADB     | Asian Development Bank                                     |
| AI      | Amnesty International                                      |
| CATW    | Coalition Against Trafficking in Women                     |
| CEE     | Central and Eastern European                               |
| CIS     | Commonwealth of Independent States                         |
| CoE     | Council of Europe  |
| EEA     | European Economic Community                                |
| EC      | European Community   |
| GAATW   | Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women               |
| GDP PPP | gross domestic product purchasing power parity per capita  |
| HRW     | Human Rights Watch   |
| ICMPD   | International Centre for Migration Policy Development      |
| IFRC    | International Federation of the Red Cross and Red Crescent |
| IHRC    | International Human Rights Caucus                          |
| ILO     | International Labour Organization                          |
| IMADR   | International Movement Against All Forms of Discrimination |
| IOM     | International Organization for Migration                   |
| NGO     | non-governmental organisation                              |
| ODIHR   | Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights        |
| OMCTIP  | Office to Monitor and Combat the Trafficking in Persons    |
| OFPRA   | Office Français de Protection des Réfugiés et Apatrides    |
| OSCE    | Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe       |
| RCP     | Regional Clearing Point                                    |
| SAARC   | South Asian Association for Regional Co-operation          |
| SANGRAM | Sampada Grameen Mahila Sanstha                             |
| SPRSS   | Service de Prévention et de Réinsertion Sociale            |

|        |  |
|--------|--|
| SPSS   | Statistical Package for the Social Sciences                      |
| TIP    | trafficking in persons   |
| UN     | United Nations   |
| UNHCHR | United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights                |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization |
| UNHCR  | United Nations High Commission for Refugees                      |
| UNODC  | United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime                         |
| USAID  | United States Agency for International Development               |
| US SD  | United States State Department                                   |
| WCAR   | World Conference Against Racism                                  |

## 1 What is trafficking?

The effective suppression of trafficking in women and girls for the sex trade is a matter of pressing international concern. ... The use of women in international prostitution and trafficking networks has become a major focus of international organized crime ... Women and girls who are victims of this international trade are at an increased risk of further violence, as well as unwanted pregnancy and sexually transmitted infection, including infection with HIV/AIDS.

– Beijing Platform for Action, chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 122 (UN 1995)

The issue of human trafficking, more especially trafficking in women and children, has attracted major international attention in recent years. Within this broad issue, the trafficking of women and girls for sexual exploitation has become a particular concern among those who consider that the nexus between women, poverty, violence and sexual slavery make trafficking one of the most pressing social issues of recent years (Woodruff 2001). However, others consider modern trafficking to be a reinvention of the previous ‘white slavery’ moral panic that pandered to a racism, that infantilised foreign women as naïve incompetents and demonised foreign men as procurers and criminals (Doezema 2000).

Trafficking is accepted to be difficult to research and to be especially under-researched regarding the experiences of people still in trafficking (Brennan 2005; Kelly 2005; Laczko 2005). In the recent trafficking discourse in Europe, the Albanians have been the most demonised group of people involved in trafficking; the Albanians have supplied both the most pitiful victims and the most monstrous perpetrators (Brissenden 2001; Doole 2001; Waugh 2006). Therefore, this study investigated a group of Albanian men and women who because of their nationality and migration trajectories are located at the centre of the European trafficking discourse. The research is intended to better explain their experiences and to improve how Albanian trafficking in Europe is understood. Therefore, this chapter introduces various trafficking issues in general and then frames the specific problems that this study seeks to address.

The chapter describes what is commonly understood as trafficking and considers why further research is necessary to better explain trafficking. Then in this chapter common myths and inadequate conceptualisations of trafficking are noted and trafficking events that have often remained invisible and under-researched are specifically identified as requiring further research. The chapter identifies which people are considered particularly vulnerable to trafficking and the popular reasons why this is considered so, while then questioning the sufficiency of the existing conceptualisations to adequately explain trafficking. The chapter then considers that further research should investigate trafficking to see if it is a heterogeneous form of migration which could be better understood by applying a wide range of complementary migration theories to its explanation rather than trafficking being explained as being driven by the 'demand' of men for paid sex.

### 1.1 Trafficking

In the last decade, trafficking has been usually represented as a form of mobility resulting in various forced labour harms. Often trafficking has been positioned as a gendered phenomenon which considers the mobility of poor women to be particularly vulnerable to exploitation through sexual slavery (Barry 1979; Chant 1995). As such, the mobility of poor women has become increasingly synonymous with serious risks (O'Neill 1999; Raufer & Quéré 2000).

Trafficking has been increasingly presented as a major threat to Albanian women (Renton 2001; RCP 2003), to other young and poor women from across Central and Eastern Europe (IOM 1995; Katro & Shaman 1999; IOM 2001), and then to poor and young women throughout the developing world (IOM 2001; Kangaspunta 2003). While young women from the developed world are considered to be engaging in migration to deliberately participate in sex work, young women from the CEE are considered to be vulnerable to trafficking (Foulkes 2005; Irish Ex 2006).

Young Scottish women are travelling to Dublin to spend the weekend working as prostitutes, Irish vice squad detectives said today. Amid fears over increased trafficking of Eastern European girls to Ireland as sex slaves, a senior Garda source warned the problem was closer to home. Girls in their late teens and early 20s are choosing to board low-cost flights in Glasgow on Friday evenings to spend 48 hours earning cash for sex ... Many of the women use the money to put themselves through university. 'It is a business for these girls. There is no question that these girls

are being trafficked. They are here for the money,' a Garda source said. (Irish Ex 2006)

When Lucie Blackman, a young British woman was murdered while working illegally as a bar hostess in a Roppongi hospitality bar<sup>1</sup> in Tokyo, her agency was not questioned nor was she presented as a trafficking victim (BBC 2001). It is usually presumed that educated women from developed countries, such as Lucie Blackman, are impervious to the deceptions and devices that entrap the supposedly more naïve and vulnerable young women from the developing or transitional world (Wight 2006).

However, institutions as diverse as the United Nations, International Organisation for Migration, the United States government and the Organization for Co-operation and Security in Europe all appear to be convinced that trafficking is a major threat to any young and poor woman from the developing or transitional world (IOM 2001; Annan 2002; OSCE 2002; Dobriensky 2005). 'In Eastern Europe, trafficking is the result of the poverty and social upheaval of transition. Some groups, above all young women, have become more vulnerable' (IFRC 2005: 1).

However, if defined as the migration of people into forced labour harm or modern slavery,<sup>2</sup> trafficking afflicts not just young women but men, women and children throughout the world. Some trafficking experts (Ghosh 1998; Blanchet 2002; ILO 2003), including Bales (1999), believe that the trafficking of men for forced labour constitutes the largest segment of those who are modern slaves. Bales (1999) who is described by his publishers as the world's leading expert on slavery considers that population growth, economic change and corruption have impacted on old forms of slavery to fuel the rapid expansion of slavery-like practices among vulnerable trafficked labour to produce what he considers to be modern slavery. He argues extensively that the conditions necessary to support this abuse are widespread and that overwhelmingly it involves people not involved in commercialised sex.

My best estimate of the number of slaves in the world today is 27 million ... These slaves tend to be used in simple, non-technological and traditional work. The largest group work in agriculture ... (Bales 1999: 9)

This endemic forced labour of migrants is reported in many parts of the world and is often orchestrated by legally registered labour recruitment agencies and other associated actors (Blanchet 2002; Lawson 2004). Reportedly this exploitation affects tens of thousands of men and women in well documented slavery-like practices outside any commercial sex enterprise (Cordell, Gregory et al. 1996; Ghosh 1998; Kyle

2001). However, trafficking is often presented by researchers, international agencies, and other commentators such as the UNODC, Barry, Malarek (2006, 1979, 2004) and others as usually being the trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation (ACD 2001; ADB 2003; CoE 2005). Such a consideration can allow trafficking to be reduced to a gender specific event that can limit responses to supposed stereotypical and perhaps mythical harms.

While this study again investigates the trafficking of women into prostitution it is intended not to perpetuate existing presumptions or myths but to examine new and rich data gained from women still in their trafficking experiences. Consequently this data will add new and authoritative voices to the current discourse and so allow this aspect of trafficking to be better understood and explained as part of a trafficking continuum. Such a continuum includes all trafficked people, so rather than allowing the experiences of migrant women in prostitution to become divorced from the wider trafficking continuum this study will allow aspects of their trafficking experiences to be understood and explained by theories regarding mobility that sit outside the usual contested discourse regarding sex work.

## 1.2 Research questions and enquiries

This work is principally about the migration trajectories, trafficking harms and self-solutions experienced by a group of Albanian women in France and the role of Albanian men in their trafficking. Albanian women have been represented as a particularly vulnerable nationality among trafficked women in Europe (Brissenden 2001; Raxhimi 2004) and Albanian men are presented as dominating the new and violent mafias that have arrived in the EC from the Balkans (Xhudo 1996; Waugh 2006). Albania has been the focus of European trafficking concerns regarding Southern Europe throughout the 1990s and the early part of this decade (IOM 2004; Limanowska 2004). The importance of Albania as a major source and transit point for trafficked women (IOM & ICMC 2001; IOM & ICMC 2002; IOM 2004) has created substantial interest in improving the understanding of Albanian trafficking (Shekulli 2005).

Trafficking is often presented as a homogeneous phenomenon that can be best explained by the 'demand' of men for sexually exploitable women and the poverty of desperate and naïve women (Hughes 2002; Malarek 2004). However, according to Marshall (2005) this conceptualisation does not seem to explain adequately many of the experiences reported by trafficked women, and consequently he believes there is a need to investigate if there are better ways to explain trafficking. Furthermore, Augstín, Brussa and Doezema have also deliberately chal-

lenged the presumed homogeneity of trafficked women and argued that the diversity of trafficking experiences demand more nuanced and complex explanations than are commonly offered by most commentators. Sangera and Kempadoo have documented the apparent agency of trafficked women and then theorised that the women's agency within the constraints of their disadvantaged choices cannot be explained by mainstream trafficking theories. This study sits amongst the growing body of work that challenges the current dominant discourse on trafficking; however, the depth and richness of its ethnographic data of women still in their trafficking experience is probably unique.

This study examines a particular Albanian trafficking flow and seeks to discover who was trafficked. It then considers if they were a homogeneous group of women whose experiences can be adequately explained by the current dominant conceptualisation or if the flow involved different typologies of women who require diverse theoretical explanations for their involvement in trafficking.

This study investigates the experiences of the researched women using an adaptation of Van Hear's (1998) migration order model<sup>3</sup>. Van Hear's model allows different trafficking experiences to be explained along the continuum of available migration theories rather than being subsumed into a single conceptualisation. Van Hear's framework makes it possible to demonstrate how common understandings of trafficking based on migrant women as either trafficked sex slaves or as migrant sex workers do not fully consider the full range of factors that can occur in a trafficking flow (Van Hear 1998). Agustín (2005) considers the simple dualism between women being considered either trafficked sex slaves or sex-work migrants are inadequate conceptualisations that have allowed a large group of trafficked women to remain ignored and invisible.

The Van Hear (1998) migration order model seeks to explain migration events by using a range of migration theories to explain different aspects of a migration flow. These migration flows had previously been conceptualised according to particular migration theories rather than being explained across a range of theories. The migration order model allows the diversity of a migration flow to be explained and so theoretically explicable but if different forms of migration are taking place within a trafficking flow, Van Hear's model offers a means by which to identify and explain these different events this would improve our understanding of trafficking. Van Hear's (1998) migration order model is also a means by which the dynamic nature of migration might be understood without relying so heavily on an economic focus and by specifically considering the role of force in migration. The dynamic interaction of various forces can create stable migration regimes according to Van Hear, but change to any one of the influencing forces can cause

sudden and dramatic change to a previously well-understood and predictable order. Subsequently a period of crisis will ensure until the migration order re-establishes equilibrium.

The migration order model developed by Van Hear encompasses theories regarding individual and household decision-making, economic and political disparities between places of migrant origin and destination, the state of migrant networks and institutions and the migration regime as shaped by the macro-political economy. The model then integrates these features as either:

1. root causes for migration
2. proximate factors for migration<sup>4</sup> as the structural features present themselves to the migrants
3. precipitating factors that actually trigger departure
4. or intervening factors that enable or constrain migration.

These factors then create a continuum along which force and choice can shape the migration. 'I suggested that looking at migration in this way might help reconcile the disparate discourses of economic and forced migration' (Van Hear 1998: 238).

By assuming that migration theories are not mutually exclusive and that they can be combined to provide more complete explanations of migration, and by explicitly including the impact of migration policies, Van Hear believes that migration flows can be better examined and understood. The dynamic interaction of various forces can create stable migration regimes according to Van Hear, but change to any one of the influencing forces can cause sudden and dramatic change to a previously well-understood and predictable order. Subsequently, a period of crisis will ensure until the migration order re-establishes an equilibrium (Van Hear 1998).

... changes in the features ... may trigger a shift in the migration order ... Some changes are more profound and significant than others: the far more far-reaching I term migration transitions in which there is a fundamental change in a given migration order. (Van Hear 1998: 21-22)

The trafficking of women from Albania to Europe represents an aspect of a transitional period of dramatic change in a new migration order which Van Hear considers to be in crisis (Van Hear 1998: 238). Van Hear identifies chaotic and sometimes unexpected events as crises, and supposes that they are the markers of a transition in a migration order to a new equilibrium: '...acute forms of migration transition I term migration crises involving sudden, massive, disorderly population movements' (Van Hear 1998: 23).



Van Hear specifically identifies the mass exodus of Albanians after 1990 as a novel phenomenon and as a new migration order experiencing transition and crisis involving traffickers (Van Hear 1998: 119). The chaotic and critical nature of a transition would also suggest that trafficking would be vulnerable to rapid changes and evolutions as the migration order sought to re-establish its stability. It could be expected that trafficking would constantly adapt and change as the transition progressed through the crisis. Understanding this change in trafficking practice and how to influence or mitigate its effects would be important and useful for those seeking to understand and address trafficking. If the migration order concept can be effectively applied to understanding modern trafficking, it should help predict and explain how such crisis episodes evolve and how these transitions might be effectively managed. In his own research on migration orders, Van Hear identified several migration orders that were in crisis and specifically considered how sudden changes in the 1990s marked a pivotal moment in the world migratory order (Van Hear 1998). The current Albanian trafficking crisis is contemporary to this pivotal moment identified by Van Hear (*ibid.*). Development of Van Hear's migration order model in this study will allow the current Albanian trafficking crisis to be better conceptualised so less adequate explanations might be superseded. Van Hear integrates six levels of a layered hierarchy that allow for a wide ranging number of dynamic components to be considered in determining the understanding of various migration orders (*ibid.*).

The six hierarchal layers of migration theory are represented by:

1. Individual decision making across a wider range of considerations including non-economic aspects relating to actor-orientated personal development and security.
2. Household decision-making strategies based principally on 'new economic migration'<sup>5</sup> considerations.
3. Wider considerations of disparities including the importance of decisions relating to disparities affecting personal development and security.
4. Social and migration networks and the structural and institutional settings in which they operate.
5. Migration policy as reflected by direct and indirect policy impacts on migrants.
6. Political forces operating at the macro level, linked to the global economy.

Within the world migratory order there are many diverse migration orders operating in various ways; therefore, it is likely that each migration order will experience any trafficking crisis in different ways. In understanding these variations there will be opportunities to consider if

there is a single focal problem of trafficking which can provide a basis for identifying a set of common solutions or if trafficking requires careful and specific interventions into each migration order to mitigate any trafficking crisis. Another importance of Van Hear's model for considering trafficking within a larger migration order is an opportunity to consider economic and other theories when examining the migration decision making of women. Van Hear deliberately introduces the idea that an individual's estimation of what are intolerable circumstances can also drive their mobility (Van Hear 1998). This very individualistic motivation has been supported by the work of Collyer (2006) that suggests that an individual's opinion of a place of origin is an important indicator of their likelihood to migrate.

Van Hear's migration order allows for considerations of the impact of macro world systems upon these individual processes. Most importantly, Van Hear deliberately addresses the issues of force and choice in migration as a continuum upon which individual decisions to migrate or not migrate can be located. While this accommodation of forced migration decision making was originally conceived as a means by which refugee movements could be integrated into wider theoretical explanations, it also supplies a means by which compulsion in certain aspects of trafficking might be coherently examined and a greater heterogeneity of experiences might be identified and acknowledged.

In this study I will use an analytical matrix based on Van Hear's concepts to investigate and explain different migration flows of trafficked women by reference to different combinations of migration theory. In particular I will describe an early wave of Albanian women migrating as being best explained according to the new economics of migration. The new economics of migration theory contends that migrants and their families enter into mutually beneficial contracts with each other to mitigate risks to the family and encourage mutual interdependence. Migration decision making is a household process intended to reduce the possible impact of various risks while maximising the benefits of migration for the family, therefore decisions to migrate may not always be based only on economic considerations. However, I will describe a New Economic process in which non-altruistic men having captured the migration decision-making process abuse it for their personal gain rather than as a household benefit. This non-altruistic manipulation of New Economic processes has been suggested at by Massey and Riosmena (2004) but specific examples of such exploitation have not been well documented and Stark (1999) has consistently argued that altruistic behaviour is the overwhelming motivator for the new economics of migration rather than any other motivator such as the reproduction of male power and dominance. This study raises questions about

Stark's presumption of altruistic motivation and suggests that much supposed altruistic behaviour in Albanian migration is actually an attempt to transnationally project male privilege and power, such behaviour would have synergy with the earlier work of Hayek (1944) regarding presumptions regarding altruism. The issue of altruistic presumption is also considered by Popova (2005) in her analysis of the intent and practice of other actors who seek to control the disposition of trafficked women.

In the case of Albanian migration Carletto, Davis and Stampini (2006) have consistently reported the importance of New Economic household decision making in the migration decision making of Albanian families so an examination of the impact of this process on Albanian trafficked women could better explain how traffickers sit within understandable migration processes and manipulate them rather than operating according to disassociated principles and methods. If migration theories such as the new economics of migration and other migration theories regarding social networks which I extensively examine in chapter 5 or the impact of policy can supply credible explanations for a variety of trafficking experiences and processes it would support the rationale for researching trafficking as a migration event.

The consequences of inadequate conceptualisations of trafficking based on inaccurate assumptions and flawed research are considered and where possible these problematic aspects of understanding trafficking are deconstructed and analysed to explain how and why they are inadequate. This study explains complex issues of power and control in trafficking and why during the 1990s an increasing number of women deliberately engaged with traffickers<sup>6</sup> even though they were apparently aware of the risks associated with such actions. It also suggests how trafficking crises might be most effectively subverted or even avoided.

The study is also an attempt to identify the harms that are experienced by these women during their trafficking episodes, how they were constrained within trafficking and to document the means by which women have left a trafficking episode. The study is an analysis of how macro-, meso- and micro-policies and practices have influenced the ability of the researched women to resolve certain harms. The study suggests extensions to existing migration and trafficking theories, that are intended to better explain the trafficking experiences of these women, and so indicate more appropriate interventions to subvert the trafficking harms experienced by them. The study also presents a new adaptation and application of Paulo Freire's (1970) participatory action research methods as a means by which trafficked women might be successfully researched.

The motivation for this research is not to supply information that will allow the more effective suppression of 'illegal' migration, as illeg-

ality is constructed upon the shifting sand of policy and such policy does not necessarily represent a just or equitable regime for the treatment of migrants (Black 1996; Collyer 2001). The work investigates the possibility that some policy deliberately creates and sustains certain forms of trafficking harm as a form of migration control. Altink (1995), Wijers and Lap-Chew (1999) and others consider that access to safe and affordable migration would mitigate many forms of trafficking harm (Friebel and Guriev 2002).

### 1.3 What is trafficking?

A consensus regarding what is trafficking is far from established but the recent supplementing protocol<sup>7</sup> to the United Nations Convention dealing with Transnational Crime (2001) defines trafficking as:

#### Definition of Trafficking in Persons

- (a) 'Trafficking in persons' shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;
- (b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) are established;
- (c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered 'trafficking in persons' even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article;
- (d) 'Child' shall mean any person under eighteen years of age.  
(UN 2003)

This protocol has been signed by more than 117 States and ratified by 42 States, including Albania and France. Yet, in spite of the consensus that this protocol was intended to create around the need to prioritise action against forced labour outcomes for migrants, many commentators – including Widgren (1994), Williams (1999) and Ashcroft (2003) –

have prioritised the trafficking issue as irregular migration or other movements that involve prostitution.

The US State Department currently defines trafficking as:

- (a) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or
- (b) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery. (US SD 2000)

In contrast, the UN Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women considered linking trafficking to illegal movement to be inappropriate and so defined trafficking as:

Trafficking in persons means the recruitment, transportation, purchase, sale, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons: by threat or use of violence, abduction, force, fraud, deception or coercion (including the abuse of authority), or debt bondage, for the purpose of; placing or holding such person, whether for pay or not, in forced labour or slavery-like practices, in a community other than the one in which such person lived at the time of the original act described in (1). (UNESCO 2000)

These various definitions illustrate the evolving nature of considerations regarding trafficking. In particular women who deliberately enter trafficking are considered trafficked if on arrival they are then engaged in forced labour, and their trafficking has been induced by the offer of some perceived benefit such as movement to some preferred destination; this is especially the case when the person involved began the episode as a child.

### 1.3.1 *A working definition*

For the purposes of this study the following definitions are used:

1. Trafficking to be any act that involves any mobility of any person from a place of usual residence into any form of forced labour.
2. A trafficking harm would be any circumstance that occurred because of this process that caused the trafficked person distress or negatively affected their well-being.
3. A trafficking episode would be the period of time that a trafficked person was either involved in preparing to move towards probable forced labour and lasting until they cease to be engaged in the

forced labour and are no longer likely to be reengaged in such forced labour.

These working definitions are compatible with the principal definitions used by the UN and its special rapporteur as it accommodates their main elements, while also allowing me to consider a wide continuum of experiences within trafficking that might cause a woman distress or fear while not being obviously linked to the trafficking episode.

The following definitions are also used:

1. Sex work is any commercialised sexual activity that involves the provision of sexual services for a reward. In this study is it usually represented by the street-based sale of sexual acts by the researched women. This definition is used by Carol Leigh of the Prostitution Education Network and similar definitions are used by several other sex-worker groups. (Delacoste 1987; Pheterson 1996; Chapkis 1997; Leigh 1997; Longo 2004)
2. Forced labour in this study is considered to be all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty. This is represented in this study by the extraction of earned income by threats, as well as coercion that delimits how and when someone must work and what services they must supply and at what price. Typically it represents a loss of control over the terms and conditions of the work involved, without any right to desist in the work, as the consequence of violence or threats of violence. This definition draws directly from the ILO conventions on Forced labour. (ILO 1930)

#### 1.4 Conceptualising trafficking

Wijers and Van Doorninck (2002) have noted that trafficking is seen as a problem by many experts in five distinct ways, namely in terms of morality, labour, human rights, organised crime and migration. They then consider responses that seek to resolve these supposed problems and divide such responses into repressive or empowering strategies. However, they recognise that often the women are not involved in directing the course of these interventions and that solutions are often imposed on them. They conclude their considerations of these differing approaches by stating that in designing an intervention for trafficked women:

(the) ... participation of the women concerned is seen as essential to the development of effective change strategies. Support and lobby strategies are directed towards empowering women, enabling them to take back control over their lives, and facilitating their ability to speak up for their own rights. Repressive stra-

tegies are rejected, if the rights of the women concerned are not at the same time clearly defined and protected ... (Wijers & Van Doorninck 2002: 6)

Interventions that do not meet this progressive criterion would probably be considered by Wijers and Van Doorninck as not addressing the needs of the women concerned in an equitable way. The five areas identified by these activists appear to offer a useful framework for examining how the various actors control the production of knowledge about trafficking and what their motives might be in exercising such power.

#### 1.4.1 *Trafficking as a moral problem*

Trafficking as a moral problem is often collapsed into moral concerns regarding prostitution (Kempadoo, Sangera et al. 2005). The language of morality is then used to represent a pressing need to stop trafficking as a means of preventing immoral prostitution (Melzer 2005), and the proponents of this moral concern often consider the 'demand' of men for the sexual services of exploitable women to be the focal problem<sup>8</sup> of trafficking (Brown 2000; Hughes 2002; Bush 2005). While the Vatican representative and some other representatives of Islamic states made specific reference to trafficking as a moral problem during the negotiations of the UN protocol about trafficking (IHRC 2000a), it is the US administration encouraged by an alliance of new abolitionist feminists<sup>9</sup> and conservative US evangelicals<sup>10</sup> who have championed trafficking as a moral issue for several years (Carnes 2000; Bumiller 2003; Friedlin 2004; Nir 2004).

During the current US administration, there has been an increasing insistence that trafficking be treated as a morality issue and as part of a moral crusade against prostitution (Nir 2004). New policy regarding prostitution prevented funding to those agencies not willing to conflate trafficking and prostitution. The impact of trafficking as a moral problem is having an increasing effect on how trafficking is being addressed throughout the world as the US administration is now insisting that all USAID overseas funding only be given to agencies that have a published anti-prostitution policy (CHGE 2003; Lynch 2004). Initially this restriction was only enforced on non-US agencies as US agencies were considered protected by first amendment free speech rights. However, the policy was extended to require US agencies working on HIV or sex-work issues to assume a public anti-prostitution position.

In a major policy shift, the Bush administration on Thursday notified U.S.-based AIDS organisations that get taxpayer fund-

ing for work overseas that they must pledge that they oppose prostitution and sex trafficking. (Sternberg 2005)

The anti-prostitution pledge requirement is contained in the United States Leadership Against HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria Act of 2003 (USCA 2003) and this states that:

... no funds made available to carry out this Act ... may be used to provide assistance to any group or organization that does not have a policy explicitly opposing prostitution and sex trafficking. (USCA 2003)

While this policy was aggressively and eventually successfully challenged in the US courts<sup>11</sup> by NGOs, including the Open Society and DKT International (Daily Reports 2006), it demonstrates the continuing power of those who wish to present trafficking as a moral problem. It is presently unclear whether the policy can still be imposed on non-US agencies, as being outside of the US they are not protected by the first amendment rights claimed by the US agencies. This treatment of trafficking as a moral problem has also been linked to the promotion of a radical feminist agenda on prostitution and increasing support for such an agenda. Laura Lederer, who was the leader of the feminist group Equality Now and also a coordinator of a feminist/evangelical alliance on trafficking that included the National Association of Evangelicals, was reported as saying that the Evangelical groups had added:

... a biblical mandate to the women's movement. Women's groups don't understand that the partnership on this issue has strengthened them, because they would not be getting attention internationally otherwise. (Lederer quoted in Crago 2003)

The alliance between these unusual allies has attracted increasing attention from a wide variety of commentators (Carnes 2000; Bumiller 2003; Butcher 2003; Soderlund 2005). However, Michael Horowitz an ideological leader of the religious Wilberforce Forum that coordinates the activities of the alliance's members has aggressively defended the alliance and disparaged its critics as apologists for slavery who in their moral corruption are supposedly reduced to adolescent logic (Nir 2004; Horowitz 2006). It is even considered by Miriam (2005) that the radical feminist agenda has prevailed in framing the UN Protocol on trafficking. I have argued elsewhere that this is directly a result of their alliance with politically powerful religious groups (Davies 2003). Wietzer (2005) considers the discourse around morality and trafficking as particularly tainted. He has accused feminist members of the alli-



ance of intellectual dishonesty (Weitzer 2005) and making unjustifiable pronouncements. 'A robust, new moral crusade against prostitution and sex trafficking has arisen in the past few years, targeting these issues with a vengeance and making a host of outlandish claims' (Weitzer 2006: 33).

Many organisations and agencies such as SANGRAM, a sex-worker cooperative in Kolkata, that have done effective work in reducing harms associated with trafficking are now unable to receive US government funding as they are unwilling to assume a particular moral understanding of trafficking (Nagarajan 2005). Morals mean money in the context of US policy on prostitution and trafficking and as such there must be a concern that this money will influence how trafficking is viewed and understood regardless of any data or evidence that might suggest trafficking is a far more complex and nuanced phenomenon than presently determined by the current US administration.

#### 1.4.2 *Trafficking as a labour problem*

Roger Plant of the Forced Labour unit<sup>12</sup> of ILO has consistently argued that trafficking is fundamentally a labour market problem that can best be resolved by improved labour rights and protections for migrant workers (Plant 2004). ILO considers forced labour to be the essential element of trafficking that can best be addressed by ensuring proper labour market function and rights. (Plant 2003; Plant 2004) This approach argues that if there are no forced labour outcomes or such forced labour is ended, then trafficking will have ceased. This is considered true even if irregular migration or prostitution might still occur, because if there is no forced labour element then trafficking will have been subverted, according to this understanding of trafficking.

While this approach considers programmes that raise awareness of trafficking risks and so help people to make more informed decisions about migration to be useful, it considers that labour market realities should dictate migration and labour policy so as to ensure migrants can then easily access labour rights and protections (Plant 2004; ILO 2005). However, this approach has been criticised by Raymond for accepting sex work as a form of labour (Raymond 2004).

According to Plant (2004), the treatment of trafficking as a labour problem considers the forced labour element to be the point at which trafficking can be most coherently addressed. This approach ties itself to the proven measures that have overcome forced labour in a variety of other settings. As such, it offers measurable indicators and outcomes for judging whether trafficking is being successfully addressed. Inspecting conditions of work and researching labour conditions are widely practiced activities. When divorced from negative outcomes for

the labourers such as deportation or punishments from the workplace, Bales (1999) reports that such interventions often receive widespread support from the forced labourers involved.

The labour problem approach is able to utilise a number of widely recognised conventions that are more widely accepted than the UN protocol on trafficking. These conventions include the forced labour conventions and the convention intended to eradicate the worse forms of child labour (ILO 1930; ILO 1999). These conventions are then used by ILO to address the forced labour aspects of trafficking (ILO 2002; ILO 2002). ILO is not the only actor to consider labour market responses to trafficking to be an effective way to subvert trafficking. A number of sex-worker rights activists argue that by treating prostitution as sex work, and according sex-workers' labour rights, it is possible to more effectively address forced labour incidents in sex work. Bindman and Doezema (1998) argue that by acknowledging prostitution as a form of labour, people in sex-work environments would have access to a wide range of existing and effective labour protection resources that would be increasingly used to subvert forced and exploitative labour practices which in turn would subvert trafficking. This argument is echoed in the call from the North American Task Force on Prostitution<sup>13</sup> for sex work to be considered a form of labour (NATFP 1979) and by activists from the Network of Sex Work Projects<sup>14</sup> (Overs & Longo 1997; Kempadoo & Doezema 1998; Kinnell 2003).

However, sex-worker solidarity on this issue is far from universal and often groups of local sex workers will vigorously oppose migrant sex workers or trafficked women being extended rights to enter sex-work labour markets. (BBC 2000) Recent law changes in the Netherlands making sex work a recognised labour practice have reportedly resulted in increasing difficulties for migrant sex workers as they are unable to acquire the necessary work permits and so have become more dependent on criminals to help them bypass the new regulations (Raymond 2004). Any solidarity between local sex workers and migrant sex workers seems fraught with the difficulties common to any labour market. These difficulties include the perceptions of a fragile economy being subjected to more stress by people often seen to have a competitive advantage because they are assumed to be willing to work for less pay (BBC 2000).

Treating trafficking as a labour problem does seem to offer a process by which to focus on the harm of forced labour, while avoiding the distractions of wider political agendas. It offers a means for addressing a wide range of trafficking events including the trafficking of men for forced labour (Bales 1999; ILO 2000; ILO 2001; ILO 2003).

### 1.4.3 *Trafficking as a human rights problem*

Addressing trafficking as a human rights violation of those who are trafficked is the most common strategy of agencies and actors who want to prioritise the rights of women and others as the means to be able to overcome trafficking harm. These agencies such as the Council of Europe, Asian Development Bank and NGOs like Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women and Anti-Slavery International prioritise the human rights of trafficked women and frame anti-trafficking initiatives as programmes intended to protect Human Rights (GAATW 1999; ADB 2003; ASI 2003; CoE 2005). Experts on trafficking such as Marjan Wijers, (2002) now a member of the EC working group of experts on trafficking,<sup>15</sup> consider 'rights' to be the main medium for resolving trafficking harm.

However, the rights that are usually considered as needing protection are those rights that relate to a person's right to be free from coercion or violence, whereas any rights to mobility or decent work are usually ignored during these considerations. In fact, in developing a rights-based approach to trafficking, most agencies are very careful to limit the gamut of rights that are being sought and to avoid claiming or articulating new rights. The overwhelming priority of human-rights based agencies dealing with trafficking is to prevent or stop the violation of these human rights with relation to the perceived violence linked to forced prostitution (IMADR 1998; UNHCHR 2002; Eichenberger 2003). It is often assumed that the trafficked women need to be rescued and rehabilitated, so their human rights might be restored (Strada 1996; Malarek 2004). Moreover, the human rights approach assumes that women, when told about the human rights violations associated with trafficking, will no longer seek to engage with traffickers and will no longer be willing to take such risks. Consequently, they will either not migrate or wait until some secure means to migrate is available (ACD 1995; ADB 2003; Commonwealth Secretariat 2003).

Many human rights agencies also assume that women will want to exit sex work at the earliest opportunity (HRW 2006). Then various institutions assume that temporary residency, possibly inside a witness protection plan with an eventual return to her homeland or the possibility of maybe remaining in a destination country after being required to give evidence against the traffickers, is an attractive outcome for a trafficked woman when compared with the alternative of continuing in a trafficking episode for an indeterminate period (CoE 1997; DG-J&HA 2005). While many human rights activists argue for compassionate and holistic treatment of trafficked people, their agenda is often subjugated by the state to the interests of a law enforcement agenda or migration policy priorities, such as the linking of temporary residency

permits for trafficked women to them agreeing to give evidence against their traffickers (Melzer 2005). This linkage is contested and recently the Council of Europe has given its support to de-linking evidence giving from temporary residency (CoE 2002). Where responses offer the victims of trafficking possible residency, a number of politicians, law enforcement agents and even refugee workers have complained that such visas are an invitation for women to falsely claim to have been trafficked (Watt 2000; Maltzahn 2003; Allen 2004; Home Office 2006).

A spokesman for Philip Ruddock<sup>16</sup> said, 'Eventually you would find instead of people claiming to be refugees, they would claim to be prostitutes who fear going home'. (Maltzahn 2003)

Similarly the US Trafficking in Persons Act had a cap placed on the number of T-visas available to trafficking victims because some US legislators feared women would falsely claim to have been trafficked as a way to remain in the USA. (Watt 2000)

... the automatic granting of reflection periods and residence permits for trafficking victims, may act as 'pull' factors to the UK. (Home Office 2006: 6)

However, rescue and rehabilitation shelters in Italy, Albania, and the other parts of the Balkans rather than seeing increasing claims for such protection and residency have reported a falling number of women who want to use the centres (RCP 2003; ProProject 2005). Many rescue centres in the Western Balkans have been reported as being empty or nearly empty of trafficked women for extended periods of time (Waugh 2006). This is contrasted with continuing reports that trafficking in the region is increasing, which has in turn created an expectation that there should be an increasing number of clients for such centres (RCP 2003; IOM 2004). Staff from these centres have also reported a number of women who express a wish not to be repatriated but want to return to Italy or some other EC destination to resume sex work (Davies 2001).

There seems to be a serious gap between the assumptions and expectations of the human rights groups and migrant women in a trafficking episode. Many women do not seem to see a 'decent job' in their home country as a satisfactory resolution of a trafficking episode. Local television stations in Southeast Albania have been regularly advertising well-paid jobs for women as seamstresses or hairdressers in the local region for a number of years, but many young women still express an intention to leave Albania (Papapanagos & Sanfey 2002; Korce TV 2003; Korce TV 2004). The urgent protestations of those who propose

a human rights programme of awareness raising and recovery for trafficked women seem to lack resonance with the behaviour of some trafficked women, in particular women willing to use trafficking as a mobility strategy and especially those women who seek to be repeatedly trafficked (Bylander 2006).

These urgent demands for programmes to meet the presumed needs of trafficking victims dominate present programming for trafficked women.

We need to focus on programs that care compassionately for the victims and we need to implement them immediately, worldwide. The most urgent priorities are safe shelters and clinics equipped and staffed to offer medical and psychological treatment. We need to understand that most of these women have been psychologically and physically ripped apart. And we need to be prepared for the fact that most have been infected with various sexually transmitted diseases. (Malarek 2004: 265)

It could be argued that while trafficked women do not want to experience coercive violence and exploitation, they are seeking resolutions and outcomes that do not have a fit with the assumptions of many human rights activists and agencies (Popova 2006). The prejudices and even racist attitudes of many service providers working among trafficked women are described by Popova (2006) as being a serious barrier to effective client driven service delivery. Waugh (2006) documents how some service provider staff seem unable to empathise with trafficked women and make outlandish presumptions based on their own class prejudices. I have also documented elsewhere how Albanian NGO workers offering services to trafficked women would deny that educated Albanian women could ever prostitute themselves and would dismiss any evidence to the contrary as contrived and untrue (Davies 2001). Consequently, through various opportunity costs, these presumptions contribute to preventing some trafficked women from receiving what they would probably consider to be more valuable assistance particularly with regard to securing residency in a destination country.

#### 1.4.4 *Trafficking as an organised crime problem*

Trafficking is represented as a major international crime enterprise that generates income only surpassed by the illicit trade in drugs and weapons (Noble 2001; Flamm 2003; Dobriensky 2005). However, for several years this dubious place in the hierarchy of criminal profits has been contested by the supposed profits of illegal trading in wildlife.

Dick Smith, former deputy of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), ranks the animal trade as the world's third most lucrative contraband. (Roberts 1996)

With an annual turnover of approximately \$ 10bn, wildlife is third only to guns and drugs in the world of illegal trade. (Rocha 2005)

It is possible that laying claim to third place in the hierarchy of criminal profits is simply a device intended to create moral panic around a criminal issue. Chomsky and Herman (1994) have argued extensively that similar claims have been used to manufacture consent that an issue requires radical intervention from the state. Best and Victor (1989, 1998) have also documented how social constructionists have regularly inflated statistics to create a moral panic. Social constructionists produce ideas which may appear to be natural and obvious to those who accept them, but in reality they are an invention or artifice of a particular culture or group. These social constructions can be deliberate human inventions that impose or overlay a certain idea over actual events to create explanations that often serve a political agenda. The modern trafficking of women as a huge international organised-crime phenomena is probably the re-emergence of an old and well-documented moral panic known as 'the white slave trade'<sup>17</sup> that had previously provoked similar concerns during a period of mass migration to North America (Irwin 1996; Derks 2000; Doezema 2000). However, that episode did not result in the development of an adequate theory to explain the phenomenon (Derks 2000; Doezema 2000) and eventually public interest subsided as the more extreme aspects of this form of trafficking eventually appeared to be no more than the creation of racist or otherwise ill-informed sources (Feldman 1967). This racialised moral panic reoccurred in Orleans, France, in 1969 when a rumour that Jewish dress shop owners were abducting women into sexual slavery created widespread alarm, but once again this moral panic was exposed as a racist fabrication (Morin 1971). Langum (1994) argues that the white-slave trade panic was engineered by moral campaigners in what Victor (1998) described as an example of the way an interest group socially constructs a moral panic to further their political agenda.

Trafficking is presented by governments and international agencies as a major organised crime problem that even threatens the security of the state (Widgren 1994; ICMPD 1999; Ashcroft 2003). Trafficking, often assumed to be the trafficking of women for prostitution, is supposed to generate billions of dollars in illegal income every year for organised criminal groups. 'Trafficking brings annual incomes to the gangster syndicates in the magnitude of at least US \$ 5-7 billion a year' (Widgren 1994: 9).

Europol<sup>18</sup> and the UN are repeatedly quoted as estimating that trafficking earns between five and seven billions dollars annually for organised crime (STT2 2003; UNODC 2004; NCJW 2005). However, Feingold's trafficking statistics project at UNESCO suggests that these statistics are unjustified and are just repetitions of previous unsubstantiated claims (UNESCO 2004). The origin of the seven billion dollar figure of annual organised crime profits goes back to a paper presented by Jonas Widgren, director of the International Centre for Migration and Policy Development (ICMPD),<sup>19</sup> at an IOM conference in 1994 (Widgren 1994). Widgren's methodology for approximating this criminal income was to take various European estimates for those asylum seekers who supposedly had no genuine need of protection and other irregular migrants and then to presume a certain percentage had used the services of traffickers. He then supported the validity of this figure by considering the European number of arrested traffickers and the migrants they had been caught smuggling as suggesting the original estimate to be sound. Using what was known about smuggling fees, he created an average payment to traffickers in Europe of between \$ 2,000-\$ 5,000.

That implies that approximately between 40,000-100,000 of the illegal migrants and some 60,000-120,000 of the non-deserving asylum-applicants made use of the services of traffickers at least at some point of the journey, e.g. to obtain a forged document, to pass the green border, or to receive general advice. This would amount to a total of 100,000-220,000 aliens who in 1993 irregularly arrived to Western European States with the help of traffickers. (Widgren 1994: 9)

These figures were then extrapolated for annual world trafficking income. While this figure is based on substantial assumptions regarding the use of traffickers by irregular migrants, it is not a figure for the income of organised criminal traffickers in women for prostitution, but seems to be more an estimation of income from the smuggling of migrants. This conflation between the smuggling of migrants and the trafficking of migrants is a common problem among law enforcement agencies that will often equate trafficking with illegal immigration. However, this figure is often presented by organisations such as the UN and Europol and assumed to be the income generated annually from the trafficking of women for prostitution (Europol 2004). For example, in a UN newsletter Flamm (2003) states:

Trafficking was more often associated with the illegal trade of goods across borders, namely contraband and particularly drugs.

However, over the past ten years this trade has taken a giant leap forward to include the trafficking of human beings, mainly women and children. Often tricked into believing they will be given legitimate work, these people soon find themselves caught in a web of exploitation and deceit, ending up in the sex trade, which generates funds that exceed the amount made in the drug trade, estimated at between \$ 6 billion and \$ 7 billion per year. (Flamm 2003)

More recently, Belser (2005) of ILO has made a systematic attempt to estimate the global profits from trafficked people in commercial sexual exploitation and has proposed a figure of almost \$ 29 billion each year. He has calculated his figure on a presumption about the cost of a typical sex act in various regions of the world; however, a principal source for helping establish this estimate was a worldwide guide for men who buy sex (Belser 2005). This guide overwhelmingly represents payments made by sex tourists to sex workers, yet such men represent a small minority of trafficked women's clients and they usually pay a significant premium (Chant 1995; Brown 2000). Therefore, it is quite possible that Belser's estimate is a substantial overestimate.

Trafficking is often understood as a serious law enforcement problem and trafficked people are seen as a strange mix of 'illegal' migrants and coerced victims. This creates a bizarre paradox in which law enforcement agencies are both arresting and deporting trafficked women as illegal aliens, working illegally as prostitutes while also co-opting the language of human rights to accelerate a highly emotive 'war on pimps' and exploiters (Crouse 2003). Women who do not assist in the prosecution of their traffickers are then seen as accomplices in the trafficking trade and as such are treated as illegal migrants or even prosecuted as traffickers (Bindel 2004; Agustin 2005). Wijers and Lap-Chew (1999) identify this paradox as a major problem in addressing trafficking harm.

Possibly the greatest objection is that within this approach the focus moves from violence against women to illegality. When 'trafficking' is defined by illegal migration or residence, both the element of violence and abuse and the gender specific character of 'trafficking in women' disappear from sight. The crime then becomes illegal entry or residence, i.e. infraction of state laws, rather than violence against women, i.e. violation of woman's rights. In this perspective, rather than the women, the state is the 'victim', namely of migrants who want to enter the country illegally and of smugglers who help these migrants. It thus transforms the women concerned from victims who need to be empowered in relation to 'traffickers' into collaborators with these



‘traffickers’. Here, it is not the fact that women are forced, abused or deceived that is defined as the basic problem, but migration itself, whether legal or illegal. (Wijers & Lap-Chew 1999: 40)

An interesting aspect of trafficking and law enforcement with regard to trafficking from the Balkans to the EC is noted by Europol in their trafficking organisation analysis. It is Europol’s belief that the organised criminals who are usually involved in trafficking are loosely associated with small groups of people who engage in a variety of irregular migration activities and that these groups contain a number of women who have moved from being trafficking victims to being traffickers (Europol 2004; Europol 2005; Kirby 2005). Therefore the idea that highly organised and hierarchical mafias (Zalisko 2003) are deliberately engaged in subverting the states’ control over immigration so as to control hundreds of thousands of women in prostitution in return for immense profits are probably exaggerated. The new definition that now constructs transnational organised crime or ‘mafia’ are so general that any irregular migration network can be recast as a ‘mafia’. Conflating such simple ‘mafia’ with traditional notions of well organised and hierarchal criminal organisations is misleading and promotes the moral panic that surrounds trafficking.

The Transnational Convention dealing with organised crime, of which the trafficking protocol is a supplement, defines an organised criminal organisation as:

Organized criminal group shall mean a structured group of three or more persons, existing for a period of time and acting in concert with the aim of committing one or more serious crimes or offences established in accordance with this Convention, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit ... (UN 2001)

This group becomes an International Criminal Organisation if its crime activity:

- (a) is committed in more than one State;
- (b) is committed in one State but a substantial part of its preparation, planning, direction or control takes place in another State;
- (c) is committed in one State but involves an organized criminal group that engages in criminal activities in more than one State; or
- (d) is committed in one State but has substantial effects in another State. (UN 2001)

Consequently, many migrants’ networks with their transnational links and who assist others with various forms of irregular migration have

unwittingly become international criminal organisations. This new immigration status of being a member of the 'mafia' has reconstructed the networks of irregular migrants to fit with the presumptions of various interested groups including many politicians and journalists who believe that such networks represent moral and criminal dangers to society and more recently a growing security threat (Specter 1998; Schloenhardt 1999; Ashcroft 2003; Dobriansky 2005; Oxman-Martinez, Hanley et al. 2005). The UN Convention dealing with Transnational Organised Crime (UN 2001) has created a framework by which the governments of developed countries of destination can co-opt other governments into their agenda for immigration control. It can be imagined that the law enforcement assault on trafficking is expected to disrupt a wide range of irregular migration networks that are not specific to trafficking. Therefore, many anti-trafficking law enforcement initiatives (Daly 2001; UNICRI 2001) are considered to be really generalised immigration control measures paraded as anti-trafficking interventions (Adams 2003; Chapkis 2003) some commentators even refer to trafficking as a 'Trojan Horse' for anti-immigration policies (Marshall & Thatun 2005).

#### 1.4.5 *Trafficking as a migration problem*

Trafficking as a migration-related problem has been subjected to an increasing contest between academics and researchers including Salt and Stein (1997, 2000) who have examined trafficking as a form of vulnerability in migration that can be understood and theorised according to existing migration theory and other academic commentators such as Hughes and Farley (2000, 2003) who have consistently sought to remove the mobility of any trafficked person from being a factor in constructing them as trafficked. Hughes and Farley (2000, 2003) argue that any woman entering prostitution is actually a trafficked person and as such the previous conflation of trafficking with prostitution becomes palindromic and all prostitution is reversed into trafficking.

If mobility is removed from any consideration of trafficking and the trafficked are conflated into a presumed homogeneous mass whose commonalties no longer need to include mobility then it could be expected that the trafficked and particularly women trafficked into prostitution would in reality become all of those who are the prostituted. Their migration experiences would become increasing invisible and even trivialised by being irrelevant to the essential condition of their trafficking/into prostitution. Agustín (2006) specifically comments on this disappearance of the migrant who sells sex from migration studies and calls for migration academics to proactively research such migrants, Black (2003) has previously expressed the need for migration

researchers to develop methods to research effectively trafficked migrants. Earlier research studies by Koser and Van Hear (2002) that considered the role of traffickers in directing refugee flows and other work by Collyer (2001, 2005) and Engbersen and Van der Leun (1998) that have an application to understanding the experiences of vulnerable irregular migrants and migration agents have been almost entirely eclipsed by a myriad of reports that restrict the understanding of trafficking to the sexual exploitation of women and children (IMADR 1998; Renton 2001; Interpol 2004; IOM 2004; Ren 2004; IOM 2006)

The research of trafficking as a migration problem has been led by IOM and since the early 1990's IOM has regularly discovered trafficking as a migration problem in every country where it has undertaken research on the issue (2000; 2001; 2003; 2003). This evidence has then been used to support the introduction of anti-trafficking legislation and activities intended to overcome trafficking as a migration problem (IOM 2001). Often restrictions on the mobility of certain women according to age and nationality have been the response to trafficking as a problem. Dubai has restrictions on the issuance of visa to young unmarried Russian women or young Russian women travelling without their husbands, these restrictions are presented as anti-trafficking measures; however, no such restrictions exist for young women from the EC (Al Jandaly 2005). This differential suggests that trafficking when examined as a migration problem often becomes a racialised phenomenon that uses ethnicity and gender to mark certain women as weak and their mobility as a vector for criminal enterprise.

Altink (1995), Wijers and Lap-Chew (1999) and others consider that trafficking as a migration problem could be mitigated by accessible and affordable migration in that if women could move without resorting to traffickers then they would be less likely to be entrapped during their migration (Friebel & Guriev 2002). However, Adams (2003) considers trafficking to be deliberately constructed as a special migration problem so that oppressive measures can be taken against the mobility of women that would also impact on other irregular migrants. Marshall (2001) specifically identifies trafficking concerns as a Trojan horse that are used to introduce measures intended to restrict all forms of irregular migration.

Laczko and Thompson (2000) and Kempadoo et al. (2005) have sought to examine trafficking specifically as a migration problem and to establish whether trafficking deserves to be considered anymore than a common form of vulnerability or exploitative experience of any migration flow. Doezema (2000) and Irwin (1996) have further questioned the notion of trafficking as a migration problem and suggested that it is a socially constructed moral panic recreated out of the white slave trade myths.

The conceptualisation of trafficking as a migration problem can probably best be resolved by extending the work of Koser (1997) Salt and Stein (1997) to establish if migration theory can satisfactorily offer explanations for trafficking events and experiences. Those aspects of trafficking that can then be adequately explained or understood through migration theory could then be considered migration related. The importance of adequately explaining trafficking experiences through extension or application of migration theory would also speak directly to the issues raised by Agustín (2006). Such explanations would specifically legitimise the continued examination of trafficking by migration researchers and would also challenge those other conceptualisations that seek to disregard or minimise the role of migration theory in explaining trafficking.

### 1.5 Trafficking harms

The harms that are usually associated with trafficking are typically related to forced labour and are normally assumed to be inflicted upon the trafficked people by traffickers. Harms are often described in terms of being unable to have control over the terms and conditions of the labour; as such, a woman might be unable to desist from sex work because of threats or actual violence. It is also usually assumed that trafficked women are unable to choose their clients and are required to offer sex without the protection of condoms and receive little or no share of the money they earn (De Stoop 1992; Campani 1998; CHRC 2001; Diamantopoulou 2001; Bindel 2004).

Trafficked women and children cannot negotiate condom use.  
(Daywalka 2006)

All sex workers are at very high risk of AIDS exposure, but children and trafficked women are especially vulnerable, as their ability to negotiate condom use with clients is virtually nonexistent. (Burkhalter 2004)

However, not all the harms experienced during a trafficking episode are directly inflicted on the trafficked person by traffickers. There is a growing consideration that men who buy sexual services from trafficked women are responsible for inflicting harm on trafficked women (Hughes 2002; Bennett 2005). Trafficked women also report being harmed by law enforcement agents, NGOs and clients (Hindu 2002; Empower 2003).

Being a trafficked person will often mean that a person is an irregular migrant and subject to arrest and deportation, outside some limited programmes related to the rescue of trafficked women and the prosecution of their exploiters (IOM 1996; Futo & Jandl 2004). While it is widely recognised that someone can legally enter a country and then become trafficked (Inglis 2003; Corrin 2004; US SD 2005), there is almost no conceptualisation that an irregularly trafficked person can cease to be trafficked without some official intervention, although this possibility is considered in the work of a Bangladeshi trafficking conceptualisation project (Bangladesh Thematic Group 2004). More important than any theoretical consideration is the fact that a person who is compelled to irregularly enter a country as a trafficked person and who then leaves the trafficking episode and is no longer a trafficked person will become an illegal migrant. Such a person loses the few protections that might have been afforded them if they had come to the attention of the authorities as a trafficked person. There is increasing attention being given to separating trafficked persons from smuggled people for the purposes of ensuring that while trafficked people might be victims, smuggled people are definitely criminals complicit in their illegal migration (HSTC 2005; US SD 2005). Therefore, most trafficked people who can resolve their own trafficking harms and leave the trafficking episode will become criminals, unless they can regularise their immigration status by some means. This would seem to be an inequitable extra burden to place upon trafficked people who achieve solutions without any official intervention.

## 1.6 Stereotypes in trafficking and female migration

Linkages between the increasing interest in the mobility of poor women and trafficking risks can be complex and opaque. Not all such linkages are necessarily based on an altruistic concern for the welfare of poor women, but that they can also represent more opportunistic attempts to link concerns about trafficking to other areas of political or social concern. Migration theory did not seem to be able to adequately predict or explain European migration events once the demise of Communist CEE, and the Soviet Union allowed for the increased mobility of many millions of relatively poorer people close to the richer European Community. The CEE and Commonwealth of Independent States formed a large region including many poor people and especially large numbers of impoverished woman. These poor people were expected to respond to economic inequality by migrating in huge numbers to Western Europe (Aron 1991; Samorodov 1991). Prior to the collapse of the Communist powers in CEE and what has become the CIS, the world's poor

were popularly considered by Western Europeans as distant others: the poor were in Africa, Asia or South America, and these were thought of as far away places (Chambers 1997; Singer 2004).

The resurgence of interest in trafficking in Europe has followed these expectations of increased mass migration from the former communist states during the 1990s. The poor woman from the CEE or CIS is an iconic representative of the woman supposed vulnerable to trafficking abuse. The migration of this woman to the EC has become central to modern trafficking accounts. Therefore, her every movement could be subject to new and repressive controls intended to protect her from trafficking harm through greater controls over her mobility. This use of a fear of trafficking as a contrived means to subject poor women to restrictions on their mobility has been recognised as the intended outcome of some actions presented as 'protective'. Human Rights Watch (2000) and others have added calls to ensure women's right to mobility when addressing trafficking issues. In documents calling for action on trafficking human rights, groups have included the following demands:

Finally, one human right cannot be traded for another: efforts to combat trafficking must not discriminate against women and must be consistent with the protection of women's right to freedom of movement and travel. (HRW 2000)

Measures designed to limit women's legal entry into countries of destination should be carefully weighed against their disadvantages as they pertain to potential immigrants and women. In particular, measures that are designed to protect women by limiting their access to legal migration or increasing the requirements associated with such migration should be assessed in terms of the potential for discriminatory impact and the potential for increasing the likelihood that women consequently may be subjected to trafficking. (WCAR 2001)

After 1990, Western Europe discovered its close poor. The female migrant from the CEE or CIS stands at the nexus of several competing disciplines, with each discipline seeking to produce compelling knowledge of her experience. These disciplines seem more than willing to speak for the female migrant while ignoring much of the knowledge produced by the migrant herself (Agustin 2005). The production of knowledge regarding the female migrant is therefore contested and is often used mutually exclusively of other knowledge regarding migrants or women (Doezema 2000; Agustin 2003). The female migrant from the CEE or CIS is much more than the sum of her parts, but she is often reduced to a series of stereotypes by populist representations of

trafficking (Toynbee 2003; Malarek 2004; Dobriansky 2005). In repeated accounts, the typical stereotype of the young CEE or CIS migrant as naïve and vulnerable travelling abroad to be a waitress forms the most common representation in discussions of trafficking.

Irina was 18 when she left her home in Chisinau, capital of Moldavia, lured by the promise of a job as a waitress in Milan ... Irina is one of many Natashas, as east European prostitutes are called, and her fate is that of thousands of women from the region. (Loncle 2001)

Irina, like most trafficked women, was duped into coming to Britain and held under threat of violence to her and her family. She was 'excited' when she landed a job as a waitress in London, after replying to a newspaper advertisement in Vilnius. (Harri-son 2005)

Katya, with a two-year-old daughter and a failing marriage in the Czech Republic, followed the advice of a 'friend' that she could make good money as a waitress in the Netherlands ... Katya was taken to a brothel. (US SD 2003)

Anahit said, 'I went to Dubai to work as a waitress ... When I arrived in Dubai, I understood that I had been tricked. They beat me, forced me to go out on the street and find clients.' (Zakaryan 2005)

Olga and Maria came here because they were promised a job in Italy or in Germany. Usually they have been offered the 'opportunity' of living or working abroad as a ... a waitress ... (IOM 2002)

Based on the stereotypes of vulnerable naïve women, the female migrants from the CEE and CIS are often considered to represent the essential element of a new and catastrophic dimension in new migration, which supposes that tens of thousands of women from the European poor are migrating annually into various degrees of sexual slavery in the EC (Gradin 1996; Giammarinaro 2002). Yet, in Albania, the CEE and even countries such as France, working as a waitress is often a cover for sex-work activities; so, offers to work as a waitress could be understood as not entirely innocuous by even the most naïve young women. Even Malarek (2004) concedes that many job adverts are obvious trafficking devices that advertise work in prostitution.

It doesn't take a rocket scientist to read a newspaper ad and see it for what it really is – a trafficking trap. (Malarek 2004: 260)

... Another category is that of the girls of the coffee bars that stay for entire hours in the bars and pubs 'fishing' the clients. They are young attractive girls and do not look like prostitutes ... the girls work in the bar or pub mainly as waitresses. (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 14)

Most parents expect a 'good girl' to have an opinion similar to Aurora's. She is an 18-year-old high school student in Durrës (Albania). She knows a girl from her neighbourhood who has spent five years in Italy as a 'waitress'. 'I see her walking around our neighbourhood and I want to spit on her when I think she has had sex with 20 to 30 men a day,' Aurora said. (MDI 2002)

By the early 1870s Paris sported a new style of Brasseries where young ladies employed as waitresses were directed to entertain their customers for the purpose of increasing sales ... later the waitress would attempt to sleep with the patron for money. The money from the act of prostitution and payment of drinks went straight to the bar. What made this element of prostitution so successful was the way the waitresses handled the situation ... the waitress would appear to be innocent and overtaken by the madness of love and make the patron feel as if she was being seduced ... in fact every element of the transaction was carefully planned and executed by an experienced prostitute. The Brasseries became well known for these activities and became ever popular in Paris. (Smith 1997)

The *konzumlány*, or 'consumption girls' working in Hungarian bars and restaurants, are the modern equivalent of the women documented by Smith (1997) and they are notorious for their elaborate over-pricing scams as well as being officially waitresses and unofficially prostitutes (Dóczy 2003).

The stereotype of the coerced or deceived innocent is contested by those who would emphasise the agency and economic motivation of such women to engage in sex work as a rational if also risky occupation (Sullivan 1995; Bindman & Doezema 1998; Andrijasevic 2003; Agustin 2005).

Various actors seek to explain the CEE and CIS female migrant through the production of knowledge about her and her migration experiences. The trafficking discourse was initially dominated by state actors who initially considered the trafficked person an illegal immigrant who should be deported (Ghosh 1998; Beare 1999; Williams 1999;



Friebel & Guriev 2002). This blunt approach has been challenged by actors active in the NGO sector such as Bales (1999), Hughes (1999) and others who have separated out trafficked people, especially women as a class of enslaved victims who need to be rescued and provided with alternatives to sexual slavery (Galiana 2000). Another group of actors led by Overs and Longo have also been active in producing knowledge about trafficked women; they have supported notions regarding the agency and rationale of women who engage in sex work as a form of labour (Overs & Longo 1997; Bindman & Doezema 1998; Longo 2004). Therefore, it is no surprise that trafficked women are usually understood as the victims of sex slavery or as conniving illegal and immoral immigrant prostitutes or as determined but disadvantaged sex workers just wanting to make some money (Beare 1999; Agustin 2005). It is hardly possible to find a discourse that moves outside these preset positions although Anderson (2003), Kempadoo et al. (2005) have attempted to develop more nuanced and complex understandings of such migrant women, but women who cannot be explained by these theories are usually left invisible as are the large numbers of women who leave these stereotypes for other situations (Agustin 2005).

## 1.7 Anti-trafficking legislation

Agencies such as Europol represent trafficking as a low risk endeavour for the traffickers:

Trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation is one of the most lucrative organised crime activities and in general remains a low risk – high reward enterprise for the traffickers. (Europol 2004)

This presumption is then regularly repeated by the media and other commentators.

Trafficking young women is as profitable as drugs and arms sales but without the same risks. (McGivering 2005)

The trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation is a high-profit, low-risk trade for those who organize it ... (Phinney 2001)

The trafficking of persons is a law-enforcement priority of Interpol, Europol and the US Justice Department (Ashcroft 2003; UNIO 2004; Europol 2005), which uses the annual Trafficking in Persons report<sup>20</sup>

to prompt prioritisation of the issue with other agencies and the international community (US SD 2000). The TIP reports are widely considered to have been increasingly compromised by political bias (Hughes 2002; LaShawn 2003; Shifter 2004; Stapp 2005). Consequently, grade three countries now tend to include the public enemies of the US, e.g. Cuba, North Korea, Burma and Venezuela (US SD 2005), while politically friendly countries with significant trafficking problems such as Pakistan and India often escape appropriate condemnation (HRW 2002). The problems of the TIP report with particular regard to its use of unsubstantiated statistics and inadequate country narratives have been the subject of severe criticism by the US Government Accountability Office (GAO 2006).

Furthermore, the French and the British governments, as well as many others, are criminalising any act that might assist an irregular migrant (O'Connell 1996; Fekete 2001). As such any activity that can be prosecuted as trafficking is increasingly attracting severe penalties and with increased law enforcement actions is becoming an increasingly risky activity. Together with the obligations relating to the UN trafficking protocol, there has been a recent flurry of punitive anti-trafficking legislation. However, the governments of the UK, Ukraine, Hungary have specifically introduced legislation that confines the issue of trafficking to the procurement of women for migratory prostitution (Levchenko 1998; Kosztolanyi 1999; Home Office 2003).

In South Asia, the SAARC<sup>21</sup> convention addressing trafficking has also deliberately reduced trafficking to the criminalising of migratory prostitution (SAARC 2002; STC 2003). Such legislation creates an environment in which the mobility of poor women is constantly suspect (Daly 2001) and anyone associated with such movement might be construed as a criminal trafficker (IHRC 2000a; IHRC 2000b). The US, like many other states, has also introduced legislation that inflicts heavy penalties for various trafficking crimes, while Bangladesh has even introduced the death penalty for traffickers. Therefore, the idea that trafficking is still a crime that can be considered low risk for those organised criminals who are specifically targeted by these laws is no longer true. With increasing resources being directed towards enforcing trafficking laws (OMCTIP 2003; US DJ 2004) there is an increasing expectation that traffickers will be caught and prosecuted (HRF 2002; Wong 2002).

## 1.8 Trafficking as a power contest

An exceptional departure from the normative methods for considerations of trafficking is represented by the work of Foucault (1991) and

Butler (1999). Although their work does not offer a complete theory for explaining vulnerability in trafficking it does offer radical alternatives for considering how power is used by various actors to dominate trafficked women and how resistance to exploitation might be made more effective (Foucault 1991, 1993; Butler 1999). If, as Foucault suggests, modern power has replaced pre-modern brutal violence and physical repression with more subtle and effective modes of domination represented by various social science technologies (Foucault 1991; Butler 1999), the present contest for control over trafficked women could be seen as representing a contest between pre-modern methods of domination and the modern systems of discipline and control. The contest between organised crime and actors such as NGOs and governments would then not be a contest to seek emancipation for the trafficked women from the supposed pre-modern dominance of the criminals but the various groups would be competing to dominate the bodies of trafficked women.

Fraser (1989) documents aspects of this possible contest and specifically considers how various actors that supposedly oppose pre-modern dominance actually support and manipulate such processes for their own ends. This study explores this possible contest and how the competitors might be engaging in a struggle for domination over trafficked women. The study also considered for what purpose these competitors seek this control rather than the personal emancipation of the women concerned (Fraser 1989). However, Fraser's suspicions regarding the real goals of the claimed altruistic actors seem to reflect Hayek's (1944) free-market analysis of ethical behaviours and control being driven by personal or partisan interests.

The means by which power is exerted over the trafficked women represents various contests. Exploiting men supposedly rely on traditional power such as physical violence (Raufer & Quéré 2000; Choudhury 2003; Kirby 2005) while the state and most other actors depend on law enforcement agencies to forcibly dispossess the organised criminal and turn over the women involved to their control (De Stoop 1992; Wong 2002). ILO recognises this disingenuous paradox by which the trafficked person is not liberated or emancipated, but just transferred to another controlling agency:

Law Enforcement Agencies may simply move trafficked people from one system of control to another – from being controlled by traffickers to being controlled by law enforcement officials. (ILO 2003: 14)

Therefore, there is a need to examine if any of these interventions are welcomed by a trafficked person or whether such action is just a matter

of a change of controlling agent from traffickers to law enforcement or NGO. Possession of trafficked women's bodies affords criminal men money; disposition of those bodies allow states to demonstrate their rights to control their borders; possession of the voices of trafficked women offer others power to influence policy on gender, migration and other social issues. The benefit to trafficked women of such circumstances should be examined more thoroughly to see what, if any, benefits accrue to the trafficked women. It would be of considerable interest if an audit of benefits was to credit the traffickers with offering more significant benefits for trafficked women than the other contestants.

### **1.9 Homogeneous trafficking**

The present trafficking discourse is filled with young women who are trafficked as teenagers, but for whom it is supposed that they are still essentially the same social person experiencing the migration and trafficking episode in the same way at the age of twenty or 25. It is assumed that they are members of a homogeneous group about whom it is possible to make substantial generalisations across considerations of age, race, education, ethnicity, social class and numerous other criteria (Malarek 2004). There is no substantial consideration in the main literature on trafficking regarding any significant heterogeneity among trafficked women or whether the experiences of trafficked women occur for different reasons. Considerations of heterogeneity among the trafficked women constitutes a significant part of this study; any heterogeneity was examined to see if such diversity can be better explained by reference to different migration theories rather than trafficking being explained by a single conceptualisation.

### **1.10 Understanding and researching trafficking**

It is widely acknowledged that the irregular movement of women into trafficking harm has not been adequately researched (Salt & Hogarth 2000; Kelly 2005; Laczko 2005) and that there is a compelling need for research that might better inform our understanding of this phenomenon. Statistics and other quantitative data regarding trafficking is widely contested and acknowledged to be in need of considerable improvement (Salt 2000; Kelly 2002; Laczko 2002).

Qualitative research among women who have experienced trafficking harm prior to them being removed from such harm by typically a law enforcement or non-governmental rescue intervention is practically unknown, but Agustín (2005), Kempadoo (2001) and Anderson (2003)

have written about the lives of trafficked women while such women have been inside their trafficking experience. The ethnographic work of Andrijasevics (2004) was with trafficked women who had left their trafficking episode and who were no longer in sex work, offers significant insight into how trafficked women reflected on their experiences.

However, the almost exclusive use of women who have been rescued or removed from a suspected trafficking episode usually by a law enforcement agency, as the cohort for researching women's experiences of trafficking is fraught with difficulties (Koser 2000; Kelly 2002). Consequently, the work of many qualitative researchers looking at trafficking harm, including Berman (2003), Scharie (2003) and Lesko (2005) are burdened by the serious methodological and design issues recognised by Koser (2000) in his research among trafficked refugees. This considers that these subjects, prior to engagement with the researcher have often had to present themselves as a trafficking victims to avoid possible legal sanctions regarding their migration status and must therefore subsequently maintain that particular presentation (Koser 2000).

Trafficked women must also manage the stigma related to involvement in sex work and claims that their involvement was compelled, are often considered by such women to mitigate such stigma and to possibly gain them more sympathetic treatment from the authorities and others. Kelly (2002) rightly prioritises the need to develop new and more effective methods by which research on trafficking might be conducted (Kelly 2002). However, Barry (1979) is of the opinion that research among trafficked women is not possible while they remain in a trafficking episode.

... traditional methods employed by those who study social life were of little use. One cannot, for example, find a sample population of sexual slaves, survey them, and then generalize from the results. Nor is participant observation a possibility. And interviewing those held in slavery is impossible. (Barry 1979: 6)

In spite of the documented difficulties in researching trafficked people, this study demonstrates how it is possible with certain populations of trafficked women to engage with them over considerable periods of time; effectively observe and even assist them with overcoming trafficking harm.

### 1.10.1 *Theoretical lacunae*

The many gaps in our understanding of trafficking are widely known. These gaps have generated a number of papers explaining the urgent need to undertake research that can better explain trafficking (Salt &

Hogarth 2000; Kelly 2005; Laczko 2005). IOM has consistently acknowledged for more than a decade that there are considerable gaps in our knowledge regarding trafficking and that research of women who are going through a trafficking episode is unknown (Laczko 2002). In 2005, IOM still saw trafficking as an inadequately researched aspect of migration beset by methodological problems preventing its adequate investigation (IOM 2005).

We need longer-term research, using more comprehensive approaches, and involving both countries of origin and countries of destination. Trafficking crosses so many disciplinary and mandate boundaries that there need for both more interdisciplinary research and research which looks at trafficking issues from a range of different perspectives, including migration, human rights, health, law enforcement, and the like ... If our understanding of trafficking is to improve, we also need to find ways to generate much better data and indicators of the problem. (Laczko 2005: 14)

The manifold gaps in our knowledge regarding trafficking have been known for several years. However, researchers have been unable to devise adequate methods for researching trafficked people, except for those women who have been rescued by various law enforcement agencies and who consequently form an unrepresentative sample. Therefore, this work is certainly original and novel in its research of women during their trafficking episodes.

### 1.11 Conclusion

This chapter has introduced trafficking as a reoccurring concern regarding the mobility and sexuality of poor women. The chapter has considered the most common definitions in use regarding trafficking and has established a working definition for use in the work. The current gaps in research regarding trafficking have been identified and the usual approaches to conceptualising trafficked were discussed. Certain stereotypes and common assumptions have been described and in particular the supposed altruistic intentions of some actors have been opened for investigation. Explanations for how traffickers exercise power and who traffickers contest with for control of the trafficked women have been flagged for further consideration and comment. The notion that some trafficked women knowingly use trafficking as a departure strategy is also presented as a possibility.

The chapter identifies the possibility that trafficking has been poorly conceptualised because of inadequate and even flawed research and that better research could offer the possibility of refining economic and migration theory so trafficking could be better explained. The chapter specifically presents trafficking as a wide continuum of issues that needs to be better understood and analysed if trafficking is to be properly theorised as a migration-related event. The possibility that trafficked women are not a homogeneous group and that different typologies can be identified suggests that there is uncertainty about who is trafficked and why. Such uncertainty calls for better ways to theorise different groups of trafficked women. In the later chapters I seek to offer improved ways of theorising trafficking and how to overcome some of these identified problems.

The next chapter presents the methodology that was developed to enable this research to consider the wide continuum of trafficking issues about the particular experiences of the researched women.

## **1.12 Chapter outlines**

Chapter 2 addresses the ethical and methodological issues raised by this study and the design of the research. It addresses in considerable depth why I rejected the most common current method of researching trafficked women, in favour of an urban anthropological approach that was designed around participatory action research methods that were intended to promote 'conscientisation' among the research group. This chapter also explains the cultural advocacy method and how the researched were included as researchers.

Chapter 3 considers if trafficking can be better analysed if considered as a crisis in a transitional migration order. It investigates the conceptualisations of trafficking that result in the invisibility of many trafficked women and why most typical responses to trafficking fail to reduce trafficking. The chapter identifies the most commonly identified focal problem in trafficking and considers whether it is adequate for conceptualising trafficking. The chapter develops an analytical matrix as a tool for examining trafficking as a crisis in a transitional migration order using Van Hears' model regarding migration orders.

Chapter 4 examines issues of gender and poverty in Albania and considers their impact upon trafficking. It also examines the pre-migration and migration decision-making experiences of the researched women and documents how different typologies of women were recruited into trafficking. The chapter considers the major assumptions that dominate how Albanian trafficking is understood and challenges the validity of these assumptions. The chapter proposes that as knowledge

of trafficking practices increased, many women began to deliberately use trafficking as a mobility strategy.

Chapter 5 describes modern Albanian migrations and the migration routes used by the researched women to reach France. The chapter also documents the sexual economy in Lyon. The chapter introduces the role of trafficking networks in controlling the researched women and the beginning of resistance to trafficking. The chapter considers the role of social networks and their linkages to trafficking.

Chapter 6 describes the role of the men including exploiters, lovers and clients who were associated with women. This chapter also carefully examines the role of the vice police in the lives of the researched women. It carefully documents and analyses how the traffickers sustained the migration of the women in Lyon and how changes in the typology of the women being trafficked created a crisis in the trafficking networks. The chapter reveals the most effective strategies used by the traffickers to survey and control the women and how these were first sustained and then subverted by the researched women.

Chapter 7 develops the issues raised in earlier chapters and specifically relates them to the circumstances of the different groups among the researched women. It then reviews the original questions and develops the notion of vulnerability and makes a specific contention regarding resistance, institutions and structures. It examines the social networks that are developed by the sex-working women and consider how the various networks are used by the women. It is a substantive and descriptive account of the principle research group's resistance to trafficking. The account is intended to let the researched women speak to the issues raised within the chapter and then to specifically examine the women's strategies for subverting trafficking harms.

Chapter 8 reviews the conclusions of the earlier chapters and then reviews how these conclusions could help refine policy and practice associated with trafficking. It details the discoveries made by this research and how they have challenged previous assumptions and offer better means to conceptualise trafficking. The chapter presents a new understanding of the nature of the contest for the bodies of trafficked women and how this understanding is different from the previous explanations of how some trafficked women are controlled. The chapter considers how one group of women operates within a new economic migration system, while others' involvement in trafficking can be better explained by considerations of social network explanations. This demonstrates how the trafficking matrix can help trafficking be better explained by allowing differing types of trafficking to be more easily identified and then differing theories to be used to explain the diverse trafficking typologies. The chapter concludes that conflating the experiences of the different types of women in the trafficking flow and



assuming that their experiences are homogeneous actually renders their irreconcilable experiences inexplicable. The chapter then considers how women negotiate the power contest to achieve self-solutions to trafficking harms and the implications of their success for refining theory regarding actor-oriented migration. The chapter considers the research's methodology implications for future research of trafficked women. The chapter concludes with a number of policy recommendations.



## 2 Research design and methods

Chapter 2 addresses the ethical and methodological issues raised by this study and the process by which the design of the research was completed and then implemented. These are areas of particular concern when undertaking sensitive research. Black (2003) and Collyer (2001) have identified investigations into irregular migration as being a sensitive area of research, while Lee (1993) considers that potential threats to the participants in such research require the researcher to consider these issues particularly carefully.

The chapter also briefly examines why I changed my intended location for the research and why I decided on the eventual research location in Lyon, France. It addresses in-depth why I rejected the use of cultural mediators,<sup>1</sup> the most common method of engagement with migrant sex-working women as well as the typical method of researching trafficked women, in favour of a limited urban anthropology<sup>2</sup> and ethnographic approach using a cultural advocate<sup>3</sup>. The ethnographic approach starts with selection of a culture, review of the literature pertaining to the culture (NCSU 2006). The ethnographer then goes about gaining entrance, which in turn sets the stage for cultural immersion of the ethnographer in the culture. The middle stages of the ethnographic method involve gaining informants, using them to gain yet more informants in a chaining process, and gathering of data in the form of observational transcripts and interview recordings. Data analysis and theory development come at the end, though theories may emerge from cultural immersion and theory-articulation by members of the culture (NCSU 2006). However, the ethnographic researcher strives to avoid theoretical preconceptions and instead to induce theory from the perspectives of the members of the culture and from observation. The researcher may seek validation of induced theories by going back to members of the culture for their reaction (NCSU 2006). This approach was then implemented using participatory action research methods that were intended to promote resistance and ‘conscientisation’<sup>4</sup> among the researched group. The research method used in this research was an application of Freire’s (1970) ‘conscientisation’ and dialogical methods<sup>5</sup> as an action research tool. Many researchers have used this method to investigate and undercover previously unseen or

poorly understood notions of identity among different groups (McIntyre 1997; O'Brian, 2001).

Action research ... aims to contribute both to the practical concerns of people in an immediate problematic situation and to further the goals of social science simultaneously. Thus, there is a dual commitment in action research to study a system and concurrently to collaborate with members of the system in changing it in what is together regarded as a desirable direction. Accomplishing this twin goal requires the active collaboration of researcher and client, and thus it stresses the importance of co-learning as a primary aspect of the research process. (Gilmore, Krantz et al. 1986)

Participatory action research is also known as action research and although some attempts are made to differentiate between the two as separate methods they are overwhelmingly used interchangeably by many researchers and practitioners or their definitions of the methods overlap completely in every essential aspect (Cameron 2002; Gilmore 1986; O'Brian 2001). This research method uses dialogue and open communication among participants to produce knowledge that can be used to then resist oppression (Fals-borda 1991; Freire 1999); however, some commentators such as Triantafillou and Nielson (2001) consider the method to often merely reproduce western liberal values at the expense of truly local responses to oppression.

This chapter also maps the principal working places of the researched women and identifies some of the characteristics of the two main types of women to come to Lyon.

## **2.1 Irregular migration requires irregular research methods**

This study offers an opportunity to research aspects of illegal migration which have been identified by Black (2003) as requiring further investigation, including the need for research that might explain situations of abuse, coercion or danger amongst illegal migrants. The study also offers an attempt to develop a more migrant-driven research agenda by involving the researched group in developing various aspects of the research and by reflecting the research back to the group for ongoing comment and analysis.

Black identifies the lack of evidence regarding possible negative outcomes of the criminalisation of the entry into Europe as a particular research gap, another gap in understanding is of the role of migrants in what he describes as illegal migration (Black 2003).

My research was intended to speak to both issues without confining the considerations to the improvement of security frameworks. The research also considers the issues raised by Salt and Stein (1997) in their consideration of trafficking as a business as it examines the relationships between institutions and trafficked migrants. The research method was designed to make an examination of a human behaviour that had become criminalised and to explain why actors participate in irregular migration including trafficking in the various ways they do. As understood by Black, such research is required.

We need to know why actors within trafficking ... respond in the way that they do ... as part of a process of unlocking the potential for alternatives. (Black 2003: 47)

The need for improved research methods in researching 'trafficking' is clearly stated by a number of researchers who note the inadequacy of present methods to produce quality data on trafficking.

... the later papers in this volume also highlight many weaknesses in current research and data collection on trafficking ... If our understanding of trafficking is to improve, we also need to find ways to generate much better data and indicators of the problem. (Laczko 2005: 14)

... perhaps the most significant observation to be made is the paucity of sound empirical research studies ... Again, however, there is an acute dearth of systematic studies. (Salt & Hogarth 2000: 16)

The present gaps in research regarding the experiences of trafficked women and irregular migrants were an obvious call for the development of new and effective methods for researching such groups.

Black makes comments regarding developing an agenda for research among irregular migrants.

In such circumstances, it might be unrealistic to expect a research agenda to emerge, unmediated, from within what are usually fragmented, marginalised and disenfranchised communities. Nonetheless, an actor-oriented approach remains critically relevant for work on a population that is too often assumed to consist of passive victims. At the very least, it is appropriate to seek the views of these communities and facilitate their contribution to research design. (Black 2003: 49)

Black later continues:

However, it is also arguably not the job of academic researchers to pass judgement on the legitimacy of any particular asylum claim. Rather, non-prejudicial research or, indeed, action research that is placed at the disposal of the disenfranchised can legitimately focus on process and lived experience for those whose lives have been placed on the edges of the law. (Black 2003: 50)

Concluding his considerations of research on illegal migrants, he makes a statement on a precondition for political and practical change:

Yet research needs to remain close to those whose migration is categorised as illegal in order to build the trust and understanding that can allow frank, non-prejudicial exchange. That implies building up the research capacity of marginalised groups themselves as much as studying their experience from an academic ivory tower. (Black 2003: 50)

My original research interest was to develop my particular interest to see if a conscientisation process could draw the researched women into a more effective resistance to trafficking harms by generating knowledge and skills that would then allow them to organise against trafficking harm. I wanted to see if the knowledge they produced about themselves would allow them to speak more effectively about their lives and experiences. I directly drew on the work of Paulo Freire (1970) and Fals Borda<sup>6</sup> (1969, 1991) to inform my research design and methods. It was my intention to engage the researched women in a series of dialogues regarding their lives and to discover their understanding and interpretations of what was happening to them. I then wanted to see if these women were able to articulate and propose solutions to what they saw as the problems they experienced. I was particularly interested to see if they would identify a focal problem or focal problems for their trafficking experiences.

## **2.2 Researching criminalised and vulnerable groups**

The feminisation of migration and the increasing numbers of sex-work migrants, presumed to include an unknown but large number trafficked women (Hughes & Roche 1999), is widely reported (TAMPEP 1997; EuroPAP 2000). This growing number of migrant sex working women present service providers, such as health-care providers and re-

searchers with the challenge to engage with these women. The social and cultural divide between host-culture 'service providers' and these migrant women in the various sex-work environments has left many agencies and researchers unable to engage with these migrants (Mathieu 1996; Brussa 1999). In particular, agencies that are concerned with addressing the abuse experienced by trafficked women have reported considerable difficulties in engaging with trafficked women while they are still within a sex-work environment (Bales 1999; Cabiria 2000; ADB 2003). Some commentators such as Waugh have acknowledged that it was impossible for them during their research to speak with trafficked women who were still in their trafficking episode (Waugh 2006). Andrijasevic who used an ethnographic method to investigate the trafficking experiences of women in Italy was also unable to interview women who were still in their trafficking experience and was only able to interview women after they had left the site of their trafficking harm. (Andrijasevic 2004)

As identified by Tyldum and Brunovskis (2005), most researchers only meet these women once the women are being held in some form of detention or protective custody by the authorities. Koser (2001) has noted that trafficked migrants are often required to present themselves in a limited number of ways, in the hope of avoiding prosecution or deportation; therefore, interviewing detained or constrained migrants presents serious limitations for those undertaking research. Therefore, I had to consider how it might be possible to research trafficked women in spite of such difficulties. Any possible research project would certainly require an accessible research site where my proposed participatory methods could be properly implemented.

### **2.3 The research site**

In deciding where to locate my research, I considered a number of places where I had already had contact with trafficked women as part of previous research activities or activities relating to the design of HIV prevention programmes for sex workers. These activities took place in several countries including Hungary, Romania, the Netherlands, Albania, Greece and France. The work I did in these places contributed some opportunities for comparative examination of the researched women's experiences so as to ensure that my research group had had comparable experiences to the other trafficked women I had met elsewhere, as well as being able to compare their experiences with the reported experiences of the common stereotypes.

In my original research proposal, I had intended that this research project would take place in Thessaloniki, Greece, where I had been

able to negotiate free access to a number of nightclubs where trafficked women were working. I had undertaken a number of preparatory exercises including visits to different clubs and street-working areas as well as meeting with a number of nightclub owners and trafficked women. However, when I was about to begin my research the local police arrested and detained several key informants. Other informants then became unwilling to allow me access to women that they were associated with as they were concerned that the arrests were an indication of an ongoing law enforcement initiative and that my research might compound their risks by either making information available to the police or by my presence attracting the attention of the police; therefore they withdrew their cooperation. Without the cooperation of this key group of informants my research was not possible in Thessaloniki as I would have been unable to adequately access the trafficked and other sex-working women.

I sought out a more stable and accessible population that would enable me to conduct my research. I considered this stability to be important as I wanted to be able to access the population repeatedly and over a considerable period of time so as to build trust and confidence among the researched women; such trust is considered by Black (2003) to be an important means by which to permit an equitable exchange with the researched. After reviewing my existing knowledge of various destination sites, I decided to find a research site that had a substantial population of street-working, trafficked women. My previous experience had shown that street-working women were often more accessible than women based in clubs, and as such I concentrated on locating a research site with such a street-working population. In this regard my research is more applicable to the experiences of street-working women who have been trafficked, but according to IOM and some leading Albanian NGOs working in the field, such experiences are the most common among Albanian women who have been trafficked abroad (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997; IOM 2003; IOM 2004; Lesko 2005).

### 2.3.1 *Choosing Lyon*

I had previously considered a number of other locations where I had met with Albanian migrant women, and so I looked at relocating my research to places where significant numbers of trafficked Albanian women had been reported such as Antwerp, Turin, Milan or Paris (IOM 1996; Gery 1999; US SD 2003). However, all of these locations presented various logistical problems and particularly the numbers of sex workers was either so large or so dispersed so as make it difficult to find an appropriate sample or maintain regular contact over an ex-



tended period of time. Eventually I discovered that in Lyon, France, there was a group of street-based Albanian sex workers who were estimated to be more than 150 in number and who seemed to have a core of women who used Lyon as their permanent base within the EC. Although there was an awareness of their existence, no NGO had regular contact with the women, and they had not been the particular subjects of any anti-trafficking initiatives. See Appendices H-O for information about sex work in Lyons.

I was interested in this development as Lyon has a historic place in the emergence of a sex workers' social movement in that in 1975 local sex workers occupied a church in Lyon to protest against police harassment and to demand greater respect for their civil rights (Table 2). The use of Freire's participatory methods in Lyon would be particularly interesting as they had formed the basis of this previous and failed attempt to radicalise and develop conscientisation among Lyon sex workers during the occupation of the St. Nizier church (Mathieu 2000; Mathieu 2001). This manifestation of a sex workers' social movement was supported by members of the Movement du Nid, the abolitionist organisation, who claimed to act as conscience constituents who would have no direct benefit from their intervention. Conscience constituents are the direct supporters of a movement who do not stand to benefit directly from its success, but by controlling larger resource pools than beneficiaries provide resources such as time, money and leadership to social movements (McCarthy & Zald 1997).

However, the conscience constituents that sought to develop the conscientisation of sex workers in the 1975 intervention operated according to a belief that the only rational consequence of such a conscientisation would be for the enlightened sex workers to abandon sex work (Mathieu 2000; Mathieu 2001); I believe that such a presumption broke the dialogical relationship between the supposed conscience constituents and the sex workers. This breach reduced their methodology to a didactic exercise as those conscience constituents had a very specific path that they intended the movement to adhere to regardless of any ideological evolution that might have grown out of a genuine consciousness-raising event. This research, therefore, offered an opportunity to repeat the use of 'dialogical methods' in Lyon among sex workers without such a presumption regarding possible outcomes among the researched women.

Lyon was also chosen by Grillo (1985) as a location for his urban anthropology work on the representation of immigrants in France. As such, Lyon offered an opportunity to use his studies and the account of the St. Nizier attempt at conscientisation (Mathieu 2001) to inform the design of my own methodology and how I conducted my subsequent analysis. I visited Lyon, and I undertook some rapid investigations intended to help me frame the research possibilities; and I also sought to

establish some initial impressions of the trafficked women. I discovered that there were approximately 30 to 40 Albanian sex workers and a very few other women from other CEE and CIS counties working on the streets. The group represented itself as considering Lyon their main place of residence in the EC and that it was their intention to remain in Lyon for sometime. Most of the women were in an irregular migration status and had travelled irregularly to France. They reported a wide range of trafficking harms, and most said that they would be willing to take part in a research project intended to examine and better explain their experiences. I considered this to be an excellent opportunity to study an entire population of Albanian trafficked women in a particular location who were reporting a variety of trafficking harms, and as such, I made arrangements to transfer my research to Lyon.

## 2.4 The researched group

The researched group consisted of 58 women who were in Lyon for various periods of time during the fieldwork period. The fieldwork period ran from October 1999 until June 2001. The researched women had divided themselves into a variety of social groups. These groups were often defined by the relationships of the men associated with the various women and relationships that had consequently developed among the women. The group was varied in that the women came from rural and urban families and their educational attainment was also varied. Some women had children; others did not. Some had previously migrated internally before leaving Albania, while others had travelled directly to the EC from their place of origin.

Most reported experiences of violence and exploitation apart from any other harm experienced in trafficking. The women were mainly aged between eighteen and 27, with three young women aged between sixteen and eighteen appearing briefly during the research period; very occasionally a woman over 30 would appear in the group (see Table 2.1).

I documented the women and their attributes in a social matrix<sup>7</sup> (Appendix H) that I then used to create the tables in this study. However, I quickly identified two main types of women who came to dominate the research; these were the women who considered themselves married to their exploiter and those who were not married to their exploiter (see Table 2.2) and who were in a contractual work relationship.

### 2.4.1 *The wives*

The 'wives' were those researched women who considered themselves 'married' to their *Çuni*.<sup>8</sup> However, 'marriage' did not necessarily mean

**Table 2.1** *Arrival age of the researched*

| Age   | Frequency of age | %   |
|-------|------------------|-----|
| 16    | 2                | 3   |
| 17    | 1                | 2   |
| 18    | 3                | 5   |
| 19    | 7                | 12  |
| 20    | 14               | 24  |
| 21    | 3                | 5   |
| 22    | 4                | 7   |
| 23    | 9                | 16  |
| 24    | 4                | 7   |
| 25    | 4                | 7   |
| 26    | 2                | 3   |
| 27    | 1                | 2   |
| 28    | 1                | 2   |
| 29    | 1                | 2   |
| 33    | 1                | 2   |
| 38    | 1                | 2   |
| Total | 58               | 100 |

**Table 2.2** *Marriage status on arrival*

| Date of arrival | Married | Not married | Total |
|-----------------|---------|-------------|-------|
| 1998            | 8       | 0           | 8     |
| 1999            | 7       | 4           | 11    |
| 2000            | 13      | 18          | 31    |
| 2001            | 1       | 7           | 8     |
| Total           | 29      | 29          | 58    |

a man and woman who had formally registered a marriage with the civil authorities. It was sufficient that a couple had been engaged or lived together for a few months to be considered a 'married' couple. Women who had eloped with their fiancé were also considered to be married. This group of women predominated in the first half the research period but they were eventually matched in number by women arriving who were not married. As a number of women 'divorced' their *Çuni*, the 'married' women became a minority by the end of the research period (see Table 2.3).

An indicator used to establish 'wife' status was that the 'wives' remitted all of their income to the *Çuna*,<sup>9</sup> apart from local expenses. The 'wives' when discussed in this work refer only to women who claim to be the 'wives' of their *Çuni* and not women who might be married to other men.

**Table 2.3** *Marriage status 2001 cross-tabulation*

| <i>Date of arrival</i> | <i>Married</i> | <i>Not married</i> | <i>Total</i> |
|------------------------|----------------|--------------------|--------------|
| 1998                   | 6              | 2                  | 8            |
| 1999                   | 4              | 7                  | 11           |
| 2000                   | 7              | 24                 | 31           |
| 2001                   | 1              | 7                  | 8            |
| Total                  | 18             | 40                 | 58           |

#### 2.4.2 *The divorced and other women*

The other main group of women were made up of those 'not married' to a *Çuni*, who were overwhelmingly 'divorced' women. Again a 'divorced' woman was not necessarily a woman who had been formally married and divorced, but she could simply be a woman who had been in a publicly known relationship with a man that had then ended. These women had usually engaged with the traffickers for the first time at an older age than the 'wives', and their most common objective was to marry a foreign husband. In a smaller group of women who were not divorced but who were also not the wives of the *Çuna* were three older rural women who were married to non-*Çuni* husbands still in Albania, and three women who wanted to arrange matrilocal marriages to a *Kollovar*.<sup>10</sup>

#### 2.4.3 '50 per cent contracts'

By the end of the research period the 'divorced' women had become the largest group of women. All of the 'not-married' were in a contract relationship with the *Çuna* that was called a '50 per cent contract', and so depending on the context of the research circumstances this group would be called the 50 per cent contract group. The per cent contract was a bonded-labour contract supposedly agreed to for a certain period of time. However, the contracts were subject to varied reinterpretation by the *Çuna*, who would often demand extortionate interest on sums supposedly owed because minimum payments had not been made. The *Çuna* would also demand extension of the contracts if they arbitrarily decided that they had not received adequate compensation during the agreed period of the contract. As such the non-wives were clearly being constrained into a forced labour situation, which made them trafficked people; the wives did not have such contracts as their remittances to the *Çuna* were dictated by the obligation conditional to their marriage.

**Table 2.4** *Number of women in each working location*

|                      | <i>Frequency</i> | <i>%</i> |
|----------------------|------------------|----------|
| Deported             | 1                | 2        |
| Gerland              | 9                | 16       |
| Gerland Left Bank    | 3                | 5        |
| Gerland/Perrache     | 2                | 3        |
| Lyon-Central         | 2                | 3        |
| Lyon-North           | 8                | 14       |
| Lyon-North Left Bank | 4                | 7        |
| Lyon South           | 12               | 21       |
| Pasteur              | 11               | 19       |
| Perrache             | 4                | 7        |
| Perrache/Pasteur     | 2                | 3        |
| Total                | 58               | 100      |

#### 2.4.4 *Working locations*

The first Albanian women of the researched group had arrived in Lyon about eighteen months before the research period, and there was a clear time line that showed how these original arrivals had acted as a link for other women to arrive. As the different women formed groups, these groups divided themselves by living and working in designated areas. This geography was in some areas fixed while in others the situation was constantly being renegotiated when new women arrived. The oldest migrants had the most stability concerning their working territory. The women reported that the social groupings could be clearly defined by the geography of their working places, and as such I named the social sub-groups according to their various working areas. This included Lyon-North, Lyon-South, Perrache, Pont-Pasteur and Gerland, and this geography was the most common indicator of a woman's relationship with other women in Lyon (see Appendix H).

#### 2.4.5 *Counting trafficked women: OFPRA<sup>11</sup>*

When discussing trafficking numbers the gaps in the research on trafficking become very apparent. Feingold's trafficking statistics project for UNESCO describes the data dilemma as:

When it comes to statistics, trafficking of girls and women is one of several highly emotive issues which seem to overwhelm critical faculties. Numbers take on a life of their own, gaining acceptance through repetition, often with little inquiry into their derivations. Journalists, bowing to the pressures of editors, demand numbers, any number. Organisations feel compelled to

supply them, lending false precisions and spurious authority to many reports. (UNESCO 2004: 1)

Laczko (2002) also comments that statistics on trafficking are often unsubstantiated and hinder proper analysis of trafficking. In 2003 different departments of the US government estimated worldwide trafficking numbers to be 700,000 persons and also 800,000 to 900,000 persons (US DJ 2003; US SD 2003). In 2004, the estimate of 600,000 to 800,000 persons was adopted; however, no methodology has ever been given for how any of these estimates have been realised. In Europe IOM has been widely credited with estimating in 1996 that 500,000 women a year were being trafficked into Western Europe (EC 2001; Scharie Tavcer 2003). However, this estimate also has never been properly cited nor has any methodology for such estimation been given. European trafficking estimates have since been regularly reduced downwards and currently approximately 120,000 women are estimated to be trafficked into Western Europe each year (EC 2001); however, no method has been given for how this lower figure is being estimated. This estimate is attributed to both the European Commission and IOM (EC 2001; Varouhakis 2002) as the source for this figure but the 120,000 figure is also credited as being originally estimated by UNICEF and OSCE (Varouhakis 2002). Laczko (2002), Steinfett and Baker (2003) and Feingold (2005) consider estimates that are not supported by any meaningful methodological substance to be a hindrance to understanding trafficking.

In considering how to count the researched women I was fortunate that the sample population was accessible and reasonably stable, but I did discover a method that might enable a better estimate to be made of the number of Albanian trafficked women in various parts of Europe. The various groups would increase or decrease in number depending on a variety of conditions, but their core numbers remained consistent throughout the research period. The number of Albanian women never numbered more than 40 working on the street at any one time, and as such it made researching the group manageable. However, this number was consistently less than a third of the number represented as being the actual number of CEE women working in Lyon by local NGO (Cabiria 2001; Tapissier 2001) and the media (*Le Progres* 1999; *Le Figaro* 2000), as such I sought to validate my numbering of the women from other sources. The researched woman reported that they relied on the asylum process to remain and work in France. The women that did not rely on this system were rapidly deported or were only quickly passing through Lyon to another destination.

Consequently, I contacted OFPRA and asked them to supply me with the statistics for asylum applications in Lyon of young women

aged eighteen to 30 for 1998-2000. I was interested to see if these statistics would have any value in helping me confirm the number of trafficked women from Albania in Lyon. OFPRA replied that it could not make such statistics available as the total number for the enquired of categories numbered less than 50 persons in each year. This was particularly interesting as the 58 women that had contact with the research project represented the entire population of Albanian trafficked women in Lyon, and most had registered during those years as Kosovan refugees in Lyon. It then seemed probable that a reliable way to achieve a top estimate for the number of trafficked Albanian women in France would have been to collate the number of applications by unattached women under 30 claiming asylum as Kosovans. This device of claiming asylum as a Kosovan was overwhelmingly used from the mid-1990s to the millennium as the means of securing a temporary residency within the EC by the researched women.

This method offers a way to produce an estimate of trafficked Albanian women in those EC countries, where asylum claiming was the principal means for securing a period of legal residency and particularly before the period when the use of false travel documentation became more common. The estimate would be inflated by the double counting of any women, who made multiple applications, and women who did not make applications would be lost, but it would offer figures that could be used to estimate the number of trafficked Albanian women year-by-year in some European locations.

## 2.5 Research design

It was intended that the research would involve urban anthropology utilising participatory action research as its principal methodology.

I am unable to speak Albanian fluently, and as I wanted to access the women through someone who shared as many commonalities with the researched women as possible, I determined to use a research assistant who not only could speak fluent Albanian but who had a non-prejudicial<sup>12</sup> attitude to sex work and whose other commonalities of class, gender, and age would allow her to join the researched group as a trusted member. Fortunately, I had access to such a research assistant who I had worked with on other projects in the Balkans, and she agreed to assist me in Lyon. While the research assistant who participated in this research shared many of the attributes of the researched group including an undocumented migration and trafficking experience, she was not a sex worker.

With regards to my own positionality, I had to undertake a number of considerations regarding how to place myself within the milieu of

the researched women without my presence becoming a disruptive or impeding factor to the research. Although my Albanian is most definitely not fluent, I can often follow conversations when the context is known to me; Furthermore, I am even more able to follow discussions in French, this and the ability of some of the researched women to speak English allowed me to pursue exchanges without the constant help of the research assistant. My simple Albanian actually became a useful resource in that I was able to spot the idiomatic use of certain words that I only knew the formal use of and as such I was able to identify words used for 'clients' and 'elopement' that then became the subject of particular investigation and analysis. My identity as a man was intriguing in that it was never raised as an issue by any of the researched women and rather than being perceived just as a man I was often identified by the women as being a non-Albanian man. This accorded me certain access to the women that would not have been possible if I was Albanian. An Albanian man could have been seen as a possible threat to the vested interest of the existing *Çuna*, but as the partner or boyfriend of the research assistant I was generally considered by the researched women to be one of a small number of men who interacted with them that were neither clients, *Çuna* nor police. As a number of women increasingly sought to attract non-Albanian partners I was often solicited for advice about what Western men might find attractive in an Albanian woman. I was able to conclude that my presence was accepted as quite normal by the researched women, who never referred to me as the researcher, but usually described me as the boyfriend of the research assistant. The researched women dealt with a wide range of men during their day and managing the various typologies of men meant that they had an equally wide range of strategies for controlling their exchanges with men. Once I was included in the various groups as the boyfriend of the research assistant I was invited to social functions and the researched women would regularly ask after me whenever they met with the research assistant. There was certainly no notion that I was the superior of the research assistant, nor was there any sense that I had any particular power or status beyond that accorded to me because of my personal relationship with the research assistant.

My research assistant was to be a cultural advocate within the research programme and also a cultural mediator employed by the local NGO that was trying to supply non-prejudicial services to the Albanian, CEE and CIS sex workers. This dual role as a mediator and advocate allowed me to compare the knowledge that could be generated by these different methods, but equally importantly it ensured the good will and support of a local NGO during most of the research period. I became the research assistant's driver, male associate, and a generic resource person regarding various matters for the researched group. A small



number of men were often kept as informal drivers and companions by several of the women and as such I was assured that my presence was considered quite normal as the cultural advocate's boyfriend.

As a man, I was able to engage with a number of other male actors probably more directly and effectively because of my gender. In particular, I was able to meet and talk with some of the *Çuna* as well as some of the vice police officers. These conversations would often assume a shared prejudice and misogyny and as such I could elicit very frank and open comments regarding their understanding of the researched women.

It was intended that the subjects for research should include issues identified by the researched women rather than be presumed by myself; as such an ongoing consultative process took place. The research method also explicitly included elements intended to raise consciousness among the participants. This was intended to promote resistance to abuse by the empowerment of the researched women rather than just seeking to influence external policy makers or create knowledge of their condition. This process led to a number of small projects being designed and undertaken including the production of several comprehensive guidebooks in Albanian that gave specific advice on how to access the asylum procedure, health care, banking services, and other topical issues that the women identified as being information that would greatly help them and particularly newcomers to Lyon. The most substantial actions that were a result of this process was an attempt by the women to jointly represent themselves to the media and challenge stereotypes about their lives and a campaign to secure the release of a group member imprisoned as an exploiter and trafficker.

During the research period, I was able to make visits to other parts of France and also Italy, Albania and Greece, where I was able to meet with various informants that included other trafficked women, law enforcement officers and NGO staff working on trafficking. I also registered with the Humanities School at the University of Lyon 1 as an Erasmus exchange student so I might have access to its library and other resources. I deliberately registered in this programme so as to support my status as a credible academic researcher with local connections, should I need to demonstrate to any local authority or agency that I was recognised by a 'French' university as an academic. This connection was later considered by the local vice police and prosecutors of office as 'proof' that I was a genuine academic researcher.

During the preliminary work in Lyon, key informants were used to conduct a mapping exercise in which they were asked to separately identify areas on a map that they believed to be areas in which sex workers were active. Using those maps, the identified areas were observed to identify any sex-work activity. In the identified areas further

mapping exercises were conducted in shops, bars and other locations with employees, managers, local residents and clients to gather further information about the sex-work areas. During the mapping exercise, I met with some informants who self-identified as sex workers or as clients. In the areas identified by the mapping exercise, I then observed from various locations such as bars or from walking tours to establish the routines of any identified area. I also sought to snowball from the mapping participants to further contacts with sex workers, their clients and other associates. I also made contact with a local agency called *Cabiria*<sup>13</sup> that wanted to engage with the Albanian sex workers to help them with non-prejudicial advice and services. I was able to associate with this agency for a number of months and was greatly assisted by their extensive knowledge of the greater sex-work community and other key actors in Lyon.

I then met with researched women and their associates and introduced myself and my interests. Through such contacts I sought to identify an issue or concern to these women that I could have used to design a complementary programme by which I could have created a role for myself within the sex-work environment. During these initial consultations, the research group made a number of suggestions that usually related to having access to information in the Albanian language and assistance to access various services. As I would usually meet the researched women on the street or in nearby cafes during rest periods or meal times, I often used informal focus groups<sup>14</sup> to investigate various areas of concern to the women, particularly issues relating to managing vulnerability and perceptions of vulnerability. Sometimes it was possible to organise more formal focus groups as a prelude to some agreed social activity or when a particular issue such as media or law enforcement was of particular interest to some of the women. The use of focus groups among migrants has been used in various research projects including a recent study of post-conflict returns by Black and Koser (2000).

When I had identified the various locations and working practices of the local sex-work environment and met successfully with local participants, I conducted informal interviews and focus groups among the various researched women to identify common issues of concern. During these interviews, I sought to identify women who might be willing to participate in various formal focus groups and more structured interviews. I also sought to interview various associates including some *Çuni*; I concluded the initial design of my research project by incorporating the various issues identified by the women themselves as being of particular concern. Among these issues regularity of immigration status was identified as being the issue of greatest concern to the women.

## 2.6 Using cultural mediators as a research method

My research required that an effective engagement and research methodology be used, to ensure that qualitative data acquired for that research be rich, accurate and allow for an active participatory role within the group. Such participatory role should be exercised by someone who shared significant experiences and identity with the main subjects of the research and who could also work with the group around the group's own agenda for action. In considering how to place and develop such a key resource person, I began an examination of the various methods of engagement that are commonly in use by agencies that have contact with migrant sex workers. In examining the various methodologies, I also drew on previous experience of contact with cultural mediators and advocates in various countries so as to evaluate the various engagement methods to see which offered the most opportunities to increase the migrant community's social capital and enabled migrants to negotiate with service providers and other institutions more equitably.

It is not only researchers who have found it difficult to engage with trafficked women, but social service providers and law enforcement agencies have also found it hard to meet with these women. Therefore, as the trafficking crisis has progressed, there has been a rush to find methods of engagement that will allow various service providers and researchers to effectively reach these target groups and to engage with them around a number of areas of concern. Foremost, among the possible methodologies is the use of 'cultural mediators'.

However, any discussion on the topic is complicated by the different ways in which the term is used. The model of cultural mediation recommended by EuroPaP/TAMPEP<sup>15</sup> for example contains many ambiguities. First, there is a presumption of a cultural divide between the service provider and the migrant sex workers. Yet, multicultural organisations that employ migrants and sex workers need not experience this separation between the agency and beneficiaries that has confronted so many agencies. Secondly, there is certainly more than one type of cultural mediator. Whilst the institutionally employed cultural mediator may have a useful role to play in helping migrants' access services and other opportunities, a more challenging task is to promote and organise around the agendas of sex-work migrants and trafficked women themselves. Cultural mediation is a term that encompasses various identities and the continuum that is understood by cultural mediation has grown as the result of practice rather than theory (Vargas 2000). This broad church includes an increasing number of health-care professionals often identified as Interpreter Cultural Mediator (ICM), (Healthlinks 2000), as well as volunteer bi-cultural advocates located

in small NGOs (Vargas 2000). Where a cultural mediator is located on that wide continuum will usually determine how they relate to the intended beneficiaries and how effective they can be in furthering the agenda of the beneficiaries.

In all cases, the cultural mediator is someone with bicultural skills who 'affords a bridge of understanding particularly between host-culture professionals and newcomers through awareness and sensitivity to ethno-cultural differences' (Vargas 2000). They are considered a 'trusted contact' (Healthlinks 2000) between their ethnic community and the service provider. The cultural mediator is increasingly called upon whenever a host-culture institution is required to have contact with a migrant community (Richter-Malebotta 2000). They are expected to 'create points of convergence between the autochthonous and the foreign culture' (Richter-Malebotta 2000).

The competent cultural mediator is a highly skilled and valuable resource person, with abilities that can mean the difference between success and failure for a project. Indeed, Heskin and Heffner (1986) argue that cultural mediation 'extends to include leadership functions appropriate only to group members' (Heskin & Heffner 1986: 6).

In this context, it could be argued that their role could be extended to either organise or even control, the migrant groups they are supposed to mediate for. Vargas' work on cultural mediation and refugee children captures the tension between two different models of cultural mediators. However, it offers no value judgments regarding their validity as practice. We are left to assume that both models are acceptable expressions of cultural mediation. Yet in practice, in recent years, the increasing push to professionalise the role of the cultural mediator has resulted in the cultural mediator as the employee of a host-culture institution, as being considered the norm in cultural mediation (Massimiliano 2000).

The notion of the cultural mediator as an institutional employee has tilted the balance on their perceived role as 'a job that aims to encourage social integration of immigrant populations and to improve the quality of the services ... provided to foreigners' (ALUD 2000: 4). In contrast, the model of the cultural mediator as an advocate located in the migrant community has almost disappeared. As a result, the leadership role that the cultural mediator could offer their own community is generally usurped and replaced, by the mono-cultural leadership of their institutional employers. In their assessment of the TAMPEP project to develop cultural mediation with a sexual health service in Hamburg, Lempp and Mansbrugge (1999) describe cultural mediators as the agents of the health services who experienced considerable angst in resolving their identities within the service provider organisation. Cultural mediators were only perceived by the report as the agents of a

host-culture organisation, and it was made clear that they needed to avoid advocacy and remain neutral. However, neutrality in this instance appeared to mean loyalty to the agenda of the employing institution and professional distance from the clients.

The limitations of the cultural mediator role are clearly represented in Lempp and Mansbrugge's (1999) report that describes the tensions between cultural mediators who want to assume greater control over how they serve their migrant community and local social workers who want to limit the cultural mediator's activities to the service provider's agenda:

Their (the cultural mediators') appraisal of their role as pseudo-social workers leads to disputes over responsibility or competence, power struggles and mistrust on the part of the real social workers. This over-estimation of their own role may well result from the above-mentioned unclear definition of their role. (Lempp & Mansbrugge 1999: 231)

However, the client group involved considered the cultural mediators in a different light and wanted the Cultural Mediators to be able to control the service provision: 'It would be good if they did everything.' (Lempp & Mansbrugge 1999: 230)

However, the report continues with the TAMPEP representatives' comments: The cultural mediators are not social workers ... Although nobody would deny that the interests of the women need to be represented, both sides should be equally represented. One must be neutral, because one has to provide information both ways, yet sometimes one is not neutral, as one is there for the interests of the women. (Lempp & Mansbrugge 1999: 230)

The conflict in developing 'neutral' cultural mediation using this TAMPEP model could possibly be resolved if the migrants and the mediators could form partnerships and if organisations would allow the mediators to abandon the neutrality that ensures the dominance of host-culture professionals and develop instead the migrants' own rules of engagement with other institutions. Cultural mediators employed by host institutions would be better called cultural facilitators, in that as employees of a host-culture organisation, they help facilitate those institutions to supply accessible services to migrants. Indeed, TAMPEP declares: 'Cultural mediation has to be understood as cultural and linguistic facilitation' (TAMPEP 1999).

These different 'cultural' actors can generate very different knowledge of a migrant group and as such it was necessary to consider which form of intervention would generate the richest research knowledge. In examining the differing types of cultural mediator, Heskin and Heffner (1986) offer some useful definitions of various actors who would often be considered cultural mediators. Heskin and Heffner (1986) identify their actors as participants in multicultural organisations that seek to establish the agenda of the migrant community, rather than pursuing a pluralism that ensures the domination of the host culture. They describe these cultural mediators as having 'boundary roles' between the dominant and migrant community. They also consider these roles to be particularly important in helping develop the social capital of minority groups.

Concerning these actors, they state:

... we have identified three such intermediating functions appropriate to the multicultural, bilingual community organisation: the roles of organiser, interpreter and cultural mediator. Conceptually these roles are not strictly exclusive categories, but shade into one another, and in practice there will be some overlap. (Heskin & Heffner 1986: 4)

The crucial difference between these actors and the institutionally employed cultural facilitator is that they are located within an organisation that represents the interests of the migrants and not the dominant culture. This is why it was decided to place a cultural advocate among the researched women, as a means by which to undertake the programme of action research according to the agendas of the researched women and not rely only on the knowledge that could have been generated by the research assistant acting as a cultural mediator. The research assistant as a cultural mediator would be able to acquire rich data regarding the institutional actors she dealt with, but she would be unable to support the full dialogical aspects of the research as her cultural-mediation role would have been restricted by the sexual-health agenda of the agency. I deliberately negotiated with the agency that employed her to ensure that they understood and accepted her other role as a cultural advocate. This was an important arrangement as it allowed her to go beyond the usual limitations associated with cultural mediation and to develop the cultural advocate method; initially the NGO involved was very supportive of this duality.

## 2.7 Cultural advocacy and participatory conscientisation

The above sections have highlighted problems with the role of the cultural mediator. It also sketched out the beginnings of an alternative, based on advocacy on behalf of the researched women, rather than the delivery of institutionally defined services to this group. This section goes on to discuss more fully a key element of the role played by cultural advocates: that of the community organiser. In identifying the weaknesses of marginalised migrant groups and their lack of organisational capacity, Heskin and Heffner (1986) state:

The low-income community will typically need some outside intervention in order to form a permanent and effective organisation. At the same time, the organisation's role as community advocate in an adversary political system makes autonomy a paramount issue, and therefore limits the type and extent of acceptable mediation. Guidance by experts or authorities can too easily be a guise for cooptation or domination. In these circumstances, the organiser's art is to walk the line between suggestion and manipulation: to discover the community's agenda, rather than advocate his own; to identify, rather than select, the naturally and locally validated leadership; to formalise the lines and linkages of already-existing interaction, rather than to impose a textbook organisational structure; and above all, to train and reinforce his own replacement. The organiser is a stimulant, a catalyst, a mobiliser, an enabler, a trainer and as these terms suggest, the role is temporary. Once the motivational barriers are overcome, once the political/managerial skills are imparted and experience begins to accumulate, the organiser's mediating role between community and society devolves upon the local leadership developed in the process. (Heskin & Heffner 1986: 5)

For the weak communities of sex-work migrants and the trafficked women among them, cultural advocates seem to offer a real possibility of greater empowerment around the concerns and issues of the community itself. Cultural advocacy will actively seek to relocate power and resources from the host culture to the migrant community by enabling migrants to claim rights or to organise for change, thus allowing the community to grow stronger.

It is interesting to note that in one study in Canada, interviewed sex-work migrants, most of whom were considered to be trafficked women, stated that they would prefer not to have services supplied to them by members of their own ethnic group (Moore 2000). This was because

of the widespread prejudice and stigma they had experienced from other compatriot migrants outside of sex work. Interviews with the researched women suggest that many women in Lyon had initially been very concerned about receiving advice and services from other members of their own migrant community because of stigma. However, when they are offered confidential and non-prejudicial services from a sympathetic member of their own ethnic community they have found such services to be both valuable and helpful. One conclusion might be that sex-work migrants in Canada do not want to receive services from any prejudiced or biased person regardless of their ethnic background. Certainly, prejudicial and stigmatising service provision from Canadians would be no more welcome than prejudiced services from their own wider migrant communities. What sex-work migrants and trafficked women do appear to want, however, is non-prejudicial contact with agents who can assist them in acquiring the services and assistance they want. There is also support for agents who are willing to engage on behalf of the migrants' agenda, rather than offer limited choices subjugated to interests of the host culture.

Some specific issues arise when the cultural advocate works with women who have been 'trafficked'. First, a cultural advocate would seek to work with a trafficked woman to address the specific aspect of abuse or exploitation that the trafficked woman might want to change. This might mean renegotiating with a male associate a change that allowed the woman to remain in sex work, but not to be burdened with threats and demands for money. Another strategy that is equally 'unacceptable' to many host-culture agencies would be to help the trafficked women acquire the legal documents required to marry a former client, and so exit sex work through that marriage. Whichever route is taken, the crucial issue is that, according to Agustín (2005) and to the various participants in the Bangladesh Thematic group (2004) on trafficking, many trafficked women are evolving their own strategies to successfully deal with the abuse that they have suffered, and these solutions could become more generally accessible if properly supported.

In this sense, the organisational location of the cultural mediator is of crucial importance in determining the possibilities; they have to advance the interests of the migrant communities, particularly vulnerable communities such as sex-work migrants and trafficked women. The top-down approach represented by cultural facilitation, offers sex-work migrants and trafficked women access to those services that the host community want them to access on the terms and conditions set by the dominant culture organisations. When sex-work migrants or trafficked women reject such services as irrelevant or inappropriate, this lack of engagement is often explained away by stating those women are compelled by organised crime not to use such services or that the



women concerned are not interested in sexual health or using the other services.

The bottom-up approach represented by the cultural advocacy model offers migrants the possibility of engaging with service providers and a variety of other institutions in such a way that, apart from access to the services that the local and dominant culture institutions are willing to provide, it is possible for the sex-work migrants including trafficked women to seek alternatives to what is offered by developing their own organisational capacity. It is clear that the funding of cultural advocates is only likely to be undertaken by organisations or donors who are willing to support a migrant driven agenda of action. The cultural advocate should ideally be supported by an organisation that will offer the advocate the freedom and the support they need to develop the organisational capacity of the migrants, rather than pursue any other agenda. Such an arrangement would prevent the conflict of interests that haunt so many cultural facilitators.

A cultural advocate is not a 'conscience constituent' as described by McCarthy and Zald (1997). These 'conscience constituents' described by Lilian Mathieu (2000) were considered vitally important to the emergence and then failure of the prostitutes' social movement in Lyon because they sought to tie the prostitutes to their own prejudicial understanding of prostitution as a moral harm. Unlike the experienced professionals with considerable organisational skills, who as conscience constituents have helped prostitutes' social movements as allies, but according to their own agendas, the cultural advocate must have a sufficiently shared identity to be able to embrace any agenda of the migrant group they work with. The TAMPEP project demonstrated the possibility for conflicting agendas to cause problems as migrant sex workers criticised TAMPEP social workers for preventing cultural mediators from assisting them with issues outside the health agenda (Brussa 1999; Lempp & Mansbrugge 1999), and Massimiliano (2000) also reported how migrants' agendas regarding education could be different from the host organisations' agendas and that this could create a situation where a cultural facilitator actually reinforced negative stereotypes of migrants among a host-culture organisation, by seeking to identify with the host culture's values and priorities and to also distance himself from other migrants who were of a different class.

Often, this will mean the cultural advocate must be able to engage with the target group and will need to mediate if possible a common agenda. In reconciling themselves with such a group the cultural advocate will need to make strategic and tactical decisions about how they can best benefit the group, and consequently, they will often have to accept pragmatic and structural restraints on their intervention. In addition, the role of the cultural advocate in helping sex-work migrants to

engage as purposeful actors in increasing their organisational capacity and social capital is a particularly interesting component of the cultural advocate's work when the women concerned have been trafficked. Many agencies consider sex-work migrants in general, but trafficked women in particular, to be the helpless objects of exploitation constrained by the agents of organised crime (Barry 1979; ICMPD 1999).

Cultural advocacy seeks to help women transit trafficking harm and even sex-work participation if they so desire; it does this by taking them past the abuse experiences to an outcome considered satisfactory by the women involved. Certainly, the need for women to engage in their own emancipation as actors is an important aspect of the cultural advocacy model. It runs against the perception that as helpless victims, sex-work migrants, including those who are trafficked, must be rescued by powerful outside agencies, usually representing the criminal justice system. As reported in subsequent chapters this aspect of the methodology offers an effective process for dismantling much of the environment in which trafficking abuses can presently be inflicted on women with relative impunity.

Mathieu (2000) and Heskin and Heffner (1986) consider that communities with weak organisational resources such as sex-work migrants will need extended intervention to ensure any success in community development. Therefore, the fragility, mobility and transience of sex-work migrants and trafficked women and their lack of organisation seems to suggest that the cultural advocate will often be a prolonged participant in any local initiative. As such, the comments of Heskin and Heffner regarding the need to avoid manipulation and domination will need to be carefully heeded if the cultural advocate wants to maintain any mandate from the migrant sex-worker community. Cultural advocacy also offers possibilities for temporary manifestations of organisation, in that it allows a migrant community or parts of that community, to coalesce around a certain issue and then to work as a temporary organisation according to the needs of that issue. Once there is a resolution of the issue of concern, the temporary organisation can disband. However, in the meantime, participation in such action involves various praxis experiences that can form the basis for future actions, and skills acquired during the temporary action can be generalised to other endeavours. As a research methodology, cultural advocacy offers a rich source of primary qualitative data that is untainted by the problems relating to the constraining issues identified by Koser (2001) and Robinson (1999), regarding researching trafficked people who are in custody or care. Cultural advocacy also offers opportunities for sex-work migrants and trafficked women to participate in the debate regarding their lives and to put forward for proper consideration, the various strategies they have evolved for overcoming the

abuse they have experienced by organised crime and institutional prejudice. The research agenda then becomes part of the emancipatory process, in that what is discovered is the result of dialogue that can lead to action directed by the researched.

## 2.8 Sampling

Finding a city where the entire population of Albanian sex workers was available for research did not make issues of sampling redundant. Not all women were as available as each other; not all were as enthusiastic about the project, and not all were as articulate as some of the leading participants. However, the research allowed for detailed mapping of social networks and ongoing opportunities to ensure that certain women or groups of women were not structurally excluded from participating because of any particular factor such as times of working, place of working, mobility, opportunity or other considerations. When the research first started, locating women working in the Gerland area was difficult as the women were rotating around often secluded working places, but with further mapping exercises it was possible able to ensure that all the women working in the Gerland arrondissement<sup>16</sup> had regular contact with the research. Some women who deliberately sought to avoid other Albanians were also difficult to locate but all of the known isolates were eventually contacted and some of these then sought regular contact with us. Regular observations of all of the street sex-working areas and contact with a wide variety of sex workers allowed continual checking of the extent of the contacts with the Albanian women.

Once a core group of women had been identified, it was possible to ensure that there was regular contact with all the main groupings and different women from within those groups. Through the women their networks and constant observations of the working areas it was also possible to meet any newly arrived women very quickly so as to be able to include them in the research. We, therefore, had contact with every Albanian sex-working woman who was known to any group, the cross-referencing and interactions between the groups and the women meant that we could with considerable certainty be sure of contact with all the Albanian sex-working women in Lyon. While it is possible that there might have been some social isolates working unknown to us it seems very unlikely that this was possible unless they stayed for a very short time in Lyon.

## 2.9 The researched as researchers

Throughout the research, there were various opportunities to report the progress of the research back to the researched women for their comments. At the researched women's focus groups or informal coffee or lunch meetings, the groups would regularly discuss the current findings and give their feedback. These would be occasions for further developing an analysis of the research. The researched women were then able to discuss and comment on the work and make suggestions and clarifications. Specific areas of interest would often be discussed with an individual or small group to ensure accuracy or pertinent analysis. The information booklets in Albanian were also presented in various drafts to the women so they could directly influence or update their content.

The increasing emphasis by the women on learning more about the solutions to trafficking harm that were being developed by some women in Lyon was a direct result of the discovery of these self-solutions and our responding to women's requests to facilitate information exchange about such strategies. The organisation of meetings where successful women actually shared their experiences about solutions to trafficking with other women was a significant activity where their own knowledge was shared with other women.

Through repeated interviews with various key informants among the researched women, it was possible to cross-check numerous events and accounts particularly regarding the induction of the women into sex work and their relationships with the *Çuna* as well as other aspects of their experiences. It was found that as trust was increasingly established, more thorough and elaborated accounts would be shared with me and the cultural advocate. Many women gave accounts that would supersede previous accounts in complexity and would sometimes contradict earlier accounts of their experiences. Women explained these unfolding accounts as being dependent on the increasing level of trust being extended to the cultural advocate and particularly the realisation of the non-prejudicial and non-judgemental attitude towards the women's involvement in sex work. Unfolding accounts were more complex and offered more points of convergence with other women's accounts. As such, effective cross-referencing between the accounts became increasingly possible. The women used these unfolding accounts as a means to control the ability of others to know them and as such this strategy must be considered when reading accounts of trafficked women and others where the level of trust is likely to be compromised by a lack of confidence in the researchers. The increasing trust that was expressed towards the cultural advocate and me during the lengthy period of the research has meant that the validity of the researched women's accounts of their experiences and their opinions regarding these

experiences, although not assessed uncritically, are considered as increasingly sincere and accurate reports.

Apart from the numerous informal interviews and meetings that formed the bulk of my research data, questionnaires were also used with the women to generate some quantitative details in regard to pre-migration experiences, migration costs, migration routes and their length of stay, sense of well-being and other considerations. The use of questionnaires was introduced later in the research period as some of the newly arrived women believed that 'proper' research required responding to a questionnaire. As such, a questionnaire was produced in conjunction with these women and eighteen were completed by various women. I only used questionnaires from late in 2000 and initially only with the women who wanted questionnaires; one woman actually took the questionnaire method very seriously and asked us to train her in their use, and she then conducted four or five of the questionnaire interviews among her colleagues before returning the same to us with her comment and notes. While the use of questionnaires might appear tangential to the main methodology their acceptance, and the ease with which the researched women used them among themselves does raise interesting questions about the supposed difficulties of researching trafficked women. Questionnaires seemed to be very effective in acquiring background information about the women and their pre-migration experiences so I began to use the questionnaires among the other researched women as well. The questionnaires were then used to help inform the construction of the social matrix. A copy of the questionnaire is included in Appendices A-G.

I had already taped more than twenty in-depth interviews with a variety of women, and I was able to tape a couple of focus group meetings. However it was the informal interviews and focus groups that provided the vast majority of my data (see pictures in Figures 1, 2, 3 and 4). At

**Figure 2.1** *Focus group meeting discussing the work in progress*



**Figure 2.2** *Researched group meeting with researcher*



**Figure 2.3** *Street-based focus group meeting*



**Figure 2.4** *Researched women socialise after a focus group meeting*



various times and especially through the informal focus groups I was able to inform the researched women about the findings and my deductions regarding the research. I was then able to receive reflection and redirection regarding the research. These sessions often required identifying information to be appropriately shielded.

## 2.10 'Çuna'

I had occasional contact with the male associates of the researched women, and I was able to interview several *Çuna* by using a second Albanian research assistant who was another associate of mine who had a similar social profile to the *Çuna*. This young man met the *Çuna* with me, and sometimes he spoke to them by telephone on my behalf. The *Çuna* were usually open and candid and were quite prepared to express themselves and their opinions about trafficking and the researched women.

The overwhelming majority of the *Çuna* were courteous and deferential in their engagement with us. They would refer to the cultural advocate as 'sister'<sup>17</sup> as a deliberate mark of respect. These men would sometimes contact us for advice on sexual health or general matters. As our work increased the safety and security of the women involved, men often considered us a beneficial resource; fortunately our work in encouraging transition through trafficking was based in the self-solutions of the women concerned and as such these efforts were not seen as being directed against the interests of the *Çuna*, but only being an adjunct to the accepted evolution of such relationships. Some men just disregarded our presence entirely or treated us as other Albanians to be acknowledged but certainly not a threat to their security. There was a general and accurate presumption that we did not supply information to the police and as such the *Çuna* were comfortable about talking to us.

The only occasion when we received direct threats from an Albanian man was related to an incident when we allowed a woman to stay in our apartment when she was fleeing an exploitative man. After several violent threats this matter was resolved by a traditional Albanian conflict resolution strategy that allowed both sides to resume certain non-hostility. This event was reported by other *Çuni* as being important in considering us non-threatening; although we intervened in the event we resolved the subsequent conflict by not involving the police and by using a clear Albanian convention.

## 2.11 Other contacts

During the research, deliberate attempts were made to find and interview people who had regular contact with the researched women but who were unconnected to those who exploited them or those who engaged with them as trafficked women. This was intended to discover how the research women organised their life away from sex work and to see where their lives, according to them, assumed some subjective normality. The research was able to engage with a number of individuals who had effective relationships with the researched women based on often idiosyncratic and eclectic links. These individuals included Mme.<sup>18</sup> Oulde who ran a small bar and restaurant and who allowed the women of Lyon South to keep their bags and coats in her bar. Mme. Oulde also ran a luncheon and dinner club for the women. She regularly informed the women about the activities of the vice police. Most of our focus group meetings took place in the rear room that she let the women use for organising birthday parties and other social meetings. Mme. Oulde's rear room was often described as the nearest thing to a home-like atmosphere that the women experienced while they were in Lyon. Other individuals included other bar owners and even a school principal who regularly assisted the women with advice and practical help regarding accessing social services and better accommodation. These supportive individuals were regularly identified by the researched women as valuable and sympathetic friends, and these contacts operated as conscience constituents in their assistance and advocacy on behalf of the women.

During the course of the research, I had opportunity to meet and talk to a wide-ranging group of sex workers in Lyon. These included transsexuals, transvestites, migrants from Africa and South America, local French sex workers, including those who were leading the campaign to expel the researched women. These contacts allowed me to discuss in detail the various myths and other perceptions that these sex workers had about other sex workers and to examine the obvious lack of solidarity among the sex workers. These contacts allowed me to investigate how the interests of trafficked women or migrant sex workers are not always the same as existing groups of sex workers. As such, trafficked women often want other services than those typically available through sexual health projects for sex workers or from exit from prostitution agencies.

I also met with a number of traffickers who were important links in the migration trajectories of the researched women; some of these people belonged to clearly defined groups and networks. Other agents worked alone and only contracted with others for certain services.



These informants were very useful in triangulating reports regarding migration costs, routes and strategies.

The Movement Du Nid, an abolitionist<sup>19</sup> organisation that was coordinating a campaign for the deportation of the researched women in cooperation with a number of local French sex workers, did refuse to meet with me (BBC 2000; CPL 2000). Otherwise, I met with all of the other local agencies dealing with sex-worker issues, as well as the local refugee advisory NGO, the vice police and some reproductive health agencies. Through these interviews, I intended to discover how the various actors understood the researched women and how their various perceptions then ordered how they treated the researched women. It was of particular interest to report their observations back to the researched women and discuss how 'knowledge' held by these agencies affected the women. The interviews were also intended to inform the development of the handbooks for the researched women by going beyond simple information regarding such actors but also positioning them regarding their perceptions of the research women.

During the research period, I attended a number of conferences and workshops on trafficking issues so I was able to keep myself informed regarding other research being conducted and general trends in trafficking. An extension of my core research method was to selectively attend various conferences and workshops on trafficking, to conduct opportunistic interviews with people I met at these conferences.<sup>20</sup>

## **2.12 Ethics, confidentiality and consent**

The cultural advocacy method depends on maintaining trust between the researcher and the researched and as such an ongoing informed consent regarding the research. The dialogue between all of the participants ensures an accountability and transparency regarding the research which can be redirected according to the interests of the researched (Freire 1970; Fals-Borda & Rahman 1991). This transparency and accountability is essential to the legitimacy of the dialogue on which the research is based and so I took particular care to involve as many women as possible and as often as possible in the reviews of the research.

In regard to other ethical concerns, I sought to address the areas of concern identified by Kvale (1996) and Hammersley and Atkinson (1995) with particular regard to confidentiality and informed consent. I agreed on an ethical statement<sup>21</sup> with my supervisors prior to my research, which basically provided me a series of guidelines based on a non-prejudicial do-no-harm principle. The ethical statement made it clear that I would keep all my research encrypted to ensure that it

could not become available to any unauthorised person, accidentally or otherwise.<sup>22</sup>

Furthermore, I clearly committed myself to avoiding participation in criminal activities, even though during my research I would associate with people who might be engaged in criminal acts. The statement included an agreement to seek further advice and guidance should I find myself dealing with an ethical circumstance that was not clearly addressed by the ethical statement; fortunately, no such dilemma presented itself during the research.

Anonymity and confidentiality were a major concern for the women who participated in this research; all the researched women had three names in use during the research; these were their original names, their working names and the names that they had registered their asylum claims under. All of these women said that they did not want their original Albanian identity to be identifiable through the research. Most women said they did not mind if they could be identified in the research according to their working name or asylum name, but there was considerable concern to prevent any identifying information becoming available to the local authorities or to anyone in Albania. As such, I have resorted to the use of coded initials to identify the women, and I have changed the names of all other informants.

With particular regard to confidentiality, I had anticipated that my research might be considered useful intelligence to the law enforcement agencies. The local vice police did try to solicit information from me and the cultural advocate during the research, and as such I considered it a real possibility that the vice police would seek to forcibly access my research notes and interviews. It is not unusual for the French Police to speculatively raid NGOs and other organisations (Ross 2000; Rajavi 2003; Amnesty International 2005) in the hope of finding evidence, they could use against people they considered undesirables.<sup>23</sup>

I considered that because of the various and evolving risks and benefits that could attach themselves to the research, it was important that I had an ongoing process by which the researched women could give or withdraw their informed consent to participating in the research, a process that would specifically acknowledge their autonomy. Such a process would have a fit with current ERSC thinking regarding research with vulnerable groups (Crow, Charles et al. 2004) and seemed to reflect best practice as outlined by Wiles, Crow and others in their work on informed consent for the ERSC (Crow, Charles et al. 2004; Wiles, Charles et al. 2004). In acquiring informed consent my prolonged presence and repeated presentations of the research in progress allowed informed consent to be renewed or withdrawn almost continually and as such women did regulate their contact and exchanges with us accordingly. There was no presumption that consent was a single event

that offered a *carte blanche* for any research activity. Only in one instance did a woman expressly ask to disengage with the research, and this was while she was in an extended period of detention and negotiating a plea bargain with the police; once she had been released she re-engaged with the research.

With other informants who were directly involved with the researched women such as Mme. Oulde, I was able to extend the same process of ongoing consent. This was also true with the local NGOs, Amicale du Nid<sup>24</sup> and Cabiria; in fact both NGOs began to withdraw their cooperation towards the end of the research as they became more apprehensive about the research. Amicale du Nid considered that I was biased towards the legalisation of prostitution and that I was rejecting their own estimation of the number of trafficked women working on the streets in Lyon. The Director of Amicale du Nid had publicly stated that the number of CEE sex workers working the street of Lyon on any single night was 150, this was 300 per cent more than my research identified (Tapissier 2001). In the later part of the research, one staff member in Cabiria began to actively work to break the agency's links with my research. I maintained links with the NGO, but this incident did make cooperation more difficult. With other informants such as other agencies or other interviewees, I was able to explain the nature of my research and elicit their consent to the agreed interview. Usually these informants were quite knowledgeable about social science research and addressed the consent issue in a matter of fact manner.

Concerning consequences, these were many and varied and their evaluation probably defies simple analysis. An active research participant was eventually employed as a cultural mediator to replace the cultural advocate and now has regular papers allowing her to remain in France. Through participation in the project some women have returned to Albania after separating from exploitative men; others left their exploiters and sex work. Some of these have married local men and secured papers that allow them to remain in France; other still sell sex in Lyon. The woman who was the focus of an action on health care, received the operation she needed and has made a full recovery; she also received humanitarian permission to remain in France. This woman still sells sex in Lyon. However, as the policing regime of migrant sex workers has become more repressive throughout France, many women have left Lyon and France to go elsewhere.

Regarding future research, I believe that this research project has probably made various institutional stakeholders in Lyon more cautious about cooperating with researchers who are not answerable or accountable to them directly. As the early findings of this research were reported back to such stakeholders some of them found the idea of an increasingly organised group of sex-working women quite threatening.

One agency has now appointed their own research director to undertake their own research agenda and to supervise engagement with external researchers and others will likely be far more cautious about such engagement. Certainly all of them are now explicitly concerned with controlling any future research agenda, and they do not intend to develop cultural advocacy engagements. One agency director frankly admitted that if they lost the ability to appropriate the voices of the foreign women, they would be required to renegotiate their political and fundraising strategy.

### 2.13 Data analysis

Grillo (1985) said that when he undertook his urban anthropology among migrants in Lyon he approached his data from three different directions that represented phases in his evolving perceptions of the ethnography; he saw this evolution as an ongoing state of analysis in progress. His levels were represented by his work directly on the immigrants, then the analysis of the society of immigration with the linkages between these two levels allowing him to identify and analyse supposed problems, leading him finally to consider the nature and structure of the ideological systems involved (Grillo 1985). I found that this structure lent itself easily to my own work: considering the experiences of trafficked women and then examining trafficking and its surrounding migration networks and systems by using a trafficking matrix.<sup>25</sup> Through considering the perceived problems associated with how these levels are thought to be linked and how I found them to be related, I was then able to analyse the various trafficking ideologies and their associated conceptualisations.

Using the analytical trafficking matrix, I could place my data and the questions it generated into various sections of the matrix that would then suggest how various migration theories could explain certain aspects of the data. Some data would seem explicable according to one theoretic group while the other data appeared to be better explained by other theories. Finally, I was able to analyse those researched trafficking events and circumstances that required better theoretical explanation and propose conceptualisations that would more properly explain those phenomena.

In my analysis, I have used Kvale's (1996) approaches of meaning condensation<sup>26</sup> and meaning categorisation<sup>27</sup> to examine my interview material and assist in my analysis; however, I have also resorted to *ad hoc* meaning generation<sup>28</sup> when seeking to link data from various sources and events. By coding my interview material and notes for certain themes and categories, it was possible to identify various common-

alities and nuanced differences that reflected on criteria such as marriage, age or date of original recruitment. To enable me to fully code my data, all my interviews were transcribed and translated into English by my research assistant. There is extensive ethnographic reference to this material by referring to the content of the interviews or quoting directly from women to support my various arguments and analysis. The charts included in the study were generated from interview data using SPSS.

Upon completion of this study, I will disseminate a summary in Albanian to as many of the women involved as can be contacted; I also intend to make a summary available to the main institutional stakeholders. A series of six information booklets in Albanian were compiled based on the best practice experiences of the researched women and were created, published and distributed before the research concluded. These booklets offered 'how to' practical advice on:

1. how to access and follow the asylum process
2. how to access health services
3. how to deal with the police and violence
4. how to move around Lyon and to and from Lyon
5. how to deal with specific sexual health issues
6. how to find specific laws dealing with sex work and migration
7. and how to get details of various aid agencies and how to access their services.

## **2.14 Conclusions**

In this chapter, I have documented how and why I conducted my research in Lyon, and I have considered the benefits of researching a whole population without disregarding issues of sampling. I have carefully examined the usual methods of researching trafficked people, notably the use of cultural mediators and explained why I did not use those methods in my research. I have described the cultural advocacy method as a dialogical and participatory research method (Freire 1970; Fals-Borda & Rahman 1991) and documented how I then used this method in Lyon.

This was an application of Freire's ideas on conscientisation, and it was a successful method for the difficult task of researching trafficked people. Using this method I was able to acquire rich and nuanced accounts of the women's various experiences and the depth of the unfolding accounts appears to reflect exceptionally useful data about understanding women in a trafficking situation and their various coping strategies. I was then able to realise quickly that the researched women were not a homogeneous group but could be divided into two main

groups, wives and divorced women, who were to prove to have very different experiences of trafficking. Using this heterogeneous divide, I was able to inform the structure of my research to develop an understanding of how these groups could inform a better conceptualisation of trafficking.

I also addressed a number of ethical issues and how I sought to ensure an ongoing consent to participate in the research whenever possible. I finally detailed my approaches to the analysis of the data that I acquired through this research.

In the next chapter I describe the trafficking matrix and the trafficking focal problem that dominates current conceptualisations of Albanian trafficking.

### 3 Understanding trafficking

This chapter seeks to further examine the various trafficking contests and problems and considers whether a migration order framework based on the work of Van Hear (1998) or a consideration in the specific form of a crisis in a transitional migration order<sup>1</sup> and analytical matrix might offer a useful means to understanding the experiences of trafficked women. This chapter takes seemingly disparate aspects of the various trafficking problems and suggests that it is possible to accommodate many of these supposedly conflicting experiences within the various layers of a crisis in a transitional migration order (Van Hear 1998). An analytical matrix is used for assisting these considerations. Such an integrated conceptualisation of trafficking is then proposed as a better way of explaining and understanding trafficking than the current theories which are often based on more limited notions of migration or economic theory. This chapter also analyses how the most commonly presented focal problem of trafficking is conceptualised which consequently then influences how trafficking is theorised. This analysis will examine how this focal problem drives anti-trafficking interventions and whether trafficking is an event that is experienced beyond the remit of any single focal problem. An analysis of these interventions will then identify if the trafficking problems have been correctly prioritised, as a failure to reduce or mitigate trafficking through the interventions would suggest either that:

1. the interventions have been inadequately implemented
2. such interventions are an inadequate response to the problem
3. the supposed problem is not the focal problem of trafficking
4. trafficking has a number of key focal problems that must be addressed simultaneously
5. or the conceptualisation that identified the focal problem is flawed.

If trafficking can be explained by reference to a single focal problem, then trafficking would likely be very homogeneous; however, if some forms of trafficking cannot be adequately explained by this homogeneous framework, then the existing principle conceptualisation will constantly render some aspects of trafficking inexplicable. If trafficking is a much more heterogeneous event, a framework able to identify and

explain such diversity is required. The Van Hear (1998) migration order model seeks to explain migration events by using a range of migration theories to explain different aspects of a migration flow.

### 3.1 Analysing migration orders

As Van Hear's migration order model (1998) considers how changes in various factors affect the whole order, it is possible that the impact of an intervention affecting one trafficking problem might affect other parts of the migration order. It is also possible that other changes in the migration order might incidentally influence the trafficking crisis. The increased freedom of mobility for women from the CEE that was consequential to EEA expansion has coincided with women from Poland, Hungary and the Czech Republic increasingly disappearing from trafficking accounts and more recently, since the Romanians have acquired similar rights, they seem to be following this trend (IOM & ICMC 2002; El-Cherkeh, Stribu et al. 2004; IOM 2004). However, Lithuanian women acquiring these mobility rights have suddenly increasingly appeared in trafficking accounts (Dudgeon 2005). Therefore it is possible that increasing legal mobility opportunities will allow some women to avoid trafficking while making others more vulnerable. If this paradox can be better explained by using Van Hear's understanding of migration orders in transition and crisis, then an improved conceptualisation of trafficking can be postulated.

An analytical matrix detailing trafficking as a crisis in a migration order would then be a useful tool in understanding these various incidents and the possible unexpected outcomes of various interventions intended to overcome trafficking harm. By taking the possible conceptualisations of trafficking and placing them in an analytical matrix based on Van Hear's model, it is possible that each of the limited explanations might be seen as a partial understanding or explanation for some aspect of trafficking, rather than an exclusive and comprehensive theory of trafficking. The matrix should also allow each trafficking explanation to be located in a wider body of theory and for better connections to be made between existing theories and trafficking events. The matrix should then clearly identify opportunities to reduce trafficking harm more effectively by showing how the trafficking networks are vulnerable to particular interventions.



### 3.2 Problems with trafficking problems

In the first chapter, five areas were identified where trafficking is considered a particular problem that can be addressed in different ways according to different priorities. How something is understood as a problem and particularly the identification of a 'focal problem' then becomes the means by which interventions and responses are framed by states and other institutions intended to overcome the problem (Norad 1999). If one problem is prioritised as the focal problem of trafficking, it is important to examine if the outcomes of these interventions resolve or mitigate the problem or if there are unexpected outcomes and if trafficking continues elsewhere in other forms (Norad 1999; Lorisika & Peeters 2003). If none of the five main problem groups offer a focus by which adequate solutions can be designed, it becomes increasingly probable that trafficking is beyond solutions based on any single focal problem and that trafficking requires a multiplicity of interventions based on a range of focal problems (Lorisika & Peeters 2003). The need to identify various trafficking problems can best be accomplished using a theoretical framework that deliberately accommodates such heterogeneous possibilities (*ibid.*). However, solutions can then become as complex and as varied as the problems (Thorpe 2006).

If the conceptualisation of what is considered the focal trafficking problem is flawed then trafficking will be inadequately addressed by interventions based on resolving that problem. While trafficking might be dislocated or compelled to adapt, trafficking will continue. Trafficking will then continue as an ongoing aspect of the crisis in the migration order and it could eventually emerge as an ongoing aspect of the stabilised migration order. The trafficking crisis matrix can help identify problems that are consequence of inadequate conceptualisations of trafficking rather than presuming such problems are the problems of trafficking. It would also demonstrate how trafficking can be displaced by some interventions from certain places only to reappear in others, Marshall (2001, 2005) describes this effect as the 'push-down, pop-up effect' and he considered such interventions to be of limited value in addressing trafficking harm.

### 3.3 Overcoming 'demand': prevention, prosecution, protection

There is now a widely accepted conceptualisation that trafficking is a 'demand'-driven industry, in which the demand of men for sex with exploitable women results in more women being coerced through trafficking to participate in prostitution (UNODC 2006). It is argued by Hughes (2002) and Shannon (1999) that while a large number of

men demand paid sex from women, criminal men will be assured of sufficient profit to justify them deceiving and coercing women into trafficking for prostitution; therefore while this demand exists trafficking will continue. Therefore the problem of demand has become the focal problem in the conceptualisation of trafficking for those who conflate prostitution and trafficking into a single issue (Shannon 1999; Hughes 2002).

The bill I sign today will help us to continue to investigate and prosecute traffickers and provide new grants to state and local law enforcement. Yet, we cannot put the criminals out of business until we also confront the problem of demand. ... So we'll investigate and prosecute the customers, the unscrupulous adults who prey on the young and the innocent. (Bush 2005)

However, the so-called demand for women for forced labour is also considered the focal problem of trafficking by Sangera (2005) the advisor to the UN High Commissioner on Human Rights, who explicitly rejects the conflation of trafficking with prostitution when analysing the causes of trafficking. Therefore, the demand for women for coerced prostitution or other forced labour is considered to be the focal problem of trafficking by a wide spectrum of those working to suppress trafficking.

The most common institutional interventions that seek to subvert trafficking usually make demand the focal problem of trafficking. These responses include increasing the awareness of women about trafficking, the funding of law enforcement initiatives intended to secure the prosecution of traffickers (Bush 2005) and other programmes intended to secure the release and return of trafficking victims to their homes, but such interventions usually focus on resisting demand or making responses to demand unfeasible because of increased costs and risks (IOM 2002; IOM & ICMC 2002; UNODC 2006). Many actors consider that trafficking has been mainly addressed in terms of resisting or disrupting demand through interventions based on prevention, prosecution and protection in countries of origin and that there is a need to increasingly reduce or repress demand in countries of destination by such strategies as the criminalisation of those who use forced labour. According to UNODC Executive Director Antonia Maria Costa: 'The [Trafficking] Protocol is about prevention, prosecution and protection. I believe we could do better in all three areas: a main challenge is to reduce demand ...' (UNODC 2006: 10).

While prevention, prosecution and protection now dominate anti-trafficking interventions it has been suggested by Marshall (2005) that interventions should be based on Ps and that policy especially migra-

tion policy should be included in any attempt to overcome trafficking. However, considering the impact of migration policy on trafficking is not part of mainstream anti-trafficking initiatives at this time. Prevention, prosecution and protection has been an attempt to mitigate trafficking by creating a multi-phased approach to trafficking that seeks to integrate responses to a focal trafficking problem. This approach gives equal consideration to prevention, prosecution and protection as complementary operational areas. The model has become overwhelmingly dominant in the design of institutional anti-trafficking initiatives. As such the focal problem of 'demand' has become the principal way that trafficking is now implicitly understood and explained, other trafficking problems are then subsidiary or subservient to this focal problem.

### 3.3.1 Prevention

Prevention strategies are intended to build resistance to demand and are overwhelmingly based on two assumptions. The first and most prevalent is that women are unaware of trafficking methods and harms. It is presumed that if women and their communities are aware of trafficking methods and harms then women will refrain from making high-risk migration decisions and thus protect themselves from harm (UNODC 2006). These expectations are based on a presumption that women would neither take the risks of being exploited, nor voluntarily accept such abusive terms and conditions as are associated with trafficking. The second assumption is that women are trafficked because of a lack of local employment opportunities and that increasing these employment opportunities will reduce trafficking. The increasing knowledge of trafficking risks and improved local employment opportunities for women are intended to help women more effectively resist the 'demand' for them as trafficked women.

Prevention is seen as increasing awareness of trafficking strategies and harm, linked to actions intended to mitigate what are considered push factors for the migration of women (UNODC 2006). However, it is hard to imagine how small local interventions might mitigate the structural and macro-economic factors that are considered to influence migration flows (Massey 1993). There are a few projects that try and supply safe migration information to women, but these are often restricted to the internet, the *femmigration* project that detailed migration and sex-work law and regulation throughout Europe which was also the most accessible and comprehensive mobility guide for migrant sex workers and trafficked women is no longer online (AfW 2003). Other projects include information campaigns and sometimes small resource spaces inside IOM offices (IOM 2006). All such projects refuse to supply information on irregular mobility as they are mandated only to pro-

mote legal migration opportunities. Andrijasevic (2004) has carefully documented how many prevention information campaigns have relied on deterring the mobility of women through the use of the fear of rape, and so she has concluded that prevention campaigns are often really anti-migration strategies rather than seeking to overcome trafficking risks.

### 3.3.2 *Prosecution*

Prosecution strategies are intended to increase the costs of meeting the demand by punishing traffickers, confiscating their assets and compensating trafficking victims. It is presumed by some that if there were no traffickers there would be no victims (Lesko 2005) and that traffickers will be deterred by severe penalties and the increasing successful action of law enforcement agencies against their activities (Wong 2002; UN-ODC 2006). It is then presumed that a reduction in the profits of traffickers and an increase in their risks will mitigate their activities and as such trafficking will be reduced (Jardine 2006). Some activists such as Lesko (2005) consider traffickers solely responsible for trafficking:

Directly working with the victims of trafficking enabled us to understand that the traffickers were the only ones who had caused their ordeals ... as long as a trafficker is free, there is trafficking in girls and women into prostitution exploitation. (Lesko 2005)

However, the criminalisation of all irregular migration networks and their typical reconstruction as trafficking networks has often meant that benign social networks,<sup>2</sup> unable to cope with the new enforcement risks and penalties, are no longer available to support migrant women thus the women must resort to the professionalised trafficking networks able and willing to circumvent the law enforcement initiatives (Chapkis 2003; ILO 2003). Furthermore, it has become common for trafficked women to be prosecuted as traffickers as they often assist other women to migrate and they are typically the easiest people for law enforcement agencies to apprehend and gather evidence against; as such it is often trafficking victims who are actually imprisoned as traffickers (FdIE 1999; Asia Foundation 2006). Bales (1999) and Marshall (2005) both consider that prosecution should be used to subvert trafficking by reducing the profits from trafficking through the effective use of law enforcement approaches. They assume that when trafficking becomes unprofitable or prohibitively expensive, traffickers will be increasingly unwilling to respond to demand and most clients will be unable to afford the higher costs which will further suppress demand.

### 3.3.3 *Protection*

Protection is the removal of women from trafficking harm by their rescue and placement with NGOs intended to assist them deal with the harm inflicted upon them by the traffickers. These actions supposedly subvert demand by removing women from the locale where demand has positioned them, so negating the power of the demand to situate them as required. However, Marshall (2005) has commented that such removals can actually increase the flow of trafficked people as the demand continues and so removed women are quickly replaced by other newly trafficked women.

Many of these agencies presume that there is a human rights problem in that trafficked women are being abused (Wijers 1998; Fielding 2006), but in offering solutions to this problem they are constrained by the agenda of the country of destination authorities and as such other problems that might be of greater importance to the trafficked women are not usually addressed (Adams 2003). This solution to the problem of abuse is to extract the trafficked woman from the trafficking situation and to dispose of her to some circumstance where she is no longer abused by the traffickers (Poppy 2004; Fielding 2006). Some women can delay their return to their country of origin by agreeing to cooperate in the prosecution of their traffickers, in Italy, Belgium and the Netherlands it is possible that this temporary residence can become permanent (Pearson 2002; Williamsen 2006) but even in these countries deportations are still more common (Williamsen 2006). Elsewhere such as the US, UK and Norway there is often little possibility for any other outcome than deportation as residence for trafficked people is either temporary, limited or non-existent (Poppy 2004; US SD 2005; Ballier 2006).

The problems addressed by most current prevention, prosecution and protection responses in Europe are contingent on demand being the focal problem of trafficking. If this is a correct analysis, then after a decade of interventions implemented around the world it could have been expected that the various outcomes would have included some substantial reductions in overall trafficking. However, such outcomes have not occurred and often there has only been a diversion of trafficking activity (Marshall 2005) this could be the result of using inappropriate methods to address trafficking. However, as common interventions are predicated on Demand as the focal problem it would not be unreasonable to expect that after a decade some notable successes could be directly and demonstrably attributed to this analysis of trafficking and the responses proposed by its proponents. Trafficking is widely reported as still increasing in annual numbers (Interpol 2006; Jardine 2006; UNODC 2006; UNODC 2006) and furthermore, traf-

fickers have apparently successfully overcome the various attempts to subvert trafficking as trafficking numbers have remained so high and constant (Ashcroft 2004; Thorpe 2006). In Albania, Arbana, director of the NGO Useful for Albanian Women, believes many organisations are uncritical of these projects and their conceptual underpinning because trafficking is a very profitable business not only for the traffickers but also for NGOs being funded to conduct these programmes (Waugh 2006). More confusing to many commentators is how some women have moved from their predicted role as a supposed subjugated victim to accomplished trafficker, running their own trafficking network often recruiting their friends and even their own female relatives (Asia Foundation 2006; Thorpe 2006).

### **3.4 Failure to understand problems: 'demand', reverse and repeat trafficking**

Stereotypical victims are the intended subjects of prevention, protection and prosecution responses. By determining what is considered the focal problem of trafficking it is possible to control how trafficking is then conceptualised, this is because causes and effects are derived from an analysis of the identified focal problem. Any logical framework analysis of trafficking that is used to design responses to trafficking requires that the focal trafficking problem be correctly identified. The failure of prevention, prosecution and protection strategies to substantially reduce trafficking is noted by Marshall (2005) and this is often explained as the inadequate implementation of the interventions needed to overcome the focal problem of demand (Hughes 2002; Malarek 2004; UNODC 2006).

Such failures will often involve substantial opportunity costs and as such identifying these failures is important. It is useful to identify problems that have wrongly been prioritised and have subsequently led to failing interventions and other unexpected outcomes. Such considerations become a means to correct our conceptualisation of trafficking and will often suggest new directions for theorising the issue. If trafficking is experienced in areas that go beyond the reach of any single focal problem, then trafficking must be understood as a complex issue with a number of focal problems all requiring identification and action. This would then affect how trafficking should be conceptualised and would allow for seemingly contradictory explanations of similar events, with women then requiring different interventions to overcome apparently similar but in reality differing experiences of trafficking.

### 3.4.1 *Reverse trafficking*

The exercise of power in trafficking is usually assumed to be the exercise of criminal power intended to assure the criminal traffickers' effective control over the trafficked women (Williams 1999; Zakaryan 2005). The trafficked woman's lack of power to control the terms and conditions of her labour is used to demonstrate the pernicious abuse inherent in trafficking (McCauley 1998; Pearson 2001; McGill 2003). Therefore, being 'un-trafficked' would require a previously trafficked woman having the power to access decent work in some location of her choice. Decent work as described by Piguet (2006) is represented as a minimal standard regarding terms and conditions of work, so ensuring access to decent work as described by Piguet could reduce the vulnerability of women who are seeking decent work. However, other actors and especially state actors often move and control trafficked women with little regard for the wishes or needs of the women so obstructed or constrained. The term 'reverse trafficking' can be used to describe the processes such as deportation forced upon trafficked women particularly by state actors that do not allow the women involved meaningful agency.

Reverse trafficking is typically resolved according to the agenda of the more powerful actor. However, the resistance of trafficked women to these outcomes by re-engaging with traffickers to negate the reverse trafficking imposed on them is of considerable interest. The deliberate re-engagement shows that current assumptions about the objectives of many trafficked women are misplaced or are deliberately ignored. Rather than a satisfactory outcome and conclusion to a trafficking episode, a reverse trafficking experience is often just another aspect of an ongoing trafficking episode. Interventions that result in reverse trafficking offer the trafficked woman only a demonstration of the perverse symbiosis that exists between the traffickers and certain other actors. Each actor seems to parody the other in their treatment of the trafficked women: traffickers take the woman to a place she wants to be, but abuse and exploit her there, the other actors try to stop that abuse but usually insist that the trafficked woman then returns to a place where she does not want to be.

### 3.4.2 *Repeat trafficking*

Women are often deported from the EC as illegal migrants rather than returned as trafficked women. Some women have even pretended to be Albanian so as to avoid being returned to a more distant country (Lesko 2005). These women expect that they will be able to return more easily to the EC from Albania than their own place of origin (IOM &

ICMC 2001; IOM & ICMC 2002). There are a number of women who leave the place where they were trafficked to and return to their country of origin, but many of these women then return to the trafficking environment often in spite of attempts to prevent them from doing so. Such attempts to prevent their repeat trafficking are often considered by women to be unwarranted and inappropriate interventions, such interventions include:

1. In South and South East Asia trafficked women who have been supposedly rescued from brothels are sometimes held against their will by non-governmental agencies which incarcerate them in secure residential homes so as to prevent them being trafficked again. (Hindu 2002; Empower 2003)
2. Between India and Nepal other women are prevented from exercising their right to cross a border because an NGO representative identifies them as being a potential trafficking victim. (Maiti Nepal 2004)
3. In Albania returning women have rejected the services that various Shelter centres offer as unwanted and irrelevant and many have deliberately avoided referral to such shelters. (Lesko 2005)
4. When Indian sex workers recently met with the Indian Minister of Women's Affairs they unanimously denounced the offered rehabilitation services as unnecessary. (ASG 2006)

In the Balkans, NGO rescue centres report the escape of their residents as the women being coerced back into trafficking rather than women fleeing the NGO regime (Davies 2001; RCP 2003). As details of the poor conditions of these shelters and more importantly the poor outcomes for women placed in such shelters have become known, commentators such as Waugh (2006) have speculated that the declining numbers of women using such shelters could be because they do not value those services. Women who are removed from trafficking situations and then return to trafficking harm are often described as having been repeat trafficked, implying that the first trafficking event had in some way been resolved and that then a new and second event had occurred (UNODC 2006). The considerable numbers of women who after being returned to their country of origin leave rescue shelters and return to trafficking as the repeat victims of trafficking are explained away by commentators such as Malarek as follows:

This is the saddest reality ... The women are forever tarred as whores, unwanted in their former homes. Many have committed suicide. Many have had massive nervous breakdowns ... they say upwards of 50% of rescued girls are re-trafficked. They try to es-



cape their village, they go to a city and there is only one thing they know how to do. (Malarek interviewed by Dunn 2006)

Among trafficked women using the Vatra rehabilitation project in Albania, more than 60 per cent have been re-trafficked (Lesko 2005). Lesko (2005) considered re-trafficking to be the major trafficking issue currently confronting Albania and like Malarek, she considers stigma and prejudice to be the overwhelming reason that women reengage with traffickers. However, Bylander (2006) challenges this assumption and argues that women who engage in repeat trafficking are probably motivated by economic considerations regarding expected financial gains. That more than 50 per cent of the very few women who are rescued should in any circumstance become re-trafficked is a serious indictment of the policy of returning such women to such vulnerable circumstances.

### 3.5 Analytical trafficking matrix

The analytical trafficking matrix in Table 5, allows examination of the differing presumptions made about trafficked women and the expected outcomes of various interventions. Where disparities or incongruities occur the matrix should then be able to suggest alternative explanations for the trafficking phenomena being considered and other possible interventions that might influence the trafficking crisis. The matrix might be able to identify other women who are being trafficked who do not fit common stereotypes.

At this time, it is apparent that only certain problems of trafficked women are usually visible and as such interventions are usually limited to what little is understood of those issues. The analytical matrix helps to identify problems that will suggest various interventions. Such interventions may or may not be common practice or possible and they will only help certain women or address certain problems. These interventions might be limited to certain geographies or political region and might only offer solutions to women with certain nationalities or other attributes. All will affect the migration order in some way and as such, the influence of interventions including the actions of the women involved should suggest how trafficking might best be subverted and the opportunity costs properly assessed.

The analytical matrix will allow strategies to be developed that are properly targeted to specific harms. A change in migration policy that allows women to safely migrate without resorting to trafficking would not directly affect abuse in prostitution in a destination country but it might eventually affect the commercial sex industry if the number of women being successfully trafficked through the industry was reduced.

It might require the industry to offer better terms and conditions to attract more women. IOM has recently commented that traffickers have begun to offer women better terms and conditions in the Balkans (IOM 2004), since Romanian and Bulgarian women have been able to access the EC without resorting to the Balkan trafficking routes.

Abuse in prostitution cannot be directly resolved through use of the trafficking matrix as the matrix can only explain trafficking in regard to migration. However, by considering the importance of social networks to trafficked women, interventions into sex-work environments could be devised to reduce the exploitation of any sex-working woman that would also influence trafficking. A non-specifically trafficking related intervention could involve regulating or manipulating the local sex-work environment to encourage the use of clubs or venues where sex-working women could have regular contact with people outside of their exploiter's control. According to agencies in Italy seeking to help trafficked women this would be preferable to suppressing the sex work into private apartments and other hidden places where any woman can be compelled to work without such contact (Waugh 2006). Where sex work is visible and accessible it is hard to keep women fully sequestered as they must access the sex-work environment if they are to make profits for exploiters and Steinfatt (2003) has argued that contact with others in the sex-work environment can become the point at which exploitation can be subverted.

The Analytical Trafficking Matrix takes the six categories of Van Hear's (1998) migration model and places the various circumstances that are associated with trafficking harms into sections that are linked to aspects of migration theory that might help explain such circumstances. Interventions that reflect demand as the focal problem are also arraigned in the various theoretical areas as are other possible interventions and questions that might help identify better conceptualisations. As such, it becomes possible to identify areas where interventions are weak or do not address circumstances that result in forced labour and the possibility of alternatives to demand as the only focal problem.

By referring to the analytical matrix (Table 3.1), it can be seen that a number of interventions that could be expected to impact on a trafficking crisis are not commonly implemented and do not form part of the current demand and prevention, prosecution and protection responses. Such possible responses include extending increasing mobility rights to women and regularisation programmes for women leaving trafficking. Furthermore, women who migrate for reasons other than demand are probably impervious to prevention, prosecution and protection responses, and likely use the interventions to inform and organise their trafficking experiences rather than avoiding trafficking. Such women

could include those women who abscond from rehabilitation programmes and re-engage with traffickers, and those women who deliberately seek to transit trafficking to permanent settlement in the country of destination. If the women who consider themselves to be in an intolerable situation in their country of origin judge that in spite of their knowledge of trafficking harms, that trafficking offers opportunities to resolve their life crisis, then these women can be expected to resort to traffickers.

### 3.6 Better conceptualisation

The 'trafficking crisis' is a contemporary event to the pivotal change in the World Migratory Order that was identified by Van Hear (1998). This pivotal change was considered to be the herald of various migration crises in a number of migration orders. Van Hear researched the role of harassment of vulnerable migrant groups specifically considering the violence and intimidation that these groups suffered concerning their migration decision making and the subsequent migration crisis. The people that Van Hear researched were subjected to various forms of abuse because of their race, nationality or ethnic identity; they were 'others' and many responded to this abuse by exercising newly acquired migration possibilities. Mobility in the 1990s has increasingly become a means by which to resolve 'intolerable' situations whereas prior to such migration opportunity many people were constrained in such situations. Van Hear considered that most people did not move because they were directly persecuted but because of their sense of intolerability. However, the sense of what is intolerable is a very individual calculation suggesting that such movements are the actor-orientated responses of people making very subjective decisions about their personal circumstances.

In all of the episodes, inducing people to leave involved varying combinations of harassment, intimidation, persecution and actual violence. But while intimidation, persecution and violence could be widespread, sparing application of abuse could yield disproportionate results, for fear was as potent a means of inducing people to move as actual violence. Indeed, the majority of the people in these episodes moved, not because they were directly persecuted or because of actual violence against them, but because they felt that life was no longer tolerable in the place they were trying to make a life. In terms of the framework ... these people were left with little choice but to move. (Van Hear 1998: 149)

Table 3.1 *The trafficking crisis matrix*

| Van Hear's migration order  | Circumstances during a trafficking crisis that often result in forced labour   | Demand and prevention, protection interventions  | Other possible interventions in the migration order   | Investigative questions   |
|---|--|--|---|---|
| 1. Individual decision making across a wider range of considerations including non-economic aspects relating to personal development and security | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Trafficker directly compel or deceive the decision-making and migration process</li> <li>2. Women find their circumstances intolerable and intentionally use trafficking as a mobility strategy</li> <li>3. Women having migrated safely are compelled into forced labour</li> <li>4. Women use sex work as an income generation strategy after migration.</li> <li>5. Women are 'illegal' in countries of destination</li> <li>6. Men with foreign residency can easily attract a marriage partner who can be exploited</li> <li>7. Gender inequalities allow a culture of exploitation among some social groups</li> <li>8. Trafficking is profitable</li> </ol> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Prevention information campaigns warning of trafficking risks</li> <li>2. Rescue and rehabilitation of trafficked women</li> <li>3. Repatriation of trafficked women</li> <li>4. Prosecution of traffickers and confiscation of their assets</li> <li>5. Repression of sex markets and specific policing of trafficking</li> </ol> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Visa-free mobility policy</li> <li>2. Easier labour migration</li> <li>3. Client-driven assistance programmes</li> <li>4. Regularisation programmes</li> <li>5. Legalisation of sex industry</li> <li>6. Application of labour laws and health safety to the sex industry</li> <li>7. Support services for migrant and sex-working women</li> <li>8. Accessible and supervised work placement programmes for migrant women</li> </ol> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Are all trafficked women coerced or deceived?</li> <li>2. Are those women who are willing to work as sex workers always unaware of the conditions of work?</li> <li>3. How are traffickers able to sustain compulsion or deception?</li> <li>4. Why do women resort to high-risk migration strategies?</li> <li>5. What are the objectives of these women and can they be achieved without trafficking?</li> <li>6. Can traffickers be repressed through LEA interventions?</li> <li>7. Why do so many women not want to go home?</li> <li>8. How do most women resolve their trafficking episode?</li> </ol> |

|   |   |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| <p>2. Household decision-making strategies based principally on new economic considerations</p>   | <p>1. Patrilocal marriage invests household decision making in the trafficker</p> <p>2. Trafficker directly compel or deceive the decision-making process</p> <p>3. Families are culturally obliged to arrange good marriages for their daughters</p> <p>4. Families and partnerships make decisions to have women migrate using trafficking agents</p> <p>5. Men with foreign residency can easily attract a marriage partner who can be exploited</p> <p>6. Trafficking is profitable</p> | <p>1. Prevention information campaigns warning of trafficking risks</p> <p>2. Rescue and rehabilitation of trafficked women</p> <p>3. Repatriation of trafficked women</p> <p>4. Prosecution of traffickers and confiscation of their assets</p> <p>5. Repression of sex markets</p> <p>6. Increased border controls and specific policing of trafficking</p> | <p>1. Visa-free mobility policy</p> <p>2. Easier labour migration</p> <p>3. Client-driven assistance programmes</p> <p>4. Regularisation programmes</p> | <p>1. Are families satisfied with the outcomes?</p> <p>2. Are the information campaigns effective and how are they used to inform decision making?</p> <p>3. What are the risks of visa-free travel?</p> <p>4. If the trafficker is the patrilocal husband, how can his privilege be subverted?</p> |
| <p>3. Wider considerations of disparities again reflecting particularly the importance of decisions relating to disparities affecting personal development and security</p> | <p>1. Women want to leave discriminatory and gender-oppressive Albania and have an expectation of improving their personal security by marriage to a man in the country of destination or by furthering their education/career</p>  | <p>1. Behaviour change campaigns intended to promote the rights of women</p> <p>2. Prosecution of domestic violence abusers</p> <p>3. Projects intended to promote better employment and education opportunities for women</p>  | <p>1. Visa-free mobility policy</p> <p>2. Disrupt the control systems used by traffickers</p>   | <p>1. Can these gender and cultural push factors be mitigated?</p> <p>2. Are the expectations realistic and achievable?</p> <p>3. Are women safer and happier after migration?</p> <p>4. How are trafficked women controlled?</p>   |

|   |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| <p>2. Other women find such circumstances so intolerable they feel compelled to leave by any possible means</p> | <p>1. Trafficking networks are often the only migration networks accessible to women that do not require marriage to an Albanian husband</p> <p>2. These networks also tend to be affordable and efficient</p> <p>3. Weak social networks are unable to support the migration of the women</p> | <p>1. Law enforcement suppression of all irregular migration networks</p>  | <p>1. Reduced policing of irregular migration networks and tolerance for non-trafficking networks</p> <p>2. Visa-free mobility policy</p> <p>3. Support for positive social networks that support migrant women</p> <p>4. Development visas that offer legal migration opportunities at less cost than trafficking options</p> <p>5. Regularisation programmes</p> | <p>1. How can other migration networks be made available as alternatives to the high-risk trafficking networks?</p> <p>2. Are women aware of the trafficking risks?</p> <p>3. Can regular migration be made more accessible?</p> |
| <p>4. Social and migration networks and the structural and institutional settings in which they operate</p>     | <p>1. Young women are often unable to travel legally because they cannot comply with visa issuance provisions</p> <p>2. Migration for participation in the regular labour market is difficult</p>  | <p>1. Information distributed to visa applicants warning of trafficking risks</p> <p>2. Consular staff trained to spot possible trafficking victims</p> <p>3. Reduction in 'entertainment' visas</p> | <p>1. Visa-free mobility policy</p> <p>2. Development visas that offer legal migration opportunities at less cost than trafficking options</p> <p>3. Labour organisation in the sex industry</p>   | <p>1. Is it possible that women who resort to trafficking networks can be given other migration opportunities?</p> <p>2. Can such women be given easier access to the regular labour market?</p>                                 |
| <p>5. Migration policy as reflected by direct and indirect policy impacts on migrants</p>                       | <p>1. Information distributed to visa applicants warning of trafficking risks</p> <p>2. Consular staff trained to spot possible trafficking victims</p> <p>3. Reduction in 'entertainment' visas</p>   | <p>1. Visa-free mobility policy</p> <p>2. Development visas that offer legal migration opportunities at less cost than trafficking options</p> <p>3. Labour organisation in the sex industry</p>     | <p>1. Is it possible that women who resort to trafficking networks can be given other migration opportunities?</p> <p>2. Can such women be given easier access to the regular labour market?</p>   | <p>1. Is it possible that women who resort to trafficking networks can be given other migration opportunities?</p> <p>2. Can such women be given easier access to the regular labour market?</p>                                 |

|   |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| <p>3. Irregular migrants cannot easily regularise their residence and must remain in the informal economy</p>       | <p>4. Trafficked women are often deported and sometimes offered temporary forms of residence</p> <p>5. Irregular women are deported</p>   | <p>3. Must such women be repatriated?</p> <p>4. Is such exclusion sustainable?</p>  |
| <p>6. Geo-political forces operating at the macro level and particularly linked to the process of globalisation</p> | <p>1. Increasing calls for demand to be addressed through the criminalisation of clients</p> <p>2. Direct linking of some bilateral funding to anti-prostitution activities</p> <p>3. World Bank requires anti-trafficking components in large development projects</p> <p>4. International conventions to address trafficking</p> <p>5. Multi-national and regional policies on trafficking</p> <p>6. Cooperation led by international police agencies</p> <p>7. Aggressive prosecution of traffickers and other abusers pushed forward by international commitments</p> | <p>1. Can the demand for female labour be mitigated?</p> <p>2. Can the demand for sexual services be repressed?</p> <p>3. Would any such mitigation/repression reduce exploitation?</p> <p>4. Can such market forces be sustainably denied?</p> |

If some women are making similar decisions to migrate based on their 'otherness' as women and because of direct or indirect experiences of patriarchal abuse or some other 'intolerable' disadvantage, then their movement will continue until they can escape what they consider to be intolerable. If these opinions of their place of origin as argued by Collyer (2006) are the crucial individual indicators of eventual migration then women will make decisions to migrate to escape the intolerable regardless of any demand for their participation in trafficking and prostitution.

### 3.7 Conclusions

If trafficking is used by some women as an escape from the very subjective experience of supposedly intolerable circumstances, then this would be a previously unknown reason for women being trafficked. Understanding that some women deliberately use trafficking in this way would help agencies design programmes, using methods that had a better fit with the agenda of these women. These options would likely be a welcome alternative to relying on the reverse trafficking of women back to oppressive intolerable environments. It would also allow for the development of more appropriate prevention programmes that could offer women useful and practical advice on safe irregular migration rather than seeking to use the fear of rape message intended to simply deter their mobility.

The conceptualisation of demand, as the focal problem of trafficking, would consider that particularly young and poor women are drawn towards and then compelled to participate in trafficking. This is because the profits available to traffickers are sufficient to encourage them to recruit women through an ongoing range of deceptive and coercive means. Vulnerability to this demand is often predicated on a belief that vulnerable women are willing to migrate because of poverty (El-Cherkeh, Stribu et al. 2004) and that, should they be able to find suitably paid work in their country of origin, they would not engage in migration that caused them to be vulnerable to abuse (CoE 2002; RCP 2003). The inability of the poor to finance their own migration (Sabates-Wheeler & Waddington 2003) means that traffickers are able to entice such vulnerable women with various entrapments such as debt bondage arrangements intended to finance the cost of the migration. Shifting recruitment strategies would suggest that women use information about traffickers to negotiate various terms and conditions of service, especially when reengaging with traffickers after an initial trafficking experience.



However, this purely economic understanding of migration decision making would be contested by many aspects of wider migration theory (Massey 1993) and Van Hear's work in particular (1998). Furthermore, it does not consider the motivation of women who are moving because they consider their circumstances intolerable because of structural disadvantages, social exclusion and gendered abuse. These other considerations do not exclude poverty and demand, but they offer another way to analyse trafficking events.

It has often been asked why do not all poor women migrate (Ehrenreich & Hochschild 2003; Adepoju 2004) and why do not all poor women sell sex (Doezema 2000; Ehrenreich & Hochschild 2003)? These questions are often prompted as the structural and institutional experiences of poor women can be so similar while their responses can be so varied. The acknowledgement of the highly individual perceptions of similar circumstances allows for varied responses to be understood as actor-oriented and occurring along an immense and complicated continuum of individual decision making and other experiences. If as suggested by Van Hear (1998) and argued by Collyer (2006) the tipping point for action is the subjective decision of what is considered personally and individually intolerable, we have a possible means for understanding the wide range of different actor-oriented responses to very similar experiences of poverty, social exclusion, social disadvantage and gender violence.

As trafficking is considered not to have been well understood and its heterogeneous features have not usually been seen as various aspects of a complex trafficking crisis, responses to trafficking have often been driven by inadequate and superficial conceptualisations of the phenomenon (Tyldum & Brunovskis 2005). Contests between competing explanations of differing aspects and types of trafficking rather than being integrated into a more comprehensive and diverse set of complementary theories have often resulted in monotonous and limited interventions that have been noticeably ineffective (*ibid.*), possibly because of the incorrect prioritisation of certain problems (Aftab 2005).

The trafficking crisis matrix allows for certain aspects of trafficking to be layered and seen in the context of often well-understood migration theory. It then becomes obvious that certain interventions will affect the trafficking crisis in different ways and address different trafficking problems. The trafficking crisis matrix enables unnecessary contests regarding differing understandings of trafficking problems to be fitted as complimentary responses to different aspects of the phenomenon. It is obvious that present responses only address a limited and partial section of trafficked women and better-informed interventions are required. Understanding trafficking as crisis in a migration order will allow for more nuanced and considered interventions. Such

nuanced interventions can then be directed towards a specific migration order with the intention to subvert trafficking, particularly about reducing the risks experienced by women seeking to escape personally intolerable circumstances in their country of origin. The opportunity costs of inadequate or non-intervention can be more easily identified as well as unjustified refusals to undertake institutional or structural reforms that would reduce the sustainability of a trafficking crisis. The trafficking crisis matrix allows questions to be asked that increase the visibility of other trafficking problems beyond those associated with current stereotypes dominated by demand and economic considerations. Therefore, the matrix offers the means to develop improved conceptualisations and so allow a more nuanced set of focal problems to be identified which can then be used to hypothesise refinements to theory.

It is now important to investigate the experiences of the trafficked women to see if these considerations are useful in understanding and explaining the diversity of their trafficking experiences. In particular it should now be possible to consider:

1. Is 'demand' the focal problem of trafficking?
2. Who it trafficked and why?
3. How are they similar or how are they different and why?
4. Do some women deliberately use trafficking and if so why?
5. How do they move?
6. How are they controlled?
7. How do women manage or escape from trafficking
8. How can migration theories better explain trafficking?
9. What might reduce trafficking?

The next chapter examines who is trafficked and offers explanation for why different groups of women are trafficked for very different reasons. It also considers how different migration theories can explain their involvement in trafficking.

## 4 Leaving Albania

In this chapter, I describe and analyse the declared migration motivation and migration decision making of the researched women. I also examine common assumptions about the origins of trafficked women and other assumptions about how and why they are involved in trafficking. I will argue that these assumptions are flawed and trafficking theories about Albania must therefore be re-conceptualised. I describe the different types of women who have been recruited into trafficking in Albania and demonstrate how this trafficking flow has evolved. I argue that some traditional social values and practices are influencing some young women to try and migrate to secure more personal freedoms as well as to still acquire the traditional indicators of a successful family life. I then specifically describe how many Albanian women are migrating to escape social traditions that they consider intolerable and that because of a lack of migration opportunities an increasing number of women, especially divorced women, are deliberately resorting to trafficking as the means to escape this intolerability.

I finally contend that conceptualisations based on mistaken assumptions have compounded the difficulties faced by women wanting to escape repressive and patriarchal subjugation by preventing their experiences and desires from being properly understood. Consequently, I conclude that to return trafficked women to communities that they experience as intolerable is cruel and will invariably result in the repeat trafficking of women seeking to escape what they consider subjectively to be unbearable prejudice and repression.

### 4.1 Where do trafficked women come from?

In theorising about migration trajectories and experiences, it is important to be able to accurately identify the place of origin of the migrant (Castles, Booth et al. 1984; Massey 1993). It is important to know about the place of origin of migrants because it is in the social and economic circumstances of the place of origin that researchers seek explanations for motivation and the migration decision making process (Sabates-Wheeler & Waddington 2003; Black, Ammassari et al. 2004). There-

fore, in considering trafficking, correctly identifying the place of origin of the trafficked people would be an important aspect of understanding how a trafficking crisis develops. In Albania, identifying the places of origin of trafficking victims has become subject to misconceptions that have in turn influenced how trafficking in Albania has been understood.

In Albania, it is Roma women and rural women who have been considered more vulnerable to trafficking; commentators such as Lesko (2005), Renton (2001a), and others (Alban 2002; AAGW 2005; Fishka 2005) have identified such women as being the majority of the women trafficked from Albania. The variation in the rural-urban populations of trafficked women has attracted particular comment from Lesko (2005). Lesko is the director of the main shelter for trafficked women in Albania, and she is acknowledged as a local expert on Albanian trafficking (Limanowska 2004). She was also the recipient of the Anti-Slavery award in 2003 for her work on Albanian trafficking issues (Lesko 2003). In 2002, she reported that most of her clients were from the underdeveloped rural Northeast of Albania, (Alban 2002); in more recent years, she has declared that more than 60 per cent of Albanian trafficking victims have been from the rural areas (Lesko, Dragoti et al. 2004; Lesko 2005).

However, it is accepted even within the reports that identify the rural women as disproportionately represented among the trafficked (Renton 2001; Lesko 2005) that many Albanian trafficked women report themselves as coming from urban centres such as Vlore, Fier and Berat. However, many of these women are then considered to be rural women pretending to be urban women so as to escape the stigma associated with being from a rural area (Lesko 2005). On this basis, Lesko argues that the percentage of trafficked women who are from rural areas is probably much higher than 60 per cent. Furthermore, she does not accept reports from women that they are not trafficked when they are willingly engaged in prostitution, so she considers all Albanian women in sex work to be trafficked (*ibid.*). Lesko would certainly consider all of the researched women in Lyon to be trafficked women and probably to be rural women, regardless of any representations to the contrary.

It is known that more than 60% of the victims come from the rural areas, where the backward mentality is prevalent. (Lesko 2005: 47)

All the girls from the villages have never enjoyed the freedom and civilisation of the girls from the city, because of the backward mentality of those areas. In order to seem emancipated they say that they live in the city ... so they say that they come from the city when in effect it is the contrary. (Lesko 2005: 33)

All the Albanian trafficked girls and women, whether prostituting upon their consent or forcefully are victims of trafficking in human beings. (Lesko 2005: 32)

However, only eight of the researched women had moved directly from, or in less than five years from, a rural location to their trafficking episode; the majority of the researched women had spent their whole lives or at least several formative years in urban locations before leaving Albania. Lesko does not say how she classifies rural or urban origin (Lesko 2005). From the researched women based on place of birth rather than any possible later socialisation, 42 women self-identified as being from an urban origin. The researched women reported that urban women formed the majority of trafficked women in every area in the EC that they worked, except around Bari and parts of Southern Italy.

I could work in Rimini which is where you have to be more sophisticated because of the clients ... the rural women are not clever enough to work in such places so the *Çuna* keep them in Italy in the south and that is why they are sent back more often ... the police are very active there ... there are not many rural women here or in Torino ... E1<sup>†</sup>

We are all nearly from the towns because the town girls are much more able to do this work. R1

... It was very interesting to see how people from different cities, have chosen a certain city in Italy. Like in Turin, you find mainly people from Elbasan in Milan you find mainly people from Tirana, in Roma it is mixed ... in Naples is mainly people from Berat. Florence and Bologna is mainly inhabited by people from Korca ... In Bari it is mixed ... and there are many rural women there because it is practically rural I mean not developed ... everybody is Albanian and those who are not, they speak Albanian, the policemen and everybody in Bari. I2

Within Albania the rural-urban divide is used to mark rural dwellers as having a 'backward mentality' (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997; Lesko 2005).

While we might not have had class divides, if you came from a village everyone from the town would consider you an inferior ... and we know where everyone is from ... you cannot hide your biography... T2

When women among the researched women tried to disguise their place of origin they were quickly discovered and identified by the other women.

I did not want the other women to know I was from a co-operative, so I told them I was from the town. If they knew I was from the village collective they would mock me ... but they know where I am from... N2

It is believed that women who are poor, unemployed, undereducated, and unmarried from the rural areas who are most involved in trafficking (Renton 2001). In particular, unmarried rural women have been considered morally suspect, and their uncontrolled sexuality is still understood as a particular risk to traditional social order (Durham 2000; Elsie 2001). This conceptualisation of unmarried rural women has then been used to inform an analysis of trafficking in Albania and also to frame interventions. The role of the civic society leaders as local key informants has allowed this conceptualisation to be received as expert knowledge (Renton 2001; Lesko 2005).

It is possible that the departure of rural women and girls from their close knit communities was more apparent than the departure of urban women and girls, and that rural women in Albania were also more surveyed and researched as the increased obviousness of their disappearances attracted more comment and attention from the media and local experts (Woodruff 2001; PBS 2004). Researchers' attention was directed towards trafficking from rural communities because they were identified as the most problematic areas by local key informants (Renton 2001). However, the researched women reported that in their opinion trafficking started in central and southern regional cities such as Tirana, Durres, Fier, Berat and Vlore, and that once women were proving harder to recruit in those cities traffickers resorted to recruitment in other places including the rural areas and especially the rural North.

I think it started in Berat and Vlore, because there the girls were more willing to go with boys and it was a way to get out of Albania and make money. The girls there could speak Italian and once they were away from their families who would know what they were doing ... Who would take a girl from the village when there were so many from the towns willing to go ...? T-Çuni<sup>2</sup>

The Southern cities offered proximity to the migration routes to Greece and Italy, and many of the young women could speak some Greek or Italian learnt from television, school and friends (Mai 2003). The importance of Southern cities in the growth of trafficking, Berat being

the main areas of initial recruitment, has also been widely reported (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997; MDI 2002; Kirby 2005), but early accounts have been replaced by repeated reports that it is the North and rural areas that are the source of most trafficked women (AAGW 2005; Fishka 2005; Lesko 2005).

On the contrary the South has been historically more civilized and as a consequence more liberal. This is one of the causes, that the massive Albanian prostitution is mainly supplied by the southern areas of Albania, where in top position stand Berat, etc. ... (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 12)

When I started in 93 and I was only 14, everyone was from the Southern towns particularly Berat and Vlore ... the Northern women came after us ... A1

When speaking with *Çuna*, the men would express their preferences for recruiting urbanised women, as they were considered to be more sophisticated and cultured, and also living in a city they were more accessible than rural women. Urbanised women were also considered more sexually adventurous and able to adjust more easily to sex working.

... girls in the city know more about life and are more willing to get it on, they know what men want and how to give it to them, but those girls from the villages have to be taught everything ...  
A-Çuni

Town girls know they have to perform well if they want to impress a man and that makes them more willing to learn, also they know from their girl friends what to expect ... E-Çuni

Anti-Slavery International, ILO and much of the media are also convinced that rural women are the dominant population among trafficked Albanian women (ASI 2003; PBS 2004; Topi 2004). IOM and the Balkan Regional Clearing Point for Trafficking Information considered that after an initial period of recruiting rural women and girls, traffickers were forced to shift to recruiting urban women as 'awareness raising' information campaigns prevented the easy recruitment of rural women (RCP 2003; IOM 2004; Fishka 2005). This promoted the idea that awareness raising strategies were effective anti-trafficking tools, and the most common awareness raising material used in Albanian schools still identifies rural women as being more vulnerable than urban women to trafficking (AAGW 2005; AAGW 2005). However, the

evolution of trafficking recruitment strategies seems to represent other factors and a return to urban recruitment represents not so much the success of rural awareness raising activities, but a shift in the terms and conditions demanded by certain urban women (IOM 2004).

I got my first girls in Fier and Durres, I offered to marry them and they agreed to come to Italy, but then it wasn't so easy once the women started to know the score. I got one girl from the village at Zgjana near Lushnja but that was so many problems with getting there, getting back dealing with her family, always problems. Then later the girls in Durres started to offer to go to Italy for money so I took two more from Durres. They knew the business but couldn't afford the boats and they needed somewhere to work in Italy and some protection ... It is best if you can get a town girl for love, but if they will do it for money that is good too ... *A-Çuni*

The rural women's apparent over-representation in trafficking reports (Renton 2001; ASI 2003; Limanowska 2004; Lesko 2005) must be explained if Albanian trafficking is to be better understood. If rural women are in a majority in the South of Italy and are more often deported to Vlore, this might have explained the disproportional bias, but Lesko collects her data from all of Albania's points of return (Lesko 2005). While all trafficked women are stigmatised, it is reported that rural women face more stigma in their communities (Lesko 2005). However, another explanation appears potentially more significant, Albania has a policy that requires the police to refer women who they believe have been trafficked to NGO so comprehensive interviews and assessments of the women can be undertaken (RoA 2005). As the police conflate migratory sex work and trafficking, this leads to any returning woman identified by the police to have been working in sex work to be categorised as a trafficked woman and then interviewed by the NGO sector regardless of whether the women wanted to be interviewed (Lesko 2005; RoA 2005). If Roma and rural women are presumed to be trafficked more often it could be harder for these women to avoid identification as trafficked women. The researched women reported that they wanted to avoid this identification as trafficked women and placement in the shelter home when returning to Albania, this was especially the case as prostitution in Albania is still a crime and women are regularly imprisoned for prostitution. The researched women avoided identification as trafficked women by having an appropriate cover story about why they had been abroad and by bribing the police not to give their details to the NGO centre.



To avoid being put in the Centre (after deportation from Italy) you have to make sure you have a change of clothes and some hidden money in your bag so you don't look like a whore when you get off the boat and so you can give the police *baksheesh*,<sup>3</sup> because if you don't you can end up having to fuck every policeman in Vlore and then spend weeks in the bloody rescue centre while they tell the whole world you are whore. Most clever women now carry a spare set of ordinary clothes in their bag and some *baksheesh* when they are working to avoid being arrested in Albania and being put in the centre ... V1

The researched women wanted to avoid detection and referral to Lesko's shelter home in Vlore, so they could avoid their families discovering about their sex-work activities, as the shelter home would contact their families to collect them (Lesko 2005).

They refuse to join their families. It often occurs that those girls deported have money with them. They use them to bribe the policemen in the border points: in exchange for being set free and skipping the identification procedures. These policemen justify their actions using the expression: 'they are adults and have the right to chose'. (Lesko 2005: 17)

Women can also be detained against their will in Lesko's Vatra Shelter:<sup>4</sup>

However, women are not allowed to leave the shelter without proper documents, so they have to wait for their families to arrange and bring the papers ... the legal grounds for such a procedure are unclear ... However, in this shelter women are not free to leave when they want, which is clearly a violation of their rights. (Limanowska 2004: 42)

The researched women also wanted to avoid local stigma from being identified as sex workers and the several days or longer of detention at the shelter home while the agency contacted their families.

They just reinforce the old ways... I have not got time to waste talking to people who despise us and can do nothing but create scandal with our families. I am 25 ... I am not a child if I don't want to see my family that is my right ... BLE

... I don't want to be publicly know as a prostitute in my town ... and if my parents get a call from them everything will come out ... also I don't want them to prosecute my *Çuni* because then the

state will confiscate the house and we will have nothing ... L1

... Everyone in my town knows I am a 'waitress' in France ... so I don't want to go home and be the object of their gossip ... I just want to spend a few days with my friends and maybe see my mother in private and then come back to France .... S3

Some women even feared that they might be subjected to further restrictions on their mobility if they were put in the Vatra shelter home in Vlore.

I am too scared to go to Albania in case the police catch me and put me in the shelter at Vlore, and then the shelter people will try to stop you leaving Albania again. I will wait until I can arrange for my mother to meet me at Vlore. If she is there the police will not detain me ... L2

The researched women considered those unable to avoid detection or detention to be women who were socially inept and those who needed to be rescued from violent men.

... You should go to the shelter in Albania if you are injured and have a bad *Çuni* and if you don't know how to deal with him ... but if you want to get rid of a bad *Çuni* you should do it in France or Italy where he cannot bribe the police so easily. They will also keep him in the prison before the trial ... don't screw with them in Albania because they or their cousins will catch you ... A1

... only the losers and turnip heads (rural women) get put in the shelter. A2

Presumptions about trafficked Albanian women referred to aid programmes representing the whole population of trafficked women have not been restricted to Lesko's organisation (Waugh 2006). IOM Rome argued that all Albanian trafficked women were very emotionally disturbed and afflicted by serious psychological problems (IOM Rome 2002). These presumptions were based on the assessment of eighteen Albanian trafficked women voluntarily repatriated by IOM in 2001; no consideration was made for the possibility that only disturbed and incapacitated women might have been unable to return to Albania without IOM assistance.

The researched women were also aware of how they were represented in the various media particularly in Western Europe and how

they were conflated with Non-EEA women from the CEE and CIS as being 'Natashas' (Loncle 2001; Malarek 2004) the naïve, innocent victims of organised crime. Their rejection of the typical representation was as emphatic as it was informative about how they viewed the contrived victimhood of a 'Natasha'<sup>5</sup>.

My name is not Natasha! and I am not an idiot ... A2

## 4.2 Roma and trafficking

The Roma groups make up about 5 per cent of the Albanian population and the top estimate for their total population is approximately 150,000 (Koinova 2000). The Roma community is significantly disadvantaged in regards to every social indicator and is widely discriminated against (De Soto, Beddies et al. 2005). The main Roma communities are located in and around the urban centres of Tirana, Fier, Gjirokastra, Berat and Korçe (Koinova 2000; De Soto & Gedeshi 2002).

In considering who is trafficked from Albania, it is often said that the Roma communities supply most of the women for trafficking (De Soto, Beddies et al. 2005; Lesko 2005), but among the researched women only six women were identified as Roma, and the rest were 'white' Albanians.<sup>6</sup> Roma women were identified by self-identification which was triangulated by seeking comments from other women in the community about the ethnic identity of a particular woman.

Ongoing research and analysis on the phenomenon that Vatra has carried out has identified the fact that about 50.2 per cent of victims of trafficking come from the Egyptian and Romany minority communities. (Lesko 2005: 1)

The fact that they were gypsies shows that this profession was exercised from members of the lowest level of the Albanian society ... Prostitution in other groups of the society was almost nonexistent ... (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 3-8)

However, Roma women have other explanations for why they appear disproportionately in modern trafficking accounts.

If you are a Roma you better be very smart, because you are always the first to get deported and sent back. You must be polite, clever and well dressed ... if you look like a Roma and can't speak properly you will be sent back quickly. The poor Roma women are sent back first because they can't pay the police and the

*Çuna* give them up to be deported because they don't make much money ... R3

Everyone assumes we are prostitutes even if we are not ... My cousin was in Greece just to visit my aunt who was working on a farm. My aunt and cousin are not prostitutes, but when the Greek police came they deported all the Roma women as prostitutes, and then when they arrived in Albania they were declared as prostitutes. My cousin cried very much because she was not a prostitute but now she is made a prostitute in their files ... E3

The over-representation of Roma women in Lesko's reports can at least in part be explained by their prejudicial treatment and mis-identification as prostitutes. It is also possible that the prejudicial expectation that Roma women are involved in prostitution means they are less able to avoid referral to Lesko's shelter for assessment when they return to Albania. It is also possible that their experiences of trafficking make them more willing to seek institutional help. The prejudice against the Roma community in regards to trafficking has resulted in trafficking often being represented as a Roma problem.

The complexity of trafficking and the unawareness of its definition appears to be closely linked to the ... the racist bias connected to the problem. There is also a great distrust in the ways that statistical data has been generated, giving numbers and percentages of Roma victims and traffickers. ... Trafficking has many times been labelled a 'Roma/gypsy problem' by governmental representatives and NGOs/institutions. This view increases discrimination against Roma and generates stereotypes. ... Roma many times, in a racist way have been blamed for being guilty of trafficking. (ODIHR 2003: 4)

### 4.3 Which Albanian women are most vulnerable to trafficking?

With more than 60 per cent of trafficked women supposedly being rural women and more than 50 per cent being reported as Roma who are mainly an urban population, Albanian trafficking is being represented as a problem mostly of the Roma and rural communities (Lesko 2005; Lesko 2005). A consequence of Albanian trafficking being seen mainly as a rural and Roma phenomena is that the attributes assigned to rural and Roma communities have become indicators for vulnerability to being trafficked. The rural and Roma communities are poor (De Soto, Gordon et al. 2002), so poverty is considered in various reports to be a major indicator of trafficking vulnerability (ODIHR 2003; Topi 2004).

Other Roma and rural attributes such as unemployment, under-education and a lack of suitable husbands are also considered to add to the vulnerability of these women (Renton 2001; De Soto & Gedeshi 2002).

... there is still an urgent need to inform those in the remote areas because the conditions that make girls and women susceptible to the approaches of traffickers – poverty, unemployment, lack of education and reduced marriage prospects due to the mass emigration of boys – are as acute as ever. (Renton 2001)

The deep poverty remains one of the major reasons for the existence of organised prostitution in Albania. (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 8)

However, if the presumption about Roma and rural women being the most common women to be trafficked is incorrect, then the role of poverty, unemployment, education and other supposed indicators for trafficking need to be re-examined.

#### 4.4 Poverty

As previously mentioned, most women earned the equivalent of or more than the annual Albanian GDP PPP per capita every month once they were in Lyon, but poverty is experienced in various ways and is often subjectively reported by those describing their own poverty. The researched women when asked about poverty would often make very subjective statements about their experience of poverty both prior to and after their migration.

Of course we were all poor before coming here, we are Albanians ... what is poor? I am not starving but I have no security, no savings. Just because my *Çuni* has a Mercedes doesn't mean I am not still poor ... E1

I was poor in Albania and I am poor here ... today I earned 11,000 francs [approx € 1,900] I earn more money than most women here, but I am poor because I don't have a real home or any certainty about my future ... S2

Poverty in Albania has been researched (De Soto, Gordon et al. 2002) and poverty among the Roma has been specifically researched (De Soto & Gedeshi 2002). The impact of poverty on internal migration has also been researched (Carletto, Davis et al. 2006) Research on Albanian

poverty often utilises the Albanian Living Standards Measurement Survey (World Bank 2005) and extensive research projects have investigated the role of poverty in Albanian migration making reference to this data (Sabates-Wheeler, Reilly et al. 2003). While it is the rural poor who are considered the most likely to be trafficked abroad, they are also considered the least likely to migrate internationally (Reilly, Litchfield et al. 2005).

However, my own research was not so well informed or structured regarding understanding poverty and the diverse and complex circumstances of the researched women complicated my considerations. The women generated very large sums of money. While most of this was appropriated from them, they would often still claim that they had an interest in such monies. Many women did not want information about the poverty of their families to be recorded in the social matrix because of their concerns regarding stigma. In considering the poverty of the researched women, the research mainly uses the subjective voices of the researched women to describe their own notions of poverty and how they believed it affected their migration.

However, it is possible to look at poverty in Albania based on the criteria of the World Bank in 1997 as:

The main correlates of rural poverty are farm size and livestock holding, and off-farm income from wage employment and remittance. About one quarter of the rural population lives on a farm that is too small to provide a modest level of subsistence ... The poorest decile of people live on an agricultural income of less than 6,568 lek (equivalent to US \$ 70) per annum, and are unable to meet even their staple food requirements year round. They are dependent on the provision of subsidized wheat/flour through the winter months, and on cash transfers ...

Regardless of the poverty line used, urban poverty has some distinct characteristics.

- i) Poorest of all, both in terms of incidence and depth are households with an unemployed head, typically male, in his early 40s, and with little or no formal education.
- ii) Next are the three generational households headed by a pensioner, often a widow. While pensioners are not among the poorest, the presence of unemployed grown-up children and dependent grandchildren in their households makes them poor.
- iii) Households headed by a low-wage earning male constitute the third largest group in poverty. These household heads are about 50 years of age, have little or no education, and are employed or self-employed in a low paying job.

- iv) Families with three and more children are especially vulnerable to poverty.
- v) Households that have no regular source of market income and rely on social cash transfers are typically very poor. (World Bank 1997: 13)

About this specific definition, only four of the researched women described themselves as being so poor prior to their migration that they could not ensure adequate food, clothing or shelter for themselves or their families. Two of these poor women had made unsuccessful migrations with their husbands to Greece and had either been deported or returned with no savings. They considered these failed migrations to be significant in their decisions to resort to trafficking as a mobility strategy.

My husband drinks a lot so in Greece he could not find work so we knew Greece would not work for us, at the end I was selling sex to the other Albanians on the farm in Greece. It was a great shame so it was better that I do it somewhere else ... so after we were deported my husband made an agreement with the *Çuni* and I went to Italy. N2

We were very poor, the children had no shoes, and we stole from the fields to eat ... after things went wrong in Greece we knew we must find another way so we decided that I should do this ... I am glad that I am here ... now we are poor but we have enough to eat, the children have shoes and coats and we even have a television and fridge ... P1

These women had also been selling sex in Albania prior to their last departure for approx € 1 per sex act. All of these women except one came from rural locations; the other woman was a Roma woman from Tirana.

I had been in prison for a violent crime I had been raped when I was 17 and then I shot and killed the man who had done it. After prison I was a cleaner in a school I lost my job and I was unemployed for two years. My father would not let me do street cleaning at night because those women are known to be prostitutes. I was really poor I had to beg from friends and relatives for clothes and cigarettes ... it was a very hard time in my life. Z1

Of the three poor rural women among the researched women all had relied on their husbands to find a trafficker willing to take them to somewhere in the EC where they would work on a 50 per cent contract until they decided to return to Albania. The contract supposedly meant that 50 per cent of their earnings could be kept by the women; the contract was to run for at least a year and would continue until the women decided to return home. The fact that the traffickers were known to their husbands was considered an added security as the women believed that should they encounter unacceptable exploitation or harm their husbands would act against the trafficker involved.

Of the other urban women, twelve women considered that their families featured in the urban poverty list described by the World Bank, and all but two of these women were in the 'wives' group. This would suggest that urban poverty was an indicator for a woman's vulnerability to deceptive marriage. Forty-two of the researched women were not from the rural or urban poor as described by the World Bank (1997). Many of the women described poverty as influencing their migration in that they had financial objectives that they could not expect to achieve without leaving Albania. Even women who said economic gains were not the main reason they left Albania would often have financial objectives that they wanted to try to achieve while their trafficking episode continued.

Typical financial objectives were the need to pay for:

1. a house
2. a shop
3. and a car.

Other financial objectives included:

1. saving for higher education
2. paying for the education and marriages of siblings
3. building and furnishing a house for their own parents and in the case of the wives not just a house for the family of their *Çuni*.

Sending money to their own parents and relatives was a common source of conflict faced by the women who were supposedly married to their *Çuni*, as Albanian tradition meant that the woman who married left her own family completely (Elsie 2001), and so the *Çuni* often would not pass money to the woman's family. In Albania remittances from ordinary migrants were often used to pay for everyday living expenses (Sjoberg, Arrehag et al. 2004; Carletto, Davis et al. 2006; Castaldo & Reilly 2006). Therefore, the women were aware that to fund significant commercial or family investments they needed to remit very large sums of money to resolve what they considered was their finan-



cial insecurity. The ability of women to earn considerable sums of money in foreign sex work was well known, and it was accepted that women were able to earn enough money to acquire the investments that could then offer them or their family financial security.

... besides those taken away by force there are those that found the profession profitable ... later, when it was understood that it was not only an easy job ... but very profitable ... within a very short time, the Albanian girls turned their attention to this profession and were increasing the army of the prostitutes abroad ... (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 12-17)

In 1994 an Albanian women came in Italy with only the purpose to become a prostitute. In a short time she managed to earn 270 million lira (approx. € 150 000). Of course with fear in her heart, without a protector, but her money reached her country and was transformed in kiosks or other private activities ... (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997: 19)

#### 4.5 Unemployment

The 28 researched women who originally considered themselves 'wives' did not consider female unemployment in Albania to be a strong motivation for migration, as they expected after having children not to work outside of the home or only in casual work if they did. However, they overwhelmingly described that the migration decision to leave Albania was supposedly based on the employment prospects of their husbands.

We wanted to go to Italy so my husband could get a good job and we could then have a good life, I would work as well but we thought that he would find the real job ... I want lots of children so I don't want to work as well ... EK<sup>7</sup>

If a woman wants a job she should go to Tirana not to Italy ... what woman says I am going to Italy because I want a job ...? what a scandal ... doesn't she have a Husband, children and a home to look after ...! You go to Italy or Greece so your husband can find a good job ... and so you can look after your children and your home ... I have one child and I want many more ... so I need the husband and the house. CT

You go because your husband must work and find a good job ...  
so you can have a better life with your children ... A1

The 'divorced' women also considered unemployment not to be a major factor in their migration decision making.

I had a job in a factory and I was making good money, enough to live on ... but my life was hard because I was divorced. It wouldn't matter what job I had ... L5

I was unemployed but I didn't want to go out of my parent's house because of the shame of my divorce ... M4

I didn't need a job I needed a Husband ... lots of children and a good home. M2

The three women from the rural areas also considered male employment to be critical in regards to their involvement in trafficking.

If he just could have kept a job and worked like the other men I wouldn't be here. N1

The women who wanted *Kollovar* husbands were the only group who considered unemployment or poor employment prospects to have been significant in their decision to leave Albania.

I knew I couldn't earn enough in Albania to catch a *Kollovar* and I am not pretty enough to get a man any other way ... and I had to think of my mother with no sons ... so I came here ... L2

I don't want to live for a man so I need lots of money; I could never earn that money in Albania so I am here ... S1

There was also an older woman in her late 30s who was a qualified nurse who had worked in a main Tirana hospital prior to leaving Albania. She said she had arranged to travel to the EC to work as a sex worker because she wanted to earn more money than was possible as a nurse in Albania.

I had a well paid job in the hospital, but I need to make some serious money if I want to own my own home. KN

## 4.6 Education

It is also supposed that the poorly educated are more likely to be trafficked (Renton 2001). All of the researched women, except eight, had completed at least eight years of school; 22 women had completed ten years of school, and of these, fourteen women had twelve years or more of education.<sup>8</sup> Three of the researched women had started University courses but had been unable to complete them because they could not afford to live as students; one of the researched women had graduated. According to Instat (2003), 27 per cent of Albanian women have completed secondary education, whereas only approximately 23 per cent of the researched women had completed their secondary education.

I was studying law but I couldn't afford the fees and living in Tirana so I am here to make money ... I am not sure if I will go back and finish but I would like to ... V1

She was studying to become a teacher, it's not like it was another professional school it was university she was going to teach ... D2 talking about E1

I finished the eight-year school, I went to the grammar school, and I had good results there as well. I went for the competition, to study medicine; I fought hard until I was awarded the place ... So I got a place to study medicine ... I also started a course to study English, I would go there every day, this was ... in Tirana.  
R2

The researched women appear to have been slightly undereducated compared with Albanian national averages but they represented themselves as being streetwise and having made rational decisions about the value of remaining in education. They also consider that they were working-class women and that might explain why they appeared undereducated.

None of us here are stupid or uneducated ... No that is not true ... L2 is stupid and so is D2 but Z1 who cannot read isn't stupid she is very clever ... Do you mean are we from the elites stay in school and who go to university ...? Then many of us are not, but V, E, S, and some of the others are went to University ... This is not an easy question to answer ... What is important is that we know how to survive and succeed ... well ... most of us do ... R3

Having a degree does not get you a husband or a good life ... why would I need a degree ...? I have ten years of school that is enough to get what I want ... and what I want is a good husband and as many children as we can afford ... I decided to leave school because it couldn't do anymore for me ... M2

Many researched women dropped out of school before they were seventeen, and they often attributed this to becoming romantically involved with a young man.

I left school when I was fifteen because I wanted to marry my *Çuni*... EK

I quit the eight-year school. I left home when I was thirteen, I'm telling the truth here. D2

I left school so I could be with my *Çuni*... I was fourteen. A1

Every researched woman said that they wanted to marry, have a family, and only work outside the home in as much as might be required to support this home circumstance. Several women said that they wanted large families and so they would be unable to work outside of the home. These women mostly considered higher education was an unnecessary exercise in achieving this objective.

We are Roma but my family is very rich and well known as musicians, I didn't need money, but I came here to be with my *Çuni* who I love very much. I don't need professional school to make a lot of money here ... When we are married I want two sons and two daughters ... R3

I want five or six children and to be a stay at home mum ... that is the work of a wife ... to be a good mother and care for the home. I don't want to be a scientist ... M3

Three women described themselves as having serious literacy problems, but only one of the Roma women was illiterate. However all of the women seemed to be competent linguists often speaking fluent Italian and French as well as Albanian. Two women specifically identified earning money to pay for a return to higher education to study law and medicine as their motivation for leaving Albania. The majority of researched women considered being undereducated to be a barrier to success as a sex worker.

It is not easy to do this work if you are not educated or not smart; the simple women have many problems ... they don't do the papers properly, they just don't seem to know how to live in the West ... they always get sent home first ... they are useless for this work. J1

While the researched women might appear slightly undereducated than average when compared to other Albanian women in general, the researched women are probably as well educated as other young women who were not members of Albania's elite groups. However, I was unable to find the means to make effective comparisons regarding class, partly because under the old Communist regime nearly everyone in the population was categorised as a *puntore*<sup>9</sup>. Consequently, research around issues of class is an aspect of my research that would benefit from further investigation.

#### 4.7 Migrating for marriage

While Renton (2001) identified the lack of potential husbands because of the massive migration of men as a motivation for migration for young unmarried women, the role of marriage in relation to trafficking is far more nuanced and complex than a lack of potential husbands. In fact the reduction in the rate of marriages in Albania between 1980 and 2001 is negligible, and it is the smallest reduction recorded in Europe during that period (UNECE 2004). However, the abandonment of a woman or divorce in any circumstance in Albania results in the woman being subjected to severe social exclusion (Baban 2003; INSTAT 2003), and remarriage within Albania is rare for divorced women (AI 2006). Therefore, these divorced women have increasingly sought to socially rehabilitate themselves by migrating to remarry abroad. The incidence of divorced women in trafficking has been noticed by the ODIHR study on Roma and trafficking (ODIHR 2003).

There seems to be many cases of young divorced Roma mothers who have been trafficked for prostitution. (ODIHR 2003: 12)

The researched women considered that women who were divorced, abandoned or had had several relationships were often willing to take trafficking contracts so they could get to the EC.

In the old days women were brought to Italy as wives and they were usually virgins who only knew their *Çuni*, but now the women who mainly come are those who have been divorced or separated or have had several boyfriends ... A1

If a woman has had a divorce or been abandoned by her fiancée, she has no life in Albania so that is why so many want to come here and be a 50-50 whore ... It is a good way for the divorced woman who wants to get some money or find a husband ... I2

This *Çuni* is not my first boy, I have had a few boyfriends so this work is easy for me ... also I am not so emotionally dependent on my *Çuni* so he knows he must be good to me or I will just find another boy ... L1

The contracts were similar to those arranged by the rural women, and they are described as lasting for various periods and as being loosely based on a 50 per cent share of gross income. The researched women said these contract relationships were becoming increasingly common among divorced Albanian women.

Only the whores work on contracts they are the divorced women with no husbands and they do this for the money. The contract is 50 per cent for the *Çuni* and 50 per cent for the whore ... EK

It is supposed to be 50 per cent each, but everyone plays tricks so the *Çuni* always want a minimum daily amount of about \$ 400 ... but this is too much because we must pay all our living costs ... so there is always fighting about the contract and how long will it last ... D2

I send the money once every fifteen days. Yes, of course, it's without question that I put money aside for my personal needs. For the time being I can't save money ... Then, later on. I don't know how we can agree, 50 per cent or something ... V1

The researched women often described a general dissatisfaction with economic conditions in Albania as being a reason to want to leave Albania; they also considered law and order to be another reason to leave Albania, but consistently they all prioritised the gender disadvantages of being a woman as the main reason they wanted to leave Albania. They believed that by leaving Albania, they would have a better chance to secure a successful and happy married life and that for divorced women it would give a chance to rehabilitate themselves through re-marriage.

Women in the West have better lives than us so to go there with your husband means a chance for a much better life for your family ... L1

Since I was divorced the other women at my work treat me like dirt and all the men come on to me ... as if I was a cheap whore ... here I have a better life and an opportunity to find a new husband and a new life ... M2

My family keep telling me I am a disgrace to them and that I should have never left my husband even if he did beat me ... I had no peace and no life in Albania ... If I could find a new husband in the West I could start a new life ... I1

The women also said that it was not acceptable to travel abroad alone; they needed to travel with or to meet a husband or fiancé. This was easily done for the women who were really betrothed or married. Other women needed to find a 'husband' to travel with or to meet, and who would offer them legitimacy in front of their home community while also allowing them the opportunity to move on from the relationship when they wanted.

When I told my family that I was going to be married to my *Çuni* they were very happy as since my divorce we had been the object of local scandal. I2

I was unmarried living with my parents with my little boy ... everything was a scandal so I decided to do this until I could find a foreign husband ... then I could have a new life. R2

From 1991 through to 1993, the divorce rate in Albania increased from 9 per cent to 13.3 per cent (INSTAT 2003); however, this official figure does not include the failure of unregistered marriages nor the break up of engagements. Among the researched women more than 50 per cent of the women considered themselves divorced, and all of the women who arrived as unmarried to their *Çuni* and on contracts considered themselves divorced or abandoned.

The relatively low level of divorces is related to the fact that Albanian women for the sake of their children and the low economic level accept to keep their marriages even though they might suffer physiologically or physically. The highest percentage of divorces is found among couples without children; almost 40% of divorces in 2002 are from the couples without children, this is related also to the male international emigration in this period. (INSTAT 2003: 11)

## 4.8 Kidnapping

None of the researched women said that they had been violently compelled to migrate, and although two women had claimed early on to have been forcibly kidnapped, drugged and taken to Italy against their will, they later recanted these stories and described in detail how they had sought out opportunities to migrate by contacting known traffickers.

I would tell the NGO people and the Police that I had been raped by fifteen men in Tirana in Albania and drugged and that then I woke up in Italy, the NGO people believed me but the Police would laugh ... I just didn't want to admit that I chose to do this ... I was ashamed of this life ... it is better to say I was drugged and kidnapped ... I<sub>2</sub>

I tell everyone I was drugged and kidnapped by four men ... but as you know I came here with my *Çuni* to make money and start a new life. I was kidnapped by love not by drugs ... but this way I can say my *Çuni* rescued me from the Mafia and so there is no blame on him ... R<sub>3</sub>

In 2001, a Save the Children Report on Trafficking reported that Albanian women were being trafficked mostly from rural areas, that most of the trafficked were children, and more than a third of the trafficked women and children were being kidnapped (Renton 2001).

[The report] ... maintains that at least 60 per cent of Albanians trafficked for prostitution are children. More than half are tricked into prostitution, while more than a third are abducted. Up to 90 per cent of girls over the age of 14 no longer attend school in some rural areas due to fear of being trafficked ... The most 'at risk' groups are children from poor and ill-educated families. (Renton 2001)

This report alerted Albania and the international community to the serious danger of forcible kidnapping for trafficking; it was widely reported by the media (Doole 2001; PBS 2004) and by many concerned groups including the International Catholic Migration Commission and the US government (Woodruff 2001; US DoL 2002).

'They are kidnapped mostly' said Lydia Bici of the International Catholic Migration Commission. (Woodruff 2001)



About one in five had been kidnapped ... It concludes that thousands of Albanian children have been cheated, abducted and forced to work as prostitutes. (Doole 2001)

Albanian women and girls are ... kidnapped to work as prostitutes ... according to a 2001 Save the Children report. (PBS 2004)

Young women are kidnapped, sold, imprisoned, raped and forced into prostitution after undergoing indescribable psychological and physical torments. (Karaiskaki 2001)

Another response to these reports was that many rural families supposedly withdrew their teenaged daughters from school because of a fear of kidnapping.

... as many as 90% of adolescent girls drop out of secondary schooling because of fears of being kidnapped. (Baban 2003: 14)

However, the reluctance of many rural families to send teenaged girls to school predates the 'forcible kidnapping' scare. The 'forcible kidnapping' threat became an opportunistic excuse for the already increasing practice of not sending teenaged girls to school to avoid a very different type of 'kidnapping'. This other form of kidnapping was the result of young women seeking to arrange love match relationships and to avoid arranged marriages. The desire of young women in Albania to escape from restrictive and repressive social practices has been increasing since 1990, and there has been traditionalist backlash against their attempts to secure greater freedoms (Pritchett Post 1998).

What are my dreams? To dress beautifully and as I like, to love freely, to travel outside of Albania and see what Western Europe is like. I would like to go to college ... Mirsa (Pritchett Post 1998: 236)

I will make it concrete. Many girls, for example, would love to continue in school, but can't because their parents think that school is a place for love stories. There are many killed dreams among young girls in our village ... Olta (ibid.)

I ... have stayed at home the past four year. My older sister went on to study ... but she didn't finish. She quit to get married to someone she loved. My parents have a fear that the same will happen with me and that is not acceptable to them ... I expect to

have an arranged marriage, not because that is what I want. Erjona. (Pritchett Post 1998: 238)

I am in the second year of High School and I don't care that people say that the only reason girls go to school is to meet a boy ... It's just like the villagers to gossip, especially the old women ... Dorina (Pritchett Post 1998: 242)

The impact of being withdrawn from school on the ability of young women in rural areas to hope for greater social freedoms was specifically noted by Pritchard Post (1998) in her extensive interviews with women in Albania. Sanctions against young women who seek to practice new freedoms such as participating in ballet competitions or dances or wanting to choose their own husband, could involve the severe stigmatising of the young women involved.

I competed for ballet ... all the village gossiped about me ... when I was 12 I received a letter accusing me of being a prostitute ... so for three years I stayed closed up ... Ina (Pritchett Post 1998: 236)

... they can't do what they want because of social opinion. What I mean is that I am a girl of 17 with lots of dreams and wishes, but I can't put them into reality. I can dance and sing, but if I do these things I will be the subject of gossip. I want to love, but I can't because it will be commented upon. Here girls live for others and not for themselves. Ornela (Pritchett Post 1998: 235)

These experiences reported by Pritchett Post's interviewees were similar to experiences reported by the researched women.

I said to my father that I wanted to choose my own husband ... he jumped up hit me to the grounds and called me a whore ... after that all the old women in the town said I was a prostitute ... L3

You have to understand ... it is worse for village girls but even if you are a town girl if you are seen by yourself walking in the street in the evening ... you are a prostitute ... if you are seen talking to a boy on a bus ... you are a prostitute ... if you go to a disco and dance with a boy ... you are a prostitute ... if you wear fashionable clothes ... you are a prostitute ... so why not go to Italy and really be a prostitute ...? A1

The list of social transgressions that a young woman can commit and expect sanction for is extensive. Amnesty International has listed numerous honour crimes that could result in punishment with forced arranged marriage or even death (AI 2006).

The range of female behaviour considered to violate 'honour' goes beyond adultery, premarital relationships, rape and falling in love with an 'inappropriate' person. Women may also be considered as 'violating family honour' by exercising the right to choice in marriage or by trying to leave an unwanted marriage; and they may be controlled through forced marriage, being punished for leaving or trying to leave an unwanted marriage, being forced to stay in an unwanted relationship or being denied access to social and economic resources and property. (AI 2006: 10)

Kidnapping a young woman for the purpose of marriage was a traditional Albanian custom (Durham 2000; Elsie 2001), but this practice has been replaced by love matches or an arranged marriage (Elsie 2001; INSTAT 2003; INSTAT 2004). Albanian and other Balkan marriage ceremonies still include symbolic rituals intended to represent the traditional violent kidnapping of the bride (Elsie 2001; Windmill 2005). Other elaborate marriage rituals that denote the transfer of 'ownership' of the bride from her father to the husband are still common (Elsie 2001), and these include the long procession of decorated cars sounding their horns as they pass through the streets to and from the home of the bride.

The word 'kidnapping' in Albanian is *rrëmbej*, and it can be used to describe the violent kidnapping of someone against their will (OUP 1998), but an equally common usage is to describe the elopement of a daughter without the consent of her father. This usage of the word 'kidnapping' reflects the historical property rights of fathers over their daughters (Durham 2000; Elsie 2001), and as such the crime of elopement/kidnapping is a violation of the father's property rights and not a matter of the woman involved being forcibly kidnapped against her will.

In Albania, in traditional marriages, as in many other societies, the woman is given... in marriage by her father, and is taken ... (sometimes literally) by her husband's family, with whom she will live. Her father's authority over her and his responsibility to protect her (and the family's 'honour') are transferred to her husband. Marriages may be arranged or sometimes forced, by her father or by her brothers. (AI 2006: 9)

Sometimes cohabitation before marriage is also described as kidnapping and is agreed to by the parents as an acceptable precursor to formal marriage.

If both families consent to the marriage, the groom presents gifts to his chosen bride, and the wedding date is set between a week to several months after the engagement. If the future bride or groom's family cannot afford wedding expenses, both families agree for the bride to be 'kidnapped', that is, for the couple to cohabit before the wedding ceremony. (De Soto, Beddies et al. 2005: 19-20)

Kidnapping by elopement of a young woman for marriage can be reconciled through various conventions.

For many of them, it is simple kidnapping, but more often, there are negotiations with families ... many grooms in the traditional societies of northern Albania still pay families for the bride. (Windborne 2003: 14)

I am from the south, but my own cousin was kidnapped with her consent by her lover and so she went to his home with him without the permission of her parents. There was a great commotion and it took a lot of negotiation to reconcile the families and formalise the marriage ... but now it is settled and everyone is happy ... Cultural Advocate

Baban (2003) and De Soto et al. (2005) have noted that many rural families arrange the early marriage of their daughters to protect them from elopement/kidnapping, many *Çuna* used this fear to acquire extra wives. Several *Çuna* reported being able to arrange second and third marriages in 2000 because desperate families wanted to marry off daughters to prevent their elopement/kidnapping.

The parents thought that the kidnappers would be unsuitable men and would catch their young daughters with honey words, so they wanted them married off to make sure they were safe and so there would be no scandal in the Village. B-*Çuni*

One man offered me his daughter when I was buying cabbages from him to sell in Tirana. I was with my cousin and a couple of friends buying vegetables from his village ... this was south of Elbasan. From one farmer we bought all his cabbages and then went to his house for a drink. I told him stories about my suc-

cessful business, so he offered me his daughter in marriage. He told me that many girls in the village had runaway to Greece with local boys and that he wanted to make a proper marriage for his daughter before some local boy kidnapped her. I think he suspected or knew that she was not a virgin and so he couldn't dare to marry her to anyone in his area ... I was surprised but fortunately my cousin was there to represent my family so we drank the coffee and the *raki*, ate the Turkish delight to ensure the marriage was sweet ... Then my cousin put the token price on the table and I was married with the daughter. The farmer put his daughter in my van and we drove back to Elbasan ... on the way back we all fucked her and then after a few weeks I had her sent to Italy ... every week she sends me the money ... no complaining ... she is a good girl who loves me and knows her place. I still buy cabbages from her father who introduces me to all his friends as his son-in-law the businessman from Tirana.  
D-Çuni

The villagers were all scared of their girls running away with young boys because of the new freedoms, there was a lot of scandal about such things ... because I was older with a business in Italy I was acceptable so I married one from Ducaj and another from near Barjam Curri. I took one to Italy and the other to Austria. C-Çuni

When we discussed 'kidnapping' with the researched women, nineteen of the 'wives' among the researched women described themselves as having been 'kidnapped'; the others had married their Çuni with the consent of their parents. As these 'kidnapped' women had previously described themselves as being willing migrants, we asked them to explain further. All of these women described themselves as being 'kidnapped' in that they had eloped with their Çuni without the consent of their family.

I was kidnapped with my lover and we fled to Italy to escape my family. I do not regret leaving ... my life was very bad ... A1

I think most of us were kidnapped; we did it for love, because we didn't want to be married off to other men ... L5

It is better to be kidnapped in love than married in Albania ...  
BE

... kidnapping with your lover is the only way to escape the tyranny of the Albanian family; I don't care about the scandal. F1

In every instance the researched women were willing participants in their 'kidnapping' or elopement, and they did not think that kidnapping by force was viable.

... They [a girl] like to do this work; no one comes to take you by force [kidnap]. No way. You go and put him behind bars. Go and file a complaint at the police. He cannot keep her against her will. Z1

No one kidnaps you by force. If the *Çuni* takes you by force at the beginning, he beats you up and tortures you; you go to the police and file a complaint. He goes to prison and no one can do anything to you. D2

In private correspondence with Dale Renton the author of the *Save the Children Report*, I was able to confirm that he was unaware of this meaning of 'kidnapping' and any reference to kidnapping in his report had presumed the violent abduction of the woman concerned against her will.

While kidnapping normally carries a penalty of ten to twenty years, the Albanian legal code (RoA 1995) has a crime of 'kidnapping or keeping a person hostage in mitigating circumstances', in such instances where a person has been held less than seven days and no harm has befallen the victim, the penalty is reduced to three to five years of imprisonment. This article can be used to involve the police in disputed elopements. Since 2003, co-habitation has been legally recognised for couples who live like a married couple, and the age at which Albanian women can officially marry has been eighteen years (WLRI 2003; WLRI 2004; UNICEF 2005). Prior to 2003, girls could marry at sixteen years (Interpol 2002) and be automatically emancipated by the marriage (RoA 1991). However, according to the current Albanian law, girls from the age of fourteen can consent to sexual activity and enter into legal contracts (RoA 1995); therefore, it is possible that a girl might be able to willingly co-habit with her fiancé but not be able to legally marry him (WLRI 2003). However, if she becomes pregnant a court can give consent for a marriage to take place which again will emancipate the married girl (WLRI 2003; AI 2006). In such confused circumstances, it is not surprising that the relationships of teenaged women and girls are so problematic.

'Rescues' of kidnapped young women who have eloped without the consent of their male family members are still happening. In March

2006 near the city of Shkodra, the sixteen-year-old daughter of the Shpuza family went, without the consent of her parents, to live with a son of the Dhampiraj family. The girl's family accused the son of the Dhampiraj family of kidnapping the girl. The young woman involved has been returned to her parents by the police even though she insists that she went willingly with her boyfriend and that she wants to return to his family home to live with him (Dushi 2006).

In my village a young woman eloped with her lover to his parents' home, but her parents refused to agree to her marriage so they went with the police and accused the boy of kidnapping, then the police brought her home even though she didn't want to come. She was seventeen or eighteen and wanted to marry the boy and he wanted to take her to Italy. Many people thought he was a trafficker but she loved him. Eventually her parents managed to send her abroad where she married a foreigner and now she lives abroad ... Cultural Advocate

#### 4.9 Migration decision making

The migration motivation and decision making of the researched women was nuanced, and the processes clearly evolved as different groups of women entered the trafficking crisis. Women who had been deceived into patrilocal marriage and coerced or manipulated into sex work were being increasingly replaced during the research period by women who wanted to leave Albania to escape the social exclusion associated with divorce. The decision-making processes also reflected various degrees of agency by the researched women, and this agency was often manipulated by the *Çuna*, especially in the case of women they kidnapped through elopement. As the husband in a patrilocal marriage, they were invested with the authority to make household decisions including those relating to migration. Consequently, this form of trafficking was facilitated through this new economics of migration process (Stark 1984; Stark & Bloom 1985) where the husband acquired and exercised decision-making rights on behalf of his 'family'. The following is a common description of the migration decision-making process by the researched women, who regarded their *Çuni* as a husband or life partner:

During the courtship he promised that if we got betrothed or married he would take me away from Albania and that we would live in Italy or some other part of Europe. When I discussed this with my parents they considered this a good match

as the young man had returned from Italy with money and his family was known to them. So I decided it would be a good idea to migrate for a better life so I agreed to marry him ... EK  
I wanted to leave Albania so I decided to look for a husband who would take me to Italy ... so I ran away with \*\*\*\* ... A1

While an Albanian husband might have the 'right' to decide for his wife about any migration, for these women a decision to marry or elope into a patrilocal relationship was a deliberate migration decision; they described such marriages as the means to more freedom and to have a better life.

I thought anywhere had to be better than Albania, and in Italy I could have more freedom and make a nice home with my Husband ... so I eloped with \*\*\*\* ... M1

Among the researched women, I did not encounter any woman who had been engaged or married to a *Çuni* without some prior discussion of leaving Albania as part of the marriage contract. Albanian women are very careful to discuss whether a potential fiancé living abroad will take them abroad to join him as many relationships have failed when after the marriage the wife has been left in Albania to care for the husband's parents. Women will explicitly make leaving Albania a condition of their marriage contract to prevent them being left in the patrilocal home in Albania.

I agreed to marry him only after he promised to take me with him and not leave me in Albania. Of course now I know he had no intention to leave me in Albania, but many men make marriages, then go abroad and just leave their wife to look after their parents and no one really wants to do that ... A1

My parents made him promise to take me with him to Italy and once he agreed the marriage was agreed ... EK

All of the engaged and married women said that they knew that by entering into the proposed relationship they would then leave Albania; however, most of these 'married' women did not know they were going to be required to work as sex workers. Only six of these women said that they expected to do sex work once they left Albania.

I had discussed this work with my *Çuni* before we left Albania but we are a real couple not like the ordinary *Çuni*, I think most of the early wives who started before 1996 didn't know ... but



after then it was not possible not to know because we had all read the stories in the media and heard from girls who had been in Italy ... D1

Other women, particularly the 'divorced' women, described how they had sought out the attention of traffickers by going to certain bars or clubs, and once they had been solicited they had negotiated the terms of their contract prior to leaving Albania. This system of inviting trafficking contact became increasingly common after 1998.

I went to a club with a girl friend where the *Çuna* would meet ... We ordered a drink and waited for about fifteen minutes and then we were approached. I said I wanted to work in Italy and the young man talking to me went and got another man. We then discussed the contract ... They were very polite and business-like with me, but I did not trust them ... A3

I had been divorced and had nothing in my life so I thought I would go to Italy or Germany and make some money. I contacted a friend of my uncle and we agreed a contract, then he drove me to Vlore and paid for my boat ride. In Italy I stayed with his cousin and worked there until I came here. The *Çuni* says I still owe him money but I don't ... I just send him enough to keep him quiet ... BL

#### 4.10 Conclusions

The urban middle class elite who dominate the civic society of Albania (Sampson 1996) appear to be reconstructing a common prejudice when they declare Roma and rural women to be the majority of the trafficked (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997; Lesko 2005). Although rural women were less than 10 per cent of the researched women, they represented at least 60 per cent of the women reported as trafficked by Lesko's Albanian NGO; while Roma women numbered about 10 per cent of the researched women, Lesko contends that Roma women represent more than 50 per cent of all trafficked women (Lesko 2005; Lesko 2005).

The researched women represented a complete population of trafficked women in a French city, and they represented themselves as being a typical population. My comparisons with larger populations elsewhere in France and Northern Italy suggested that they were similar to these other populations of Albanian trafficked women. Consequently, I believe a misconception has been created regarding the main

origin of Albanian trafficked women. This misconception is based on an assumption that the women who have contact with shelter homes and other formal interventions are representative of the whole population of Albanian trafficked women when this is not the case. This misconception has been strengthened by popular prejudice against Roma and rural women and consequently it has informed theory and the design of anti-trafficking programmes.

Rather than speaking to the whole population of trafficked Albanian women, the assistance programmes can tell us only about the women who access those programmes or who are reported to the NGO by the authorities. It would seem that Roma and rural women are disproportionately reported and disproportionately use such resources. The urban women reported as having networks and strategies that either allows them to avoid deportation or to avoid identification in Albania as trafficked women. Lesko reports that a number of deported trafficked women deliberately avoid contact with her agency by bribing police officers to release them without passing their details to Lesko's agency (Lesko 2005). It is possible that the rural women who are referred to Lesko's shelter represent a particular population that want to escape violent abuse, and others who do not have the desire or resources to avoid referral. This could mean that rural women are more likely to seek assistance from NGOs to leave trafficking and/or that they are less skilled in avoiding contact. It is also possible that a self-fulfilling prophecy is in action in that urban women are able to avoid referral and identification as trafficked because it is believed that it is the Roma and rural women who are mostly trafficked.

If in fact the overwhelming majority of trafficked women are from urban locations and not rural places of origin, then researchers have been creating conceptualisations of trafficking in Albania based on a misconception. This is particularly important when migration motivation and decision making is considered with regards to what are the push factors in a supposed place of origin and how these vulnerabilities can then be overcome. Improved analysis of the migration motivation of trafficked women would also enable better understanding of what are the expectations of trafficked women regarding migration, what is really motivating them to leave Albania and what might be attracting them to a particular country of destination.

Also, absolute poverty is not a principal indicator for trafficking vulnerability as the *Çuna* were able to recruit many urban women who were not particularly poor, but who were actually seeking marriage. A few other women wanted to fund investments and expensive consumer goods. Therefore, as only a very small fraction of Albanian trafficked women are suffering the abject poverty associated with the rural poor, then Albanian trafficking with regards to rural poverty as an indicator

needs to be re-conceptualised. Theorists need to realise that reducing poverty (IFAD 2006) is actually unlikely to impact on the decision making of women who want to escape intolerable personal circumstances, or acquire the substantial sums of money thought to be available through sex work or those who have another objective that requires them to leave Albania.

The researched women were not vulnerable to trafficking because of their underemployment or unemployment. The researched women overwhelmingly expected to eventually leave any employment to be homemakers and any employment outside the home would be occasional or subsidiary to their role as a homemaker. The main consideration regarding migration and employment was the need to migrate so their partners could find better employment. Therefore, any attempt to mitigate the trafficking vulnerability of women by increasing the availability of employment for women is unlikely to mitigate trafficking that is achieved through the supposed need for the male partner to migrate to find better work and remuneration. The findings regarding employment and poverty challenges the predominate presumption in South East Europe (El-Cherkeh, Stribu et al. 2004) that women are being driven by economic disadvantage into trafficking harm.

The researched women were slightly less educated than average in Albania (INSTAT 2003). The researched women clearly demonstrated that they considered a lack of education to be a barrier to trafficking, as such, the notion that a lack of secondary education might be an indicator for trafficking risk needs further investigation. However, university graduates were under-represented among the researched women, and this does mark a differential between the highly educated women who control Albanian civic society and trafficked women. This differential might explain the sense of social superiority and moral indignation that is reflected in reports by some Albanian agencies on trafficking (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997; Lesko 2005) and the reported lack of empathy of women belonging to these elites with the lives and objectives of trafficked women (Davies 2001; Waugh 2006).

The common notion that a third of all Albanian trafficking victims are forcibly kidnapped is a misconception, and this misconception was based on an inadequate translation of the word *kidnapped*. ODIHR considers forcible kidnaps for trafficking purposes to be very rare events (ODIHR 2003). None of the researched women knew of a woman who had been forcibly kidnapped for trafficking, although all of them knew women who had been compelled to engage in sex work after their elopement, betrothal or marriage. Women who use kidnapping/elopement to escape social repression and arranged/forced marriages are unlikely to want to return to circumstances that they consider repressive. Anti-trafficking campaigns that seek to keep young women in

such repressive social circumstances and subject to such conventions as forced or arranged marriages are not likely to be considered helpful by young women seeking to overcome such social repression.

Instead of the researched women being mainly the Roma and rural poor, the researched women were mostly urban women and their recruitment demonstrated a clear evolution of the trafficking crisis. The researched women were principally divided between young women who had been recruited through offers of patrilocal marriage and many of whom had then kidnapped/eloped with their *Çuni*, often to escape what they considered to be repressive family circumstances. These women were usually the women who had left Albania before 1996, and they had been deceived and coerced into trafficking. The acquisition of the patrilocal rights by the *Çuni* meant that they could legitimately make a household decision to migrate, and as such marrying a woman who you intended to traffic offered the ideal and legitimate means by which to direct her subsequent migration and exploitation. This use of household decision making as a means to traffic women offers an interesting extension to considerations of the new economics of migration regarding the consequences of non-altruistic household decision making.

Awareness of trafficking has impacted on Albanian trafficking; Albanian women received information about trafficking from various sources including returning women, the media and from formal NGO anti-trafficking programmes. The increasing awareness of the risk of abusive marriages clearly affected the population of the researched women. However, the divorced women were not informed about using trafficking to find a foreign husband by the media or NGO programmes; this information was passed to them by other trafficked women who returned to Albania to visit with their foreign husbands and who demonstrated how such marriages often rehabilitated them in the local community. This clearly demonstrates that information received from other migrants is very important in influencing the behaviour of these women. This has implications for understanding the limitations of awareness raising programmes.

Once women had become aware of this recruitment strategy, most women were able to avoid such trafficking devices and over a period of three years, trafficking significantly changed. Instead of traffickers recruiting deceived wives, an increasing number of women sought out traffickers to enter into contracts by which they might travel to the EC. These 50 per cent contracts were made for some indeterminate period of time, and the women agreed to engage in sex work until they could find a foreign husband. These women were the divorced and abandoned women who in Albania were subjected to social exclusion and stigma. They were women who specifically wanted to socially rehabili-

tate themselves by marrying abroad. They found their situations in Albania to be intolerable and had discovered that marriage abroad was a way to regain social status and acceptance by their families and local communities. This notion of unacceptable and unbearable social exclusion as motivating the migration of these women has a fit with Van Hear's (1998) arguments that people experiencing a sense of intolerability will seek to migrate; it also confirms Collyer's (2006) assertion that attitudes towards the place of origin are crucial in migration decision making. Apart from these two groups that represent about 90 per cent of the researched women there were a few rural women who were engaged in sex work for the remittances they could send home to their families and another small group of women who wanted to arrange *Kollovar* relationships.

It is the socially excluded and stigmatised who are increasingly involved in trafficking but these women are not the Roma or rural women; but it is those women who have been stigmatised because they have been divorced or abandoned. These women are aware of their construction by the media as naïve and innocent 'Natashas' and they although they reject this construction they help perpetuate the myth by assuring their families that they have gone abroad as wives or waitresses or child carers.

It is, therefore, important that Albanian trafficking be reconceptualised to include this growing population of Albanian trafficked women. Many are not deceived or coerced into trafficking as they proactively seek to be trafficked. Unless there is a substantial change in attitudes towards divorced and abandoned women, it can be expected that such women will continue to want to escape their intolerable circumstances. It certainly must be understood that women fleeing intolerable social stigma will be unwilling to be returned to such circumstances and if returned, will likely seek to be re-trafficked. It must be understood that none of the present interventions intended to reduce or mitigate trafficking will have any impact on the desire of these women to leave Albania, as these women do not seek jobs, nor are they poor or uneducated, and they are usually not able to be socially rehabilitated in Albania.

An examination of these conclusions against the analytical trafficking matrix would confirm that present conceptualisation of trafficking in Albania and consequential interventions intended to address trafficking will not assist women seeking to escape unbearable social stigma because of divorce. In fact, by returning women to communities where their original stigma will be compounded by new associations with prostitution, the interventions can only increase the suffering of the women involved. This would suggest that only interventions that address this particular stigma would have any impact on the divorced

women's migration motives. Until such fundamental social change is achieved, the principal way these women can achieve their social rehabilitation is to marry a foreign husband. If such an outcome is to be acknowledged as the objective of many trafficked Albanian women, the trafficking matrix would offer possibilities for addressing this motivation for migration and so reduce trafficking.

An immediate amelioration that would be suggested by an analysis using the trafficking matrix is that if the divorced women could travel without needing the intervention of traffickers, then they would be at less risk of being trafficked. Therefore, if such women had greater mobility rights they could possibly seek out foreign husbands without resorting to trafficking as the means to leave Albania.<sup>10</sup> It is also important to add, however, that these 'divorced' women would also require the means by which to sustain their migration in a place of destination. The next chapters will consider the importance of social networks for the researched women, especially in enabling them to eventually sustain their migration without any need for support from a trafficking network.

## 5 Arriving in France

In this chapter, I briefly describe modern Albanian migration before specifically examining and analysing the various networks that were used by the researched women to reach France. This chapter also describes and analyses the different networks that the researched women had access to and explains the way trafficking networks used established irregular migration routes to transport the women to France. The chapter then considers why some researched women deliberately resorted to trafficking as a means to leave Albania. (See Appendix F for ethical statement used in this study and Appendix H for a social matrix of the trafficking order in Lyons, that gives information about researched women.)

The chapter explains how the trafficking networks organised and controlled the researched women and how the women's social networks were unable to effectively assist or equally importantly unable to sustain the researched women's migration. This consideration of the importance of sustaining the migration rather than just facilitating the movement of the trafficked person is often not fully analysed when the role of traffickers is examined. I then document the role of the different trafficking networks in placing and establishing the researched women in Lyon and how the *Çuna* would come and go from Lyon to avoid detection and arrest. I also describe the beginning of resistance to trafficking abuse. I conclude that a substantial aspect of the Albanian trafficking crisis is a consequence of the lack of alternative social networks able to support and sustain the safe migration of the researched women.

Social network theory posits that rather than isolated agents, people are linked to one another through social networks Portes (1997). These connections can affect migration in two important ways, firstly by making migration less risky for individuals by passing information back to potential migrants, and secondly by facilitating subsequent migration through practical assistance. The initial high-risk attached to migration is therefore supposed to decline for new migrants as denser networks of migrants provide potential migrants with increasingly reliable information about the opportunities and dangers associated with the migration process and assistance to migrate successfully. Networks can also

encourage a further migration through cumulative causation Massey (1993) but when networks help create a desire for new migration but cannot sustain such migration they become problematic Portes (1997). This is particularly problematic when a previously successful network can no longer support nor sustain someone who could have previously expected to have benefited from chain migration through a strengthening network. Chain migration is a process based on an established linkage or chain from the point of origin for migrants to their destination. This process of migration is assisted by migrants who already live in the destination. Earlier migrants help their friends and relatives to migrate by providing them with various resources often including information, money, a place to stay, a job and emotional support. When such a network weakens because of institutional or structural obstacles such as new visa restrictions or more severe policing, both the desire to migrate and the desire to assist new migrants remains but the weakened network now requires migrants to find ways to overcome the new obstacles. Therefore, these are not networks with weak ties as described by Granovetter (1973) and Enbergson (1998) but networks whose chaining capacity has been weakened while still retaining some capacity or desire to assist new migrants. If the network is unable to overcome the new obstacles then it will eventually be unable to function as a migration network. This chapter now examines the women's responses to the weakening of their previous networks.

## 5.1 Modern migration and Albania

In recent years, Albania has attracted particular attention as the CEE nation where the largest proportion of the population took part in the mass emigration that followed rapid political change. Almost one in three Albanians is involved in some form of migration (King & Vullnetari 2003; Kotic & Triandafyllidou 2003). Years of watching foreign television from Italy, Macedonia, and Greece had created an awareness of 'other' worlds (Mai 2001; Mai 2002), while the increasing chaos in Albania was seen as an insurmountable obstacle to the 'good life' (Mai 2003). Albanians began to plan the ways and means to secure opportunities that they believed could only be realised outside of Albania (King, Mai et al. 2003; Mai & Schwander-Sievers 2003). Post-Communist migration strategies can be seen as a series of progressions intended to overcome an evolving mixture of domestic and internationally created obstacles (Barjaba 2000), all of which are usually seen by most Albanians as inequitable attempts to constrain their freedom of movement (Hatzipropokopiou 2003; King & Vullnetari 2003).



These strategies started in 1990 with mass ‘invasions’ of foreign embassy compounds in Tirana (Barjaba 2000; INSTAT 2004), which resulted in the relocation of 5,000 Albanians to various receiving countries (King & Vullnetari 2003). In 1991, 23,000 Albanians reached Italy by means of old and derelict ships but after this group was allowed to remain a further 20,000 Albanians who arrived by ship in 1992 were returned to Albania (Martin, Martin et al. 2002). Tens of thousands of other Albanians crossed the mountains into Greece during the same period (King & Vullnetari 2003). Today more than 20 per cent of the population is thought to be living outside of Albania (*ibid.*), and Albanian migration has become increasingly linked to concerns regarding irregular migration (King 2003; King & Barjaba 2005).

Much of the movement has been chaotic, clandestine and hence poorly recorded. But there is no doubting the overall scale of the Albanian exodus: perhaps no country in the world has been so deeply affected by emigration in the last fifteen years. (King & Vullnetari 2003: 6)

This irregular migration has attracted the attention of various academics such as King and Vullnetari, (2003) as well as Barjaba (2004). King and Mai (2003, 2004), Kosic and Triandafyllidou (2003) have also documented these Albanian migration strategies and the media responses to the Albanian migrants in Italy that have resulted in the demonisation of Albanian migrants as dangerous criminals. In Greece, a similar process has resulted in Albanians experiencing similar prejudice, and the Albanians are also typically presented as dangerous criminals. Lazaridis (1999) and King and Vullnetari (2003) have described this increasing association of Albanians with insecurity and crime, while Baldwin-Edwards (2001) has refuted the common opinion that increased crime rates in Greece are related to migrants. However, in this atmosphere of demonisation Albania has also become synonymous with trafficking (IOM & ICMC 2001; Mai 2001; IOM & ICMC 2002) and as such the migration of Albanian women is often reported by the media as being directly linked to trafficking (Raufer & Quéré 2000; Doole 2001; Kirby 2005)

## 5.2 ‘Choosing’ trafficking

Notions of choice in the trafficking discourse are often confused and are extremely contested (Doezema 2002; UNODC 2004). It is usually considered that no one can meaningfully consent to be engaged in slavery or forced labour as these estates are so inherently exploitative

and degrading (Bales 1999; UNODC 2004). It is argued by Bales (1999) that anyone entering slavery or forced labour must be so severely constrained by various structural inequalities that any notion that they have consented to be so exploited is meaningless. This argument would consider that in being trafficked, the researched women must be deceived about the nature of trafficking, coerced into trafficking or so otherwise constrained that they are reduced to using trafficking.

Those researched women who I describe as wives and who were recruited by deceptive offers of marriage were unaware that they were going to be trafficked; however, the 29 researched women who later entered into 50 per cent contracts, who were mainly divorced women fleeing social exclusion, were very well informed about trafficking practices and yet they still deliberately engaged with traffickers.

I would say all of the 50 per cent contract women were well aware of what was involved and how could they not be? ... Maybe you don't know all the small details but you know what the *Çuna* are and that this is the most difficult life ... but when you are that desperate you try to jump the abyss .... M3

... the deception started from 1990 and lasted perhaps until 1995. From 1995 until now all new girls are not deceived but they want to do this work themselves. There are no more deceptions ... if I tell you it's about 90 per cent maybe 99 per cent of the women that are abroad are working in the sex work and ... they have gone abroad to do this work ... V1

It was common to tell their families that they were working in a fast-food restaurant. Several women actually visited a pizzeria in Lyon where the staff would allow them to wear the uniform and take photos of themselves behind the shop counter so the women could send such photographs home to their families. The women were also aware that being a waitress was often a front for prostitution, but they considered that working in a fast-food restaurant behind a counter was acceptable work for their families. There was no one amongst the researched women who thought she was going to be a waitress in Lyon.

I don't know anyone here who ever thought they were going to be a waitress ... those women must be somewhere else I have never met one ... Anyway being a waitress in Albania is just like being a 'waitress' in Italy or Greece ... serve in the front room, fuck in the back room ... Did you hear about the restaurant by the river Shkumbi; near Elbasan that sold chicken for € 20 and with every chicken was a free session with a 'waitress'? ... D2

Why go abroad to be a waitress, it doesn't make sense how are you going to earn enough money to live in the west and send money home just as a waitress, it is not possible ... The only waitresses who make money are the waitresses who also serve sex and everyone know that .... V1

Do you know what being a waitress means in Greece? Well it doesn't mean you are entering the convent, it is often a cover for prostitution. So anyone who is going to be a waitress in the West knows what that means ... we are not stupid. M3

The researched women and particularly the 'divorced' women identified a factor that they considered important in their departure experiences that in turn disposed them towards trafficking. Many of the women spoke of having being refused visas to visit the Schengen area as tourists; this was particularly true of women who first travelled abroad after 1996. Women who travelled before 1996 had not usually attempted to acquire a Schengen visa as they had mainly travelled in the company of their *Çuni* by speedboat.

Why waste time trying to get the papers for the visa it is quicker and better to use the boats from Vlore ... maybe when it is easier I will pay for a passport with a visa ... A1

I didn't have any chance to take a visa so I came on the boat with S ... Young women are not given visas without a lot of money ... E1

The man at the Embassy gate said they don't give young women visas because they want to stop them being taken to Italy for prostitution. R1

I went back there in 98. I stayed four months because I was waiting to get the visa to come here in France. I couldn't get one no matter what ... so I came with, with false papers, after changing the picture in the documents, once I was in Italy I sent back the passport so it could be used again ... S3

The researched women considered that young women were almost always refused visas by the EC embassies unless considerable bribes of up to € 1500 were paid to various agents. Young women who could access student visa programmes or met the stringent requirement for Schengen visa issuance were considered exceptional.

Only the elite women who are in the universities or NGO or whose families have money and connections get the visas easily. For ordinary women we can lose a lot of time and money trying to make a visa, unless we pay the *baksheesh*... V1

However, the researched women reported that young men could easily acquire visas for around € 1,000 and were more often granted visas in any case. This gendered disadvantage in visa issuance was bitterly resented by the women and was specifically identified as a reason why they had to resort to trafficking as a mobility strategy.

Men get the visas because they want them to work in construction and on the farms, but they don't want us so we don't get visas ... but of course they do 'want' us in their beds so they make us illegal ... so we must work in the streets ... this isn't a choice it is our only way to escape the problems we have because we are divorced .... M3

... without a visa you must go with the *Çuna* or you must stay ... there is your choice ... but if you can't stay you must be a whore in Italy ... then there is no choice that is the only way ... TC

The extra cost of visas for young women was explained by the researched women as a 'tax' on their expected high earnings as sex workers, as it was often assumed that they would be engaged in well-paid sex work in the EC.

Everyone wants more money if the papers or visa are for a young woman because they know that she is worth big money ... so these papers cost more, because they are worth more ... A1

We have to pay extra *baksheesh* for a visa because they know that we earn more money than other migrants. If you can convince them you are not a whore you can sometimes get the visa cheaper ... E3

F1 specifically made reference to this problem when she described how she felt compelled to return to France using a trafficker after her Schengen visa application was refused. This happened after she had made a visit to Albania to investigate rumours that her original *Çuni* had married another woman.

I couldn't stay in Albania because of the stigma, I was now divorced and everyone now knew I had been whoring in France,

so I decided I would return to France and work for myself, get my own money and a new husband ... F1

The Consulate said that they knew that I had been illegally in Europe; I don't know how they knew this so even with the *bak-sheesh* they would not give me a visa. I didn't have time to buy another passport so I decided to contact \*\*\*\*\* and agreed with him to work for him for six months if he would take me on the boats to Italy, so I could go back to France ... F1

When she was asked why she did not just pay for the speedboat and travel independently she said:

If you arrive in Vlore and they can see you don't have a *Çuni* the boat boys might come on to you with offers, but if you travel with a *Çuni* or the *Çuni* makes the arrangements then they are too scared to touch you ... so it is worth to pay more for a visa so you can avoid them and avoid having to give more money to a *Çuni*. The visa is € 1,000 to € 1,500 but the boat is only € 600 or € 700 but the visa can work out cheaper because then you can dodge the *Çuna*, but you must have the connections in Italy or France to be able to live without a *Çuni*... F1

She then explained that

If I had been able to get the visa I could have flown to France and then I would have been working for myself ... I have my own work place unlike most women. I broke with my last *Çuni* because he was not building the house like he promised, that is one reason I went back to Albania to make the divorce ... but instead I must work six months for the new *Çuni*, before I can get free again ... F1

The researched women who wanted to travel abroad to try and socially rehabilitate themselves through marriage to a foreigner had very limited opportunities to pursue such an agenda. Even if they could travel to Italy or Greece and engage in the other occupations available to migrant women it was thought unlikely that they could achieve their goal.

You can't meet men as a baby-sitter in Greece, you have to stay in the house all day and the Greek family don't let you meet men. You are not allowed to bring a man to the house and where would you meet a man ...? TC

I would agree that as a cleaner you wouldn't find a husband in Greece ... what sort of men would you meet as a cleaner ... Albanian domestic worker in Thessaloniki

I met my husband in an office in Athens, but I had high qualifications and speak perfect Greek, most women couldn't do what I did ... most end up marrying an Albanian ... 25-year-old Albanian woman interviewed in Greece.

By working in sex work the 'divorced' women believed that they would meet local men who would be willing to marry them.

Not all of the clients are suitable, but you would be surprised how many are very suitable. They visit us because they are divorced and lonely, or some have never been married. So you must choose one carefully and then develop the relationship ...  
M<sub>3</sub>

These women consider remaining in Albania to be so intolerable that forced labour that could eventually be escaped through marriage was considered preferable.

### 5.3 The problem of weak networks

The years of isolationism under Enver Hoxha<sup>1</sup> meant that there had been almost no migration between 1944-1990. Therefore in the early 1990s the vast majority of Albanians did not have any effective social networks in Italy that were able to facilitate their migration to Italy (King, Iosifides et al. 1998; Kosic & Triandafyllidou 2003). Without substantial networks able to support their migration, these migrants were required to create new social networks. Those migrants who were able to create effective networks able to facilitate the migration of others became important and influential gatekeepers (Lazaridis 1999; King, Mai et al. 2003). Some of the new networks became increasingly well organised and the speed boats working out from Vlore began to move scores of irregular migrants into Italy each night (Monzini 2004).

The Albanian government has responded to the concerns of EC states regarding irregular migration by cooperating in attempts to suppress irregular migration and trafficking networks; examples of this cooperation were increased border patrols on the border with Greece and the confiscation of some of the speed boats used to transport the irregular migrants to Italy (Choudhury 2003; US SD 2003). The Albanian

government instituted new laws in 2004 specifically to criminalise trafficking and irregular border crossing (RoA 2004). More recently there has been a ban on the use of certain motor boats in Albanian waters (BBC 2006). The increasing law enforcement initiatives made irregular migration more difficult (King, Mai et al. 2003).

Prior to 1990 it was possible to acquire residency in Italy by various different processes; with the arrival in 1990 of the 'Martelli' law immigration possibilities into Italy became severely restricted, and administrative barriers continued to increase during 1991-2001 (ibid.). Confronted with these increasing barriers, many of the weak and new social networks of the earlier migrants were not able to facilitate the subsequent migration of their friends and relatives to Italy, as they could no longer use the means and methods that had previously been successful (King 2003; King, Mai et al. 2005). Furthermore, the social networks that were being created by the new migrants often had neither the capacity nor the competence to support the researched women even if they were able to leave Albania and make contact with the network. The new weak social networks were sufficient to create the expectation or hope of migrating through chain migration but they were unable to facilitate such migration. Consequently, many women sought the means to migrate through other stronger networks. Those researched women who had social networks in countries of destination that were unable to sustain their migration, resorted to the stronger trafficking networks not only to move but also to sustain their migration.

I had a twin sister in Germany, but she could do nothing to help me because she was so poor and had only just got her own papers so I could not expect her to help me ... I2

My sister is married in Italy, and she would tell me: 'I will take you here,' et cetera, but she gave birth to her children one after another, and she had a lot to deal with, because every family has its own problems, you understand. Her husband was Italian, and I didn't feel at ease to go and live there, I don't like to live in somebody else's house and so on, in particular when you have a child ... and they could not afford to support me ... I thought this can't go on like this. I will better leave; I will try and do something, to make some money ... so I found the *Çuni*... R2

I had a one month visa with which I came to Italy ... If I returned to Albania, I had no future, I had nothing. Then I went to some cousins there in Italy, I went there, I tried, I was there with them for about six months, trying to arrange any staying permit papers, or to start work, to work as a hairdresser, as

everybody else. No one was willing to employ me without any documents ... and my cousins said that they didn't know how to help me because the rules had changed ... this was the time that I got to know a guy. He was Albanian as well and then I had no money any more. I couldn't ask my family for money ... and also they couldn't help me, not that they didn't want to, but they couldn't help me ... so I got to know this *Çuni*. Then I started this work so I could stay ... S<sub>3</sub>

... my mother has died, my father has died, my brothers and sisters are in Italy. They left at the time of embassy [occupations]. We are six sisters and four brothers. One sister and one brother are in Albania. This sister is looking after my son. And then all the rest are in Italy: Rome, Sicily, Palermo, all over the country, but they still don't have papers so I could only stay with them a few days ... they have no money no way to help me ... Z<sub>1</sub>

Limited by poverty, insecure migration status and reducing opportunities for new irregular migrants to access the labour market, the women's own social networks were similar to the disadvantaged social networks described by Collyer (2005). Collyer considers that these limitations account for why some social networks do not direct migration movements as might otherwise be expected (Collyer 2005).

#### 5.4 The networks of men and women

There is a common notion that trafficked women often disappear (Malarek 2004) and no longer keep connections with their own family networks in Albania (Woodruff 2001). This notion seems to be misplaced. The researched women who reported that they had little open contact with their families usually stated it was because:

1. They had previously been estranged from their families;
2. They no longer kept contact with their father and male relatives because their elopement/kidnap had still not been resolved.

However, although such women did not have contact with their father or brothers, they often had extensive contacts with their mothers, aunts, sisters and female friends; this contact was then kept secret from their male relatives. Such contacts and devices are common protocols when an elopement dispute is awaiting resolution (Elsie 2001) and as such is not peculiar to trafficking in any way. Resolution of a disputed elopement will often involve protracted negotiations between the parents of the eloped couple. However, once the man's family has



made appropriate apologies and explained how he had been compelled by his passion for the young woman to rush<sup>2</sup> her away, the families can often then be publicly reconciled and a marriage formally take place. Therefore, women who are often reported as disappeared and having no contact with their family will often have extensive contact with their female relatives but not their male relatives.

## 5.5 The irregular migration networks

The growing number of obstacles placed between the Albanians and their migration objectives has increasingly meant that only the most ruthless, reckless and criminally competent networks could be reasonably sure that they were able to overcome such obstacles (Monzini 2004; King & Barjaba 2005). The efficiency of these networks and their influence over Albanian migration during the research period was the constant object of international concern and action (Williams 1999; Doole 2001). The ability of these networks to afford the large capital expenditures needed to acquire speed boats that were able to outrun Italian coastguard vessels meant they had financial resources beyond the means of most Albanian migrants (Viviano 1999; Takieddine 2000; Thomson 2001; Monzini 2004). That these criminal networks were ruthless and reckless enough to secure their survival by throwing their passengers overboard to ensure their escape, as the coastguard would then be required to rescue the discarded passengers, also demonstrated a callousness that is not a normal feature of a supportive social network (Takieddine 2000; Monzini 2004).

These irregular networks also offered migration opportunities to any Albanian who could afford the \$ 450-\$ 600 that was required for passage (Monzini 2004). This passage came with a guarantee of a landing in Italy with a promise of another trip should the migrant be quickly deported (Viviano 1999; Renton 2001). This service was quicker and was often cheaper than acquiring all of the documents necessary for regular visa issuance.

I came on the boats and so did all of my friends, I had already wasted a lot of money on making papers for a visa and waiting weeks only to be rejected, so it's not easy to come by speedboat ... You pay \$ 600 and they will guarantee to put you in Italy, it costs more if you are a foreigner ... The way this goes for the money is that if you are sent back within three days, they send you again without payment, you don't have to pay again, you understand. And we were sent back, we went to the person who arranged our departure, and he arranged a second passage ... R2

Using the boats is cheaper than getting the real visa and is about the same price as the fake visa ... TC

Such criminal networks also needed to be able to subvert law enforcement agents and politicians in Albania to be able to continue their activities (US SD 2000). The politically inept or incompetent would soon be suppressed while the politically astute networks operated with impunity (Monzini 2004); such competencies were not common to ordinary social networks. The dominance of these criminal networks was also guaranteed by the lack of alternatives able to deliver the migration to Italy for similar costs (Monzini 2004; ProProject 2005).

However, these irregular migration networks were never exclusively trafficking networks; they were a service industry that offered transportation to a wide range of migrants and contraband products (Monzini 2004; ProProject 2005). These networks also transported cigarettes, drugs and weapons (IOM 2003; Monzini 2004). The trafficking of women was a small component of these irregular networks (Monzini 2004). Apart from smuggling large numbers of Albanian migrants, they also transported numbers of non-Albanian migrants; most of these people were not trafficked (Limanowska 2004). Trafficking networks used these irregular migration networks to move trafficked women, and there was an overlap between the various participants in the various networks (Brissenden 2001; ASI 2003; IOM 2003; Kirby 2005). Consequently, irregular migration networks mostly used by non-trafficked migrants, but also used by trafficking networks, became increasingly identified as trafficking networks (Monzini 2004).

The difference between the service offered by irregular migration networks that only offered transportation to a destination and the trafficking networks of the *Çuna* was that the trafficking networks were able to ensure and sustain the migration of the researched women in the places of destination. While these networks were considered by the researched women the most effective way that they could migrate, remain in a country of destination and be able to pursue their migration objective, the women remained dependent on the trafficking networks and the traffickers controlled the women.

## 5.6 Feminisation of Albanian migration?

A characteristic of the traditional and pre-Communist Albanian migration accounts is their gendered bias: women are usually invisible and the accounts are completely dominated by men (King & Barjaba 2005). In the pre-communist era migration was dominated by the movement of men regionally for labour and the eventual participation of Alba-

nians in the great migration to North America and Australia (King & Vullnetari 2003). King and Vullnetari (2003) also document how men or men with their families led the post-communist migrations. The development of female mobility independently of men has been a very recent phenomena and is often represented as a feminisation of the Albanian migrations (King, Mai et al. 2003; King, Mai et al. 2005).

Consequently, in the modern Albanian migration narratives, women have taken on an increasingly substantial and visible role (Lazaridis 2000; Kelly 2005; Orgocka 2005). In these modern narratives they are often represented as trafficked women (Doole 2001), but they are also seen as significant factors in ensuring the successful integration of their migrant families or as independent sometimes highly skilled migrants (Lazaridis 2000; Kosic & Triandafyllidou 2003; Kelly 2005; Orgocka 2005).

Young women are as likely to express an interest in migrating as young men (Papapanagos & Sanfrey 2002; Reilly, Litchfield et al. 2005), and in spite of the risks becoming widely known, women continued to migrate using networks known to be controlled by traffickers (PBS 2004; Bylander 2006).

## 5.7 The migrating women

The researched women divided into two main groups regarding the declared motive of migrating to achieve a successful marriage and family life. The first group consisted of 28 researched women who considered themselves married to their *Çuni*. Their objectives were:

1. the building and funding of a house
2. the setting up of business in Albania
3. acquiring a car
4. furnishing the house
5. and capitalising the business.

Once these objectives were achieved, they expected to return to Albania and live a normal family life as man and wife and start their own family.

All of us who are married plan to return to Albania to live with our husbands once the houses and businesses are ready ... Maybe L1 will stay in Italy with her *Çuni*, but I will have my family in Albania in my own homeland ... EK

This objective was shared with many other young Albanian women.

I am looking forward to my wedding and then returning to Greece to work for sometime ... we will return. I also want a family and a better house in my own country. Florenca (Pritchett Post 1998: 246)

While the 'wives' dominated among the earlier researched women, they were eventually replaced in importance among the researched women by divorced women seeking to marry a French man. There was also a small group of four or five women who sought to acquire a *Kollovar* husband. However, this small group of the researched women included only one woman who wanted to acquire the same assets as the wives and then use them to acquire a traditional *Kollovar* husband in Albania. The other women wanted to marry French men as *Kollovar*, which really meant paying men to marry them so they could acquire residency papers for France.

I married a *Kollovar* for the papers, not for love ... S1

The last group consisted eventually of about 25 women who wanted to find a French or foreign husband and acquire a secure family life in France or other Western country. The researched women who wanted to find a foreign husband had usually been divorced or abandoned by their Albanian husband or fiancé and as such were not considered eligible or desirable for marriage in Albania. They had heard from other trafficked women that it was relatively easy to use trafficking to find a foreign husband.

I was told that prostitution is a good way to catch a French husband, and it is true ... they don't care that we do this and often they want to rescue us from this life. I work here in Gerland because here the men are more open to marriage ... M3

So many women have found husbands here ... my friend married an Italian and it changed her whole life that is why I came ... M2

I saw the other women in Albania visit with their foreign husbands ... My only hope for happiness is to find a foreign husband because in Albania I cannot have any life, as a divorced woman ... E4

I don't want to be trapped like most Albanian women I want a French husband who will treat me with respect, like a human being ... we know this is the way because the other women told us about this ... T1

Women who had been in failed relationships and were able to marry foreign men could be rehabilitated by their families and reintegrated as honourable and successful women. Such rehabilitations were becoming increasingly common and had occurred among many families.

Even in my family I had a cousin who went to Italy with her Albanian fiancé. They had a child but then she left him in unknown circumstances, this was a scandal. However, she quickly took up with an Italian truck driver who she said she had met in some place she had been working. They were married and she and her son now live with him in a fine house in Northern Italy. He is a very kind and loving man. Now the family is very proud and happy with her ... there is no scandal and no one asks about how this all came to be ... Cultural Advocate

Once I had married my French boy ... I was a family favourite again and everyone wants to visit me. Having a foreign husband makes a big difference, before I was dirt ... now I am a princess ... Z1

The common objective of the all of the researched women was to secure a successful marriage and secure family life. This demonstrated that the researched women shared the most common social objective of most Albanian women (Pritchett Post 1998; UNICEF 2000; Young 2000; INSTAT 2003), and that they considered finding a 'good' husband to be the key to a happy and successful life (INSTAT 2004).

The perception of marriage as a life goal is often the frame of reference, although some women mention the desire to escape the parental home, poverty or violence as a motivation for getting married. Marriage is constructed through women's discourse as a norm and a desirable condition for women's social status. The patriarchal traditions of marriages arranged by a male authority are still frequent. Through marriage, women expect to gain a successful and worthy life. (Baban 2003: 8)

## 5.8 The migration route

The migration route organised for the researched women by the *Çuna* was dependent on the existing irregular migration networks. The *Çuna* relied almost exclusively on the movement of women via the Vlore-based motor boats to Italy and then by train or car through Italy with stopovers at various safe houses, before depositing the researched wo-

men in Lyon. When the *Çuna* were mainly trafficking their wives, they would travel with the woman and induct her into sex work in Italy before escorting her to France and establishing her in Lyon. Women were usually inducted into sex work in Italy because the *Çuna* wanted to have the women trained by the experienced sex-working women in Italy before they were sent onto locations where such training might not be so easy to supervise.

When the women were on 50 per cent contracts, it was usual for them to use the same route but to travel with another woman and for them to pass through Italy in a matter of weeks or days rather than spending months in Italy. As such, this trafficking route was identical to the irregular migration routes used by most Albanian irregular migrants travelling to and through Italy (Monzini 2004). The trafficked women used the same boats and routes as many other irregular migrants (*ibid.*).

Most *Çuna* only know one way to get us here, they are not so clever like us but they have the money and they have the power. We have to have money and power to beat the *Çuna*, but it can be done ... A1

Before 1996, the researched women who were then mainly wives would usually travel with their *Çuni*, but it became more common for the *Çuna* to acquire business visas for the Schengen area. Therefore they would arrange to have the women taken to Vlore, and the women would travel without the *Çuni*, but under the protection of his name. Any women travelling without their *Çuni*, who were solicited by another Albanian man would then announce that she was under the protection of her *Çuni*, and the solicitation would then usually stop. The *Çuni* would also make all of the arrangements for the woman to be met or make her way to a contact place in Italy.

Several women described the journey across to Italy as very stressful. Landing in Italy could also be very frightening because landings were often done at night and during bad weather. There was also the fear of capture by the Italian police, and it could be very difficult to find the waiting driver who would take the various migrants to the train stations where they could take trains to other parts of Italy.

The second time I travelled do you know how many waves there were? People have been killed even ... it was a big speedboat, there were about 30 something or even 40 people. There were also small children, I was terrified ... I was very scared that the men would throw us into the sea if the Italian navy found us ...

R2

The police chased us through the trees after we landed ... they caught one old woman who couldn't run ... she gave up and was sitting on top of a large bag in the forest ... She had been given the bag to carry by the boat boys. Anyway when the policeman looked inside, it was full of marijuana ... she was so scared that she would go to prison for ever ... Anyway the policeman told her to runaway and leave the bag so she did ... S2

From a nearby station they would travel to a northern city in Italy such as Milan to an address where they would meet their *Çuni* or his accomplices. From Milan the women would take the train to Lyon or sometimes be driven to France if the trains were being subjected to severe immigration inspections at the border. The risk of being intercepted on the train and detained en route to France eventually became so risky that the researched women resorted to crossing the Franco-Italian border using the intercity bus service. No woman was ever taken off the bus service, and it eventually replaced the train as the normal means of travelling into France.

This route to France had evolved in operation and practice between 1996 and 2000, particularly concerning how much time the women spent in Italy. In the early and mid-1990s most women would make asylum applications in Italy and would spend several months or even years in Italy before moving on to other destinations. As these processes became more difficult in Italy and particularly as new undocumented women were targeted for deportation, more women moved through Italy to other destinations more quickly. It was during the time in Italy the researched women usually entered sex work, but as transit periods reduced four or five women arrived in Lyon without having first being involved in sex work in Italy.

I came straight through Italy here so I was working for the first time when I arrived here ... E3

During the research period the initial trafficking route was static; the means by which the women crossed between Italy and France changed; the women who were recruited evolved, and the length of time women spent in Italy varied, but the actual initial route was the same for 57 of the 58 researched women. The exception to this was the single woman who had travelled to Italy on a student visa and who had been recruited in Italy by her *Çuni*. However, the women were to later develop alternative routes.

## 5.9 Trafficking networks and arrival in Lyon

The researched women had a variety of experiences of arriving in Lyon. The earliest women to arrive arrived independently of one another in 1998 but were accompanied by their *Çuna*. Within a few weeks these women had been joined by several other women whose *Çuna* were associated with men already in Lyon. As such, new women who were linked through these relationships were able to arrive in Lyon with accommodation and working places already established. This is how trafficking networks established themselves and created a self-regulating and constraining system that would be able to control the activities of the women.

Once the network was well established the *Çuna* would withdraw and allow the participating women to regulate the network. The women within these trafficking networks would regularly inform on one another's activities to their own *Çuni* who would report such information to the other *Çuna*. A well-organised trafficking network in the place of destination operated with a panoptical<sup>3</sup> gaze over the women within the network. Consequently, the women who experienced the greatest constraints were those who belonged to the networks with the most participating members. The *Çuni* would often try to form alliances and agreements between themselves so that various women could be required to work in association and as such supervise one another on behalf of the *Çuni*.

It is best if you get the women to work together, so mine works together with my cousin's women and that way we know everything they do as we can check their stories ... D-*Çuni*

All the women inform ... that is why I work alone ... then the *Çuni* cannot be sure what I am doing ... Z1

... and they tell the *Çuna* everything they know ... So, there are some girls that if another girl does something, they go and tell their *Çuni* immediately. At the end of the day we are their girls ... it's all the fault of the girls that the *Çuna* know everything and knowing everything means they can control everything ... I read once that knowledge is power ... V1I didn't know what was going on. I would go to the disco in the evening and my guy would tell me about it the next morning ... it was J3 she would tell her *Çuni* and he tells mine. My *Çuni* found out where I was living, who with etc ... Who told him? J3. I have talked to her for instance as a friend ... it was J3, because I heard her myself, she told her guy about me that: she has a lover, she goes to the dis-



co, and she doesn't work. Then my guy calls me up and says: I'll fuck your sister; I'll do this and that ... I told him: you mother-fucker you can do nothing to me ... But it's the girls who tell. I know that J3 will tell my guy. D2

This ability of the *Çuna* to use the researched women and particularly the wives to police themselves was a sophisticated application of power and discipline similar the systems described by Foucault (1991) as being the preferred method of policing in a modern society. It also contradicts an earlier presumption in chapter 1 of this study that the *Çuna* relied on pre-modern traditional force to coerce the maintenance of the women in trafficking. The media often wonders why women who are not sequestered by their *Çuni* do not runaway or otherwise escape from trafficking (Bienstock 2006); this is usually explained by reference to the use of threats (*Le Progrès* 1999; Hughes 2000). However, the Albanian *Çuna* relied on co-opting the women into a surveillance of themselves that effectively ensured that the *Çuna* only occasionally had to resort to threats and rarely to actual violence to be assured of the women's compliance with their regime. That no other authority was able to establish an equally effective surveillance of the women demonstrated that rather than any law enforcement or other government agency the *Çuna* were the most effective group using modern power, to operate a supervisory controlling gaze over the women.

There were several different trafficking networks that coexisted in Lyon; they ranged from the sophisticated network of *Çuna* and women organised by A-*Çuni* across various countries involving dozens of women to simple networks involving two or three male relatives controlling a single woman each, down to one *Çuni*-one woman arrangements. Women who were unassociated through their *Çunis* or previous contact would often be suspicious and hostile towards one another. However, the *Çuna* reported that they agreed among themselves on where the women would work and that most conflicts were quickly resolved. As more women arrived the new women moved into other parts of Lyon and developed new working territories. Many of the working areas in the Gerland district were used for the first time by the Albanian women (see Appendix G for researcher's map of Lyon hotels and sex-working areas). The local media would also publish maps showing the sex-work locations of the different sex-worker groups as part of their social commentary.

The practicalities of setting up in Lyon were more complicated than just arriving in the city, so being a member of a well-organised trafficking network could mean that a woman could receive considerable assistance when she arrived. Women had to find affordable hotels where they could live; several hotels refused to accept them because they did

not want to have sex workers as guests; however, there were a number of small cheap hotels in the *Place Carnot* area and around the *Gare Des Brotteaux* that would let rooms to the women. The newly arrived woman also needed help to acquire a *permis de séjour*.<sup>4</sup> However, the application process was complicated and time consuming, particularly if the woman concerned could not speak French.

As soon as a woman arrived in Lyon, she would be directed by the other researched women to the Refugee Forum so she could start the asylum process. Women in well-organised trafficking networks would be accompanied by a woman familiar with the process. The Refugee Forum was an NGO that was retained by the local municipal authority to issue refugee application forms to new applicants. All of the researched women, with the exception of one, claimed asylum as Kosovan refugees as a means to remain in France. The exception was a woman who started sex work before applying for asylum and who was quickly deported after being arrested by the local vice police as an irregular migrant. Consequently, women did not usually start sex work until they had their official papers showing that they had applied for a *permis de séjour*. Once a newly arrived woman had collected the necessary application forms and acquired some fake Kosovan documentation she would go to the Lyon Prefecture<sup>5</sup> and submit her asylum claim. There were a number of Kosovans in Lyon who sold fake birth certificates and asylum stories to the Albanian women and even though such stories were often transparently inaccurate or false, they would allow the applicant to enter the asylum process. Once the claim was filed, a receipt was issued showing that a *permis de séjour* was applied for and the woman could start to work on the streets without fear of immediate deportation.

Women such as E1 and S2 arrived in Lyon at the direction of but independently of their *Çuni*. They arrived only in the clothes they were wearing and without money for accommodation or food. Without access to support from an existing network in Lyon the women had to sell sex as soon as they arrived so as to pay for their accommodation, food and new clothing. By having to sell sex before they could apply for a *permis de séjour* they were vulnerable to arrest and deportation by the vice police as irregular migrants. The value of the well-organised trafficking networks in providing access to the various means to find accommodation and documentation was well understood by the researched women.

A-*Çuni* is well organised ... before any new woman arrives he tells the women here to find accommodation and to help her with money until she has the papers, then they must let her

work with them until he says otherwise ... it is an efficient system and it works ... TC

### 5.10 'Wives' and forced labour: when irregular migration becomes trafficking

Until the women were placed into forced labour, they are very similar to other irregular migrants and therefore their induction into forced labour and the means by which they are constrained to remain in forced labour will be of particular interest to understanding how trafficking is sustained. Prior to 1996, the women had overwhelmingly travelled as 'wives' with their *Çuni* to Italy. Once in Italy, most of these women spent several weeks being inducted into sex work and then spending months or years working on the streets. The wives described a typical induction process as being deceptive and if necessary both contrived and violent. This process usually involves the *Çuni* and wife arriving in Italy and staying with friends of the *Çuni*. The couple would live on the *Çuni's* money for a while and both would be unable to find regular work.

So we go to Italy, you know, by speedboat, suffering, no food, no water, 48 hours without eating, without putting anything in our mouth, suffering to the maximum. And we go to Italy, in Italy we go to stay with some friends of the *Çuni* ... Now I was curious, it's understandable, I was young as well, I was only nineteen years old, I became twenty in Italy ... It continued like this for about a month. And after that, looking at other girls, he was with his friends, their girls were working, they would bring home one million, two million, one million and a half lira each, it depended on the girl, how the girls are. Not that I really wanted to have money, because I used to say to them: me going to work in the street? Me ending up on the street? He won't put me on the street, I would say. Never. And afterwards he said to me, two months ... he said, not more. I thought, if it came to this, if could come to this point when he said it, you understand, it's in vain, it's in vain for me to do this and that, I was away from home, I didn't speak to my parents, and there is nothing you can do, you know ... and you love him, you're stuck, you don't know what to do. You don't think much ... I didn't say much when I went in the street for the first time. I was the one saying I wouldn't work there, I was the one who didn't say a word. I went. I won't say details, it's understandable, the first time you go to work there. I went, I went there, my *Çuni* was behind ... BLE

... didn't I tell you before? The first year the *Çuni* says ... come darling we'll work to buy a house, the second year to build a restaurant, the third year to build a hotel, the fourth year to get a car, the fifth year an aeroplane ... [laughter] and so on and by the time you realise it six years have passed. When he does all these things, he says good bye to you ... there are some girls who believe. Not really totally honest, because now they have started to doubt, but they pretend: my guy is the best and there is no one else ... In the beginning yes, the girls would be deceived. But now there are some things that are self-understood. V1

... I can tell you my life. The first year, I used to love my *Çuni*. The second year my *Çuni* told me we will build a hotel together. The third year he told me we will have five children. The fourth year he told me we will build a restaurant and a disco. I was seventeen then. The fifth year, then the threats: I'll kill you and your family. The sixth year he took me back to Albania and I was left in the street, with no house and no money, no support. I then called him back because I had no one there to go to. My family all knew that I was a whore and didn't want me back. My mother came to meet me in Italy. And of course I would run away and I would come back here. My mother has seen me go with clients. He would tell me that he loves me very much; he calls me all the time. Now he has a house built with marble, with seven rooms. He has a hotel in Tirana and now he is building a hotel in Spain. D2

The wife would become aware that the wives of their *Çuni*'s friends in the apartment were working as sex workers. Women would suggest to new comers that this work was no more burdensome than other unpleasant household chores and certainly better than looking after elderly Italian invalids which was the other work commonly available to Albanian women in Italy.

I used to tell the new girls that being on the street wasn't so bad, it was better than looking after old people and much more money ... also sex is just like cleaning the house or cooking sometimes it's fun other times it is just work ... I told them not to fuss and get on with it ... it is like cleaning fish heads. R1

I said do you always enjoy it when you do it with your boy ... no ... so what is the difference ... it is cleaning fish heads. L1

As the financial situation of the couple worsened, these other 'wives' would suggest to the new 'wife' that she should join them in sex work. Some new 'wives' would be subjected to taunts by the other 'wives' that they were lazy and were not willing to work.

The other women said I was lazy because I wouldn't work and if I didn't work I shouldn't eat ... EK

The couple would 'discuss' the sex-work option, and the *Çuni* would agree to the wife working as a sex worker as it would bring money in that could be used for the couple to make a better life. The new wife would then go out with the other women and be shown how to work. All the wives said that they had helped to induct other women into sex work using this sort of process. Some of the wives described how when they still refused to engage in sex work they were subjected to cold baths and beatings that eventually compelled them to engage in sex work.

... when she told him she wouldn't go on the street he hit her very hard and then took her in the bathroom and held her under a cold bath. Every time she said no he would drag her to the bathroom and almost drown her in cold water. Eventually she just gave in and came to the street with me ... L1

... when I said 'no' he would hit me with a telephone book so it wouldn't leave bruises ... once he hit me so hard I couldn't hear anything for a long time. I couldn't go home because of the shame so I just did what he wanted ... F1

Non-wives did not need to be subjected to such contrivances as they knew that they would be engaging in sex work. Many non-wives had been engaged in sexual affairs with their *Çuni* before they left Albania, and many described the sexual content of the relationship as being an obvious training for sex work in that they were expected to perform sexual acts in similar circumstances and manner to how they would have to work when abroad.

We did everything like it would be done here ... that is why I knew I could do this work ... VT

The *Çuni* also usually arranged for these women to be tutored and supervised by other women until they were confident in their work. This reinforced and reproduced the surveillance regime and reporting system. However, these women were also subjected to demands and

threats by the *Çuni* and as such they were unable to control their labour. They were unable to desist from the labour because of the abusive and arbitrary nature of the 50 per cent contract and the demands of the *Çuna*.

### 5.11 Controlling 'wives': co-dependency and violence

The *Çuna* relied firstly on the apparent emotional co-dependency of those researched women who were 'wives' to maintain their control over them, such control is used by many Albania men over their intimate partners (MAHR 1996; UNICEF 2003). Co-dependency is a learned behaviour; it is an emotional and behavioural condition that affects an individual's ability to have a healthy, mutually satisfying relationship (Kasl 1990). It is also known as 'relationship addiction' because people with co-dependency often form or maintain relationships that are one-sided, emotionally destructive and/or abusive (Cermak 1986). It usually involves emotional dependency on an abusive person and for a co-dependent's self esteem and identity to be invested in sustaining the abusive relationship at any emotional cost (Bradshaw, 1998). Kasl (1990) has carefully documented how women in such addictive and destructive relationships can be conditioned into sexual promiscuity. Kasl then describes how through this conditioning co-dependent women will seek out emotionally bereft sexual contact as a means to endorse or legitimise their abusive relationship as being more meaningful or positive, Kasl (1990) suggests that this abuse can be sustained for many years.

Dobash (1987) and Bradshaw (1998) have documented the abuse sustaining behaviour of women who are apparently assisting in perpetuating relationships where their role as the abused appears to have become a means by which they legitimise their supportive and reproductive role. Norwood (1985) has also written extensively about women 'who love too much' who then remain in abusive relationships and whose demonstrations of love are used to construct them as particularly worthy and saintly women. The researched women repeatedly described themselves as 'loving to much'.

'Of course we all love them too much, this is the curse and joy of the Albanian woman. Only she can love the Albanian man and that takes a love that is greater than any other ... and once she loves she never stops... it is our way of love.' S1

'How is it possible to stop loving your first love ...? it isn't possible you will always love him ... and if he needs it you must love

him more than normal, you must never stop loving him or you will stop being a woman and become a whore ...' M3

Co-dependency has been severely criticised by Dear (1996) and others (McIntyre 1984; Raven 1994) as this model casts the victim of violence as complicit in their abuse and because the theory of co-dependency is also considered by its many critics to be unsupported by adequate research (Dear 2002). At various points in my research, I seriously reconsidered whether the abusive relationships I saw, especially between wives and their *Çuna*, were always co-dependent. I believe that not all of these relationships were co-dependent. However, the relationships between the wives and their *Çuna* often appeared to present as co-dependent relationships as the wives would engage in behaviour such as provoking the violent attention of the *Çuna* by pretending that they had lost money or were intending to abscond. I concluded that this analysis was adequate for explaining certain complicit behaviours among the research women which seemed to cause them to act against their own interest, but I also considered that this conceptualisation was not without limitations and analytical difficulties. I eventually considered that the research should have been better informed regarding gendered power relationships and the other theories regarding exploitative intimate relationships.

After this co-dependency the *Çuna* also used the mutual surveillance that the wives extended over themselves to control the women. When this self-policing failed the *Çuna* would resort to threats of violence and actual violence against the women and their families as the principal means to ensure their compliance with their demands. The *Çuna* also used threats to expose the women as prostitutes to their families and home communities as a means to control them. Most *Çuna* were very violent men, and most had no hesitation in using violence against women; however, they considered such violence to be 'normal' and the means by which to control 'disobedient' women, regardless of whether such women were being trafficked. However, their development of a panoptical surveillance strategy meant that they often could rely on the women to police themselves according to the *Çuna* agenda and that very little violence was required to control the women once the regime was in place.

I don't beat my whore any more than I would beat my wife ... actually I treat the whore better than my wife. If my wife spoke to me like the whore does, I would kill her ... but the whore is more like a cow and you must take care of the cow because it gives the milk. What does the wife give ... nothing ... D-*Çuni*

It is not because they are whores we beat them it is because they are stupid fucking women who don't do what they are told ... and any woman who behaves like that is going to get a slap ...  
C-Çuni

... the Çuna are just Albanian men abroad ... the violence you have here with your Çuni, is because he is Albanian not because of the prostitution ... R3

Violence is not just used by Albanian traffickers to control trafficked Albanian women, it is regularly used by Albanian men to control any Albanian woman. Gender-related violence is endemic in Albania (AI 2006), and partner abuse is considered by Amnesty International to be a serious and growing problem in Albania (MAHR 1996: 27).

Domestic violence is a serious and widespread problem in Albania and it is virtually ignored by public officials. Women in Albania are routinely denied their basic, fundamental right to be free from violence ... In a recent survey conducted by the women's association Refleksione in Albania, more than 63 per cent of the women surveyed reported that they had been abused by their husbands or partners. (AI 2006: 10)

An estimated one in three women in Albania have been hit, beaten or subjected to other physical violence within their families. Some have been raped, some have been killed. Husbands, former husbands and partners are responsible for most of these acts of violence against women – abuses which are often condoned by the wider community. Violence against women is widely tolerated on grounds of tradition, even at the highest levels of the government, police and judiciary ... Research by forensic practitioners has documented an increase in intimate partner violence over the past five years. (AI 2006: 8)

Successive research over the last decade has shown gender abuse in Albania to be endemic among Albanian partnerships (MAHR 1996; Baban 2003; AI 2006). Baban (2004) identifies young women to be at even greater risk than other women. The researched women often reported being beaten for circumstances not related to controlling their sex work.

He beat me for spending too much on cosmetics, and for changing hotels without asking him, but he is very old-fashioned and is only worried that I might get robbed if people think I have money ... I love him very much ... L1



... we lost everything in the pyramid scams ... I told him that the pyramid banks were stupid and he was more stupid for putting our money in the pyramids ... then he hit me and threw me out of the car while it was moving ... R1

Well ... he heard she had been seeing someone else ... I don't know if it is true but I saw her dancing with an Algerian at a club ... anyway he really beat her up. They only do it because they love us so much that they can't bear us to be involved with another man ... F1

Some *Çuna* deliberately fostered a reputation for violence by regularly engaging in violent crimes and these men were generally regarded by all of the researched women as exceptionally dangerous and violent.

A-*Çuni* would just start fights in the street to show what he was capable of ... everyone is afraid of him ... He would beat EK very much ... TC

The four *Çuna* with the most violent reputations all had wives in Lyon who reported that they were infatuated with them; they represented the *Çuni* as their true love and with whom they wanted to have children and live with permanently, even though they suspected their real intentions.

... that he is gonna squeeze me like a lemon until I'm about 30, or maybe even older, and then I get old and then he doesn't want to marry me any more, and he's going to throw me in the street and say ... well, just you know, basically say sod off, because I don't need you any more, or he is just, he is just gonna leave me and say, well, you know, he is gonna marry another woman and have kids with her. So whatever might come, I just hope that he is well and he'll not get killed, he is the only person that I ever loved in this world, as a boyfriend, and I don't think I would ever get married again. I am very much in love with him and I just want to have his children and be happy ... EK

Threats used against wives seemed to be more effective than threats against contract women, and the *Çunis* regularly expressed the importance of emotional co-dependency in ensuring the compliance of the women.

Once you have been the first love of an Albanian girl she must keep you or she will be destroyed. If she leaves you she is a

whore and will never be accepted anywhere. Once we have their love we have them forever. If you are a real man, strong and fearless then the women admire, respect and fear you. That is why they never leave us ... A-Çuni

The Çuna used various degrees of co-dependency or threats to constrain the wives in the forced labour associated with the trafficking. Women who are constrained in forced labour by co-dependent relationships will require complex interventions and assistance to overcome such a constraint. However, women who are contractually engaged with traffickers could probably be more easily assisted to reduce their dependency on such contracts and therefore could be assisted to avoid such violent men.

### 5.12 Challenging trafficking constraints

Developing new social networks was the most common means used by the researched women to challenge their exploitation. Women such as R2 had absconded with a client to another French city after only being in Lyon a few weeks. Other women had absconded with clients or travelled to other countries where they had networks of friends or family to try to separate themselves from their exploitation, but finding sustainable alternatives to trafficking was difficult. The researched women said the compelling need was to find sustainable work alternatives to sex work.

Running away is easy, finding somewhere you can build a decent life is very difficult ... very difficult ... solve that problem and you are free ... M3

It is all about papers and money ... with papers and money you are free to go somewhere and start again, without them you are a prisoner ... I am a prisoner. R2

Several women who made attempts to leave trafficking returned once they realised that they could not sustain their alternative. If they had absconded with a client and that relationship failed, they could not easily sell sex in other French cities as that made them vulnerable to the Çuna working in those places. Women whose attempts to escape failed would sometimes claim they had been kidnapped by other Albanians and escaped so they could return to their original Çuni and Lyon.

I went with a client but it didn't work out so I had to come back, I told my Çuni I had been kidnapped by Albanians. He believed me ... next time I must choose a better man to run with ... S2

During the research period only one woman rejected the sex-work experience and sought to return permanently to Albania as the solution to the episode. This was a young woman aged nineteen, in 2001, who after two weeks of sex work decided that she could do far better by returning to Albania and making a marriage there. After some assistance from the cultural advocate, she returned to Albania. She told her *Çuni* that if he pursued her she would tell her male relatives what he had done.

I am not like the young women of previous years; I am not stupid to believe the *Çuni* lies. I thought I would like this life of sex and money, but it is not for me. I will go home and if he tries to make trouble I will tell my older brothers what he has done to me ... E3

While seventeen women never left Lyon during the research period, 27 women travelled to other parts of France and Italy to visit and work, and twelve women had visited and worked in countries such as Greece, Belgium, the Netherlands, Spain, Austria and Germany. These visits were often to work and to visit their *Çuni*. Most *Çuni* did not stay in Lyon because of the higher level of policing in the area so they would meet their women outside of Lyon. Some trips were vacations with clients and others were to visit friends or relatives who were also in the EC. Migration information did not always readily pass between the differing groups of women in Lyon and as such different mobility skill sets were often quite varied. One aspect of the research was to make such information more generally available to all of the women. As these skill sets developed, the researched women developed social networks outside of Lyon that were not dependent on the *Çuni* contacts.

### 5.13 Conclusions

In properly identifying the migration motivation and subsequent objectives of the various researched women it is possible to better understand their migration agenda. By correctly identifying some of the constraints placed upon their migration options it is possible to better understand the wives and the reasons why some other women 'choose' trafficking as a migration strategy. The wives migrated as part of a deceptive household migration strategy, legitimised by patrilocal marriage traditions in a form of new economics migration. This lack of altruistic decision making offers the possibility to theorise some new economic migrations as potentially having serious opportunity costs for the weaker participants.

Understanding such constrained choice should help in the design of interventions intended to overcome trafficking. The researched women required support from networks that not only could facilitate their migration but that could also support them to remain in a country of destination while they pursued their various objectives. Consequently, their migration was directed by the trafficking networks that had such competencies and not their own weaker social networks that lacked such capacity. However, their weak networks did create expectations and desires to chain migrate and the desire to reintegrate into these networks motivated and directed their strategies intended to overcome trafficking. This has implications for seeing the consequences of weak networks able to create migration desire, whilst being unable to facilitate and sustain a successful migration by a new migrant. Networks consisting of family and friends often could not facilitate the women's migration or they could not support the women long enough for her to be able to sustain herself. These weak social networks meant the researched women were unable to regularise their status and access sustainable alternatives to sex work. This weakness was an important constraint that kept the researched women in a place where they could be controlled and exploited.

The 'wives' among the researched women were co-opted by marriage into trafficking and consequently the trafficking network was their principle social network. As 'wives' they usually had a co-dependent relationship with their trafficker. Such intertwined social and trafficking networks were extremely complicated and resembled the complex relationship experienced by other women abused in intimate partnerships. The other researched women had weak or non-existent social networks outside of Albania and this meant that they had to engage with trafficking networks to be able to initially migrate and then sustain the migration. The trafficking networks were varied but they used the same irregular networks as used by most irregular Albanian migrants travelling to Italy. They were then able to sustain the migration episode by providing the means to remain in a country of destination for at least two or three years and often longer.

Some researched women then began to develop points of resistance that were based on the development of new social networks or their reconnection to social networks outside the trafficking network. These women were harder to control, and the researched women's attitudes towards trafficking began to change as a consequence as they saw sustainable alternatives to trafficking becoming available. This would suggest that involvement in trafficking could be mitigated by using the analytical trafficking matrix to identify interventions that would reduce the need to resort to traffickers for migration. Such interventions must include actions intended to assist the migrant woman to be able to sus-

tain any migration without the need for the support of trafficking networks.

In the next chapter the study describes the women's experiences in Lyon and the growing tension between the wives and 'divorced women' and how both groups developed their initial resistance to the traffickers.



## 6 Living and working in Lyon

This chapter examines the role of the *Çuna* and other men in sustaining the researched women's trafficking episode and the researched women's experience of living and working in Lyon. The chapter describes the sexual economy of Lyon and the activities of the trafficked women within this economy. I then further examine and analyse the different 'wife' and 'non-wife' experiences of the researched women and the contests between them. I describe and examine the evolving relationships between the *Çuna* and the researched women. I also document the complicated and evolving social groups that were originally organised by the traffickers but were later adapted by the researched women. I particularly analyse how status changed within these groups and how women moved between different levels of status and between the groups. The chapter continues by documenting the various experiences of the researched women with clients and the local vice police.

Finally, I consider how these complicated notions of status helped to constrain many of the researched women within trafficking. I conclude by considering the different contributions of various men and the researched women to the viability of the trafficking networks and analysing the evolution of the researched women's strengthening networks.

### 6.1 The sex-work economy in Lyon

In Lyon the sex-work economy was a well-established aspect of local life, since before the nineteenth century Lyon had had a well documented and substantial number of street-working sex workers that was a source of constant concern to the local authorities (Mathilde 2003). The Lyon authorities in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries were deeply concerned about the involvement of coerced women (Benabou 1987; Berliere 1992), risks to public health (Jeannel 1868) and the involvement of organised crime in local prostitution (Bluzet 1902; Mathilde 2003). These same issues continued as concerns for the local authorities in 1999-2000 and were repeatedly highlighted in the French media as being a crisis in Lyon because of the appearance of

the Albanian women (*Le Progrès* 1999; *Le Figaro* 2000; *Le Monde* 2000; *L'Humanite* 2000).

The sex workers in Lyon in 1998-2001 consisted of far more than the street-working sex-worker group, and the street-based sex workers formed a minority of the sex-working people in Lyon in 1996-2001 (Mathieu 1996; Cabiria 2000). Within Lyon there were an unknown number of off-street sex-work sites as nightclubs, strip-tease bars, sex clubs and massage parlours. These enterprises would often close and then open elsewhere as new businesses (Mathieu 1996; *Le Progrès* 1999; Cabiria 2000). Other sex-workers worked from apartments and publicised their availability by advertising in local papers, on the internet or through Minitel (*L'Humanite* 2000) or by fly posting small stickers with their contact numbers on lamp-posts and in phone boxes (*Le Progrès* 1999) (see Appendix D). There were also escort agencies and massage parlours offering sexual services (*Le Progrès* 1999; *Le Figaro* 2000; Vital-Durand 2000). However, there was no agreed estimation of how many people were involved in these off-street activities although it was argued by Cabiria, a local NGO working with sex workers, that it must involve several hundred sex workers (Cabiria 2000). The local media and local NGOs working with sex workers in Lyon regularly used the figure of approximately 500 to represent the total number of street-working sex workers in Lyon (*Le Progrès* 1999; *Lyon Mag* 1999). This estimate was attributed to the records of the vice police (*Le Progrès* 1999).

From the 58 researched women there were never more than the 40 who were working at any single time in Lyon. Women would leave or arrive in Lyon and as such the street-working population of Albanians never exceeded 40 on any day throughout the research period. These 40 women represented less than 10 per cent of the estimation of the street based sex workers and therefore, an even smaller fraction of the total sex-worker population. However, this small group dominated the public imagination and became the driving force behind every sex-worker related initiative in Lyon in 1999-2001 (*Le Progrès* 1999; Cabiria 2000; Legardinier 2000; *Lyon Capitale* 2000; *Lyon Mag* 2000; Vital-Durand 2000).

## 6.2 The researched women's experiences of Lyon's sex-work economy

The researched women were charging the equivalent of between € 25 and € 80 depending on the sex acts supplied (see Appendix B) and were usually earning between € 7,000 and € 10,000 per month. In



2002, the GDP PPP per capita for Albania was approximately € 5,000 per annum (UNECE 2005).

M1 only does straight sex and hand job, she doesn't do any oral or anal ... for straight sex they used to get 400 even 500 francs. But now the prices have gone down, so it's 200 to 300. In the hotel they used to get 1500 to maybe 1800, now they have gone down to 800 to 1,000 francs ... Z1

The women reported that their earnings were directly affected by their 'attractiveness', the sexual services they were willing to supply, and the amount of time they could work. Consequently, the earnings of women could vary greatly depending on the weather or sickness or any number of factors that could affect their ability to work; however, the *Çuna* would still demand minimum payments regardless of any problem.

I stayed until midnight but the rain was so bad and it was so cold I just gave up ... there were no clients ... I made less than 600 francs. E3

We had to leave our work area because of the Police so we went to Place Carnot, but then they moved us from there, it has been like this for three days, we have made very little money ... V1

Some women built up considerable debts because of the minimum payment system, but equally often these debts would be forgiven if the woman sent the *Çuni* a substantial remittance as a settlement.

She owed me 25,000 francs but I accepted 12,000 to clear the debt ... the debt is only claimed to make the lazy bitches go back to work ... if there were no debts none of them would work ... C-*Çuni*

Once she was working everyday again, I forgave her the debts and she was very grateful, she bought me an Armani suit to say thank you ... D-*Çuni*

If women were ill or otherwise prevented from working their income could fall to nothing, but in spite of any circumstance women would still try and earn at least € 1,000 per month to pay their local accommodation and other expenses.

I will have the heart operation next week but I must still work. The doctors say I could fall down dead anytime ... but I need to pay my bills and send a little money home in case I do die ... I2

When I was ill I could send no money so the *Çuni* kept a record and said that I owed him money for the days that I did not send him money. He said I owed him 20,000 francs (€ 3,000). E4

From their earnings the wives deducted any local living expenses then all of the excess money was then remitted to their *Çuni* as was their responsibility as a wife in a patrilocal marriage.

I would never send my *Çuni* less than 10,000 francs (€ 1,500) per week, and I know several women were sending similar sums ... we must send all of our money because our hotel rooms are not safe and we are the target of thieves. EK

The researched women lived with a variety of harms and fears, which were not just related to their exploiters, but to the whole domain that surrounded a trafficking episode. Women feared being robbed because they could not have a regular bank account in which to keep their income because they could not supply the required documentation to open a normal bank account, particularly proof of a permanent address. The researched women would often complain that they felt depressed because they could not easily rent apartments and have a more normal home life.

Some of us are able to rent small apartment through clients or friends but most of us must live in the hotels and that is very depressing ... D3

The researched women could only open a post office savings account as an asylum seeker, but if they became irregular in their status they could lose access to the account so none of the women kept money in such accounts. Money kept in their hotel rooms was regularly stolen and consequently the researched women were unable to save money for use in emergencies. The fear of theft was another reason why some of the 50 per cent contract women sent their earnings to the *Çuni*.

I sent him his 50 per cent and my smaller 50 per cent because I had nowhere to keep it safe here ... I just have to hope he will keep it safe for me ... D2

Women who did not have a family member who knew about their sex work could not send unexplained large sums of money to their own families as this would raise suspicion about them being involved in sex work; this was equally true for the wives and non-wives. Women would even pretend that their *Çuni* was a drug smuggler to try and explain

any large sums of money they managed to send to their own families (Illiria 1999).

I can't send money to anyone but my *Çuni* because if I did, my family would know what I was doing ... M4

All the women would have income targets set by the *Çuni*, and especially during the initial period of their arrival in Lyon, many women reported having to stay out working exceptionally long hours to meet these daily targets.

I have to work sixteen hours a day to make the money he demands, and it is very hard to find somewhere to work for this time. I have been attacked by the French sex workers for working in their places ... EK

I am working more than twelve hours and I am so tired but if I don't make enough money the *Çuni* will get very angry ... S2

Therefore, if the woman was on a 50 per cent contract she would often have to send all of her earnings after her local expenses as the *Çuni* would have set a minimum daily sum as part of the contract. *Çuni* of 50 per cent contract women would often demand that they be sent the equivalent of € 250-€ 300 per day, every day of the week, as a minimum '50 per cent'.

After paying his 50 per cent, I have nothing left except money for my room and food ... BL

He said his 50 per cent was 2,000 francs everyday ... but that was too much ... J3

The unsustainability of such an income level and its obvious inequity as a supposed '50 per cent' would quickly become apparent and this target would in practice eventually be renegotiated.

He has agreed that he was asking too much so now I tell him each day what I have made and he tells me what to send ... E1

The *Çuna* said that they considered the daily income target an important way of making sure the all the women paid them some money, particularly in case any new woman was planning to abscond.

You must demand a certain amount of money each day or the lazy bitches would never get out of bed ... C-Çuni

Make big demands and then reduce them...it makes you appear reasonable to the whores ... also so many run away nowadays you must get as much money as you can before they disappear ... D-Çuni

The renegotiation of this unsustainable financial demand was often the researched women's first experience of influencing the conduct of their sex work and overcoming a demand of their Çuni.

Telling him I couldn't keep sending so much money was the first time I ever said no to him and managed to get him to agree to change his demands ... BE

### 6.3 The importance of marriage

I have already discussed in chapter 4 of this study, the social importance of marriage and the devastating affect of divorce or abandonment on Albanian women and its role as a vector for involvement in trafficking. The overwhelming social importance of marriage for Albanian women is based on an understanding that a woman's identity is totally tied to her husband. Wives will often subsume their own identity into their Çuni and refer to themselves and others as the girl of a particular Çuni.

I am the girl of A-Çuni and she is the girl of B-Çuni, Z1 is the girl of E-Çuni. EK

She is D-Çuni's girl ... S3

Through their patrilocal marriage Albanian women are considered to have completely left their own families and to have joined their husband's families (Young 2000; Elsie 2001; AI 2006). As a woman without a husband you have only a very limited social existence (Young 2000). To be divorced by your husband is to be cast into a social void where you essentially become a non-person (Pritchett Post 1998; AI 2006). Therefore, your social position and prestige is based on your role as a 'good wife', a wife who supplies all of the needs of her husband and who the husband praises to his colleagues as being dutiful (Pritchett Post 1998; UNICEF 2003). The good Albanian wife is often emotionally co-dependent on her husband; this means that she has be-

come dependent on the man for her social identity and self-esteem and is unable to imagine life without his approval (Kasl 1990; Pritchett Post 1998; Young 2000). Young Albanian women often expect to be subservient to their husbands.

... In Albania, the Albanian men especially when the people get married, he commands in the house whatever happens. It's not like here in France that the wife, can decide for herself ... the man decides, that's how it is in Albania. R<sub>3</sub>

Whether the researched women were married or not married to their *Çuni* was, therefore, very important because of the social status that was linked to 'marriage' by the Albanians. That the value of this status shifted among the researched women during the research period further complicated researching this important aspect of the women's lives. Twenty-nine women identified themselves as 'wives' of their *Çuni* at some point during the research period and recruitment by 'marriages' was the most important initial means of recruitment before 1999. However, as more women arrived on 50 per cent contracts, the value of such 'marriage' became contested. Increasingly, a number of 'married' women wanted to divorce their *Çuni*; the status of 'non-wife' was seen as better positing women to find a good husband and achieve a happy family life.

I divorced my *Çuni* when I realised he was not the only fish in the sea and that being single like the other women meant you could find a better husband who was more sincere and honest ... M<sub>3</sub>

The evolution of trafficking from Albania originally took women who identified themselves as wives and then required them to increasingly work with women who were usually 'divorced' and working on 50 per cent contracts. This development caused considerable tension in Lyon, because the 'wives' did not want to associate with the 'non-wives', who they considered their social inferiors. The researched women were very aware of the social opprobrium attached to divorce. Consequently, those women who claimed they were married to their *Çuni* assumed a superior social status to women who they considered to be engaged in prostitution just for the money. When I met the Lyon-North Group<sup>1</sup> the core members of the group took particular concern to describe themselves as being married to their *Çuni* and that they then referred to various other researched women in Lyon as 'wives' or 'whores'.

We are wives they are 'whores' and we treat them like whores ...  
EK

It was apparent early in the research period that being designated a wife had a far superior social status among the researched women compared with being a 'whore' or non-wife. However, to be a wife rather than a whore required having certain socially recognised attributes and having a 'marriage' registered was not an essential pre-requisite. Marriage in Albania is a matter of publicly establishing the relationship before your family, friends and community, usually by a marriage feast and celebration or by elopement. Formal registration of a marriage can often take place months or even years after the public pronouncement of the marriage.

My parents were married for several months before going to the Town Hall and registering the marriage. Couples who are publicly living together are considered married and will present themselves to be married. Z2

To be a wife, a woman needs to have been publicly acknowledged by her *Çuni* as being his wife. The most convincing means of being so acknowledged is for the couple to have undertaken a public wedding or betrothal feast in Albania and for the groom's family to have acknowledged the marriage. Various derivatives were considered of similar value among the researched women; these included that the couple had known one another in Albania and had eloped together to Italy and some public betrothal feast had taken place among their friends in Italy. A relationship that existed prior to departure from Albania was considered pre-eminent in deciding the validity and integrity of the claimed marriage.

I had the marriage meal with my *Çuni* with my parents and his parents in Tirana, with all of our friends and family present ... I am a real wife ... B1 lived with her *Çuni* in Albania before coming here and everyone knows in Tirana that she is his wife, the same with L1 ... None of us has registered the marriage in the town hall but we will do that later but that is what everyone does ... EK

Of course I am married to him ... He kidnapped me and we ran to Italy together if that isn't true marriage what is ...? A1

It was also important that some validating event regarding the relationship had taken place before the woman's involvement in sex work. This

could be as little as a short period of living on the resources of the husband before the wife was required to enter sex work. The most validating event was to have had a child together, and it was not unknown for some women to claim that they had a child by their *Çuni* as a way of supporting their claim to wife status. E4 falsely reported that she had children by her *Çuni* as a means to convince the other women she was a wife; however, when this contrivance was exposed E4 was humiliatingly relegated to 'whore' status, and she was forced to work alone at the Pont Pasteur.

The lying bitch E4 was pretending to be his wife and to have had a son with him, but we knew that he was married to another woman and this whore is just his lying whore ... EK

#### 6.4 Marriage and sex work

'Wife' is an occupational status in Albanian society, and it is her labour that should meet many of the needs of her family (Durham 2000; AI 2006). Therefore, when Albanian migrants first entered Italy and informal work opportunities began to grow scarce, some men expected their women to enter prostitution as an occupation to fulfil the obligation of the wife to provide for the family (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997). The activity was justified in that it was undertaken for the legitimate purpose of providing for the needs of the patrilocal family.

I do this only to meet my responsibilities as his wife, I am not a whore I do not do this for personal gain. EK

We do this because it is the only well paid work for women and because it is our own responsibility to make a good home for our husband ... TK

In Albania we would be expected to work in the fields, as well as preparing everything in the house and garden. Staying at home means more work not less ... I work on the street because it makes more money than growing vegetables and if we want a house we need money ... My *Çuni* works hard with the cars (dealing in stolen cars) ...I work hard here ... B2

Once significant numbers of women had entered sex work, it became normalised among the subsequent wives as another female occupation.

Of course it is women's work ... all the difficult jobs are given to the women and this is no different ... it is no different from the dirty work that all women must do ... A1

Better this than living like my mother and aunts ... their work is backbreaking and harder than this ... Being fucked is what women do ... and we only do what all women do but we do it more often ... so we work harder at sex and they work harder with the fields and other stuff ... BE

The moral paradox is rationalised in that if the activity is only undertaken for the purpose of the wife fulfilling her responsibility to care for her family, it is considered 'acceptable' by the wives. Many researched women expressly stated that their involvement in prostitution is for the purpose of securing a family home and business, and at that time, they will leave prostitution and take up another domestic role.

When we have everything we need for our family I will leave this life and go home to Albania and have children and live as his wife ... it will still be hard work but different work ... SmV

Therefore a 'wife' who entered sex work as a means of meeting her responsibilities to contribute to her husband and her new family's household was considered by the 'wives' as acting honourably. The wives among the researched women willingly sent the majority of their income to their husband, as this legitimised their sex work as being an activity only for sustaining their family. This rationalisation explains why wives did not keep any of their income above their necessary living expenses and willingly forwarded all the excess to their husband. It also explains why the *Çuna* who controlled wives, did not need to subject such women to constant violence but only needed to maintain the co-dependency of the wives under their own surveillance to ensure the constant flow of remittances.

Being 'married' to a sex-working woman was of particular interest to the *Çuna*, as 'husbands' could legitimately claim all the income of their 'wives' and the 'wives' would usually willingly pay over their income. However, with 'non-wives' there was often negotiation regarding the monies to be paid. Through my discussions with the *Çuna*, I found that the intention of the men was to maintain the 'wives' in sex work for as long as possible to maximise their financial gain. The marriage contract between most of these men and women was a fraudulent contrivance used to exploit the women.



These women are so stupid they deserve everything that happens to them, they are whores not wives and the longer we can keep them working the better it is for us. B-Çuni

I would never marry a whore, my mother already has a girl ready for me to marry ... these women are just business ... D-Çuni

If they are so stupid they deserve all they get, what man is going to take a whore back to his mother and say 'look mum I married a whore ...' My mother has already found me a real wife and when I go back I will marry her ... E-Çuni

## 6.5 Good husbands, bad husbands

The ease with which wives could be manipulated and the way that wives would police one another to ensure that they sent their income to their husbands meant it was an advantage if the Çuni could maintain himself in the estimation of his wife and the other women as a 'good husband' and so ensure the willing compliance of his 'wife' in sending her remittances. Such a status would mean that the Çuni could maximise his financial benefit from the activity of the 'wife', while investing little energy in the everyday management of her activity. According to the researched women, the principle quality of a good husband is that good husbands are sexually faithful to the female partner. Other valued, but equally rare, qualities included the careful investment of the woman's income and the regular purchasing of gifts from this income for the woman and her family.

A good husband does not screw around, is wise with money and is generous to his wife ... when you see a man like that tell me because he is rarer than gold ... V1

As the sex-work income of any Albanian wife was the property of the husband, it could be disposed of in his absolute discretion, although it was usually assumed by the 'wives' that such income should be used to build and furnish a house for the couple and to create a business. Therefore, a husband who uses the sex-work income of his wife to buy her an expensive dress or watch would be widely considered to be a Çuni-*i-mire*,<sup>2</sup> as would be a husband who purchased the wife's family consumer goods such as a television or a refrigerator. An example of this 'generosity' was when B1. who once having delivered more than eighty thousand francs<sup>3</sup> to her Çuni in a two-week period, was re-

warded by the purchase of a coat to the value of a few thousand francs. The coat which was purchased with a small fraction of the money she had surrendered to the *Çuni* was considered by the Lyon-North group as an exceptional act of generosity on the part of her *Çuni*.

Br's *Çuni* really loves and respects her and the coat was a sign of his love ... No wonder she is so happy with her *Çuni*... TC

If a husband was serially unfaithful, an accommodation could be reached by which his infidelities could be ascribed to his sexual needs and demanding libido. As long as such infidelities were supposedly the consequence of geographical separation, then these indiscretions could be accepted. Maintaining marriage status required the fidelity of the female partner which meant she should only have sex with clients and her *Çuni*, and for the male partner not to have relationships with other Albanian women. Among the researched women it was considered inconceivable that an Albanian man would actually marry a non-Albanian woman and as such no non-Albanian woman could be considered a serious rival to an existing wife.

He is a man so I know he is fucking other women, but as long as he only does foreigners I don't care; he can't marry a foreigner ... EK

They all fuck other women, but if they are fucking other Albanian women then there will be trouble ... LI

However, relationships with other Albanian women were the subject of many contests and caused many wives considerable distress. Should a husband be seen with another Albanian woman or should it be reported that he was spending time in another location with an Albanian woman it could cause a crisis in the marriage relationship.

When I found out my *Çuni* had been fucking I2 I was so angry that I went to her hotel and destroyed her papers and wrecked her room. When I next see her I will beat her up ... EK

I discovered he had another Albanian woman, so I decided I would then find a way to break with him ... why couldn't he fuck a Bulgarian like the other *Çuna*? M3

A husband who controlled more than one Albanian woman had to spend a considerable amount of time reassuring the various women

that each of them were the actual wife and the other women were only dupes being exploited for the purpose of financial gain.

Each of them wants to believe that she is your real love, so you tell them what they want to hear and make sure they never meet the other women. If they get snotty about it you just beat the crap out of them ... B-Çuni

## 6.6 Relationships with the 'Çuna': contract relationships

Çuna who were not husbands were identified by the researched women as men of varying capability who supplied various services. They could, therefore, command payments with varying degrees of success depending on their capacity for violence and the services they provided. The main role of a non-husband Çuni was:

1. to have arranged the movement of the woman from Albania into the EC
2. to have supplied her with a working place
3. to have supplied the contacts necessary to enter the asylum process
4. and to resolve any harassment the woman might receive from any other Albanian man.

Having delivered these services, the Çuni could demand a minimum payment for a period of several months or even years. Such arrangements have already been described as 50 per cent contracts and were supposedly time bound, but the Çuni would often try to vary such contracts to their own advantage by claiming that the contracted woman had not sent sufficient money and so still owed the Çuni money with interest.

Non-husband Çuna would try to assume a husband identity and relationship with any Albanian woman that was working with them. It was recognised by the Çuna that co-dependent Albanian wives were the easiest group to manage and that they offered the most sustained source of reliable income among sex-working women. Recognition as a wife also offered Albanian women a more prestigious status among the sex-working women, but the value of this status diminished during the research period. However, three of the researched women entered into marriage relationships with their contract Çuni, but these relationships were far more fragile than the marriages that predated a woman's involvement in sex work and all the women involved sought to break the relationship within a few months.

That *Çuni* says he wants to marry me but I know he just thinks that is the way to catch all my money ... V1

I did agree to marry my *Çuni* after I came to France, but he was not sincere and it was a big mistake so I told him I have broken with him ... BML

A non-husband *Çuni* was often still required after any initial contract period had been concluded as women working independently would sometimes receive threats or advances from other *Çuna* seeking to subjugate them to their control. Payments to a *Çuni* to protect women from other *Çuna* were usually considered necessary by the women to enable them to resist threats and advances from other Albanian men.

I still send my old *Çuni* a little money so I can tell the others that I am under his protection, that way none of the other *Çuna* will hassle me ... M2

Often the only service rendered by a non-husband *Çuni* apart from arranging the woman's migration was to prevent harassment of the woman by other Albanian men.

I told that other *Çuni* the last time he visited Lyon that if he tried to catch me again I would tell my *Çuni* and then there would be war, so now he leaves me alone ... V1

## 6.7 The social contest between wives and whores

The group of women who had a financial contract with their *Çuni* and did not have a 'marriage' relationship were initially considered 'whores' by the 'wives'.

... only whores do this for the money, which is why they are whores ... BE

... doing this just for the money would be immoral, you can only do this if you have a reason to make this sacrifice. I do this for the future of my family the whores do it for their own greed ... TC

However, those 50 per cent contract women who were using trafficking to find new husbands did not always accept that there was such a big divide between them and the 'wives'.

... they do this for love, we do it to find love ... I don't see a big difference. M2

They want to be married with families and we want to be married with families ... we just are not fooled by the *Çuni* about who to marry ... E2

The 50 per cent contract women were mainly divorced women who had become aware of the possibility of using trafficking to leave Albania through the media and friends. These women then sought to use the traffickers to help them leave Albania.

I read in the newspapers that the *Çuna* were tricking women with marriages and fake jobs to make them prostitutes, and I thought why trick people I would be willing to go to Italy and be a prostitute if I could then do what I wanted after a year or so ... so that I decided to find a trafficker to take me to Italy ... VT

I read a leaflet about trafficking and thought ... yes why not as long as I can leave here ... SmV

The 'wife-whore' social hierarchy evolved during the period of my research and at the end of the research period it was only the group based in Lyon-North who still regularly used the wife-whore hierarchy; elsewhere in Lyon the pre-eminent social group amongst the researched women became those women who had detached themselves from their *Çuni* and were arranging marriages to local men. Prior to 2000, the married women had been in a clear majority, but as the recruitment of new wives in Albania became increasingly difficult because of the increasing awareness of how false marriage was being used to traffic women, the type of women being trafficked changed. As more people became aware that traffickers were seeking women, the divorced women began to seek out the traffickers as the means to migrate; consequently they grew in numbers until they could challenge what they considered the unjustified social status of the wives. The wives then became associated with ideas of repression and delusion, and they were often considered by the others to be deceived women unable to come to terms with the fact that their *Çuni* were using them and would eventually replace them with younger non-prostituted wives.

Those women (wives) are living in fantasy land. No man will really marry and have children with a whore; they will keep them here for as long as they can make money ... Name one

man who had children with his whore wife? ... not one has done that. A1 after her divorce in 2001

She is so deceived and she still believes the *Çuni*'s lies, even though we all know he has married a young virgin from his own town ... M3

The divorced women would even ridicule the wives for claiming a superior social status.

EK keeps saying she is better than us because she is married, but that is very stupid she is married to a *Çuni* who turns her out on the street to fuck strangers and she thinks she is better than us. Being a wife only means she is more stupid than even D2 ... V1

... there is nothing special about being made to whore for your husband ... anyway I had a fucking husband and that was nothing special...so if anything we are living more modern lives than the wives ... A3

Increasingly, those wives who had positive relationships with their *Çuni* and who were able to influence them were very careful to ensure that these men did not have other women working for them and were careful to also ensure the men were dependent on them for money. In this way some wives intended to maintain their 'marriages'; however, only four of the wives were able to effectively use such a strategy, most *Çuna* were not so compliant.

I know what is happening in Albania that is why I have brought my *Çuni* here and hidden him from everyone, L1 and R1 have done the same. When the boys are away they play ... to keep them you must make them dependent on you ... D1

D1 is clever she keeps her *Çuni* dependent on her and close by, so he is always good and kind with her, but that is not usual; most *Çuna* will go where they want when they want. I think D1's *Çuni* is a bit weak, but kind ... D2

Women who had left their *Çuni* became a very noticeable group in 2001, and they were the most vocal in disrupting the wife-whore hierarchy with their denunciations of the *Çuna*.

They are liars ... they say we are their wives and then they tell their friends that they are looking for virgins to marry and have children with ... M1

I told him that I would make money for myself, and I have told the other women what is happening in Albania so now everybody knows about the cars, the other women, and they are all going crazy ... how could we have been so stupid to believe their lies for so long ... F1

## 6.8 Clients and *Kollovars*

Within the contested debate concerning prostitution and sex work, the role of sex workers' clients are often considered to be defined by the supposed exploitation of vulnerable women by powerful men. These men supposedly demand unrestricted sexual access to women who as a result of some economic or other coercive force are required to supply sex to the predatory clients (Hughes 2002). It is often assumed that trafficked women cannot refuse clients and, as such, the clients are active partners of the traffickers in the subjugation of the trafficked women (Hughes & Roche 1999; Brown 2000; Hughes 2002). However, the researched women were contemptuous of their clients and referred to their clients as *Kollovar*. The use of *Kollovar* as a descriptive for the client of an Albanian sex worker is common to all the Albanian sex-worker groups that I had contact with, and it was reported by the woman as being in common usage in every location known to them.

...*Kollovari c'est la soldi* ['clients are money'] Z1

If I don't like the look of a *Kollovar*, I tell him to go away and if he does not go away I tell him to fuck off ... A1

A *Kollovar* has already been described as a man who instead of bringing his wife to his parents household, agrees in exchange for a promised inheritance to join the household of the wife's family (Young 2000). While this is often a pragmatic and mutually beneficial arrangement for a younger son who marries into a family who has no sons, it carries a perpetual stigma. A *Kollovar* is widely considered to be a lesser man who has delivered himself into the power of his wife. This understanding was the unanimous opinion of the Albanian women in sex work in Lyon.

The *Kollovar* is not quite a real man; he is caught by the woman for her family ... S1

I want to choose a *Kollovar* so I can have control over my money ... L2

Men who have to pay for sex are, therefore, identified with *Kollovar* and were considered weak and unable to sexually attract women. Like Albanian *Kollovar*, the clients have access to the women only at the discretion of the woman or her family. *Kollovar* might be nice and kind or ugly and stupid, but they supposedly lack an essential masculine quality that in turn requires them to assume a place where they are subjugated to the feminine.

The *Kollovars* do what we want not the other way around...if we don't want to do something we don't do it. V1

The *Çuna* do not consider *Kollovar* to be their equals as men and therefore a client could not be a threat to the primacy of a *Çuni*. Consequently sex with clients, who are *Kollovar* was not considered 'real sex'. The *Çuna* would often suggest to their 'wives' that because the women were only having sex with *Kollovar* it was not 'real sex' and therefore, it was not morally transgressive.

... men who have to pay for sex are not men they are *Kollovar*, they have no power, no force, they are wankers ... having sex with a *Kollovar* is not 'real sex'. I told my women that having sex with *Kollovar* doesn't count. I said if it was 'real sex' with real men I would be jealous and would go crazy ... but as they are not real men it doesn't count. The girls like that idea ... D-*Çuni*

If it was 'real sex' my *Çuni* wouldn't let me do it but it doesn't count if you do it with a *Kollovar*... BML

With a *Kollovar*...you have intercourse but without desire, ... is different when you have intercourse with the person you love, ... It is something you do without desire ... simply for the money ... It depends on the *Kollovar* ... he has come simply to have his sex, and give me the money and go ... because he is weak ... R2

According to the researched women 'real sex' requires the submission of the woman to the sexual demands of the man, and the ability of the man to compel the sexual excitement of the woman.



'Real sex' is when you are overcome by the passion and strength of the man who fucks your brains out ... a *Kollovar* can't do that ... EK

This was one reason why women who reported that they enjoyed sex with certain clients were considered to have committed a form of adultery: as such, a man was not really a *Kollovar* if he was able to provoke such a response. The women would often scandalise one another with reports that other women had been overheard in a hotel room enjoying sex with a *Kollovar*.

I heard S2 with a *Kollovar* in the next room and she wasn't faking it ... so maybe he was an Albanian, if her *Çuni* knew he would be so angry. L2

'Married' women would occasionally be unfaithful with clients and others with whom they would develop affectionate relationships. These relationships were considered unprofessional and adulterous by the other women:

1. if the woman involved did not receive payment for the sexual content of any such relationship
2. if she used the relationship for her own sexual pleasure
3. or the relationship developed a non-sexual aspect.

Adultery, when discovered would be punished by a period of social exclusion by the other women and by violent beatings by any 'husband'. However, as the research period developed, the Albanian women began to show increasing acceptance of women who had such extra-marital affairs, and 'non-wives' would often have clients or others that they considered to be boyfriends and with whom they would engage in a variety of social and non-sex work-related activities. Dating a client was seen as the primary way of acquiring a local husband.

If you find a nice *Kollovar* you can see him regularly and if you really like him you can marry him. I think most of us would like to marry a French *Kollovar*. They are very kind and respectful towards women ... M3

The researched women began to reconstruct their client group into a more subtle and nuanced series of categories and while clients were universally referred to as *Kollovar*, certain women would reclassify clients they liked as being manlier than an ordinary *Kollovar*. The nature of *Kollovar* was completely renegotiated during the research period as the divorced women were not willing to subscribe to the *Kollovar* myth

of inferiority as they were actively considering the clients as potential husbands and would regularly list the positive attributes of certain clients as well as acknowledging their sexual competence. Consequently, these men became re-categorised according to a new and more sophisticated set of criteria, particularly by the women who were seeking local husbands.

However, there were men who the women refused to accept as clients in any circumstances. Sub-Saharan African men were refused access to the researched women without exception and sex with sub-Saharan Africans was considered perverse. This prejudicial consideration was also universally accepted by the *Çuna* group, and as such the women were free to reject any solicitation from any sub-Saharan man.

Not even the Gypsies fuck Niggers ... I am sick even to think of having sex with a nigger ... D2

I just couldn't do it with a Nigger ... never ... S2

We don't expect the women to fuck the Niggers it is not natural ... B-*Çuni*

The women received very few solicitations from sub-Saharan men, as they were aware that the researched women would refuse them.

We are not welcome by them [the researched women] if anyone of us asks them for sex they shout at us to go away ... they are very bad with black people ... very racist ... Client from Cameroon

There were a large number of sub-Saharan African women selling sex around the Perrache area and it was considered that sub-Saharan men should purchase sex from these women.

The Niggers are dirty animals and no woman could ever have sex with a black ... better to have sex with a dog ... let them fuck their own women ... L1

The next group that was publicly rejected were North African men. All of the researched women said that they refused to sell sex to North African men. North African men were universally called 'Algerians' by the researched women. However, many women would sell sex to Algerians depending on the general appearance and demeanour of the particular Algerian and especially if the woman had not earned a particular sum of money during that day.

None of us ever do Algerians they are always stealing ... well ... I have done a few clean Algerians, nice ones with good clothes and manners ... BE

We don't do Algerians we only do good Algerians ... but D2 is having an affair with one and it will end in trouble ... V1

Once an Algerian had gained a reputation as a trustworthy client he could often solicit sexual services from a number of women. The usual rejection of Algerians was justified by the assertion that it was the North African client group who was considered the most likely to use violence against the women. It was reported by the women that Algerian men were often aggressive, were the most likely to insult the women, and the most likely to assault the women after the sex act. The Algerians were also reported as often trying to negotiate prices down. Young Algerian men would often harass women in the Lyon-South and Gerland working areas and the majority of street thefts reported by the women during the research period involved young men identified by the women as Algerians.

El was robbed by an Algerian with a knife, so was BE and so was I ... the Algerians are all thieves and they are violent ... V1

... the Algerians would throw stones at me from above ... D2

The Algerians were considered sexually repressed and potentially dangerous. The researched women stated that by letting Algerians have sexual access to 'white' Albanians the researched women were probably saving a number of young 'white' French women from rape and sexual assault.

... the Algerians are all obsessed with fucking white women ... they say we are much better than Algerian women ... if they couldn't fuck us I am sure they would be raping French women so that is a good reason why the French should be pleased we are here ... D2

I am sure that when we are not here they are raping French women; they are sex maniacs for white women ... E1

Eventually, women began to use a series of profiling strategies to reduce their exposure to men who they considered potentially dangerous clients. Algerian men who did not fit the negative stereotypes could be re-classified as 'Spanish' or 'Portuguese' if they presented themselves

well and did not subject the women to insults. A number of women had regular 'Spanish' or 'Portuguese' clients with whom they reported feeling safe and comfortable. Other strategies apart from racial profiling, included careful examination of any car being driven by a potential client; old ill-kept cars and cars with out-of-region number plates were carefully avoided by the women. Men who appeared ill-kempt or drunk were also avoided. The women would often work in groups and try to keep details of the vehicles that colleagues entered. Pedestrian men who solicited women for sex in the rooms of small local hotels were usually accepted, but men who wanted sex acts on the street or in nearby alleys were usually rejected. Most clients solicited the women from cars which were then driven to a nearby location. The preferred client was a young to middle-aged French man in a clean and presentable car with local number plates who wanted to purchase regular and/or oral sex. The preferred client group also included local French men who were physically handicapped or disabled.

I am a clinical dwarf, which is the result of a genetic difference, the Albanian women have been very accepting of me and I like them very much. Now they know me, we often go out socially together as friends without any payment. If I had not been able to buy time with them we would not have become friends. This has worked very well for me they are very nice to me. Client 1

I have had an operation because of my morbid obesity and it has prevented me from finding girl friends. R3 and S2 have never minded about it and have been very kind to me. I would be very happy to marry one of the Albanian women ... Client 2

There was also a group of older men who would pay various women to accompany them to bars and restaurants, but would not require any sexual service.

I have an older client who is too old for sex so he just takes me out for dinner and it is easy money ... TC

About the demand of men for an increasing number of sexually available women fuelling trafficking harm, in Lyon it was possible that it was the increase of supply that built the market and attracted men into purchasing sexual services. The Albanian women did not only operate in traditional sex-work areas, but developed new locations and times when sold sex was made available; in particular, they would sell sex during the day in the hi-tech industrial areas of Gerland. The client group in this newly developed area was substantially different from the

client group in the centre of Lyon that frequented the traditional sex-working locations in the Lyon North, Lyon South and Perrache area.

The men in Gerland especially during the day are much better than the men in the Second District (Lyon-South). They are more friendly. BE

In speaking with several clients who had only purchased sex from Albanian women in the new locations, they all mentioned that it was the regular visibility of the women in the new locations near to their place of work during the day that made them consider buying sex. Six of the eight men interviewed said that they had not purchased sex prior to meeting the researched women, and that they were attracted to their apparent normality and because the women did not look like prostitutes. One client, who had not purchased sex before meeting the researched women, said that he had never frequented nightclubs or other sex-work areas, and he had been intimidated by the idea of propositioning a woman for paid sex. He said it was the visibility of women near his workplace that encouraged him to seek engagement with them.

I had never paid for sex before, but the girls looked so attractive and friendly that I stopped once or twice just to chat and eventually I gathered the courage to ask one to come with me. If they had not been so friendly and available I would have never have done it. I am too scared to go to a red light district because you might be robbed or arrested. Client 3

All of these men said that the women treated their initial approaches with good humour and that they had made the initial encounters non-threatening. Some men had stopped their cars to talk to the women on a number of occasions before soliciting sex. Most of the men had said that they doubted that they would have bought sex if the women had not advertised their availability during the day and in a location that was not associated with prostitution.

However, clients in the centre of town who canvassed the traditional red-light areas often reported that they had regularly bought sex for a number of years from a number of sources.

I have been doing this for years every couple of weeks ... this is the traditional area and I come here looking for the available women ... sometimes I go to a massage parlour. Client 4

These regular users of sex workers considered the Albanian women younger and more attractive than the other available sex workers. They also said that the researched women were cheaper than women based in clubs.

They are younger and prettier than the old French women and they are real women not like the transsexuals so I much prefer to have them ... The price is better than in the clubs ... Client 5

Rather than being a single homogenous category, *Kollovars* became increasingly divided into certain groups or types. Divisions could be according to age, race and class or according to sexual predilection or performance. The diversity of the client group was a common matter of discussion among the women, especially when the women were discussing enticing certain clients to marry them.

They are not just *Kollovars*, when you can see them as men you realise that some of them would make very good husbands ... M3

## 6.9 The vice police

I met the vice police for formal interviews twice during the research period, once in 2000 and once in 2001 after a change of command. I also met with vice squad officers informally during the research period. The local vice squad was situated in an office at the back of the main post office in Lyon on the Place de Poncet, which was close to the traditional red-light areas of Lyon North and Lyon South. The squad was led by a police captain and the squad's officers were majority male. The local vice police were the other group of organised men with whom the women were required to negotiate.

The declared objective of the vice squad was to catch and prosecute men who exploited the earnings of sex-working women (*Le Figaro* 2000; *Lyon Capitale* 2000; *Lyon Mag* 2000; Marzloff 2000). According to the vice police, the only really effective means by which to secure such prosecution was to secure the cooperation of sex workers in giving testimony against their exploiters or for the sex-working women to arrange compromising situation in which their exploiter might be arrested. To this end, the strategy of the local vice squad was to acquire some aspect of control over a sex worker and through a mixture of threats and promises, secure their cooperation in achieving the arrest of an alleged exploiter.

The role of the vice police is to arrest exploiters and ensure there is enough evidence to prosecute them. When there are no more exploiters there will be no more trafficking so by making the women help us we are helping them ... Police captain vice squad 1999

We must have the means to secure the cooperation of the women and when they are *sans papiers*<sup>4</sup> they are in our hands ... by keeping them regular they are able to laugh at us<sup>5</sup> ... that we will not accept ... Officer vice squad

The only way to control the Albanian women is when we charge them with a crime or when we can threaten them with deportation. When we don't have these possibilities they will not cooperate unless they have their own agenda ... Officer 2 Vice Squad

If they do not cooperate with us it is because they are accomplices of the exploiters, they are not trafficked they are all here willingly, we know this because they have told us this and they have made it clear that they do not want to go back to Albania. Therefore if they do not cooperate we will deport them whenever we can ... Police captain 2001 Vice Squad

The vice police had succeeded in making some arrests of *Çuna* during 1998-1999 (Lyon Capitale 2000; Marzloff 2000; Shitty 2000), but on each occasion they had depended on the evidence or cooperation of a women of other nationalities to secure such arrests. The vice squad were unable, until 2000, to find an Albanian woman willing to cooperate with them in securing the prosecution of a *Çuni*. During 2000, two Albanian women agreed with the vice police to contrive the arrest and imprisonment of their *Çuni* as both men had become increasingly violent towards the women. These exceptional events involved considerable risk to the women involved and had mixed outcomes which will be fully discussed in the next chapter.

The officers identified a number of issues that they felt impeded their ability to arrest Albanian exploiters. An important obstacle was in their opinion the emotional relationships that the Albanian women had with the men associated with them.

They are in love with their exploiters, and so they have no interest to help us ... Officer vice squad

The vice police were engaged in an active contest with the *Çuna* for control over the researched women as they were dependent on women to acquire evidence to arrest and convict the *Çuna*.

Without information from the women it is almost impossible to catch the exploiters ... Officer vice squad

The Albanian women present us with major problems: they do not give us reliable information and whenever they know we are investigating their men, the men leave Lyon and do not come back for weeks ... Their mobility is the biggest problem as it stops us from keeping them under control ... Officer vice squad

The vice police were subjected to public accusations by local politicians and local media that they were not acting aggressively enough against the trafficking mafias responsible for the supposed sexual slavery of the researched women (*Le Progrès* 1999; Shittly 2000; Vital-Durand 2000; *Lyon Mag* 2001). Consequently, the vice police would stage raids upon the accommodation of the researched women when they would take along the TV media to film the rescue of the researched women. After one TV raid, the three women involved were quietly released several hours after their rescue and allowed to return to their accommodation. The vice police would also use anti-pimping legislation to harass the researched women by accusing the women of being exploiters of other women. These events offered the perverse scenario of one of the most harmed women being arrested and charged with being an exploiter as means of compelling her to cooperate with the vice police (Shittly 2000).

The vice police arrest all five of us and said that one of us had to be the controller of the group. We said that we just worked together for security and company ... but they insisted that a group was evidence of organised pimping ... so they detained EK. TC

The vice police were overwhelmingly described by the women as being coercive, manipulative and deceitful.

The *Flic*<sup>6</sup> are liars and will do anything to try and bully you into doing what they want, you must learn to feed them the lies they want to hear, and then they will leave you alone ... A1

They are all lying bastards ... never, never, never trust anything they tell you ... R3



The vice police were also feared and considered by the research women to be dangerous.

The vice police are the most violent, they will beat you and scream at you ... LI

... only the police can really hurt us ... everyone else we can fight back ... they will lie and arrest you and keep you in the prison ...  
EK

In pursuit of their objectives the vice police would detain women and subject them to long periods of detention in unheated cells and then subject the women to hours of threats and haranguing to try and secure information about the researched women and their *Çuna*:

You are a fucking liar and we are going to send you to prison for years if you don't start fucking cooperating right now you little bitch ... Police Captain 2001 Vice Squad

Lies ... lies ... lies start telling the truth right now or I will have you strip searched and thrown back into the cell naked ... you little bitch ... Police Captain 2001 Vice Squad

Tell me everything or you will rot in prison for years ... I will keep you here until you tell me everything I want to know ... you fucking piece of shit ... Police Captain 2001 Vice Squad

## 6.10 Conclusions

The researched women were confronted by three groups of men in Lyon who were directly connected to their trafficking episode. These were the *Çuna*, the *Kollovars* and the vice police. The *Çuna* transported the women to Lyon and sought to profit from the women for the longest possible time; the *Kollovars* or clients were a mixed group of men who purchased sex from the women and so ensured that trafficking was profitable, while the vice police sought to use the women to entrap and prosecute the *Çuna* for this exploitation. Therefore, each group interacted with the researched women in pursuit of their various agendas. However, the researched women also had their own agendas regarding their engagement with these groups. Wives valued their relationships with their *Çuni* and considered the clients a means by which to fund their future family life with their *Çuni*, while the vice police, by seeking to imprison their *Çuni*, were a risk to that goal. The 'divorced'

women considered the *Çuni* the means by which to escape Albania and to reach the clients, who they then surveyed as possible husbands with the intention that they might start new family lives with these men; the vice police were a distraction, if not an obstacle to that goal.

During the research period,<sup>7</sup> the *Çuna* had to adapt their trafficking networks to accommodate changes in the typology of the women they were able to recruit. The nexus between the different trafficked women once they met in Lyon then created a crisis in the social hierarchy that had previously sustained the trafficking networks. This crisis became the engine for an evolving praxis that increasingly disrupted the trafficking network as women abandoned the previously established trafficking system based on 'marriage' to a *Çuni* and sought to fulfil their desire for a successful family life by marrying a French client. Even women who sought to stay in 'marriages' to the *Çuni* found their privileged social status ridiculed by newly arriving women who were not 'married' to the *Çuna*. This nexus disrupted the panoptical surveillance that has been described in chapter 5 of this study and that was so successful in controlling the wives. Consequently, the trafficking networks were thrown into increasing crisis. The *Çuna* no longer received such reliable intelligence about the activities of the researched women, because the 'divorced' women had no commitment to maintaining a network that privileged the status of the wives. This evolving process of disruption and its consequences will become increasingly apparent in the next chapter.

The social norm regarding Albanian patrilocal marriage, where women are transferred to the ownership of their husbands had created a scenario where married women who were inducted into sex work could be manipulated and controlled. Fear of the social exclusion associated with divorce and the co-dependency that was fostered by the *Çuna* had conditioned their wives to consider their sex work as type of reproductive labour, intended to support the family unit. The *Çuna* had created a normative process where wives could 'legitimately' be required to engage in prostitution in the same way they could be expected to undertake any number of other laborious household tasks such as gathering wood or tending animals, which are also intended to support the household. The researched women initially operated within a social hierarchy that exalted the wife of a *Çuni* over the 'non-wife' 'whore' among the researched women. When these wives had been more numerous, they were able to subjugate the 'non-wives' to this hierarchy through their surveillance and policing of their activities.

However, the hierarchy was challenged during the research period, and this contest was the direct result of 'divorced' women arriving in Lyon seeking to use trafficking to find French husbands. As I have previously stated, the anti-trafficking awareness campaigns did not reduce

the flow of trafficked women, but resulted a shift away from deceived wives to more explicit commercial arrangements between 'divorced' women and the *Çuna*. The 'divorced' women were well informed about the earlier recruitment of women through contrived 'marriage', and they openly challenged the claims of the wives regarding their claim to superior social status. As an increasing number of 'divorced' women arrived in Lyon on contracts seeking to find new husbands, they refused to accept the 'whore' label, and they were quick to reproach the wives with taunts regarding their gullibility and subjugation to their husbands.

As it became increasingly difficult to recruit new wives and with 'divorced' women actively seeking to use trafficking, an increasing number of 'divorced' women arrived in Lyon. These women were determined to overcome the stigma of divorce by marrying *Kollovars*. This challenged the previous norms by which the wives had engaged in sex work. The 'divorced' women reconstructed the *Kollovars* and made them desirable men and the means by which to achieve a successful family life, rather than them being some type of *übermensch*. The 'divorced' women consistently described the *Çuna* as liars and cheats and repeatedly announced their intentions to leave sex work at the earliest opportunity. Such challenges to the previous order were shocking to the wives and it became increasingly difficult for the wives to maintain their sense of legitimacy. This change in the typology of the recruited women changed how the trafficking networks were able to control the trafficked women but it also directly subverted the system that had relied on the co-dependence of deceived wives. The disaffection with the *Çuni* husbands grew, and women began to 'divorce' their husbands as part of rejecting the limits imposed on them as wives. A new hierarchy developed, which placed women who had been able to withdraw from sex work and regularise their documents by marriage with Frenchmen as pre-eminent among the researched women. This further disrupted the panoptical surveillance as the wives began to challenge their patri-local subjugation, as many of them no longer ascribed legitimacy to the relationships that had constrained them.

Those who continued with the wife status found themselves being increasingly considered to be foolish and exploited, by the other researched women. This shifting hierarchy and its use among the women is an interesting indicator of the changing agendas of Albanian women who entered sex work in Lyon during the research period. As the nature of the various trafficking networks became more understood by Albanian women, new women began to reject 'marriage' to a *Çuni* as a migration strategy and began to negotiate contracts as the means to access and use the trafficking networks.

In Lyon, clients moved from being dehumanised *Kollovars* who were the means by which the *Çuna* could enrich themselves, to becoming the means by which the women intended to successfully remove themselves from trafficking. This was the direct result of the 'divorced' women arriving who left Albania to seek new husbands. Consequently, the researched women increasingly surveyed their client group for possible partners, and some women who had been 'married' to the *Çuna* began to consider adopting the strategy of the 'divorced' women as a means to find happiness.

The vice police remained focussed on the prosecution of exploitative men; they used threats and violence to coerce the women to comply with their agenda. This agenda prevented them from properly understanding how trafficking was being organised, because they were unwilling to move from the law enforcement mandate that required them to arrest criminals. The women perceived them as being very similar to the *Çuna*. The vice police contested directly with the *Çuna* for control over the women while using similar methods to secure the women's compliance with their demands.

These various processes and contests enabled the researched women to develop and test their various strategies to escape trafficking and some women became increasingly determined to break their dependency on the trafficking networks. In the next chapter the study examines how the processes described so far began to result in women successfully leaving trafficking and how their new knowledge and skills, when shared with other women, developed a cumulative causation effect (Massey 1993). Cumulative causation synthesises migration theories with theories about how migration momentum grows faster than chain migration would predict, because migrant social capital becomes increasingly effective in shaping new and better outcomes. In this instance, the social capital of women able to leave trafficking was shared with other trafficked women increasingly quickly, allowing the other women to add this possibility to their migration trajectory as well. This rapid pace of change resulted in a series of women suddenly concluding their trafficking episode. Previously such events had been very unusual and many women had been trapped in trafficking without an exit strategy or other possibility that had a fit with their migration objective. The cumulative causation effect enabled an increasing number of women to suddenly start a process that would enable many of them to leave trafficking, this was particularly exciting as it came after a period of many years when such departures had been uncommon.

## 7 Overcoming or accommodating trafficking

This chapter documents how the increasing mobility for the researched women between Albania and a variety of places of destination led to the strengthening of their social networks and consequentially, changes to their experiences of trafficking. The chapter also considers case studies of the different methods developed by the researched women to enable them to acquire increasing mastery over their lives. These case studies will present the different outcomes these methods had for the researched women who tried to use them. I then analyse how the researched women overcame or accommodated trafficking and will identify certain factors as indicators for resilience or vulnerability. I then analyse these different experiences and the impact of social networks and mobility in directing these outcomes. I conclude by considering the strengths and weakness of the various subversion strategies used by the researched women and identifying which have been the most effective in resolving the women's trafficking episodes.

### 7.1 Reconnecting to their social networks

Prior to 1998, most of the researched women had left Albania and had not returned. Women had visited Italy to take part in various regularisation programmes, some of which were specifically aimed at foreign sex workers (Crane 2001; Waugh 2006). Some women went to the police in Italy, where they denounced non-existent exploiters and agreed to leave sex work in exchange for a humanitarian permit to remain in Italy. These women then returned to France to work, knowing that they could always take up residency in Italy if they had to leave France. These women also reconnected to their social networks to help them maximise the benefits of this development.

I went to the Italian police and received a permit to stay in Italy as a trafficked woman. I then made contact with my cousin, I hadn't spoken to her for a long time, now my cousin is looking for papers to show I have an ordinary job, and then I can leave

here and live with real papers in Italy ... so once I have some money I am thinking about running away ... BE

Other women had moved around the Schengen area and some had asylum claims in Belgium as well as France and Italy; only two or three women had returned to visit Albania. Women who had papers that showed they were actively in the asylum process in an EC country could travel throughout the Schengen area because, if they were stopped, they would only be sent back to that country and not Albania. The *Çuna* often told the women that it was not possible to visit Albania because the Albanian police would arrest them and imprison them<sup>1</sup> or stop them from leaving Albania again as an anti-trafficking measure.

We tell the women that if they go back to Albania that they will be put in the shelter homes and their names will be put in the newspapers as whores ... or that they will be arrested for prostitution and put in the prison...we want them here working not nosing around in Albania asking questions ... D-*Çuni*

Being unable to return to Albania to visit their family and friends was a great concern to many women. Even though they were often concerned about the possible stigma or problems regarding their possible detention in a shelter home, over 50 of the researched women said they wanted to be able to visit Albania for a holiday.

LI and DI and RI have been back to Albania, but my *Çuni* did not let me go; it makes me vary sad because I have not seen my family for four years but now I will visit Albania for about a month ... EK

I am very happy that I have seen my family, but A-*Çuni* is such a bastard. You had to see his house, you had to see his car and everything, it was all my money in there ... now I'm going to do something, I'm just going to say to him: I'm going to work for myself and, and he has to build me a house just like his and all that and ... because this is unbearable ... EK after returning from Albania

... I want to go back to Albania and next week I will go to visit my family ... I will come back after a few weeks ... BE

During 1998-1999, women increasingly started to return to Albania for holidays and family visits, as they had discovered from BE that they could leave Italy without documents by taking the ferry from Bari or

Brindisi, and that it was possible to avoid being detained in a shelter home. Women would take the train or bus to Southern Italy and then the ferry to Vlore, where, as previously described, they would bribe the police not to arrest them for prostitution or refer them to the anti-trafficking NGO. Several of the researched women had said that they had not previously returned to Albania because they feared they might be detained by local authorities in a prison or a shelter home and prevented from leaving Albania, as described by L<sub>2</sub> in chapter 4. The *Çuna* also had their own reasons to keep the wives away from Albania as many did not want the wives among the researched women to discover what had happened to their remittances.

If they go back to Albania and see that the houses and businesses are not there it will only cause trouble, it is better that they don't go ... C-*Çuni*

The fact that some *Çuna* allowed their wives to make return visits to Albania created considerable tension among the other *Çuna* and their wives. It became increasingly apparent that *Çuna* who were using the remittances as agreed and who were emotionally engaged with their wife were quite comfortable with the wife occasionally visiting Albania; however, *Çuna* who were misappropriating such funds and were engaged in adulterous relationships were deliberately trying to prevent their wives from visiting Albania.

They only told us not to return to Albania because they did not want us to see what they had been spending our money on ... F<sub>1</sub>

My *Çuni* didn't mind if I visited my parents because he had nothing to hide from me, he is a *Çuni-i-mire*<sup>2</sup> ... L<sub>1</sub>

Eventually women began to return to Albania and then return to Lyon and these repeat migrations had substantial impact on the whole community of the researched women as the credible news brought from Albania about the activities of the *Çuna* by these women radically changed many women's attitudes to their *Çuni*.

I believe F<sub>1</sub> ... everything she has said about the *Çuna* is true ... I am sure there are no houses ... all the money has been wasted on other women and cars ... M<sub>3</sub>

Some 'non-wife' 50 per cent contract women also started to make such trips, but the women on contracts were also subject to demands that they should not return to Albania. This was because during such holi-

days the *Çuni* would receive no income from the woman concerned. To avoid such reductions in income the *Çuni* would usually demand that any woman taking a holiday would have to agree to still send them the expected income, as if they had been working. Consequently, negotiating time away from their forced labour could be as difficult for 50 per cent contract women as it was for the wives.

The narratives about Albanian trafficked women do not mention the voluntary returns and repeat migrations of the trafficked women, as it is often presumed that only deported or rescued women were returning to Albania (IOM 1996; Renton 2001; RCP 2003; Kane 2005). Re-trafficked women are sometimes identified and are often assumed to be the exceptionally tragic victims of organised crime (IOM & ICMC 2002). However, increasing numbers of the researched women were beginning to make holiday trips home to visit their families and especially their female relatives. At the end of the research period, eleven women had recently returned to Albania and back to France and others were agitating to arrange similar trips.

It doesn't matter what the *Çuni* says I will go home. I want to see my family and find out what has been happening to the money ... BE

When my sister gave birth to a baby ... I went to Albania after seven and a half years for thesecond time. Thefirst time was after two years. I am 24 years old now. I have been ten years on the street. D2

I have arranged to leave next week. My sister will meet me at Vlore to make sure I am not detained ... J2

## 7.2 Increasing mobility, strengthening social networks

In 2000, TC was the first woman from among the researched women to travel back to Albania and specifically look for documentation that would allow her to travel more easily. The researched women had heard from friends in Italy and Albania that it was becoming increasingly possible to acquire high quality fake passports from agents in Tirana (Khan 1999). The researched women also heard from the same sources that it was also possible to acquire original passports of various states with the photograph and other details changed. Tirana has increasingly become a centre for the distribution of high quality forged documents (Harvey 2005). In Tirana, TC acquired a new Albanian passport in someone else's name, but with her photograph and with a



valid Schengen visa. TC then flew back to France via Hungary with that documentation. Once in France she reassumed her Kosovan refugee identity and only used the passport when crossing international borders. Other Albanian women have used similar documents to return to Albania for holidays and then to return to a country of destination (BBC 2003).

I got this Albanian passport through a friend for \$ 2,000 ... it has my photo and a Schengen visa so now I am free. I can go where I want, when I want ... I have not told my *Çuni*... he would be crazy if he knew I had this ... TC

Once women were able to acquire passports with Schengen visas or other passports that allowed visa free travel their mobility increased (Wood 2006), and they started to travel more often. It was these women who then developed new migration routes using these documents. For the researched women the new routes involved using the acquired documents to fly into the Schengen area and then to use trains and buses to return to Lyon. The women who had such documentation presented their ability to fly rather than use the boats from Vlore as a prestigious status symbol.

I don't use the boats anymore I just fly wherever I want ... being able to move like this is very important and to be able to get these documents costs big money especially for the real Italian passports ... having the Italian passport with your own photo is like having Gucci shoes or Chanel sunglasses ... every woman needs an Italian passport it means freedom from the *Çuni* and choice about where you can live and work ... I could go to heaven without a visa with this passport [laughter]. B1

These passports were greatly prized and if possible the researched women would hide them from their *Çuni*, as the *Çuni* would often demand to hold onto such documents to prevent the women from using them without their knowledge. Controlling the mobility of the women was an important priority for the *Çuna*.

The problem when the women start moving about without us is that they meet all sorts of people outside our life, and then if you are not careful they just disappear ... It is very important that all of their friends and contacts are inside our own circle then we can find them wherever they go ... D-*Çuni*

The developing migration and mobility capabilities were varied, and most researched women used them to build or reconnect to social networks.

I have visited friends in Italy and my relatives in Germany, none of them knows what I am doing. It was so nice to have a normal life for a few days, now I have somewhere to go once I leave here. What I need is money and papers ... I told the *Çuni* I was ill and then that I was with a client in Nice ... A1

Even without alternative documents many women were accomplished travellers and could move extensively around the Schengen area easily, but this mobility was not matched by a capacity to sustain any migration to another place.

I know how to get to any part of Italy with no problem; I never go to Switzerland because it has too many controls ... France and Belgium is no problem and I know how to get to Holland and Spain. I never go to Greece – it is a dead end ... but I always have to come back because there is no way to remain anywhere else except by sitting in the hand of the *Çuni*... but when it is possible to go and stay I will go and never come back ... A1

As the women's own social networks strengthened they recognised that they could be the means by which they could leave trafficking.

Next year my sister will have her papers and then she has said she will help me get mine, and then I will leave here ... I2

I keep contact with all of my good clients and if I can get them to support me I can leave Lyon ... S1

### 7.3 The 'whore' is at the door

One immediate consequence of this new mobility and repeat migrations was an increasingly number of reports regarding the activities of the *Çuna* in Albania. Women would give returning women presents to take to their own families and also ask them to bring news of home. One woman went unannounced to visit the house that was being built by her *Çuni* after being told by her mother and sisters that the man had another wife.

I went to the house that my *Çuni* had built with the money I had sent ... the door opened and there was a new wife carrying a baby ... she called out that, 'Your whore is at the door'; my *Çuni* came to the door and started shouting and screaming at me and chased me away ... that was when I decided to come back and work for myself ... fuck him ... if he tries anything with me I will have him put in the grave ... he is fucked ... I can pay for him to be killed no problem ... F1

F1 then visited a number of houses and businesses being funded by women in Lyon and was able to report that in many cases the houses were not built and that the *Çuna* were spending the money on gambling, cars and other women. On hearing these reports, two other women M3 and EK then returned to Albania and discovered similar circumstances for themselves and other women. It was then widely reported that A-*Çuni*, the biggest *Çuna* leader, had destroyed an expensive Mercedes car in Tirana and had been boasting that he would have a new car in a month from the proceeds of his prostitution network that included at least five wives.

Now what we would say in secret is said in public, A-*Çuni* has at least five women and is spending all the money on gambling and cars ... He has the restaurant and some kiosks in Tirana but everything is in his name ... He calls EK a whore to his friends ... All the *Çuni* call us whores ... F1

#### 7.4 Leaving trafficking: divorcing the *Çuni*

Among the researched women who were married to a *Çuni*, there was the possibility to leave trafficking by divorcing the *Çuni* according to a certain ritual. This ritual was widely known among the researched women and involved very specific practices, but it was a protocol that had been invented by the *Çuna* and the trafficked women.

To divorce your *Çuni* you must go back to Albania and meet with him there. Then you must give him any passport or document that he might have prepared for you. You must renounce any claim on any money or property and you must agree to never work for another *Çuni*... then you are free to go. M3

You must go back to Albania, give up any claim on the money, you must never work for another *Çuni*, you must not go back and work in working place that the *Çuni* found for you, then

you are divorced. The idea is to make sure that the woman takes no advantage from the divorce and must start again from Albania without money ... V<sub>1</sub>

However, the researched women were divided about the efficacy of this system.

If I tried to divorce my *Çuni* he would kill me ... bullet in the head ... dead ... not a word ... S<sub>3</sub>

I could never do that, my *Çuni* would never agree to it ... S<sub>2</sub>

Two of the researched women followed this protocol to divorce their *Çuni* and leave trafficking; the first was F<sub>1</sub>, who was the woman who had returned to Albania and uncovered the widespread *Çuni* deceit. The second was M<sub>3</sub> who after discovering through F<sub>1</sub> and her family that her *Çuni* had married another woman decided to try a form a relationship with a married client. F<sub>1</sub> met her *Çuni* after the 'whore at the door' incident and said that she would no longer work for him. Unable to acquire a visa she agreed to return to France on a short-term 50 per cent contract with another *Çuni* in breach of the 'divorce' rules.

I don't give a fuck about the rules anymore I just want to get back to France, I have my own working place and after a few months I will be working just for myself ... F<sub>1</sub>

After a few months, F<sub>1</sub> stopped sending money to the 50 per cent contract *Çuni* and was working in the Perrache area for herself.

It is just fine, I don't have to work so much, and I am sending my money to my family so in a couple of years I will have more than enough to go home ... and maybe I will find a husband here ... anyway I am now free to do what I want ... F<sub>1</sub>

M<sub>3</sub> returned to Albania in 2001 and with the support of her family 'divorced' her *Çuni*.

He thought I would be too scared to tell my family because my family is of such good reputation in the town, but my parents love and care about me and I can trust them to help me so when this *Çuni* lost my love he had no way to hold on to me. M<sub>3</sub>

With an invitation from a French client, M<sub>3</sub> tried to acquire a visa to return to France, but she was refused the visa. Unable to marry the already married client, she was at a loss how to return to France. She did not want to return to sex work but at the end of the research period she was still in Albania and considering using a 50 per cent contract to get back to France.

It has been a real disaster, I gave her an invitation, but the French Embassy refused to give her a visa. I would be very happy to give her a job in my factory. But they said it wasn't allowed. I can't afford to divorce my wife to marry M<sub>3</sub>. M<sub>3</sub> Client

I do not want to return to France and be in the hand of the client, I want to be free to find someone who can marry me ... I think I will try and find a passport with a visa at a good price or I might agree to go with a contract ... I am undecided, but I do not want to remain in Albania ... M<sub>3</sub>

After several weeks of being unable to find a means to return to France M<sub>3</sub> concluded:

The only way I can get back to France is to find a new *Çuni* but I am not ready to start all of that over again, but I will not stay in Albania ... M<sub>3</sub>

The divorce ritual was known to all of the researched women and the wives often discussed it as a means by which married women could end an association with their *Çuni*. The consensus was that the possible success of this option was dependent on various factors such as the nature of the *Çuni*, whether he had other women and so other income and if he lacked the capacity or inclination to compel the woman to continue in trafficking.

Some *Çuna* would never let you 'divorce' them, but they might be willing to 'divorce' you especially if they are flush with money and other women ... D<sub>1</sub>

If they have other women then often the other women want them to 'divorce' you because they know he is fucking you, so it can be done if you choose the time carefully ... TC

The *Çuni* also considered 'divorce' to be a useful device that could help manage the risks associated with trafficking women.

Once she loses the 'married' mentality it is all over ... other *Çuna* will beat them and force them to carry on, but that is a mistake ... It is too much effort to control such a woman and eventually she will look for revenge and that usually means trouble with the police ... better that you let her go in Albania then everyone will know that she is a cheap whore and when she goes back to whoring then you can say: 'look she is whoring after the divorce ... that is why I divorced her because she is by nature a whore ...' this keeps you safe from the police ... Then find another wife and start again ... B-*Çuni*

### 7.5 Leaving trafficking: absconding

Occasionally, women would leave their *Çuni* suddenly and without warning. Some women entered trafficking with the intention of absconding at the earliest opportunity.

I will leave as soon as I can ... you see my broken tooth that was done by the *Çuni* when I asked how long I would have to work ... I hate the bastard and as soon as I find a client who will take me, I will disappear ... R2

R2 has gone to Paris with a client and not come back, she was only here a month her *Çuni* is mad ... but what can he do ... nothing. If he goes after her son she has said she will make a complaint against him here and in Albania so he is fucked ... TC

As previously mentioned in chapter 5 of this study, the biggest problem with absconding for the women was sustaining the experience and avoiding communities through which the *Çuni* might be able to relocate them. Of the 58 researched women, four of the women managed to successfully abscond, eight more women attempted to abscond and then voluntarily returned to their *Çuni*. The eight returns were consequential to the women's social networks being unable to sustain their absconding.

I came back because I had nowhere else to go after leaving the client ... BE

I stayed with my cousin but there was no money and no work so I had to come back here. Next time I will plan more carefully ... A1

Two of the successful absconders had made previous attempts before eventually being successful.

In 1999 I had no-one I could stay with so I had to come back, but now (2001) my brothers have papers in Austria and my sister has married in Italy so I will send money to my sister and when I am ready I will run to her ... E4

Before I had nowhere to go, but now my client is divorced and has invited me to live with him ... E2

## 7.6 Leaving trafficking: local marriage

For the 'divorced' women on 50 per cent contracts, it was their specific intention to leave trafficking by marrying a local man and regularising their residency in France through such marriage. The 50 per cent contract would often be agreed for a period of one or two years or until a particular sum of money had been paid over but many contracts would run until the women could arrange such a marriage and the *Çuni* expected that such an arrangement could take many months, if not years to arrange. The contract extension was necessary because usually the women could not sustain their migration without the income from the sex work. This was because as asylum seekers they did not receive any welfare payments after a few months, and so they needed the sex-work income to support themselves. They then usually needed their *Çuni's* protection to continue in sex work without being harassed by other *Çuna*.

The agreement is that they can leave when they marry a local man and leave prostitution ... but it is not so easy ... many *Kollovars* offer marriage but they are already married and not divorced or they want the woman as free pussy and don't want to marry her for children. Also it is not easy to make a marriage without proper papers ... so I know they will be working for a long time ... C-*Çuni*

The women were also aware that the marriages they sought were not easy to arrange.

The client will offer to set you up in an apartment with a small allowance, but they will not marry you so you can get the papers, so that is no good ... A1

I wanted to make the marriage but I can't marry him in my asylum name I want to use my real name, but I don't have any papers in my real name. This is a real problem how to make the marriage ... E2

The first woman to successfully arrange her marriage to a local man in Lyon was Z1. Z1 was an illiterate Roma woman who left Albania after serving a prison sentence for killing a man. After leaving prison, she was also divorced from an arranged marriage. Once Z1 had decided to leave Albania, she started to frequent bars where traffickers were known to meet. Within a short time she was solicited by a friend of A-Çuni.

I knew this was the Çuni for me, he was a big bastard and everyone was frightened of him, even A-Çuni. So I agreed to work for him for as long as it took me to find a husband in the West. He agreed because he said I was so ugly no one would ever marry me so I could work forever. Z1

He sent me to Italy on the boats and after I was working in Italy for a few months he came to Italy with A-Çuni and took me to Lyon. EK and I arrived within a few days of one another, but it was a few days before we all met up. I have been here ever since ... Z1

I would send him money a lot of money, but I always had my own plans. Z1

Z1 eventually moved in with a French client who was younger than her and had a regular job as a carpenter.

He is a Çuni-i-mire, he works hard and I keep him well fed and the apartment spotless, so with the sex, he thinks he has arrived in heaven. Z1

Z1 was the first of the researched women to negotiate the complicated process of regaining her true identity and the necessary papers so she could marry her client in her real name. Z1 was in France claiming to be a Kosovan schoolteacher using an asylum story and documents supplied to her by a Kosovan translator in Lyon. This was particularly problematic as she was illiterate and had no idea what her asylum application had said.



The problem was how do I become ZI again? So I came up with a plan. ZI

ZI's plan involved having her sister send her a new passport in her real name. With her passport she registered herself at another prefecture in a different town as an asylum seeker in her original name. With the new *permis de séjour* and passport she arranged the marriage to her client. ZI's next step was to visit the vice police and declare herself to be a victim of trafficking and to denounce an imaginary trafficker. As part of this process, she had herself declared a witness and received a police statement about her true identity.

ZI then called her *Çuni* and announced she had married and stopped working. After a few attempts by the *Çuni* to have her restart work using threats, ZI threatened to reveal his real identity to the vice police and as such he would have an arrest warrant issued in his real name. After this, he left ZI alone, and she continued to live with her French husband. ZI then began the process to have her son brought to France as part of a family re-unification programme. She was then eventually able to bring her child to live with them in France. ZI's self-resolution to her trafficking experience was considered by her to be a perfect outcome, and she considered herself to have used trafficking to have achieved a significant and worthwhile goal.

This prostitution is not easy but it has given me a good life at the end of the day ... I did this and I made this happen ... the *Çuni* used me, but I also used him and at the end of the day I am the one laughing ... I never had any trust in the *Çuni* and I knew that I must always take the initiative, remember I had a very difficult life but it taught me that you must be strong, suffer the pain and never give in ... also the *Çuna* talk big about how strong and violent they are ... but as they all know I am the one who went to prison for killing a fucking *Çuni* so they know I am no one's donkey ... I am not scared of pain, prison or to die and that is my secret, that is why I always knew I was free ... ZI

Once she had completed the process of securing her permanent residency in France, she explained to the cultural advocate exactly how she arranged everything. As such, the cultural advocate was then able to arrange a number of focus groups where the necessary procedures were discussed with other interested women. In consequence, four more women started to copy the procedure almost immediately, and the process quickly became well known among the researched women. Several more women asked their families to arrange new passports in their real names so as to be able to access the process if opportunity pre-

sented itself. The ability to quickly spread knowledge of this process and its ability to allow women to affect their migration and trafficking episode appeared to create a very sudden and rapid cumulative causation effect (Massey 1993). This cumulative causation meant women, whose migration had stalled because they were unable to arrange their departure from trafficking, were suddenly benefiting from the increased information exchange between the women; this exchange was allowing new processes to be appropriated into their own migration trajectories. Therefore a process that had taken Z1 some years to develop and use in resolving her own trafficking episode, was being adopted and successfully used by women who had only been in trafficking a few months or even only weeks.

The next two women to use this process were equally successful in arranging marriages to local men and so closing their trafficking episode.

I did everything as Z1 and I will be married in a few weeks ...I have already left the streets and I am living with him as his wife ... E2

I am living with my new husband I don't work anymore ... I only come down here to see my friends and have a coffee ... it has all worked out very well ... A1

By the end of the research period, more than fifteen women were actively pursuing this method of leaving trafficking.

## 7.7 Leaving trafficking: law enforcement

During the research period, two of the researched women sought to escape trafficking by cooperating with the local vice police to arrange the arrest of their *Çuni*. The vice police would regularly offer the researched women the possibility to escape from their *Çuni* by helping the police arrange compromising situations so the *Çuni* could be arrested and convicted without the women needing to give evidence against the *Çuni*. This required that enough evidence be gathered that the *Çuni* could be convicted, even if the woman involved protested the *Çuni*'s innocence.

The vice police told me that if I cooperated they would put my *Çuni* in prison and I would then be free ... but it didn't happen as they said ... the *Çuni* is in prison but I am not free ... S3  
The police told me to make sure that he was calling me on a

regular basis and that I had a lot of money in the room that I should give to him and then to make sure he stayed the night ... When I arranged this I called them with the details ... I also told them that he had a gun in the room ... They promised that he would go to prison for ten years ... BML

S3 had also arranged with the vice police that her *Çuni* would be in her room with a large sum of money and with his second woman present so he could be accused of a more serious crime of exploiting more than one woman.

They arrived and arrested the *Çuni*... There was 100,000 francs and a gun in the room and I was there with R3 so he was charged with organised crime. He is now in the prison and they are talking about him getting ten years ... Both of us said that he was a client and not a pimp so the *Çuni* would not think that I had given him up, but the police had his telephone record to show that he had been calling us many times a day and they had the money and the gun so they did not need any testimony from us ... S3

However, the escape project failed as the arrested *Çuni* simply arranged for a cousin to take over his role and the cousin would only visit the women unannounced or deal with them by telephone making it impossible for him to be set-up for arrest. The *Çuni* had S3 and R3 pay for his legal defence. Over the following months after the arrest of the *Çuni*, S3 and R3 paid the *Çuni*'s lawyer almost € 20,000 to arrange his defence and to try to get the *Çuni* bail. To finally escape her *Çuni*, the vice police arranged S3's deportation to Albania. However, S3 could not reintegrate into Albanian society, and she had no wish to remain in Albania, so she returned to Lyon and restarted work for the cousin of her original *Çuni*.

Life in Albania was impossible, so I agreed to come back to Lyon for the *Çuni*, but he is still in prison so my life is more bearable. I am not sure what will happen to me ... S3

S3 described the experience a partial success as the *Çuni*'s detention reduced her fears of physical violence, and she felt that she would be able to escape from the cousin when she could decide on another plan.

I am better off than before because the cousin is not so violent like the *Çuni* in prison and so I am sure I can find another way to escape ... S3

BML was not so happy with the outcome of her cooperation with the vice police.

After two weeks they released my *Çuni* without charge because he agreed to give them some information about other *Çuni*. Also they didn't find his second phone so they couldn't prove he was controlling two women. He told them that he loved me and wanted to take me out of the prostitution ... So he found me and beat me up and then he wouldn't let me work so I couldn't get any money ... While he was arrested I was able to send 50,000 francs to my sister because I was working long hours everyday for myself ... I told her that it was money I had collected over a long time ... BML

Cooperating with the police got me nothing, I wouldn't do it again ... BML

Other researched women considered cooperation with the vice police as a means to escape trafficking to be too dangerous.

Oh ... like the *Çuni* don't know how the vice police work ... My *Çuni* told me that if he is every arrested in France he will know it was arranged by me and his brother will kill me ... E1

The vice police always need the same thing; they need to catch the *Çuni* with his telephone and the money in a room with two women. So the *Çuni* now always change their phone numbers, use different phones to call different women, never collect the cash and will never be in the same room with two women. Last time I tried to give my *Çuni* cash in my room he smashed me in the face with a lamp and told me he would kill me if I ever tried to set him up ... BE

## 7.8 Leaving trafficking: assistance agencies

There were two agencies in Lyon that were mandated to assist sex workers to exit prostitution; one was a government agency the SPRSS<sup>3</sup> and the other was an NGO called the Amicale du Nid. The SPRSS office said they had no contact with any of the researched women and even if they did they could not offer any services to anyone who was undocumented or in the asylum process as such people were not entitled to be inserted into French society.

We cannot help anyone who does not have the right to live permanently in France. Our work is to reinsert people into French Society so if a person does not have the right to stay in France we cannot help them ... SPRSS Director Lyon

The other agency was Amicale du Nid which was an abolitionist NGO that was also funded to promote the rehabilitation of sex workers. It had two French outreach workers who would distribute condoms to street-based sex workers. The outreach workers with this agency were relatively well known among some of the more established researched women.

Amicale ... they are very nice people ... they give us condoms ...  
TC

Amicale du Nid had a policy of seeking the exit of women from sex work and would often link the provision of services, such as the emergency accommodation to demands for participation in rehabilitation programmes and the cessation of any beneficiary's involvement in sex work. The agency had no programme for the researched women that did not expect their eventual repatriation to Albania.

We cannot supply help to someone who wants to stay in prostitution, helping someone to continue in their prostitution would be immoral ...we are here to help people to leave prostitution. We cannot help people who want to remain illegally in France that would be illegal so we are here to help the Albanian women to go home. The solution to trafficking is to arrest the exploiters and for the women to go back to their families in Albania. I am very sure that they want to go home and be free of this exploitation ... Director Amicale du Nid Lyon

The only woman who received any substantial assistance from either of these agencies was I2 who after a heart operation and extensively lobbying by the cultural advocate was allowed to use the Amicale du Nid emergency accommodation, which was a run-down, unfurnished two-room apartment.

It was very dirty but I had nowhere else to go so I stayed there ...once I was well enough I started to work again once or twice a week and so they told me I must leave the apartment ... so I left as soon as I could, even though I was still very weak ... They asked me if they could help me to go back to Albania ... I told them to go and fuck themselves ... I2

I2 had not returned to Albania since leaving in 1998 and explained that she did not want to return to Albania, because of the stigma and other problems she had experienced relating to her divorce.

There is nothing for me in Albania, all I want now is \$ 50,000 and my children and I will do what I need to the get these things. I2

I2 had been abandoned by her *Çuni* because of her ill health and because of a dispute over his relationship with another woman. The other woman wanted the *Çuni* to abandon I2 and as I2 was unable to work regularly, the *Çuni* agreed that she could work independently. Therefore I2 was working for herself and hoping to find a local husband. Through the sustained intervention and support of Cabiria the cultural advocate helped I2 receive appropriate medical treatment and to make an application to remain in France on humanitarian grounds because of her serious medical condition. Once I2 received the permission to permanently stay in France, she stopped seeking to marry a French man and began to focus on earning money with the intention of finding a way to bring her children to Italy and then to France.

If it had not been for ... Cabiria and \*\*\*\*\* (Cultural Advocate) I would never have got the medical treatment and I would have never got the permission to stay ... no one else did anything that really helped me ... I2

It is very important to acknowledge that the life-saving medical treatment I2 received was only possible because of Cabiria's constant interventions on her behalf with the various authorities ... without Cabiria's intervention I am quite sure this woman would have been left to die ... Cultural Advocate

When the cultural advocate left Lyon she was replaced in her cultural mediation role at the Cabiria NGO by E1 who was then able to break with her *Çuni* and leave trafficking; her employment by the NGO meant she acquired the right to live and work in France.

## 7.9 Managing trafficking

Some women did not intend to escape suddenly from trafficking nor did they intend to separate from their *Çuna*, but they developed various strategies by which they managed the trafficking experience. They con-

sidered that they could manage trafficking and keep it within limits they considered tolerable.

I know what most of the *Çuna* are; I am not stupid; I am 25 and I have had a few boyfriends. My *Çuni* and I are a real team and we get on very well together. I keep him close and we both control the money. In a couple more years we will have the money we need for a new life and we will start something in Albania or Italy ... He doesn't make me do this. We really are lovers ... BLE

I have watched all the other women get shafted, but I chose my *Çuni* so carefully and he depends on me. I am the best thing that has ever happened to him. I work where I want, when I want. I stay away from the other women so no one knows where I live with my *Çuni*... I started this when I was older and now I am 24 ... I am not struck by love ... I am in control and this is good according to my plan ... D1

Women who considered that they still had a viable and meaningful relationship with their *Çuni* continued to work towards the objective of acquiring the money for a home and a business. As the abuses of many of the *Çuni* became increasingly known to the researched women, a group of about four women had their *Çuni* join them in Lyon, and they began to avoid contact with the other women.

We have our *Çuni* here ... and they are '*Çuni-i-mire*' but we must keep them safe from the other women who might give them up to the police ... We are all older than the other women and we chose our *Çuni* so that we have always had more control. The women taken as girls did all of this for love ... We are older and wiser ... R1

Another example of how women managed the trafficking experience was L2. L2 was 27 and had arrived in early 1999 with her *Çuni*. Their relationship was a much more congenial arrangement than most of the *Çuna* relationships in Lyon. L2's *Çuni* was substantially older than her as he was in his fifties; they had claimed asylum as being Kosovans and as members of the same family. L2 had grown up in a town and belonged to a poor family, and she had several siblings. She was close to her mother and had discussed her going to Italy for sex work with her mother. She had met her *Çuni* in Albania, and he had asked L2 to come and do sex work in Italy with the agreement that she could send half her money to her family. L2 accepted this invitation because she wanted to travel with a man that she felt she could manage.

He is quite small and fat, and older than me, so if he gives me problems I can beat him very hard. When he is drunk he is very easy to beat. Also I like him and it's nice to have someone to be with away from work ... Life was getting difficult for new women in Italy so we came to France ... L2

She told her mother about her specific plans, and they opened a bank account for L2 in Albania. She was the first woman to arrive in Lyon with such a pre-arranged bank account and with a relative fully informed about her intentions. Therefore, she was able to send large sums of money home to her mother without having to offer any explanation for where this money had come from. L2 was considered to be rather unattractive and simple by the other women, but she was also considered friendly and helpful. The other women openly acknowledged that by having opened a bank account and telling her mother about what she was doing, she was in a much better position than them, because she could send money home to her own family without having to explain where the money had come from.

We all think L2 is stupid but she has more money in her own bank than anyone else ... E1

After arriving in Lyon, L2's *Çuni* had been threatened with arrest by the vice police, so he had fled to Marseilles, and L2 would occasionally visit him there. I interviewed L2's *Çuni* before he left Lyon, and it was apparent that he did not have the capacity to physically force L2 to work for him, as she had beaten him a couple of times for getting drunk.

I help L2 and she helps me ... we are simple people ... we both need money ... that is all. I can't make her do anything; we make plans together ... L2's *Çuni*

L2 insisted that she enjoyed her *Çuni's* company and was happy to give him money as he had brought her to France and because she needed to be able to tell the other women she had a *Çuni* and so avoid harassment from other *Çuni*.

He is nice company and, as everyone knows, I have a *Çuni* – I am not bothered by the other *Çuna*... L2

L2 was determined to go back to Albania and use her savings to build a house and a shop, buy a Mercedes and marry a *Kollovar*.



I can't drive but if I have a house, shop and a Mercedes I should be able to find a husband, then I will be the wife and have some children. I don't mind a *Kollovar* and we can be very happy in Albania. I couldn't live anywhere else. L2

Any woman who wants to have control over her life should do this, and put the money in the bank and then choose a man. Don't let the man do this to you because he will take everything. It is better to have a good *Kollovar* than a bad *Çuni*. L2

Other women were reduced to managing trafficking by complying with all of the demands of the *Çuni*, as non-compliance was considered unthinkable because of the possible repercussions.

I just do everything he says ... I am too scared to do anything else ... BE

It is just easier to do what he says ... I don't have the strength to resist him and if I did he would just beat me senseless. There is no point to fight him because there is nothing else I can do ... A2

### 7.10 Failing to leave

While the researched women developed a continuum of possible solutions to trafficking, there were many women whose attempts to leave or manage trafficking failed. Some of these women were compelled to remain in fear and exploitation. As mentioned before, women who had previously attempted to abscond had returned to the control of the *Çuna*, because they had been unable to sustain the alternative to trafficking. However, these women found that their strengthening social networks were enabling them to abscond more easily.

Now I have friends and family who can let me stay for many months and my sister says she can arrange a marriage with a friend of her Italian husband ... she knows what I am doing so I can send her money ... as soon as I have been able to send her 100,000 francs, I am going to disappear ... L3

The improving social networks of the researched women were having a direct impact on the ability of the women to leave trafficking. However, three women who attempted to leave their *Çuni* failed as a result of threats of violence from their *Çuni*, who managed to track them down.

Women who absconded would change their mobile telephone numbers to prevent their *Çuni* calling them with threats, and each of these failures was caused by a particular strategy utilised by the *Çuni* to contact and then control the researched woman.

As described in previous chapters of this study the *Çuna* had created self-policing and supervisory surveillance networks by which the researched women would reveal details about the other women in the group to their own *Çuni* who could then pass this information around the *Çuna* group. The *Çuna* would regularly interrogate the women by telephone to ascertain who had been working and how many clients they had been seeing. By such interrogations the *Çuna* were able to locate absconding women who kept contact with friends that were still located within the supervisory network. In each of the three failed instances, the absconding women had kept contact with other women who had then been instructed to visit them and to pass them a telephone so the *Çuni* could speak to their absconding women.

B<sub>1</sub> gave me her phone and A-*Çuni* told me that his friend was watching my younger brother playing football in the street in Tirana and if I did not return to work he would have my brother killed. Then his friend called and put my younger brother on the phone. I was so scared that I agreed to return to work immediately ... EK

E<sub>1</sub> visited and gave me her telephone ... then my *Çuni* said if I did not return to work he would kidnap and rape my sister ... so I agreed to return to work ... S<sub>2</sub>

E<sub>4</sub> gave me her phone and my *Çuni* told me he still loved me and that I must come back to him or he would tell my family that I had left him to become a whore. I think that maybe he still loves me so I said I would go back to work ... BML

EK's case demonstrates the transition from being a deceived wife into being a coerced woman. EK was the wife of A-*Çuni*, and she had heard stories from women who had visited Albania about A-*Çuni*'s spendthrift manner and his womanising with other Albanian women. Furthermore, money that was supposed to have been given to her family had not been passed on. All the property acquired by A-*Çuni* was in his name, and he had not registered the 'marriage' with EK as he had promised to do. EK began to have doubts regarding A-*Çuni*, and she entered a period of crisis.

Part of me still loves A-Çuni, but inside I know I must leave him ... I keep crying I don't know what to do ... EK

The wives' relationships demonstrated how familial relationships can be contrived for the purpose of commercialising and exploiting relationships. A similar process was described by Wilson (1991) among Mexican sweatshop workers when work supervisors adopted the role of 'mothers' so as to be able to control and manipulate younger women according to familial conventions. However, several wives' began to reconsider their relationships with their exploiters, and within their own groups the women began to refer to these men as exploiters, declaring that they wanted to be free of their exploiters.

We are not wives we are slaves and they are the slave masters ... A1

I want to escape from this hell, it was all lies and the Çuna are all exploiters and liars ... EK

There was considerable discussion amongst the women regarding how to disengage from the Çuna. By 2001, all the wives, except the four who claimed to be managing their Çuni, considered that by being placed in prostitution their 'husband' had broken the social contract between them. As such, the woman could legitimately leave the man.

We have the right to leave them because they made us whores ... F1

The prostitution was a betrayal of marriage and we should have the right to leave the Çuna... S2

EK intended to try to break her link with A-Çuni by pretending that there was no work and that there was no money available to be sent to Albania, in the hope he would abandon her. However, this strategy failed when another woman reported to A-Çuni that other women were still earning good money in Lyon. EK then absconded and hid in an apartment in Lyon for three days and refused to answer her own telephone. A-Çuni now changed from his previous role of 'husband' to overt exploiter. He began to make serious threats against EK's family should she continue to try and defy him. EK confused and unsure of what else she could do returned to sex work. EK had fully evolved from exploited co-dependent wife to exploited coerced woman.

He kept threatening to have my younger brother killed and so I agreed to return to work ... EK

The ability of A-Çuni to regain contact with EK and the other Çuna to regain contact with absconded woman so they might issue threats was crucial in compelling absconding women to return to work. The researched women were, therefore, aware that if they intended to abscond they must break all contact not just with the Çuni, but also any women who were still participating in the panoptical surveillance regime.

I always worked away from the other girls so they couldn't spy on me, I would just say that if I worked with the others I could earn no money because they were younger and prettier than me. I also made friends with my regular clients until I found one I wanted and who wanted me. Z1

... if you go you must dump your phone and have no contact with anyone ... the Çuna have a web like a spider and if at any point you touch the web they feel you and will catch you ... if they can't reach you to threaten you they have no power over you ... TC

It was also possible for women to fail to leave trafficking when using a usually successful method for other reasons than Çuni interference. After hearing about Z1 successful marriage to a younger man, D2 absconded with a younger Algerian client<sup>4</sup> for two weeks. D2 agreed to marry the young man who was only eighteen, but after two weeks she ended the relationship and returned to Lyon to resume work for her Çuni. D2 friends considered her attempt ill-conceived and destined to fail as the young man involved was unemployed and his family was opposed to the relationship.

D2 is such an idiot; he had no job no apartment and no means to support them. He was expecting her to return to work to support them ... what was the sense of that? If the *Kollovar* doesn't have an apartment or a job it is pointless being involved with them. V1

D2 is a fuck-brain she doesn't plan properly so that is why she fucked it all up ... We all told her he was a useless idiot but she wouldn't listen ... She is going to be working like this forever, because she is too stupid to do anything else ... M2

### 7.11 The value of trafficking

All of the researched women considered their trafficking to be an important opportunity if it could be used to achieve their primary life objectives regarding finding a good husband and establishing a happy family life. However, many women and especially 'non-wives' considered these opportunities were being hampered by the demands of their *Çuni* and that to enjoy any personal benefit from the migration they would need to separate themselves from the *Çuni*.

The *Çuna* make a contract and then they spend all their time trying to cheat and change the contract and if you do not give into them they get nasty with threats ... The only way I can resolve this is to run away with a Frenchman, but that was my plan anyway ... B2

Fifty-two of the researched women considered their migration to have been something that demonstrated their own resilience and strength. They expressed pride in the large sums of money that they had earned, and the wives considered that they deserved respect and gratitude for the sacrifices they had made.

I am worth more than any man I know and the money I earn shows that I can do something in this world ... M3

Our family will have been built on what I have done here so of course he should be grateful to me ... I have made great sacrifices for our life ... L1

However, 49 of the researched women said that the sex work was too high a price to pay for the migration opportunity and that it should have been possible to migrate without having to do sex work. The women generally said they would not recommend trafficking as a migration strategy unless the woman was very mentally strong and had no other possibility. Unanimously, the women said that they would not want any of their female relatives to be trafficked although some had cousins and sisters who were.

The problem is that this work can destroy you because if you don't find a husband you can never go home because if you do everyone treats you like a whore. I wouldn't want my cousins to have to do this; no one should have to do this work. We should be allowed to come and work in ordinary jobs and find the husbands we need without this hard life on the streets ... M4

I wouldn't want my younger sisters to have to do this, but my older sister is in Italy already. If you are very strong and know what you want you can make a good life, but you must work for yourself and keep the money safe. S1

## 7.12 Conclusions

The most compelling conclusion of this chapter must be that the researched women developed solutions to trafficking that had no resonance with the supposed solutions to trafficking harm represented by the 3Ps responses outlined in chapter 3 of this study. The diversity of the researched women experiences required each woman to make careful judgements about her individual trafficking episode. It is of interest that their most successful self-solutions are unreported by and therefore are apparently unknown to the various agencies seeking to combat trafficking. An understanding of the successful and unsuccessful outcomes achieved by the researched women could suggest interventions into a trafficking crisis that might better subvert trafficking harms, while also promoting the women's successful self-solutions. If the women's experiences were placed into the analytical trafficking matrix, the matrix could be used to suggest opportunities to pre-emptively reduce the need of the women to resort to traffickers. These pre-emptive interventions could then reduce the need for reactive interventions. Such pre-emptive strategies would probably have significant opportunity cost benefits.

The increasing mobility of the trafficked women and the concurrent strengthening of their social networks as friends and relatives, increased their own security and resources and enabled the women to network outside the trafficking networks. New social networks incorporating clients and other people outside of trafficking also created options for the researched women to strategise about leaving the control of the trafficking networks. The development of social networks that can overcome the many obstacles to the successful migration of Albanian women offered a means to replace the trafficking networks that were dominating the researched women. The 'divorced' women would particularly benefit from interventions that would resolve the stigma that creates their sense of intolerability in Albania. However, while the need for foreign marriage continues, increased mobility rights linked to supportive social networks would let divorced Albanian women meet potential 'husbands' without resorting to trafficking.

It was women who eventually travelled back to Albania and who returned to Lyon who were able to credibly inform the researched women about what was happening to their remittances and how their

'husbands' were behaving in Albania. These reports precipitated an increasing crisis among the wives and consequently an increasing number of wives sought to leave trafficking. While media reports and awareness-raising campaigns about trafficking were well known to the women, the 'whore at the door' incident shows that information from trusted sources is considered more credible and is more likely to be acted on. This has implications for interventions intended to inform trafficked women about the deception methods of traffickers.

The complex relationships between the *Çuna* and the researched women became vulnerable to the increased mobility of some researched women, who were able to successfully challenge the validity of the supposed social contracts between the *Çuna* and their wives. The ability of some women to return to Albania and then return back to France was a very important development in the researched women's self-awareness and judgement regarding their own situation. The reconnections to old social networks, particularly to their female relatives, and information about other women's solutions to exploitation began to inform the researched women's plans and expectations regarding their own circumstances. However, it is interesting to note that the compulsory requirement to have contact with anti-trafficking NGOs upon the women's return to Albania, if they were identified as a trafficked woman was used by the *Çuna* to discourage trafficked women from seeking to return to Albania. Furthermore, the *Çuna* also used the fear of possible arrest and imprisonment for prostitution in Albania also as a deterrent to returns.<sup>5</sup>

The existence of the 'divorce' ritual seems to have a fit with the other pseudo-traditions that were exploited to induct 'wives' into sex work. The 'divorce' ritual required the women to expose themselves to penury and stigma. That two women were able to successfully use the ritual to 'divorce' their *Çuni* was interesting; both women used the ritual to legitimise their new agenda of seeking a foreign husband.

Many women absconded, but only one of these women returned to Albania; all of the other absconders tried to find the ways and means to remain in the EC. Most absconders were unsuccessful in 1999, but by 2001 most absconders were successful. The successful absconders had social networks that allowed them to sustain their migration in a place they wanted to be. Furthermore, these successful absconders also placed themselves beyond any possible contact with their *Çuni*. If a *Çuni* was unable to deliver a threat, he was powerless to coerce a woman to comply with his demands.

The most successful outcome for the researched women was marriage to a local man. The women received no assistance in pursuing this solution to their trafficking episode, and it was only by information sharing among the researched women that this strategy was refined

and made readily accessible. This solution demonstrated the resilience of the trafficked women and the importance of properly supporting their solutions to trafficking harm. The increasing effectiveness of the information exchange between the women appeared to create a cumulative causation effect by which processes could be appropriated by the women very rapidly, and then quickly implemented by them to affect their migration trajectories and outcomes. This would suggest that cumulative causation processes could be deliberately harnessed to effectively subvert trafficking. Particularly, interventions that enable trafficked women to meet and share information could be useful means by which to subvert trafficking. Such interventions could be as simple as accessing social events attended by trafficked women or accessing their social networks and passing information to them by word of mouth.

The ability of the law enforcement agencies to release women from trafficking harm was very limited; this was particularly so as the *Çuna* are able to continue to control trafficked women from prison by relying on friends or relatives to take their place. Assistance Agencies were mostly ineffective in resolving the trafficking harm experienced by the trafficked women. They were either institutionally unable or unwilling to help the researched women in the ways that the researched women wanted to overcome trafficking harm. The occasional incidents that did result in some help for the researched women did suggest that trafficked women who could get permission to live and work in France would be able to leave trafficking. However, none of the agencies were able to replicate this solution for the benefit of other trafficked women. The inadequacy of the short-term statutory welfare support for asylum seekers meant that women were required to remain in sex work to support themselves during their time in Lyon. It is possible that if adequate welfare payments had been more available that some women might have been able to more effectively abscond. If they had received welfare payments for more than a few months the women could have more easily left the sex-work milieu and avoided the *Çuna* surveillance, as they would not have been dependent on the sex-work income to pay for basic necessities.

The presumption that to solve a trafficking problem a woman must leave the trafficking environment is challenged by those women who managed their trafficking episode and successfully negotiated what they considered acceptable terms and conditions with their *Çuni*. It might be argued that these women have negated the forced labour aspect of their trafficking episode. These women say that they have resolved trafficking by renegotiating terms and conditions that no longer require them to engage in forced labour. This would have a good fit with a labour market understanding of trafficking, but it would not be



considered a solution by those who conflate sex work with trafficking, even if the trafficked woman insists that she has resolved any forced labour aspect of her situation.

What is possibly even more informative about overcoming trafficking are the stories of women who have failed to leave trafficking. The transition from deceived wife to 'coerced' woman must be particularly bitter for the women who, having suffered years of subjugation to a deceitful *Çuni*, are then terrorised by such men once the deceit is exposed. Some women failed to leave trafficking because there was a lack of support for their solutions; other women were constrained by co-dependency or fear. These women, if supported in achieving their desired solutions, could have left trafficking more quickly and easily. If those women, who were willing and able to leave trafficking, were helped to do so in the ways they wanted help it is probable that the trafficking networks in Lyon would have become unsustainable.

The Albanian trafficking networks would have become increasingly difficult to sustain at a number of levels:

1. The reduced number of Albanian sex workers would lose control of many profitable sex-working areas to other competitors. If the city became dominated by women from another nationality, the Albanians could be compelled to leave the city by the organisers of the other women.
2. Fewer women would make the surveillance network less efficient, or the women will have to be relocated in fewer working areas which again would make the Albanian networks vulnerable to other actors.
3. The profits from the reduced number of women still working would have been unable to justify the costs of the *Çuna* physical enforcement activities.
4. Most importantly, as more women left trafficking, the easier it would become for them to support other women seeking to leave trafficking and other women would then become increasingly aware of how to leave trafficking, creating through this cumulative causation a virtuous circle of subversion.

That the women did not receive such support suggests a lack of commitment on the part of large institutional actors to helping women avoid or overcome trafficking, which is supposedly a major priority of such institutions.

The final chapter of this work presents considerations of how different migration theories can be refined to better explain the findings of my research as well as my final conclusions.



## 8 Conclusions: explaining trafficking

In this chapter I review how this study has used the study of the researched women to consider their experiences of trafficking as part of a crisis in a migration order. That study and subsequent analysis now allows for the drawing of conclusions regarding implications for theory, policy and practice. Through my research I have tried to better explain the various manifestations and evolution of Albanian trafficking. This was to enable me to challenge existing presumptions and develop new conceptualisations. To achieve this I had to develop a research methodology that allowed me to acquire rich and accurate data from trafficked women. The difficulty of effectively researching trafficked women was widely considered to be a problem that was constraining the development of better understandings of trafficking (Kelly 2005; Laczko 2005).

This study has identified a number of problems related to how trafficking has been understood, and it has challenged common explanations for Albanian trafficking. The work has also questioned whether 'demand' is the focal problem of trafficking. It has also considered the common interventions intended to suppress or mitigate trafficking and has explained how the majority of Albanian women usually transit trafficking without the aid of any of these interventions. The book then subjugates demand, criminal power, economics, class and ethnic origin as the main vectors for Albanian trafficking to ideas of actor-orientated use of trafficking for personal development. It argued that after the recruitment of patrilocal wives became difficult, they were increasingly replaced by significant numbers of Albanian women who deliberately resorted to trafficking, as a consequence of social exclusion and constraints on their mobility. These discoveries should have a considerable impact on how trafficking is understood and theorised, because the explanations presented for the socially excluded women's involvement in trafficking requires a new conceptualisation of trafficking.

By adopting Van Hear's (1998) migration order model that allowed the creation of an analytical matrix, offering various theoretical explanations for different migration events, the study was not required to subscribe to or propose a grand theory of trafficking intended to be a complete and exclusive explanation of trafficking. Consequently, it was

possible to identify different groups of people in trafficking who were being trafficked in different ways and for different reasons. By using different theories to explain the different experiences of the wives and the 'divorced' women, the work was able to discover previously unknown migration motivations and practices regarding trafficking. These discoveries better explain who was trafficked, why they were trafficked, how they were controlled and how some of them were able to leave trafficking. In particular, this analytical method allowed the study to highlight the need to refine how the new economics of migration work when a non-altruistic actor captures the decision-making and control processes. The analysis also revealed the importance of weak social networks in motivating socially excluded women to use trafficking to migrate, then to strengthen their social networks and then eventually to use the strengthened networks to leave trafficking and re-engage with their original networks; this process was not previously understood or documented.

The study has made extensive use of the women's own words regarding a multitude of topics. It could be argued that the study has quoted these women in an excessive and often uncritical way and that their comments are not substantial evidence of their claims. It is possible that the text could have been more readable if so many quotes had not been included. However, the research confronted the issue of the validity of the women's accounts by being an extended period during which the women's stories were constantly tested and challenged. The substantial trust established with the researched women was intended to ensure that their accounts represented their authentic, if subjective, experiences and opinions. In recent years, the voices of women experiencing trafficking have been almost totally absent from the trafficking discourse. Therefore, for any work to be considered overloaded with such voices would probably be unique and such an abundance of voices not necessarily a negative attribute.

## 8.1 What needs to be refined

This final chapter offers refinements to migration and trafficking theory regarding:

1. The need to re-conceptualise the focal problems of trafficking because of mistaken presumptions and flawed analysis.
2. Who is trafficked and why.
3. How traffickers control trafficking.
4. What can and what cannot be explained using migration theory.

5. The need to examine the consequences of non-altruistic actors dominating decision making in new economic migrations.
6. The importance of social networks in explaining trafficking.
7. How exploitative social networks can be disrupted through better information exchange, resulting from cumulative causation processes.
8. The continuing importance of weak social networks in directing chain migration.
9. The deliberate use of trafficking networks as a 'bridge' for chain migration.
10. The role of policy in sustaining or mitigating crises in transitional migration orders.

Although Albanian trafficking began with the large-scale deception of young women into contrived marriages, these women were to be increasingly replaced by slightly older women who were deliberately using trafficking to leave Albania. It is clear that these discoveries challenge the previously dominant explanations for Albanian trafficked that depended on rural or Roma women being the deceived, kidnapped or otherwise coerced victims of violent criminals. The misconceptions of who was trafficking and how they were trafficked have been sustained by inadequate research and flawed analysis as described in chapter 4 of this study. This final chapter reviews the flawed presumptions regarding trafficked women exposed by this study, and considers the implications for improving how Albanian trafficking can now be theorised.

The work describes that after an initial period of trafficking recruitment in Albania, which mainly relied on the deception of young women into exploitative marriages, this recruitment strategy changed dramatically as increasing numbers of divorced women became aware of trafficking. Unlike the previously solicited wives, these women deliberately engaged with traffickers as a mobility strategy. The 'divorced' women wanted to leave Albania because of the stigma associated with their divorce, which they considered made their lives in Albania intolerable. The study identifies the importance of this change in the trafficking networks and its subsequent consequences for the networks. By examining the role of the women in trafficking networks rather than assigning greater importance to the roles of traffickers or other actors, it has been possible to explain previously misunderstood processes about how women leave trafficking as the result of deliberate actor-orientated actions by the women. In this chapter, I consider the implication of such changes in conceptualising how to subvert trafficking networks.

The study also discovered that the most effective control regime used by the *Çuna* was a panoptical system that depended on the complicity

of the women involved. This demonstrated the sophistication of the traffickers and was contrary to a presumption that the *Çuna* depended primarily on overt threats and violence. This was achieved by the *Çuna* acquiring the right to make household decisions for their wives as the head of the patrilocal household. This has considerable implications for considering how the new economics of migration must be extended to specifically consider the role of exploitative actors. In this chapter, I consider how this theory could be refined to better understand some forms of trafficking.

In documenting how the experiences of the researched women involved various trafficking harms in varying degrees, the work has also hypothesised that many of these experiences are harms directly related to their mobility rights and inadequate social networks, while other harms were coincidental and unrelated to the migration. The study proposes that understanding trafficking as a crisis in a transitional migration order makes it possible to suggest better interventions that might more successfully reduce some of the harms experienced by trafficked women. Understanding trafficking as a crisis in a transitional migration order also makes it possible to see the various places in the order where trafficking has not been addressed. Such an approach reveals a number of significant gaps in the response to trafficking. Perhaps the most plausible explanation for this is that conflating harms or experiences that are not specifically related or especially connected to one another has created conceptual confusion and has often reduced explanations of trafficking to inaccurate stereotypes. Using Van Hear's (1998) model in the form of an analytical trafficking matrix enables the researcher to more easily understand what elements of trafficking can be placed in the matrix and so can be understood as migration related, and what trafficking harms cannot be explained by migration theory. In this chapter, I will identify aspects of trafficking harm that cannot be addressed through any use of migration theory and how such harm is required to be conceptualised as non-migration elements of trafficking.

The importance of strengthening supportive social networks in overcoming trafficking has been an important finding of this research. The development of alternative social networks to the exploitative social networks of the traffickers was the most successful means by which the researched women overcame trafficking harm. Therefore, the accounts presented in chapters 5 to 7 of this study offers rich and complex material that suggest modifications to the social network level of Van Hear's (1998) model regarding understanding crisis in a transitional migration order. This chapter reviews the evolution of Albanian trafficking and considers its implications for understanding and theorising the re-

relationship between social networks and trafficking, using the trafficking matrix.

The work argues that not only were institutions such as law enforcement agencies and civil society groups unable to impact on Albanian trafficking significantly, but that the institutions that most effectively sustain trafficking networks are in fact states, through their migration policies. The study then argues that criminals are not so much the creators of the environment for trafficking, but rather the opportunistic beneficiaries of the exploitable spaces created by policy. Therefore, this chapter also considers the relationship between policy and trafficking, and how migration theory might be extended to more clearly capture the impact of policy on trafficking.

In the closing sections, limitations and weaknesses in the work are identified and considerations are made regarding possible directions for future research that might build on this work. I conclude the chapter with an indictment of those actors who I believe can be held most responsible for the trafficking harm experienced by the researched women.

## 8.2 Dynamics of Albanian trafficking

Before leaving Albania, some women had experienced sexual violence and rape; others had experienced stigma and social exclusion, but overwhelmingly most of the researched women had articulated these harms throughout chapters 5 and 6 of this study as being the expression of a general misogynistic malaise that allowed women to be treated prejudicially by Albanian men. The researched women considered Albania to be a society where men could easily abuse women with almost total impunity. Women who were removed from the traditional institutions of marriage and/or home, which were the primary sites of gendered violence, were then socially excluded to the point that they could subjectively feel their lives in Albania had become intolerable.

These misogynist practices seem to underpin the dynamics of Albanian trafficking in the following ways:

1. The societal construct of marriage, and a woman's responsibilities within it, played a key role in facilitating trafficking in a number of ways, most notably through: stigmatisation of divorced women acting as a push factor to leave Albania; promoting dependency and submission of the trafficked wives on their 'husbands' once at the point of destination; and shaping the way in which the trafficked women conceptualised a successful migration outcome (i.e. marriage to a foreigner).

2. Women who were induced to marry traffickers would then allow them to make household decisions on their behalf because of the patrilocal nature of Albanian marriage.
3. Women would accept an exaggerated period of misogynist abuse in trafficking in the belief that they could acquire significant capital that would allow them to return to Albania and mitigate future misogyny through such conventions as *Kollovar* marriage.
4. Women who considered Albania such an unbearable place, were willing to accept misogynist abuse from traffickers in the belief that such abuse was a matter of degree, compared with the abuse to be expected in Albania and that the new geography would present opportunities not available in Albania.

These motivations were compounded by other considerations, but in not understanding the complex nuances associated with these processes, most interventions could not mitigate migration intent. Consequently, women continued to resort to trafficking networks for mobility in spite of increasing awareness of trafficking risks.

### 8.3 New economic migrants: understanding trafficked wives

I have described in chapters 5 through 7 of this study how Albanian trafficking is divided into two main periods and typologies that overlapped. The first was a period of several years from 1991 when young women, who were using marriage as a migration strategy, were deceived into patrilocal marriages for the purpose of placing them into sex work in the EC. These young women were often fleeing repressive family environments where they expected to be coerced into arranged marriages, and so many readily agreed to elope with men who they believed offered them a genuine love match and a life away from misogynist Albania. While women entered into such marriages with an expectation of leaving Albania, the patrilocal nature of Albanian marriage meant the decision to migrate was the decision of the 'husband' as the head of the household. His decision was considered to be a household strategy intended to benefit the new household, but subsequently the trafficked 'wives' were being subjugated into a system that was a malevolent exploitation of the household mechanisms described by 'new economics of migration' (Stark 1984).

These women were deceived and often manipulated or coerced into accepting sex work as a part of their new responsibilities as a wife in the patrilocal family. Central to the sustainability of this deception was the concept that the sex work had become a legitimate female occupation under certain conditions, and that the women were therefore not



common prostitutes but valued contributors to their patrilocal family. Proof of their non-prostitute identity was that they did not engage in sex work for personal gain but to fulfil their responsibilities to support the patrilocal family, which was a traditional and legitimate obligation of a wife. This support of the patrilocal family was then physically demonstrated by the regular remittance of a wife's earnings, apart from local expenses, to her 'husband'.

While the wives were in the majority among the trafficked women, they supported and sustained the legitimacy of their actions and considered themselves socially superior to other women. Unmarried women, who the wives considered to be illegitimately engaged in sex work, were described as 'whores' and treated with contempt. Once a wife was involved in sex work, she became increasingly dependent on the patrilocal justification myth to maintain her social legitimacy; any departure from her role as wife would condemn her to becoming a stigmatised 'whore'. The presence of such 'whores', who were subjected to taunts and stigma from the wives, was a constant reminder of the possible consequences of losing 'wife' status. These 'wives' were entirely dependent for their social legitimacy on their continued recognition as wives by their '*Çuni*'. Many of these women became co-dependent on their 'husbands' who were then able to also exploit their fear of social exclusion to control them.

### 8.3.1 *Controlling 'wives'*

As the women were firstly loyal to their 'husbands' the trafficked wives lacked solidarity and would report to their 'husbands' on the activities and plans of other women. This was the essential condition that allowed the panoptical control regime to be so effective among the wives. The 'husbands' would often share information and work together to ensure the subjugation of the women to a common agenda and the efficiency of the surveillance. This complicity of the women in their own surveillance and control has not previously been understood and offers a new explanation for why traffickers often do not need to be physically present to control trafficked women. Previously, it was thought that these women were all controlled through the use of violence or threats of violence; this study has challenged that assumption. The self-supporting and self-regulating trafficking networks that ran with the active cooperation of the wives were resistant to almost any law enforcement intervention, as the women had no interest in informing on men to whom they were so emotionally attached. This highly efficient control regime was only significantly disrupted by the eventual appearance of other Albanian women who did not subscribe to the patrilocal prostitution legitimacy myth and whose increasing numbers meant that they

could resist the attempts of the wives to stigmatise and control them. These 'non-wives' did not have any emotional attachment to the *Çuna*, so they did not so readily report transgressions to the *Çuna*, and this detachment further undermined the effectiveness of the surveillance regime.

The ability of an exploitative and abusive actor to acquire the right to make household migration decisions is a significant vulnerability among families that participate in new economic migration. The role of non-altruistic actors in household migration decision making is an area where further research could refine our understanding of these risks in new economic migration. This research details how some exploitative actors deliberately acquire and then exploit household decision-making rights and processes to the detriment of other members of the household. When the importance of emotional co-dependency became apparent in ensuring the compliance of women with the demands of their *Çuni*, it was possible to consider the phenomena as an important factor in determining the strength of a *Çuni*'s social network; but, there is no migration theory that could suggest a practical solution to co-dependency.

Women who are in co-dependent relationships with abusive men are in a partner abuse situation. This relationship is probably impervious to any intervention that is specifically related to the women's mobility. The complexities that surround such relationships require specialist interventions, particularly when women are manipulated into prostitution through these relationships. This phenomenon is widely reported as a common aspect of abuse in prostitution (James 1978; Barry 1979; Barry 1995; Jeffries 1997; Farley 2003) and is not specifically related to trafficking.

#### 8.4 Other women different theory

After 1998, the pre-eminence of young wives in the trafficking networks was challenged by the second main trafficking typology, which was older 'divorced' women who discovered that trafficking could be used as a substitute for their inadequate social networks. As a substitute, trafficking could help them leave Albania and while in a country of destination chosen by the trafficker, they expected to develop their own alternative networks. These alternative networks were intended to enable them to leave trafficking often through marriage to a French man and to then re-engage with their matrilocal networks.

It is the group of mostly divorced women who deliberately used trafficking to leave Albania that is the most misunderstood group among the trafficked women. When awareness raising campaigns and better

information exchange meant that Albanian women were not willing to enter into potentially dangerous marriages, the numbers of women being trafficked from Albania did not fall (Limanowska 2004). This meant that other women were being recruited into trafficking by other means. In chapters 4 and 5 of this work, I described how these new women were reporting that they were leaving Albania not as wives but to take up employment elsewhere in Europe. It was, therefore, assumed that these women were then being deceived about the nature of the employment and that awareness raising about such recruitment strategies would result in a reduction of trafficking. However, in spite of numerous campaigns to alert Albanian women to the risks of accepting work outside of Albania, trafficking numbers continued to rise throughout 1998-2001 (IOM 2001; IOM 2004).

I have shown in chapters 4 and 5 of this study that the reason the new awareness raising campaigns did not work is because many women were then deliberately engaging in trafficking and were only using stories about working in restaurants or other employment as a means to hide their actual intentions. Awareness raising about trafficking and information exchange from returning women probably only increased the awareness that trafficking was an efficient and certain way to migrate, even though it involved various risks and exploitation. It had been presumed that no woman would willingly engage in trafficking and knowingly accept the forced labour associated with such abuse. However, there was a significant group of women in Albania who subjectively considered their situations to be so intolerable, that they were willing to try to use trafficking to escape their social exclusion and to further use trafficking to try to rehabilitate themselves through re-marriage to a foreign man. This group consisted mainly of the divorced women who were highly stigmatised and socially excluded. This new knowledge has implications for re-conceptualising trafficking as an actor-oriented exercise, involving well-informed women rather than trafficking being an exercise in the power of criminals to deceive and coerce women. This would be a major departure from how trafficking is presently understood and would suggest the need for a substantial reanalysis of other trafficking patterns and migration orders, to establish whether such or similar findings are reflected elsewhere.

#### *8.4.1 Women subverting trafficking networks*

The study describes how the changing trafficking population changed the nature of the trafficking network. This has substantial implications regarding the need to properly conceptualise the actor-orientated actions of trafficked women. The 'divorced' women were not willing to subscribe to the patrilocal prostitution myth, and these women had a

very clear understanding of the *Çuna* as exploitative criminal men. When the increasing number of 'divorced' women mingled in the same trafficking networks as the wives, they were often unwilling to participate in the supervisory network operated by the wives. Furthermore, they openly challenged the validity of the patrilocal myth. When increasing mobility resulted in better information exchange between the trafficked women and social networks in Albania, wives became increasingly dissatisfied with the status quo, as the duplicity of the *Çuna* became widely known. In previous years, the only simple alternative to the patrilocal role was to be re-classed as 'whore' or occasionally abscond.

Wives had had very few options by which to end their involvement in trafficking, without losing what they imagined was considerable social status. The most common way wives originally sought to mitigate trafficking harm was to enter into a marriage with a *Çuni*, who they believed they could develop a mutual and equitable relationship with. The 'divorced' women offered a new model for resolving trafficking that allowed women to exit trafficking through marriage to a foreign man. This gave them a considerable gain in social status and the opportunity to reengage positively with their matrilineal social networks. Marriage to a foreign man offered a valuable resolution to trafficking that could be presented to the matrilineal family as a very successful migration outcome. Such a marriage would also allow the social rehabilitation of any previously socially excluded woman. This was also the first viable alternative to life with a *Çuni*, available to the wives that had a fit with their desire for a happy and secure family life.

Once a viable alternative option was available to the wives, the system that had previously sustained their trafficking episode for many years began to break down. During the research period, an increasing number of women arrived who were not 'married', during the same time wives became increasingly likely to divorce their *Çuni*. The success of the 'divorced' women in disrupting and subverting the previous trafficking system as described in chapter 7, clearly demonstrates that solutions to trafficking that offer trafficked women outcomes that are valued and desired by the trafficked women, can have a dramatic impact on trafficking networks. This finding has clear implications for understanding how trafficking and social networks interact with one another; it also demonstrates the importance of understanding trafficking as an actor-orientated event, where the role of trafficked women as actors should not be hidden by presumptions about the coercive role of traffickers.

Furthermore, the success of the 'divorced' women in disrupting the trafficking networks suggests that interventions that encourage links between trafficked compatriots, who can share information about pos-

sible solutions that fit with the interests of the trafficked women, would be well received by trafficked women. The identification of the principal typologies of the women participating in the Lyon networks showed that participants in such networks are heterogeneous and their participation can be better explained by using a multiplicity of migration theories, as suggested by Van Hear (1998). Such explanations are more theoretically rational than a grand theory of trafficking predicated on demand as the focal problem of trafficking. This work, therefore, challenges the validity of the current dominant theory regarding trafficking and suggests that Albanian trafficking is widely misunderstood. A major refinement to current conceptualisations of trafficking is the finding, that it is solutions based on the actor-orientated agency of women that are most successful means of subverting trafficking.

### **8.5 Problems in understanding trafficking**

An important aspect of developing the trafficking matrix in this study was to be able to identify trafficking problems that could not be explained by migration theory. By identifying problems that cannot be considered migration problems, it is possible to see where trafficking needs to be seen as a multidisciplinary issue that requires interventions that are unrelated to migration or mobility. This in turn, would suggest that there cannot be a single focal problem for trafficking, as trafficking can be a mixture of unrelated problems that when they occur simultaneously manifest as a type of trafficking.

As Albania had been isolated from the rest of the world for so many years, there were often no social networks available to women to ensure their safe mobility. The increasing obstacles to migration made many women dependent on trafficking networks to migrate and sustain their migration. The earliest participants in the trafficking networks used patrilocal marriage to leave their own families to join their husband and migration for marriage was an accepted social convention. However, these women would often become emotionally co-dependent on the exploiting man, and then they were subjected to various coercion and exploitation. This relational exploitation seemed to allow traffickers to inflict severe harm upon the women concerned. This form of exploitation seems to be impervious to any change in the migration order, as the vulnerability was based in the nature of Albanian gender relationships. As long as women considered themselves inside a viable intimate relationship, they seemed to be vulnerable to a manipulative and violent partner. While Albanian social conventions stigmatise divorce, and there is tacit acceptance of partner violence against Albanian women, co-dependent women will remain trapped in

their exploitation, regardless of any intervention intended to deal with a migration problem. While this speaks to how Albanian men manipulate household decision making and to how the new economic model can be adapted to explain this trafficking process, the new economic model does not offer any possible solution to this type of abuse.

Another aspect of trafficking that would be resistant to any application of migration theory is some of the abuse that occurs because of risks associated with participation in sex work. Women in sex work are at risk from violence from clients and other sex workers; these risks relate to the specific conditions of a local sex-work market. The fear and harm trafficked women experience because of these aspects of sex work can neither be explained, nor better understood by reference to the analytical trafficking matrix based on Van Hear's model (1998) nor can the trafficking matrix suggest solutions. The women were also vulnerable to harassment by the vice police, because of the women's irregular migration status and the criminalisation of certain aspects of sex work. Their vulnerability because of their irregular status can clearly be understood and explained by reference to work by Engbersen and Van der Leun (1998); changes in migration practice and policy could mitigate such vulnerability. The harm they experienced because of criminalised aspects of sex work and how this might have increased their dependency on the trafficking networks can also be explained or better understood by reference to the trafficking matrix based on Van Hear's model (1998). The matrix would suggest that by regularising their employment status as migrant workers they would no longer be vulnerable to such official harassment. The trafficking matrix is a valuable tool in helping distinguish between such similar events and identifying which of these can be explained by migration theory and which cannot. Without the analytical matrix, it would be easy to conflate these similar events and then miss the nuanced differences that would allow some to be resolved through a change in migration policy.

### *8.5.1 Conceptualising non-migration-related trafficking problems*

In chapter 3, the study describes how policies and practices that encourage open sex-work environments allow women and exploiters to become increasingly visible and the methods of exploiters known. Relationships with other women, regular clients, local vendors, hotel staff, taxi drivers and others all then offer women opportunities to develop their social networks as means to overcome exploitation. Such interventions would assist any exploited woman in sex work and not just trafficked women; such harm is not specifically migration related and as such, is probably best conceptualised separately from explanations of the migration of trafficked people.

Women who are in co-dependent relationships with abusive men are likely to experience a multitude of harms no matter where they go or what they do, their exploitation in sex work is a consequence of this co-dependency and is not specific to their mobility. Furthermore, women who are trafficked into sex work will have to contend with all of the problems and harms that might be associated with any particular sex-work environment, but such these various harms are not inherent to their migration but are aspects of problems in that sex-work environment or their co-dependency. Consequently, these harms cannot be resolved by any consideration of trafficking and migration, but only by interventions that specifically address these problems. Conflating non-migration harms with other trafficking harms related to mobility creates a problem that can never be completely resolved by considerations of migration theory. Any solution suggested by the use of the trafficking matrix to reduce or mitigate trafficking cannot solve these non-migration problems. These partial solutions can then be rejected as inadequate by anyone who would prioritise any of the other harms as being more urgent or serious.

The prominence of sex work in this trafficking network could have been a result of the structure of the informal economy in Italy encountered by the arriving Albanian migrants in the early 1990s (Ballauri, Vojkollari et al. 1997). It can be imagined that if the Italian labour market was regulated like the German labour market, where sex work is subject to labour regulation, trafficked women arriving in such a labour market might have been directed to a sector that was not so visible or supervised. This would be particularly the case, if the number of women arriving could not be accommodated in a sex-work industry already amply supplied with local and legal migrant sex workers from the expanding European community. If as a sector in the labour market sex work could offer terms and conditions that would attract sufficient numbers of women legally entitled to work in its various enterprises, and then traffickers would find it incredibly difficult to find a market for trafficked women in such a sector. In the mid-1990s, IOM research discovered that six percent of Hungarian young women were willing to travel to take part in erotic labour (IOM 1998); now that these and other women from the new accession states are acquiring greater mobility and labour rights in the EC, it is possible that any demand for paid sex in the EC might be met by voluntary sex workers, if the terms and conditions of employment are adequately improved.

Therefore, trafficking needs to be considered as groups of problems that can be conceptualised separately or sometimes jointly; the development of the three-Ps approach was an attempt to understand a wide continuum of trafficking problems, but increasingly with demand as the focal problem. Some problems such as co-dependency or sex-work

regulation need to be examined to see if they are really trafficking problems and whether or not they should be re-conceptualised as coincidental to the practice of trafficking. It is also likely that if the traffickers could not have engaged the researched women in sex work, they would have sought to engage the researched women in other profitable forced labour. Thus, it is possible that Albanian women who were unable to work as sex workers because of their age or other considerations have also been subjected to forced labour, but forced labour outside of sex work, possibly in sweat shops or domestic work. There is a need to conduct further research to identify if such women exist, and if they do, to then research their experiences to see how they compare with the experiences of the researched women. Such research would have considerable value in refining our understanding of trafficking.

## 8.6 Trafficking presumptions and realities

The work challenged three substantial presumptions that have dominated the Albanian trafficking discourse and a fourth that is sometimes offered as an alternative to the three dominant presumptions. These presumptions can be summarised as:

1. Rural and Roma women are pushed by poverty and pulled by 'demand' into trafficking.
2. Albanian women do not deliberately engage with trafficking networks.
3. All trafficked women are the victims of deception or coercion by organised criminals, and they only seek to be released from sexual slavery.

To these three dominant presumptions, this fourth presumption is sometimes offered as an alternative.

4. Many trafficked women are women who want the freedom to engage in migratory sex work for its substantial economic rewards. If sex work was free from institutionalised and structural exploitation, they would be able to achieve their economic goals more easily.

For the vast majority of the researched women, involvement in trafficking was not intended to be an economic means to an end, they did not want to be sex slaves but neither did they want to be sex workers. Their trafficking experience was supposed to be a transitory episode in a trajectory intended to result in a happy marriage and a life free of misogynistic Albanian social norms.

This research found that the presumption that the migration decisions of the researched women were the result of rural and Roma



wanting to overcome poverty to be inadequate. Less than 10 per cent of the women were Roma and these women were all from urban areas. Approximately 10 per cent of the women were from rural areas. A distinguishing feature of the Roma was that they all had eight or fewer years of education. Otherwise, the researched women were overwhelmingly educated, urban women who can be described as mostly young, deceived wives or slightly older divorced women.

Researched women in Lyon often articulated that their migration decision making involved considerations regarding greater personal freedoms, particularly an opportunity to go beyond the cultural restraints imposed upon women in Albania. These women understood the risks of trafficking but deliberately used trafficking as a means to migrate. I discussed in chapters 5 and 6 how presumptions had hindered a better understanding of Albanian trafficking. The findings that exposed these presumptions are not simply of academic interest. To be returned to such a misogynist and prejudicial environment as the result of a 'reinsertion' programme based on such presumptions, even if the returnee has secured a poorly paid job, will not be considered a satisfactory outcome by women seeking new social freedoms or trying to escape social exclusion.

The exposure of these presumptions, and thus the research and analysis based on them as inadequate, requires that Albanian trafficking be re-conceptualised so as to better explain the experiences of Albanian women. This exposure would suggest that research on such vulnerable groups should use appropriate methods and when methodologically sound research is not possible, the greatest care should be taken when speculating about possible explanations for a phenomenon such as trafficking.

## **8.7 Social networks**

A principle conclusion of this study regarding social networks is the overwhelming importance of weak and inadequate social networks in some women's decisions to use trafficking networks to leave Albania. While Koser (1997), Engbergson and Van der Leun (1998) and, more recently, Collyer (2005) have found that the ability of social networks to direct and support migration flows have been hindered by the need of new migrants for extended support because of increasing barriers to regularisation, Collyer has also shown how migrants will nevertheless continue to migrate, but without burdening their social networks and unconstrained by the network's geography.

This research supports Collyer's (2005) idea of weak social networks as being a repellent force, as the trafficked women did not want to be-

come an unacceptable burden on their social networks; these women were also repelled from contact with their social networks because they wanted to avoid the stigma of being identified as sex workers. However, this work extends our understanding of this process by describing in chapter 7 how these migrants will effectively reintegrate themselves into their previous social networks and how they strategise to achieve such reintegration without becoming a burden to the network.

As described in chapters 4 and 5, many Albanian women will resort to trafficking to leave Albania and sustain a migration, because their own networks are unable to support their migration. Unlike Collyer's (2005) Algerian migrants, the women are not free to go wherever they could as the traffickers direct their migration trajectory. However, this constraint was not considered a disadvantage as many women wanted to eventually re-engage with their social networks in the various countries of destination. These countries were easily accessible from trafficking destinations, but they were not easily accessible from Albania. The women also increasingly strategised successful ways to reinstate their links with their social networks in Albania, particularly those based on their female friends and relatives. The women then extended their social networks to include others who could help sustain their migration. Trafficking is used by these women as a bridge to overcome the inadequacies of their social networks and to sustain their migration until they can reintegrate themselves into their social networks without being an onerous burden. Therefore, women used trafficking to initially avoid overburdening weak networks, but would then increasingly reengage with the woman's social networks as she acquired the resources to no longer be a burden. This actor-orientated use of trafficking as a 'bridge' is a previously unknown use of trafficking. This demonstrates the continued importance of weak social networks in influencing and directing a chain migration, even when such networks are unable to offer the usual means to support normal chain migration. This would extend the theoretical importance of chain migration to include people who previously had been thought to have been unable or unwilling to participate in chain migration, because of structural weaknesses in their networks.

## **8.8 Trafficking networks, social networks**

The social networks that evolved to become trafficking networks have become the focus of much speculation and attempted analysis. These networks are seen as the fundamental element of trafficking and if they can be suppressed by law enforcement actions, trafficking presumably could be defeated. As such, repeated calls are made for law

enforcement action against trafficking networks be made the priority in dealing with trafficking (Widgren 1994; Hughes 2002; Europol 2004; Malarek 2004). Others have theorised the importance of trafficking networks in directing migration flows and how these networks operate as commercial enterprises (Salt & Stein 1997; Salt & Hogarth 2000; Koser 2001). However, the researched women in this study have shown trafficking networks to be very vulnerable to changes in the typology of the trafficked women and the creation of alternative social networks that will support the women in leaving a trafficking episode according to her agenda. The rapid information exchange that represents a cumulative causation process can quickly subvert a trafficking network's sustainability.

### 8.8.1 *The growth in trafficking networks*

The *Çunas'* main influence on the Albanian trafficking crisis was predicated on their ability to direct migration flows according to their social networks and their ability to sustain the trafficked person in the place of destination. The research clearly identified that trafficking from Albania had evolved from a system that had begun as the coercion of deceived wives into sex work to a contract-based business that involved mainly divorced women who wanted to leave Albania to find foreign husbands. As these two principal groups met and interacted inside the trafficking networks, the 'divorced' women disrupted and subverted the original value system by which the wives had acquiesced to remain in trafficking and the surveillance system that policed the network. The evolution of the trafficking system to include women who had no emotional attachment to the *Çuna* was the means by which the existing trafficking networks was most substantially challenged. Information exchange is an important element of any social network (De Jong & Gardner 1981; Koser 1997), and the need for information exchange in the trafficking networks to ensure the surveillance of the women also created opportunities for information exchange between the women. As described in chapters 6 and 7, the information exchange between these two groups of women who shared the same trafficking networks was the means by which an increasing number of women eventually acquired the knowledge required to leave trafficking. Such information exchange created a cumulative causation process that allowed women to use information acquired through years of experience by some women to rapidly affect their own migration trajectory and outcomes.

As trafficking networks' abusive practices became better known, women increasingly sought contracts that supposedly allowed them to use trafficking networks and then leave them. Most women still wanted

good husbands and secure domestic situations, but they did not consider the *Çuna* able to meet those goals, and so they wanted to be able to find foreign husbands or acquire funds to arrange *Kollovar* husbands. As these women were deliberately engaging in trafficking to achieve other personal goals relating to their gendered priorities regarding a good marriage, and increased personal freedoms, the flow of trafficked women did not diminish. There was no overall reduction in the number of women in trafficking because of awareness raising or law enforcement initiatives; only the type of participant in trafficking changed. This new participant was then wrongly considered to be typically a woman who was deceived with a fake job offer as a baby-sitter or waitress. It can be imagined that while women want to escape Albanian misogyny, but still live married lives to more congenial men, poverty reduction, awareness raising or other similar attempts to reduce trafficking will not be effective. While the efficiency of trafficking continued, trafficking could be expected to grow especially when the women had no other means to achieve their migration-related objectives.

Increasing interaction and information exchange between the different groups of trafficked women led to the wives increasingly rejecting the *Çuna* as husbands. These wives and the 'divorced' women sought to develop new social networks that allowed them to sustain their migration independently of the trafficking network. Consequently, an increasing number of women were able to disengage from the trafficking network. Therefore, when women are aware of trafficking risks they will make rational decisions about using trafficking networks. Where they can create their own social networks able to support their migration agenda, they will often resolve their trafficking episode without any direct external assistance. It could be, therefore, expected that Albanian women who have access to adequate social networks will migrate to find husbands and other opportunities without ever experiencing trafficking harms; such networks are a most effective way to divert women away from traffickers. These social networks will have a perfect fit with the migration intentions of the women who use them, while not requiring the women to engage in any form of forced labour.

## 8.9 Trafficking and policy

It is clear that when immigration policy changes, trafficking practices change to reflect the different circumstances and possibilities. An example of policy directly influencing trafficking was changes in policy in Italy regarding migrant sex workers in the late 1990s, in which newly arrived women were targeted for deportation. This resulted almost immediately in newly trafficked women coming directly or at least

more quickly to France. The confiscation of some of the speedboats in Vlore meant that some women in 2001 began to travel with false documents. There was no noticeable drop in the numbers of women being trafficked, only a change in the routing of such women (IOM 2001; IOM 2004; IOM 2005). Recent policy changes are reflected in the changing preference among those *Çuna* now in the UK to recruit women from the newly accession states that do not have strong social networks in the UK, such as Lithuania, since sustaining Albanian women in the UK as Kosovan refugees has become increasingly difficult. The recent emergence of Lithuanian women as the new woman of choice for many *Çuna* (Dudgeon 2005; Nugent 2005) could be explained as being predicated on the women's right to live and work in Europe, while they lack social networks which are strong enough to protect them. These new rights are the result of EC policy that allows for the freedom of movement for labour. At the same time, sustaining the migration of Albanian women through the asylum system has become increasingly difficult as the Kosovan conflict was no longer a justifiable reason for supporting an asylum claim and Albania had been added to the Home Office white list<sup>1</sup> (Dholakia 2003; Home Office 2003). Therefore, mixtures of migration policy involving different institutions has resulted in a substantial change concerning which women are now preferred for recruitment.

This research has highlighted how trafficking orders are highly susceptible to changes in migration policy. Trafficking routes respond decisively to changes in such policy and possibly, more predictably than they do to law enforcement initiatives. Law enforcement interventions can cause a route to redirect, but do little to reduce numbers of trafficked women (IOM 2004; IOM 2005; Marshall & Thatun 2005). Awareness campaigns can increase awareness and so can require traffickers to offer better terms and conditions (IOM 2004), but they do not reduce the desire to migrate among women who want to leave their countries of origin. If a woman can avoid engaging with traffickers to effect and sustain her migration, she can protect herself from much trafficking harm. As with awareness raising, programmes to offer increased economic opportunities in sending countries also have their shortcomings. Obviously, women who are involuntarily immobile and are motivated to migrate for non-economic reasons will not be satisfied with interventions based on resolving supposed economic motivations. As such these women might consider engaging with traffickers to try to achieve their migration goals. But, even economically motivated women will find the money available from the types of local jobs that are invariably provided by such livelihood programmes to be mostly inadequate substitution for the hope of better-paid employment abroad.

### 8.9.1 *Using policy to subvert Albanian trafficking*

It is these unresolved motivations that are not satisfied by any policy initiative which creates a demand for trafficking services. This demand for the services of traffickers is in sharp contrast to the notion that trafficking exists because of the demand of men for paid sex. In considering demand as a trafficking problem, it could be argued that if there was no demand for the services of traffickers then trafficking would not exist. Without a substantial group of women willing to participate in trafficking, in spite of the known or suspected risks, Albanian trafficking would have become unsustainable. During 1998-2001 women became more aware of trafficking risks before they engaged with traffickers so after an initial season of deception and coercion, the Lyon trafficking networks become increasingly dependent on women willing to risk engagement with traffickers as a mobility strategy.

The opportunities to use policy to subvert trafficking have been identified by various commentators (Altink 1995; Adams 2003; Marshall & Thatun 2005). If the migration motivation and objectives of many trafficked women are properly understood, then it is possible that certain migration policies could subvert many aspects of trafficking and reduce the sustainability of trafficking networks. As a substantial number of Albanian women have no wish to be sex workers but only to overcome social exclusion through marriage to non-misogynist men, it should be possible to devise a policy that allows Albanian women to live and work in the EC so they might incidentally meet appropriate marriage partners. Such an approach would also have direct advantages for the EC which I detail below. The impact of significant numbers of women leaving Albania and achieving happy secure marriages would probably have a considerable impact on social norms in Albania. This should encourage change as Albanian men would have to compete with foreign non-misogynist men as marriage partners for Albanian women.<sup>2</sup> Albanian men able to marry would then no longer be able to constrain their wives so effectively through the fear of being stigmatised by divorce if remarriage abroad was a ready possibility.

Once a large and successful community of Albanian women were to be established by such marriages throughout Europe, there would be a corresponding strengthening of their female networks. These strong social networks would become the means for the chain migration of subsequent female relatives who could then be protected by the networks of the already established women.<sup>3</sup> Such opportunities could be created by policies that can be constructed as temporary-worker programmes in specific labour sectors such as catering, cleaning or self-employed, non-residential caring. However, the intention of the policies would be to create the strong female-dominated social networks

that would undermine the utility of trafficking networks. This would need a shift of attitude towards visa issuance towards young unmarried women or exempting the women by some means from visa requirements. Several women said that they would be willing to pay for visas so they could avoid traffickers and as such their comments are now being reflected in the proposal by Jandl (2005) that EC visas be sold in an Albanian pilot project intended to subvert trafficking networks (*The Economist* 2005). Currently young unmarried Albanian women are often refused visas to visit the EC countries as they cannot show that they are intending to return to Albania after any visit. Instead of such young women being considered potentially unwelcome prostitutes and liabilities, they should be viewed as a valuable demographic resource. All of the researched women expressed a wish to marry and have children; and in chapter 4 of this study some described how that they wanted three or more children. Albania has the highest birth rate in Europe (UNECE 2004). Therefore importing young educated women with a culture of child bearing and whose female migrant compatriots have already been shown to bring up these children fully integrated into local society (Kelly 2005) is a significant opportunity to use these women for a particularly valuable form of replacement migration (UNPD 2000). Rational migration policy making would require that these Albanian women be given access to the EC as the impending demographic problem of reducing and aging populations could be partly mitigated by these young child bearing migrants (Lesthaeghe 2000; UNPD 2000) who can be expected to be committed to social integration into the host community (Kelly 2005).<sup>4</sup>

By allowing access to the EC without the need to resort to trafficking to migrate or sustain that migration, traffickers would find it very difficult to capture and exploit these women. As the women's own networks grew, it would become exponentially harder for traffickers to divert women away into harm. The predominance and importance of social networks clearly demonstrates that understanding trafficking as a type of social network and how it is used by some women to compensate for their own weak networks, is an important extension to how trafficking should be conceptualised. The study also describes how weaknesses in social networks can be overcome and chain migration reinstated, so further disrupting the sustainability of the trafficking networks. By using the analytical trafficking matrix as a tool to identify how different migration theory can contribute to a better understanding of trafficking, explanations can be offered that help us understand the different typology of the women involved, rather than resorting to presumptions that require the women to be constantly deceived and coerced.

### 8.9.2 Policy and 'demand'

Rational policies allowing women to access strengthened social networks offer a clear alternative to addressing 'demand' for prostitution as a focal problem of trafficking. The policy initiatives suggested so far do not try to address 'demand' as the focal problem of trafficking. Instead they are based on the identification of weak social networks as being the focal problem of Albanian trafficking and are intended to subvert Albanian trafficking networks.

If demand for paid sex is then not reduced by these strategies, it is possible that traffickers will simply locate other women with similar or other vulnerabilities and seek to traffic them. It seems that as sustaining the trafficking of Albanian women has become harder because they are no longer able to easily use the asylum process as Kosovans, Albanian traffickers have found other women to traffic (Nugent 2005). It could, therefore, be argued that this European trafficking crisis has already evolved to the point where Albanian women are no longer the preferred recruit and that the high point of the Albanian trafficking crisis has passed, as other women are now easier to traffic. Trafficking in Albania and the Balkans is reported as being in decline (RCP 2003; IOM 2004; Lesko 2005) although other agencies insist that this reported decline only demonstrates an increase ability on the part of traffickers to avoid detection (ProProject 2005). However, there are lessons that can be learned from the Albanian experience that should be useful for refining migration theory to explain and predict the evolution of other trafficking crises.

## 8.10 Limitations and possibilities

The limitations of this research are many and obvious. The study is based on a single population of trafficked Albanian women in Lyon. It is not possible to be certain that their experiences can speak to how trafficking works in other migration orders outside of Southern Europe or trafficking that involves women who are not Albanian. The key factors that involved Albanian women in trafficking were deceptive marriages and social exclusion because of divorce. These factors could have been accentuated by Albanian traditions and social norms that might not be so pertinent in other cultures. The patrilocal separation of a married woman from her birth family is particularly strong in Albania, and the tradition of kidnapping through elopement to avoid an arranged marriage is still common; in other places where these traditions are not common, other explanations for trafficking will be required. The importance of social exclusion leading to a sense of intolerability



among 'divorced' women that resulted in a desire to leave will not apply to societies where women are not so stigmatised by divorce or other supposed social transgressions. While divorce is uncommon in Albania and severely stigmatised, it is very common in other countries associated with high levels of trafficking such as Russia (UNECE 2004). Thus, there is a need to examine the relevance of this work to other trafficked women from other countries by conducting similar research among other trafficked women.

Another disadvantage of only undertaking substantial research among the women in Lyon is that it is possible Lyon was an exceptional population that would not allow meaningful generalisations of the study's finding to even other Albanian women. While this is mitigated in part by the varied trajectories of the researched women and brief research among Albanian women elsewhere, there remains a need to extend this research to other communities of trafficked Albanian women to see if its findings can be generalised. Furthermore, it would be naïve to expect traffickers not to learn lessons from the actions of women leaving trafficking. Thus, there is a need to continue to research the ongoing evolution of trafficking from Albania. It would be important to see how traffickers and the women have continued to negotiate the trafficking experience and to identify how and why any further shift in power between the traffickers and the trafficked has occurred.

## 8.11 Conclusions

This chapter re-examined the presumptions that had dominated the explanations for Albanian trafficking and again found them misconceived and the analysis based on them inadequate. This chapter then recapitulated how the analytical trafficking matrix could be used to identify different theoretical explanations for different types of trafficking and to identify events that could not be explained or resolved by any aspect of migration theory. These new theoretical explanations were possible because of the immensely rich and thick data that was collected from the researched women over a period of more than two years. This data covered every aspect of their induction into trafficking, their experiences in trafficking, and the means by which they left trafficking. Consequently, it is hard to exaggerate the importance of the research methodology that allowed this data to be collected. Regardless of any theoretical contribution that might be made by this study, the methodology by which the data was acquired will remain an important contribution to the effective researching of trafficked women.

Using this data, it was possible to identify the two typologies of trafficked women that eventually dominated the research. These typologies were the deceived wives and the 'divorced' women. Using the analytical trafficking matrix, I was able to offer explanations for the two main typologies of trafficked women that made up the majority of women trafficked to Lyon between 1998-2001. The matrix allowed me to identify theories to explain how and why these women were involved in trafficking, and as such, I could hypothesis refinements to the theories. The matrix also allowed me to identify problems that cannot be explained by migration theory and to perceive the subtle differences between similar events by offering explanations for some of these events but not others.

The significance of patrilocal marriage and its legitimising of the household decision making of the *Çuna* as a non-altruistic new economic of migration process had not previously been fully understood. How this relationship was then used to form the basis of a panoptical surveillance that allowed the *Çuna* to remotely control the women with the minimum of violence was a significant discovery that invites comparisons with other new economic migrants to see how such controls are used by other households. This power of panoptical surveillance meant that the *Çuna* had a far more sophisticated control over the women than was previously supposed, as the linkages and information sharing between the *Çuna* exponentially increased their ability to discipline and control the women. As the different typology of trafficked women could be identified and their heterogeneity mapped, it became possible to see dynamics between the groups that were affecting the trafficking networks. The disruption and subversion of the *Çuna* surveillance was the result of these typologies colliding and the tensions arising from the nexus. This has implications for policy and practice intended to subvert trafficking networks, particularly suggesting that actions that encourage strong matriarchal social networks would subvert trafficking networks.

Albanian trafficking has evolved, and this evolution was driven by an increasing awareness among Albanian women about how trafficking could be used to leave Albania and to achieve social rehabilitation. These trafficked women were unable to utilise their weak networks to migrate or to sustain their migration. So, they intended to chain migrate by using trafficking as a means to bridge the gap in the weak networks. Although they were repelled by the weak networks as described by Collyer (2005) and Engbersen (1998), they developed a strategy to overcome the weaknesses and to eventually be able reintegrate into their own social networks. This particular and deliberate use of trafficking has not previously been so comprehensively conceptualised especially in the use of trafficking to bridge across a lack of capacity divid-

ing members of a weak network, although Kempadoo (2001) and Agustín (2005) have described women deliberately using trafficking networks to pursue sex work and other objectives. The conceptualisation challenges the currently accepted notions of how trafficking works in Albania. This new understanding of trafficking has substantial implications for anti-trafficking policy and practice, as well as the need to re-conceptualise the focal problems of Albanian trafficking to include the problem associated with weak networks. The final section of this chapter argues that if women can be mobile and if that mobility is supported and protected by strong social networks, many women could avoid the majority of trafficking harm. They would be able to avoid the harm because they would have no need to engage with traffickers neither to move nor to sustain their migration in a place of destination.

The researched women have demonstrated incredible resilience and courage in overcoming trafficking harm through the development of their self-solutions to trafficking. These achievements, which have been invisible for so long, should be acknowledged and lessons learnt from these women. The most successful self-solutions to trafficking were consequential to the women's actor-orientated development of information exchange and new social networks that grew beyond the control of traffickers. These networks were strengthened by the women's increasing mobility and repeat migrations that were undertaken, often in spite of traffickers and policy makers. It is an obvious conclusion that most trafficked women are very well informed about trafficking and these women have insightful understandings of how to subvert trafficking. When such women are engaged with and listened to in a non-prejudicial way, their insights into trafficking are compelling and easily offer the best explanations for their experiences.

### **8.12 Postscript: *J'accuse...***

I have also concluded that in my research I have uncovered little regarding the important role of policy in sustaining trafficking networks that was not really obvious to any unbiased observer. As such, I am compelled to assign responsibility for most trafficking harm not to organised criminals but to other actors. When I started my research I met and spoke with people who had been trafficked and people who were trafficking others, but they did not know about trafficking as an organised crime activity. What they knew was that they wanted to leave where they were and take the risk to go some place where things might be better. Some of these people were willing to take unfair advantage of others because the circumstances created by government policy allowed them to do so.

I believe that as the EC with the governments of EC member states and other countries built their 'fortresses' and sought to discourage migration, they allowed the creation of a no-man's-land between their fortress walls and the migrants' countries of origin. This no-man's-land was an unregulated and lawless gap that the irregular migrants had to cross, before they could reach their objectives of a new way of life. The unregulated migration networks for irregular migrants became increasingly vulnerable to abusive people. However, no effective alternatives were made available by which irregular migrants could easily avoid these risks, except if they were to follow the wishes of those who wanted them to stay at home. With the increasing feminisation of migration, the initial role of traffickers was apparently to act as a proxy deterrent to intimidate women into not leaving their homes. They were used to fueling the trafficking panics that placed every irregular migrant woman at substantial risk should she try and move to another place. The potential irregular female migrant was warned that if she dared to travel, she risked rape and slavery. Then, perversely, by refusing to allow her to travel in any reasonable or regular way, the European governments effectively compelled her to take these very risks when she did migrate.

In spite of governments, and often with the help of traffickers, women continued to break their way into the EC; eventually, some would leave trafficking and start new lives. If they did come in contact with a trafficking victim support agency, however, often all the agency could offer was to return them back to somewhere they did not want to be or to remain in some administrative limbo inside a shelter programme. These agencies, mainly NGOs, became not just the propagators of the trafficking panic, but they became the reverse traffickers and another obstacle for the migrant woman to overcome. Finally, when it was realised that the fear of the traffickers would not stop women from migrating, the governments decided to use traffickers in another way. Traffickers who had been used so unsuccessfully to intimidate female migrants became the 'reason' for a new crime war, which while superficially targeted at traffickers, was more obviously aimed at the essential irregular migration networks that shared the same resources as traffickers. The new war on traffickers is an attempt to criminalise every participant in any irregular migration as a serious and dangerous internationally organised criminal.

This study clearly shows how traffickers have flourished because women were compelled to use irregular migration routes that the traffickers dominated. The governments created the space for trafficking abuse by refusing to allow these women regular mobility. The governments helped maintain the women's vulnerability by not allowing them access to safe and regulated employment. Therefore, I have concluded

that trafficking has only been so successful because governments of the countries of destination have created the need for trafficking; thus they have also created and sustained the demand for trafficking services. Maybe this other sort of 'demand' could be the real focal problem of trafficking.



# Notes

## Chapter 1

- 1 Roppongi is a notorious trafficking destination.
- 2 Bales' Free the Slaves (FTS) organisation considers modern slavery to differ from previous forms of slavery in that modern slaves are considered cheap and disposable by slave users.

In 1850, it was difficult to capture a slave and then transport them to the US. Today, millions of economically and socially vulnerable people around the world are potential slaves. This 'supply' makes slaves today cheaper than they have ever been. Since they are so cheap, slaves are no longer a major investment worth maintaining. If slaves get sick, are injured, outlive their usefulness, or become troublesome to the slaveholder, they are dumped or killed. (FTS 2006)
- 3 The Van Hear (1998) migration order model seeks to explain migration events by using a range of migration theories to explain different aspects of a migration flow.
- 4 Proximate factors would be those structural and measurable economic, political and environmental factors that impact on human security and promote migration i.e. a downturn in a regional business cycle.
- 5 A theory proposed by Stark (1985) that emphasises the role of the household in migration decision making with the specific objective of mitigating various market risks.
- 6 Traffickers are those people who take part in the moving and constraining of other people into forced labour.
- 7 The protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, also known as the 2001 Palermo Protocol.
- 8 A focal problem is a central problem supposedly identified by the various stakeholders experiencing a crisis or difficulty that becomes the means by which the crisis can then be analysed, understood and responses formulated.
- 9 New Abolitionist Feminists are feminists who considers that trafficking and prostitution is the consequence of the demand of men for paid sex and that trafficking can only be stopped through the suppression of male demand for prostituted women and the abolition of all forms of prostitution. (Hughes 2006).
- 10 US evangelicals are a broad collection of conservative bible-based churches and organisations that include groups like Focus on the Family and well-known church leaders such as Charles Colson.
- 11 The US administration filed an appeal in August 2006 against the judgment given against them.
- 12 Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labor, ILO.
- 13 The North American Task Force on Prostitution was founded in 1979 to act as an umbrella organisation for prostitutes and prostitute rights organisations in different parts of the United States.
- 14 In 1991, an informal alliance of sex workers and organisations that provide services to sex workers formed as the Network of Sex Work Projects (NSWP). NSWP is now a

- legally constituted international organisation for promoting sex workers' health and human rights.
- 15 The EC describes the experts group saying it shall be made up of qualified individuals competent to consider matters relating to trafficking in human beings. This experts group should contribute substantively to the further development of the prevention of and the fight against trafficking in human beings and enable the Commission to gather opinions on any Commission initiative relating to trafficking in human beings EC (2003). Setting up a consultative group, to be known as the 'Experts Group on Trafficking in Human Beings', L 79/25 *Official Journal of the European Union*.
  - 16 Federal Member for Berowra was a member of the Australian Liberal party and Immigration Minister 1996-2003.
  - 17 The term 'the white-slave trade' was first used in the 1830s and referred to young European women being forcibly or deceitfully transported to various countries for coerced prostitution.
  - 18 Europol is the European Law Enforcement Organisation which aims at improving the effectiveness and co-operation of the competent authorities in the EC in preventing and combating terrorism, drug trafficking and other serious forms of international organised crime including the trafficking of people.
  - 19 ICMFD is an inter-governmental organisation working on migration policy development. It supports governments and institutions through research and other services regarding the promotion of orderly migration regimes.
  - 20 The TIP report lists each state's responses to trafficking and rates every nation according to various criteria. A grade one country is considered to be addressing trafficking appropriately while a grade three country is considered to be failing in its responses to trafficking and can be subjected to sanctions if it does not improve its performance.
  - 21 The South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) consists of Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. SAARC aims to accelerate the process of economic and social development in member states.

## Chapter 2

- 1 Cultural mediators are people who supposedly can bridge the gap between a migrant group and a host-culture organisation, because they have a 'cultural' empathy based on a set of skills and experiences that allow them to relate to both the host-culture organisation and the migrant group. These skills and experiences usually require a successful 'cultural mediator' to be socially accepted and subjectively trusted by the host culture and the migrants so enabling them to effectively act as a bridge between the groups.
- 2 Urban anthropology involves the study of the cultural systems of cities. Smaller-scale urban anthropological studies often study small groups or individuals in the form of life histories in specific social contexts (Kemper & Rollwagen 1995).
- 3 A cultural advocate has a similar set of shared 'cultural' experiences as a cultural mediator, but the advocate acts on behalf of the migrant group rather than on behalf of a host community institution.
- 4 'Conscientization' was used in the original English translation of Freire's (1970) seminal work as the translator felt 'conscience raising' did not reflect the dialogical relationship required in Freire's process. I have decided to continue the use of 'conscientization' to reflect my own emphasis on the dialogical relationship required in my own participatory research. 'Conscientization' is learning to perceive social, political



- and economic contradictions – developing a critical awareness – so that individuals can take action against the oppressive elements of reality (Freire 1970).
- 5 Freire argues that dialogical methods involve equality and respect, and that the method should not involve one person acting on another, but rather people working with each other.
  - 6 Both of these activists worked among marginalised people deliberately using dialogue for promoting ‘conscientization’ or an ability to control how knowledge is produced about the marginalised group.
  - 7 Photo of the church by the researcher; photo of women in the church from the collection of Lillian Mathieu.
  - 8 This social matrix is available at the back of this book, allowing the reader to refer to it when reading about the researched women.
  - 9 *Çuni* means ‘boy’ in Albanian, but is used by Albanian trafficked women to describe the man who controls or organises their trafficking episode.
  - 10 Plural of *Çuni*.
  - 11 A *Kollovar* husband is a husband who joins the household of his wife in a matrilineal marriage instead of having his wife join his household; , this usually occurs when a family has no sons, in such marriages the wife is able to ensure the security of her own parents and personal assets (Elsie 2001).
  - 12 OFPRA is the National French Agency that processes asylum applications in France.
  - 13 Non-prejudicial in this research means not having preconceived convictions or exercising moral judgments that presume someone is immoral or inferior because their involvement in a stigmatised activity like sex work.
  - 14 Cabiria is an NGO that was funded to promote harm reduction and HIV prevention among sex workers. Cabiria has a policy of accepting the fact that commercialised sex could be a form of work and the organisation worked to develop a client-driven agenda.
  - 15 These focus groups were usually informal meetings of various members of the researched women where we would discuss the research and other issues of interest to the women. The groups could occur spontaneously on the street or as part of social or other gatherings.
  - 16 EUROPAP/TAMPEP EuroPaP (European Intervention Projects AIDS Prevention for Prostitutes) now cooperates in Transnational AIDS/STD prevention among migrant prostitutes in Europe, (TAMPEP) in a joint programme funded by DG-5.
  - 17 Gerland is part of the 7<sup>th</sup> Arrondissement, which is a mainly light industrial area in south-east Lyon.
  - 18 The ‘sister’ has the highest status among the female relatives of an Albanian man, and she is considered a respected and protected person.
  - 19 ‘*Madame*’.
  - 20 Abolitionists define prostitution and other categories of sex work as inherently exploitative. Abolitionists want to end the institution of prostitution, envisioning a world where no one sells sexual services for any reason (Leigh 2003).
  - 21 At one conference that I attended in Paris for the deliberate purpose of trying to interview participants, I was able to interview a senior member of the National French agency dealing with trafficking and also some French NGO leaders working on trafficking issues about their knowledge of the situation in Lyon and trafficking in general.
  - 22 A copy of the ethical statement appears in Appendix F.
  - 23 My research notes and resources were secured in accordance with the agreed ethical statement. I stored all identifying information on a computer in encrypted files using a 1024 single-key encryption engine and all physical materials such as tapes and minidisks were stored away from my apartment. As such the information in my

- computer was unavailable to anyone without the password as the encryption sequence was of military intelligence strength. The password was only known to me.
- 24 When the police did detain my research assistant and search my office seeking information about the researched women, they were unable to find identifying information apart from one Post-it note that only had the public pseudonyms of an Albanian exploiter and his exploited partner. As my research assistant and I had carefully avoided engaging in any possible criminal activities, the research assistant was quickly released without charge and the public prosecutor ordered the investigation into our activities to be closed as unnecessary.
  - 25 Amicale du Nid is an abolitionist NGO that seeks to assist people who are in danger of being prostituted or are in prostitution. The organisation helps them leave prostitution.
  - 26 In chapter 3, the trafficking matrix is presented as an analytic tool based on considerations of trafficking as a crisis in a migration order that can best be understood by reference to a range of migration theories.
  - 27 Meaning condensation means an abridgment of the meanings expressed by the interviewees to aid analysis.
  - 28 Meaning categorisation involves grouping similar concepts together for subsequent analysis.
  - 29 *Ad hoc* meaning generation generates analysis through a combination of approaches.

### Chapter 3

- 1 Transitional changes are more profound and significant than other changes and Van Hear considers the most drastic to be migration transitions in which there is a fundamental change in a given migration order.

### Chapter 4

- 1 Appendix H is a summary of the biographic data of the researched women in this study.
- 2 I have made reference to the various *Çuna* by a single initial, most *Çuna* did not want to be identified in this research as being the *Çuni* of a particular woman, and consequently they are not, with the exceptions of A-*Çuni* who is the *Çuni* of EK who was indifferent to being so identified and the *Çuni* of L2 who was also happy to be so identified.
- 3 A bribe.
- 4 Vatra or 'Hearth' is the name of Lesko's NGO and shelter in Vlore.
- 5 'Natasha' is used as a generic name for a CEE/CIS sex worker in many places and has also been co-opted by the media and many anti-trafficking actors as nomclemature for a trafficked woman (Malerek 2002)
- 6 The Roma are often popularly referred to as being Non-White and their 'colour' is used colloquially to distinguish them from non-Roma or 'white' Albanians.
- 7 Whenever initials are used the relevant biographical details of the quoted woman can be found in the social matrix in Appendix H.
- 8 Details of the women's education can be found in the the social matrix in Appendix H.

- 9 Occupation was included in the old Albanian passport and '*puntore*' meant worker. Although I saw hundreds of these passports, I never encountered anyone who was not described as a *puntore*. Classification as a worker implied legitimacy in the class war and so many people would claim to be a *puntore* despite having another occupation that might infer another 'class'. Notions of class are therefore tainted by this political history.
- 10 If this population of women were to one day become unavailable, one could expect that traffickers would seek to replace them by recruiting women from other places or that they would offer these and other women increased incentives to engage with them. Their likelihood of success is outside the realms of this book.

## Chapter 5

- 1 Enver Hoxha was the leader of Albania as the First Secretary of the Communist Albanian Party of Labour, from the end of World War II until his death in 1985. Hoxha's rule was characterised by increasing isolation from the rest of the world and by adherence to a ruthless interpretation of Stalinism.
- 2 To act impetuously is also another meaning of '*rrembe*' or 'kidnap'.
- 3 Jeremy Bentham, an English philosopher, created a type of prison building that was referred to as the Panopticon. This type of prison allowed the warden to watch prisoners without them being aware of the observation and made the prisoners feel as though the warden was omniscient.
- 4 The *permis de séjour* is a temporary permission to stay in France granted to asylum seekers.
- 5 The prefecture was the administrative office for the Rhône-Alpes department, of which Lyon was the principal city.

## Chapter 6

- 1 The core members of the Lyon-North Group were EK, B1, LI, TC, S1, J1 and R1. Z1 and A1 were also associated through their *Çuna* to this group that was dominated by A-Çuni. Other women in Lyon North such as M1, R2, J3 and VT were subservient to this core group of women as they were controlled by the *Çuna* of the core group, but they were 50 per cent contract women or their 'marriage' status was disputed.
- 2 '*Çuni-i-mire*' means a 'good boy'.
- 3 Approximately € 12,000.
- 4 Meaning to be in an irregular immigration status.
- 5 The cultural advocate assisted the women in keeping their immigration status regular by ensuring that OFPRA and the prefecture received appropriate notification of the women's contact addresses and by reminding the women to comply with any administrative requirements. As they became more able to comply with the administrative process, the researched women during the research period thus moved from often being in an irregular immigration status to being overwhelmingly in a regular status.
- 6 French slang for 'the police'.
- 7 The research period serendipitously covered the period in Lyon when the balance of power between the 'wives' and the 'divorced' women went through the dramatic changes described in this chapter.

## Chapter 7

- 1 Prostitution is still a criminal offence in Albania and women are regularly sentenced to prison terms for selling sex.
- 2 This means 'a good lad or man' and is used to describe a man who is considered trustworthy and not a regular *cuni*.
- 3 The SPRSS is a state-funded agency intended to assist in the rehabilitation of sex workers by offering them retraining and alternative work placement.
- 4 Although referred to by the women as 'Algerian' the young man was actually Turkish.
- 5 In Albania the actual sale of sex is still a criminal offence so a sex-working woman can be imprisoned for prostitution. In most other European countries, including France, the sale of sex is not illegal and it is exploitative acts such as controlling and benefiting from prostitution that are illegal. Laws regarding solicitation for prostitution vary widely and are often applied in an apparently arbitrary way.

## Chapter 8

- 1 The Home Office's so-called white list specifies those countries from which a national's asylum application will be presumed unfounded.
- 2 This is already beginning to happen as match makers are promoting to potential Albanian brides, the 'woman-friendly' virtues of young Albanian men who have lived for many years abroad and have supposedly acquired more enlightened attitudes towards women.
- 3 However, it can not be assumed that all such networks would not be abusive, but networks based on matrilocal networks would exclude the risks associated with most current Albanian trafficking.
- 4 A patronising policy that would be based on prejudicial considerations of Albanian gender and identity but that also offered a pragmatic benefit to countries of origin.

## Appendix A Questionnaire and guidelines

Interviews are not usually formal question and answer sessions that take place during a single encounter, but should be events that allow the participants to cover a range of topics that are of interest to both sides.

Our questionnaires are guides about what we think we need to know about migrant sex workers and other stakeholders, it is quite likely that sex workers might want to tell us about other things that they believe are more important or relevant to their lives as sex-work migrants. We should be willing to listen to their voices and follow them when they want to direct us towards issues that are important to them.

The objective of our work is to understand and to relate to our subject groups, therefore we should accord them the respect and dignity of courtesy and acceptance.

Interviews will range from the quite structured to the very open-ended, time, personality and other circumstance will intervene to influence how each interview is conducted. Interviews can take place at any time or place and for any length of time. However, they are best conducted when time and circumstance allow for the respondent to be relaxed and without any pressing commitment. Interviews that allow the respondent to break away to fulfil work commitments, are often appropriate, in that sex work can often involve long periods of waiting interrupted by brief and frantic period of work.

Be conscious of other stakeholders and gatekeepers, good relationship with them will often facilitate access to our principle respondents. Other stakeholders are also part of our target group. Your notes should always show how contact was made with the respondent i.e. from a referral from another sex worker, casual contact, etc. Your notes should locate the interview according to time, place and any other circumstance of note i.e. was the respondent nervous or friendly.

Introduce yourself and the project, and explain that our work is intended to improve understanding and acceptance of migrant sex workers and that we are interested to hear about their experiences. We can

refer them to the STD clinic or other agency but we have no resources to take on social work cases. This is a serious but genuine limitation.

The questionnaire should be used as a guide and it is likely that you will not get answers to all of the questions. Questions are grouped into certain areas and it is possible that you will receive answers to certain questions, out of the order in which they appear in the questionnaire this is not important. Also it is more important to hear the voice of the respondent and follow them into an area of which they have particular knowledge or experience than to complete the questionnaire.

Never out-stay your welcome and always try and leave the door open for a return visit or a focus group meeting. Try and get a reliable means of keeping on-going contact with the respondent. When possible try and snowball to a new contact from any existing respondent.

Always be aware of your environment and its dynamics. Try to anticipate and avoid difficulties by disengagement.

## **Questions guide for semi-formal sessions**

### *Pre-migration life experiences*

*Family life, education, social factors, relationships, work, migration expectations*

How do they perceive themselves, how old are they, do they have children, what are their relationships with husbands, partners, managers, etc.?

What are their personal details and data, what was their sexual experience, sexual health knowledge, women's position in their society?

What are their life experiences before migrating, had they worked in sex work before migration?

### *Migration processes*

How do you migrate, where do you get information, who makes the decision?

How is it done, how did they get papers?

How did they migrate without papers: the routes/networks that they used, do they go to other countries if so why, and how is this organised?

Who uses agents and why, what do they use agents for, what do different agents do, how much do agents cost and how are they paid?

How do you contact an agent, how do various agents co-operate or organise themselves, do migration agents work as sex-work agents, is there a special migration procedure for sex-work migrants?

What is the influence of social institutions in pushing for sex-work migration, what are the reasons for migrating, who are the stakeholders in their migration?

Who decided that they would migrate, what were the factors that influenced them?

How did they organise their migration?

### *Sex work expectations and reality in the country of destination*

What are their expectations?

Did they know they would work in sex work, what did they expect sex work would involve, how does it compare with other work/experiences, what would they change? Can they return home, is repeat migration possible?

Where do they work, how do they find work, where do they live?

Why Greece, did they visit anywhere else?

How is their work structured, what do they do with their money?

How much control do they have over their lives, how could they have more control?

What abuse have they suffered, how do they cope with abuse, how do they perceive abuse, is it sex work-related or another form of co-dependency, how did they change abusive situations or how did they avoid abusive situations?

Do their families know what they do, are they received, tolerated or rejected?

Why do they think they migrated for sex work, what would they have done differently?

Do they engage in substance abuse, greater STD/pregnancy/abortion risk, can they sell safer sex, do they, what are the options?

### *Their status, perceiving*

How do they cope with stigma, arrest, prejudice?

How do they perceive themselves in comparison with other groups, how do they compare their lives in Greece with life at home?

Are there common experiences, are there differentials according to nationality or other identifiable factor i.e. age, education, previous sex-work experience?

How do the experiences of sex-work migrants compare with other female migrants or women/sex workers who do not migrate?

How do they think sex work should be organised?

*Looking into the future*

How long do they intend to work in sex work?

What are their future plans, what are their fears/hopes, what do they want to do in future?

How long have they been in Greece, how long do they want to stay?

*Policy country of origin/destination*

Do the countries have a social policy towards female migration, what is the perception of female migration, how are returnees treated?

What is Greek policy, on migration, prostitution, trafficking, also for the other nations?

How do institutions in Greece treat sex workers, how are they perceived by others including clients, health services, etc.?

**Questionnaire**

Remember you don't have to answer any questions you don't want to. All answers are strictly confidential.

Date

*Personal details*

1. Name or initials
2. Telephone number
3. Address
4. Age
5. Gender M/F
6. Place of birth (town & country)

*Family details*

1. Father's age
2. Mother's age
3. Brother's ages
4. Sister's ages
5. Were you a close family?
6. What age did you leave home?
7. Why did you leave home?
8. Have you ever been in care?

*Pre-migration experiences*

1. How old were you when you left school?



2. Do you have any vocational qualification?
3. Did you have a job before left?
4. If so what did you do?

*Migration decision and experience*

1. Why did you consider leaving Albania?
2. Where did you want to go and why?
3. Where did you get information about foreign countries?
4. How did you organise your migration?
5. How did you leave your country?
6. How much did it cost and what were the expenses for?
7. What did you expect to find in the country of destination?
8. Who did you travel with?
9. What places have you visited and for how long?
10. How did you get to Lyon?
11. How long do you want to spend in Lyon?
12. How long do you think you will be in Lyon?
13. Have you ever returned to Albania?
14. If so when and why?
15. Do you want to return to Albania permanently?
16. If so when do you want to do this?
17. Did you expect to work in sex work?
18. If you were deported would go somewhere else in the EU?
19. If so where?
20. What would you do to make life better for female migrants from Eastern Europe?

## **Violence questions**

Initials

Date of birth

*Violence questions*

1. Were you ever sexually attacked or abused as a child?
2. Were you ever sexually attacked or abused before you left Albania?
3. Have you ever been sexually attacked or abused since you left Albania?
4. Have you ever been attacked by a client?
5. Have you ever been attacked by another sex worker?
6. Have you ever been robbed?
7. Have you ever been attacked by your partner?

8. Has he ever used threats to make you work when you didn't really want to?
9. Are you scared of your partner?
10. Do you have any fear of being attacked? If so, who are you afraid of?
11. Have you ever attacked anyone? If so, why?

### Other questions

Initials

Date of birth

1. Do you use tobacco, alcohol?
2. If yes how much or how many times per week?
3. Do you use other drugs? If so, which ones?
4. What is your status in France: irregular or regular?
5. Are you in or have you used the asylum process?
6. What is your favourite newspaper in Albania?
7. If you are married, has your marriage been registered?
8. Was your partner already married?
9. How many women do you know have left sex work, returned to Albania and married their partner and now run a bar or restaurant?
10. Has your partner ever asked you to stay on in sex work longer than was initially agreed?
11. Has this happened more than once?
12. If you could speak on Albanian TV for one hour, what would you speak about and why?

### Help and assistance questions

Initials

Date of birth

Which of the following agencies have you heard of?

- Forum Refugee
- Family Planning Association
- HIV testing agency
- Welfare benefits
- SPRS
- Cabiria

- Amicale du Nid
- Movement du Nid
- Other please specify...

What do these agencies do?

- Forum Refugee
- Family Planning Association
- HIV testing agency
- Welfare benefits
- SPRS
- Cabiria
- Amicale du Nid
- Movement du Nid
- Other please specify...

Which of these agencies do you have regular contact with?

- Forum Refugee
- Family Planning Association
- HIV testing agency
- Welfare benefits
- SPRS
- Cabiria
- Amicale du Nid
- Movement du Nid
- Other please specify...

### **Sex work questions**

Initials

Date of birth

#### *Questions*

1. Did you know that you would do sex work before you left
2. What did you do before sex work?
3. What are the advantages of sex work?
4. What are the disadvantages of sex work?
5. What do you dislike about sex work?
6. What do you like about sex work?
7. What are the main problems associated with sex work?
8. How do they deal with these problems?
9. What do they do with the money they earn?
10. How much do money do you send to your family every month?

11. Do you have any debts?
12. Who decides when and where you work?
13. Can you refuse clients?
14. What are your main fears?
15. What is your relationship with your associates?
16. What is your opinion of the police?
17. How long do you expect to be in sex work?
18. Did you use a condom with your last client?
19. Do you always use condoms with clients?
20. Do you have a non-client sexual partner?
21. Do you use condoms with this partner?
22. Is there a difference between sex with a partner and sex with a client?
23. Do you still enjoy sex with your partner?
24. Since your involvement in sex work has your sexual orientation changed?
25. How would you describe your orientation – hetero/homo/bi?
26. Do you think that sex work should be illegal?

Which of these agencies are the most important to you? Number them 1-8: 1 being the most important.

- Forum Refugee
- Family Planning Association
- HIV testing agency
- Welfare benefits
- SPRS
- Cabiria
- Amicale du Nid
- Movement du Nid
- Other please specify...

Can you name any worker from any of the above agencies?

Which worker do you have the most contact with?

Would you like an agency – especially for women from the CEE/NIS and, in particular, a place in the central Lyon area – where women from the East can go for advice and help from women who speak their own languages, and where they could have confidential assistance on all matters, mail collection

If to open such a centre it were necessary to pay the rent on a shop, would you be willing to contribute to the setting up expenses.

How much would you be willing to contribute for the first six months towards setting up such an organisation?

- Nothing
- 250 francs per month for six months
- 500 francs per month for six months
- 1,000 francs per month for six months
- Other amount ... please specify

Would you be willing to work in such a centre for a few hours each week?

Would you use such a centre if it were available?



## Appendix B Cost of sex acts in Lyon

| <b>Les salaires du sexe</b>  |                             |
|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Animatrice de Minitel rose   | smig                        |
| Strip-teaseuse par Internet  | 50 F net/heure              |
| Strip-teaseuse en peep-show  | 62 F net/heure              |
| Hôtesse de bar américain     | 40 F/coupe, 200 F/bouteille |
| Prostituée en foyer-chantier | 100 F la passe              |
| Prostituée de rue            | 300-500 F la passe          |
| Prostituée en studio         | 1 000 F la passe            |
| Travesti                     | à partir de 200 F la passe  |
| Dominatrice                  | à partir de 2 000 F         |
| Call-girl                    | à partir de 2 000 F         |

*Prices for Various Sex Acts Figaro 1999*

**Appendix C The lamp-post sticker used by  
the campaign**





## Appendix D Advertisements for off-street sex workers



## Appendix E Number of transsexual and female prostitutes in Lyon

*Numbers of Street Sex Workers Figaro 1999*

**La prostitution de rue en chiffres à Lyon**

Ces chiffres ne prennent en compte que les prostituées fichées comme telles par les services de police.

|      | Prostitution masculine (travestis) | Prostitution féminine |
|------|------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1991 | 44                                 | 322                   |
| 1992 | 53                                 | 327                   |
| 1993 | 59                                 | 329                   |
| 1994 | 64                                 | 379                   |
| 1995 | 66                                 | 425                   |
| 1996 | 73                                 | 360                   |
| 1997 | 84                                 | 382                   |
| 1998 | 95                                 | 399                   |

Source: Le Figaro 2000

## Appendix F Ethical statement

### SEX WORK MIGRATION IN THE BALKANS

#### Ethical Statement

I will at all times maintain and protect my informants from any possible harm related to my contact with them. As such I will ensure total confidentiality regarding my informants. Where ever possible I will encrypt any notes or other documentation that is identifying.

I will not surrender or make available any identifying information to any authority or other person, without a valid court order that will be appealed in the first instance. I will reserve the right to be in contempt of court if I consider the circumstances require such action. I will not reveal information to any authority regarding any criminal activity that is revealed to me as the course of my research.

I will share non-identifying information and criminal methodology according to the regular academic and research conventions with other interested academics and researchers.

I will avoid direct participation in any criminal action or enterprise. I will seek to avoid implication in any criminal activity, and will familiarise myself with relevant legislation to that end. However I will be required to associate with various individuals who are involved in a variety of criminal activities, this association will be only for the purposes of my research.

As a participant observer I will seek to avoid any conflict of interest that could compromise the value of my research. In particular I will seek to avoid any role that would require me to act within the arena of my research as a vital or key element.

In the event of any ethical dilemma not dealt with by this statement I will consult with my supervisors at the earliest possibility for guidance and advice.

I believe the role of participant observer in my area of research offers on-going opportunities for ethical conundrums. I will seek at all time "to do no harm", and to be guided by principles that regard the individual as unique and deserving of utmost consideration in accordance with such conventions and laws as protect the weak and vulnerable.

I am not an agent of any state or a conscripted proxy and as such I am neither required nor willing to proactively seek or represent any state's concerns during my research. I am neither qualified nor competent to judge intricate legal issues regarding many individual circumstances and as such it would be inappropriate for me to comment or take any other action that could precipitate prejudicial treatment of any informant.

Signed



John Davies  
Student

Approved



Dr Richard Black  
CDE Director/Supervisor



Professor Tony Hilding  
Co-Supervisor

## Appendix G The researcher's map of Lyon



*Work areas in boxes; work places indicated with pins; accommodation locations are Perache (centre) and Hotel Brottraux (upper right)*

## Appendix H Social matrix of the trafficking order in Lyon

### KEY

---

|               |                    |                      |                          |
|---------------|--------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|
| M = married   | NM = not married   | R = return           | NR = non-return          |
| N = No        | SS = self-solution | Cab = Cabiria        | VP = vice police         |
| R = rural     | U = urban          | R-U = rural to urban | <8 or fewer years        |
| 8 = 8-9 years | 10 = 10-11 years   | 12 = 12 years        | 12+ = more than 12 years |
| R = Roma      | I= non-Roma        |                      | ? unknown                |

---

| Nr. | Name | Aprox. age on arrival | Date of arrival | Marriage status on arrival | Marriage status 2001 | Migration objective on arrival |
|-----|------|-----------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|
| 8   | A1   | 18                    | 1998            | M                          | NM                   | R                              |
| 19  | A2   | 19                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 45  | A3   | 18                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 3   | B1   | 19                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 46  | B2   | 22                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 35  | BE   | 18                    | 1999            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 34  | BL   | 23                    | 1999            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 51  | BLE  | 25                    | 2001            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 49  | BML  | 21                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 4   | CT   | 28                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 26  | D1   | 24                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 28  | D2   | 23                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 47  | D3   | 23                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 24  | E1   | 24                    | 2000            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 30  | E2   | 24                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 42  | E3   | 19                    | 2000            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 48  | E4   | 23                    | 1999            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 1.  | EK   | 19                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 15  | F1   | 23                    | 1999            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 16  | I1   | 19                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 18  | I2   | 26                    | 1999            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 6   | J1   | 20                    | 1999            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 7   | J2   | 20                    | 1999            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 14  | J3   | 20                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 17  | KN   | 38                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 9   | L1   | 20                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 22  | L2   | 27                    | 1999            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 33  | L3   | 22                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 38  | L4   | 23                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 58  | L5   | 20                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 13  | M1   | 21                    | 2000            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 29  | M2   | 19                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |
| 36  | M3   | 26                    | 2000            | M                          | NM                   | R                              |
| 40  | M4   | 25                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 41  | M5   | 25                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 53  | M6   | 20                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 23  | N1   | 23                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 37  | N2   | 29                    | 2000            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 55  | P1   | 20                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | ?                              |
| 56  | P2   | 21                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | ?                              |
| 57  | P3   | 22                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | ?                              |
| 10  | R1   | 23                    | 1999            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 11  | R2   | 20                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 31  | R3   | 20                    | 1999            | M                          | M                    | R                              |
| 5   | S1   | 20                    | 1998            | M                          | M                    | NR                             |
| 25  | S2   | 19                    | 2000            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 32  | S3   | 20                    | 1999            | M                          | NM                   | NR                             |
| 52  | S4   | 20                    | 2000            | NM                         | NM                   | NR                             |
| 54  | S5   | 23                    | 2001            | NM                         | NM                   | R                              |

| Migration objective in 2001 | Location             | Trafficking solution | Ethnicity | Place of origin | Years of education |
|-----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------|-----------------|--------------------|
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | SS                   | I         | U               | 8                  |
| R                           | Pasteur              | SS                   | I         | U               | 10                 |
| NR                          | Pasteur              | SS                   | I         | R               | 8                  |
| R                           | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Pasteur              | N                    | I         | R               | 8                  |
| R                           | Gerland              | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Gerland              | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| R                           | Lyon-South           | SS                   | I         | U               | 12                 |
| NR                          | Gerland              | VP                   | I         | U               | 10                 |
| NR                          | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | R-U             | 8                  |
| R                           | Lyon-South           | SS                   | I         | U               | 12                 |
| R                           | Lyon-South           | N                    | I         | U               | <8                 |
| NR                          | Pasteur              | N                    | I         | R               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | Cab                  | I         | U               | 12+                |
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | SS                   | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-North Left Bank | N                    | R         | U               | 8                  |
| R                           | Pasteur              | N                    | I         | U               | 10                 |
| R                           | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Perrache/Pasteur     | SS                   | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Perrache/Pasteur     | N                    | R         | U               | <8                 |
| NR                          | Pasteur              | Cab                  | I         | U               | 12+                |
| NR                          | Lyon-Central         | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | U               | 12                 |
| NR                          | Lyon-North Left Bank | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| R                           | Pasteur              | SS                   | I         | U               | 12+                |
| NR                          | Lyon-North Left bank | N                    | I         | U               | 12                 |
| R                           | Lyon-South           | SS                   | I         | U               | 12                 |
| NR                          | Perrache             | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| R                           | Pasteur              | N                    | I         | R               | 8                  |
| R                           | Perrache             | N                    | I         | U               | <8                 |
| NR                          | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | N                    | I         | U               | 10                 |
| NR                          | Gerland              | SS                   | R         | U               | 12                 |
| NR                          | Gerland              | N                    | I         | R               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Gerland              | N                    | I         | R               | 8                  |
| NR                          | deported             | N                    | I         | ?               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-Central         | SS                   | I         | U               | 12                 |
| R                           | Gerland              | SS                   | I         | R               | 8                  |
| ?                           | Gerland Left Bank    | N                    | I         | U               | ?                  |
| ?                           | Gerland Left Bank    | N                    | I         | ?               | ?                  |
| ?                           | Gerland Left Bank    | N                    | I         | ?               | ?                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-North Left bank | N                    | I         | U               | 8                  |
| NR                          | Lyon-North           | SS                   | I         | U               | 12+                |
| NR                          | Gerland/Perrache     | N                    | R         | U               | <8                 |
| NR                          | Lyon-North           | N                    | I         | U               | 10                 |
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | N                    | I         | U               | 12                 |
| NR                          | Gerland/Perrache     | VP                   | I         | U               | 12+                |
| NR                          | Lyon-South           | N                    | I         | U               | ?                  |
| R                           | Lyon-South           | N                    | I         | U               | 10                 |

| <b>Nr.</b> | <b>Name</b> | <b>Aprox.<br/>age on<br/>arrival</b> | <b>Date of<br/>arrival</b> | <b>Marriage<br/>status on<br/>arrival</b> | <b>Marriage<br/>status<br/>2001</b> | <b>Migration<br/>objective<br/>on arrival</b> |
|------------|-------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|---|
| 50         | SmV         | 20                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | NR  |
| 20         | T1          | 20                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | R   |
| 39         | T2          | 24                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | NR  |
| 27         | V1          | 25                                   | 2000                       | M   | NM                                  | NR  |
| 43         | V2          | 16                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | ?   |
| 44         | V3          | 17                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | ?   |
| 12         | VT          | 16                                   | 2001                       | NM  | NM                                  | R   |
| 2          | Z1          | 33                                   | 1998                       | M   | NM                                  | R   |
| 21         | Z2          | 22                                   | 2000                       | NM  | NM                                  | R   |



| <b>Migration objective in 2001</b> | <b>Location</b> | <b>Trafficking solution</b> | <b>Ethnicity</b> | <b>Place of origin</b> | <b>Years of education</b> |
|------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------|------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|
| NR                                 | Pasteur         | N                           | I                | ?                      | 10                        |
| R                                  | Pasteur         | N                           | I                | U                      | 10                        |
| NR                                 | Gerland         | SS                          | I                | R                      | 10                        |
| NR                                 | Lyon-South      | N                           | I                | U                      | 12+                       |
| ?                                  | Perrache        | N                           | I                | ?                      | <8                        |
| ?                                  | Perrache        | N                           | I                | ?                      | <8                        |
| R                                  | Lyon-North      | N                           | I                | U                      | 8                         |
| NR                                 | Gerland         | SS                          | R                | U                      | <8                        |
| R                                  | Pasteur         | N                           | R                | U                      | <8                        |



## References

- AAGW (2005a). 'Lesson Plan #1: Introduction to the Problem of Human Trafficking'. *Anti-Trafficking Educational Curriculum High School*. Tirana: Association of Albanian Girls and Women.
- AAGW (2005b). 'The Problem'. *Anti-Trafficking Educational Curriculum High School*. Tirana: Association of Albanian Girls and Women.
- ACD (1995). *International Migration of Women: A Study on Causes and Consequences, a Study on Migrant Women of Shibgonj under Chapai Nawabganj District in Bangladesh*. Rajshahi: Association for Community Development.
- ACD (2001). *Paradigms of Women Trafficking in Bangladesh*. Rajshahi: Association for Community Development.
- Adams, N. (2003). 'Anti-trafficking legislation: Protection or deportation?', *Feminist Review* 73(1): 135-139.
- ADB (2003). *Combating Trafficking of Women and Children in South Asia: Guide for Integrating Trafficking Concerns into ADB Operations*. Manila: Asian Development Bank.
- Adepoju, A. (2004). 'Trends in international migration in and from Africa', in *International Migration Prospects and Policies in a Global Market*, D. Massey and J. Taylor (eds.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Aftab, A. (2005). 'Using a dynamic, interactive and participatory process to develop and redefine the human trafficking paradigm in Bangladesh' in *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered*, K. Kempadoo, J. Sangera and B. Pattaniak (eds.), 199-211. London: Paradigm Publishers.
- AfW, (2003). *Legal Agenda for Migrant Prostitutes and Trafficked Women on the Internet*. Hamburg: Amnesty for Women Städtegruppe Hamburg e.V. <[www.amnestyforwomen.de/eu\\_projekte\\_en.html#femmigration](http://www.amnestyforwomen.de/eu_projekte_en.html#femmigration)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Agustín, L. (2003). 'Sex, gender and migrations: Facing up to ambiguous realities', *Soundings Spring*(23): 84-98.
- Agustín, L. (2005). 'Migrants in the Mistress' House: Other Voices in the "Trafficking" Debate'. *Social Policy* 12(1): 96-117.
- Agustín, L. (2006). 'The Disappearing of a Migration Category: Migrants who sell Sex'. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 32(1).
- Alban, B. (2002) *Albania: New Shelter Opens as Trafficking on the Rise*. Vienna: Radio Free Europe.
- Allen, T. (2004). *T Visas: The Refugee Industry's Latest Racket*. <[www.VDare.com](http://www.VDare.com)>. [Accessed 19 October 2005].
- Altink, S. (1995). *Stolen Lives: Trading Women into Sex and Slavery*. London: Scarlet Press.
- ALUdD (2000). *General Paper on Cultural Mediation NP2*. Milan, Italy, Libera Università delle Donne. <[www.linda.it/nuova\\_pa3.htm](http://www.linda.it/nuova_pa3.htm)> [Accessed 1 July 2003].
- Amnesty International (2005). *Patterns of Impunity in French Police Abuse*. London: Amnesty International.
- Amnesty International (2006). *Albania: Violence Against Women in the Family: 'It's Not Her Shame' Summary*. London: Amnesty International.
- Andrijašević, R. (2003). 'The difference borders make: (Il)legality, migration and trafficking in Italy among East European women in prostitution', in *Uprootings/Regroundings: Questions of Home and Migration*, S. Ahmed, C. Castaneda, A. Fortier and M. Sheller (eds.). Oxford and New York: Berg.

- Andrijasevic, R. (2004). *Trafficking in Women and the Politics of Mobility in Europe*. College voor Promoties. Utrecht: University of Utrecht.
- Annan, K. (2002). *Secretary-General Calls Human Trafficking 'One of the Greatest Human Rights Violations of Today'*. Abuja: UNIS.
- Aron, L. (1991). 'The Russians are coming: Millions of Soviet refugees will be fleeing to the West', *The Heritage Foundation Policy Review* 58: 44.
- ASG, (2006). 'Sex workers refuse rehabilitation, want to continue', *Asian Sex Gazette* 29 March.
- Ashcroft, J. (2003). *Trafficking is a Transnational Criminal Enterprise*. Washington, D.C.: Department of Justice. <[www.usdoj.gov/trafficking.htm](http://www.usdoj.gov/trafficking.htm)>. [Accessed 19 October 2005].
- Ashcroft, J. (2004). *Trafficking Numbers and Profits*. Washington, D.C.: Department of Justice. <<http://tokyo.usembassy.gov/e/p/tp-20050111-37.html>>. [Accessed 19 October 2005].
- ASI (2003a). *Trafficking Worldwide and in Albania*. London: Anti-Slavery International.
- ASI (2003b). *Migration Trafficking Nexus*. London: Anti-Slavery International.
- Asia Foundation (2006). *Case Study: Twenty-Four-Year Prison Sentence for a Human Trafficker*. Washington, D.C.: Asia Foundation.
- Baban, A. (2004). *Domestic Violence and Albanian Women*. Tirana: UNICEF.
- Baldwin-Edwards, M. (2001). *Crime and Migrants: Some Myths and Realities*. International Police Association 17th Greek Section Conference. Samos: Open University.
- Bales, K. (1999). *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy*. London: University of California Press.
- Ballauri, E., J. Vojkollari, et al. (1997). *Prostitution: Society in Dilemma*. Tirana: Useful to Albanian Women Association.
- Balliet, C. (2006). 'Responsibilities of the destination country', in *Forced Migration Review* 25 May, T. Morris and M. Couldrey (eds.), 28-30. Oxford: Refugee Studies Centre.
- Bangladesh Thematic Group (2004). *Revisiting the Human Trafficking Paradigm: The Bangladesh Experience Part I: Trafficking of Adults*. Geneva: IOM.
- Barjaba, K. (2000). 'Contemporary Patterns in Albanian Emigration', *South East European Review for Labour and Social Affairs* 3(2): 57-64.
- Barry, K. (1979). *Female Sexual Slavery*. New York: New York University Press.
- Barry, K. (1995). *The Prostitution of Sexuality*. New York: New York University Press.
- BBC (2000). 'French prostitutes protest to PM', *BBC news online*, London. 19 October. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/979126.stm>>. [Accessed January 2005].
- BBC (2001). "'Glorious" Lucie laid to rest', *BBC news online*, London. 29 March. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/uk/1249865.stm>>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- BBC (2003a). 'Gypsy king's daughter is sad child bride', *BBC news online*, London. 29 September. <[news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/3148364.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/3148364.stm)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- BBC (2003b). 'Two illegal immigrants stopped', *BBC news online*, London. 13 October. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/3187346.stm>>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- BBC (2006). 'Albania targets speedboat outlaws', *BBC news online*, London. 4 April. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/4877272.stm>>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Beare, M. (1999). 'Illegal migration: Personal tragedies, social problems, or national security threats?', in *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex*, P. Williams (ed.). London: Frank Cass.
- Belser, P. (2005). *Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits*. Geneva: ILO.
- Benabou, E. (1987). *La Prostitution et la Police des Moeurs au Dixhuitième Siècle*. Paris: Librairie Académique Perrin.

- Bennett, C. (2005) 'It's all very well condemning the sex traffickers, but what about the punters who keep the trade going?', *The Guardian*, London. 20 October. <[www.guardian.co.uk/Columnists/Column/0,5673,1596294,00.html](http://www.guardian.co.uk/Columnists/Column/0,5673,1596294,00.html)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Berliere, J. (1992). *La police des Moeurs sous la Troisième République*. Paris: Seuil.
- Berman, J. (2003). '(Un)popular strangers and crises (un)bounded: Discourses of sex trafficking, the European political community and the panicked state of the modern state', *European Journal of International Relations* 9(1): 37-86.
- Best, J. (1989). *Images of Issues: Typifying Contemporary Social Problems*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter.
- Bienstock, R. (2006). 'Sex Slaves', *Frontline*. Boston: WGBH. <[www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/slaves/etc/script.html](http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/slaves/etc/script.html)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Bindel, J. (2004). 'Trafficking for prostitution – A policy dilemma?', *Gender Equality News*. London: British Council.
- Bindman, J. & J. Doezema (1998). *Redefining Prostitution as Sex Work on the International Agenda*. London: ASI and NSWP.
- Black, R. (1996). 'Immigration and social justice: Towards a progressive European immigration policy?', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 21: 64-75.
- Black, R. (2003). 'Breaking the convention: Researching the "illegal" migration of refugees to Europe', *Antipode* 35(1): 34-54.
- Black, R. & K. Koser. (2000). *The Mobilisation and Participation of Transnational Exile Communities in Post-Conflict Reconstruction: A Comparison of Bosnia and Eritrea*. Brighton: ERSC/SCMR.
- Black, R., et al. (2004). 'Migration and pro-poor policy in West Africa', *Working Paper C8*. Brighton: Sussex Centre for Migration Research.
- Blanchet, T. (2002). *Beyond boundaries: A Critical Look at Women Labour Migration and the Trafficking Within*. Dhaka: Drishti Research Centre.
- Bluzet, J. (1902). *La Prostitution Officielle Et La Police Des Moeurs*.
- Bonnet, F. (2006). *Social Control and Identity: Explaining the Criminalization of Immigrants in Lyon and Milan*. PIIRS Conference, Princeton University.
- Bradshaw, J. (1988). *Bradshaw on the family*. Pompano Beach: Health Communications.
- Brennan, D. (2005). 'Methodological challenges in research with trafficked persons: Tales from the field', *International Migration* 43(1): 35-54.
- Brissenden, M. (2001). 'Albania – Sex Slaves', *ABC NEWS* 22 August. <[www.abc.net.au/foreign/stories/s361850.htm](http://www.abc.net.au/foreign/stories/s361850.htm)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Brown, L. (2000). *Sex Slaves: The Trafficking of Women in Asia*. London: Virago-Asia Books.
- Brussa, L. (1999). *Health, Migration, Sex Work: The Experience of TAMPEP*. Amsterdam: TAMPEP International Foundation.
- Bumiller, E. (2003) 'Evangelicals sway White House on human rights issues abroad', *New York Times*, New York. 26 October.
- Burkhalter, H. (2004). 'The politics of AIDS: Engaging conservative activists'. *Foreign Affairs* January/February.
- Bush, G. (2005). *Remarks by President Bush at Signing of H.R. 972, Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2005*. Washington, D.C.: White House Press Office.
- Butcher, K. (2003). 'Confusion between prostitution and sex trafficking', *The Lancet* 361 (9373): 1983.
- Butler, J. (1999). *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. London: Routledge.
- Bylander, M. (2006). *Circular Traffic: Exploring Repeat Migration Among Trafficked Women*. IASFM 10. Toronto: York University.

- Cabiria (2000a). *Rapport d'Activite 1999*. Lyon: Cabiria.
- Cabiria (2000b). *Rapport Intermediaire sur la Situation des Femmes venant d'Europe de L'Est*. Lyon: Cabiria.
- Cabiria (2001). *Rapport d'Activite 2000*. Lyon: Cabiria.
- Campani, G. (1998). 'Trafficking for sexual exploitation and the sex business in the new context of international migration: The case of Italy', *South European Society and Politics* 3(3): 230-261.
- Cameron, K. (2002). 'A model of dialogue and conscientization: A pedagogical paradigm for justice'. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education* 13(1): 1-23.
- Carletto, G., B. Davis, et al. (2006). 'Familiar Faces, Familiar Places: The Role of Family Networks and Previous Experience for Albanian Migrants. Poverty, Vulnerability and Migration Choice', IMISCOE A2 workshop, Geneva, IMISCOE A2.
- Carletto, G., B. Davis, et al. (2004). 'Internal Mobility and International Migration in Albania, Working Papers 04-13', Tirana: Agricultural and Development Economics Division of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO-ESA).
- Carletto, G., et al. (2006). *Moving Away from Poverty: A Spatial Analysis of Poverty and Migration in Albania*. Poverty, Vulnerability and Migration Choice Workshop. Geneva, IMISCOE A2/DRC Sussex on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
- Carnes, T. (2000). "'Odd Couple" politics', *Christianity Today* March.
- Castaldo, A. & B. Reilly. (2006). *How Do Migrant Remittances Affect the Expenditure Patterns of Albanian Households? Poverty, Vulnerability and Migration Choice Workshop*. Geneva, IMISCOE A2/DRC Sussex on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
- Castles, S., et al. (1984). *Here for Good: Western Europe's New Ethnic Minorities*. London: Pluto Press.
- Cermak, T. (1986). *Diagnosing and Treating Co-Dependency*. Minneapolis: Johnson Institute Books.
- Chambers, R. (1997). *Whose Reality Counts?: Putting the First Last*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications.
- Chant, S. (1995). *Women of a Lesser Cost: Female Labour, Foreign Exchange and Philippine Development*. London: Pluto Press.
- Chapkis, W. (1997). *Live Sex Acts: Women Performing Erotic Labour*. London: Cassell.
- Chapkis, W. (2003). 'Trafficking, migration and the law protecting innocents, punishing immigrants', *Gender and Society* 17(6): 923-937.
- CHGE (2003). *US Attack on Sex Worker Programs*. Centre for Health and Gender Equity. <[www.genderhealth.org](http://www.genderhealth.org)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Chomsky, N. & E. Herman. (1994). *Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media*. London: Vintage.
- Choudhury, B. (2003). 'Warning over Albanian gangster menace', *BBC news online*, London, 3 July. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk\\_news/3040388.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/uk_news/3040388.stm)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- CHRC (2001). *CHRC Members' Briefing: Trafficking of Women and Children*. Washington, D.C.: Congressional Human Rights Caucus.
- CoE (1997). *Recommendation 1325 on the Traffic in Women and Forced Prostitution*. Strasbourg, France: Council of Europe.
- CoE (2002). *Recommendation 1545 Campaign Against Trafficking in Women*. Strasbourg, France: Council of Europe.
- CoE (2005). *Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*. Warsaw: Council of Europe.
- Collyer, M. (2001). *Is There Any Difference between Documented and Undocumented Migration?* 7th IRAP Conferences, Johannesburg, South Africa.
- Collyer, M. (2005). 'When do social networks fail to explain migration?', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 31(4): 699-718.

- Collyer, M. (2006). *How Does a Culture of Migration Affect Motivations for Migration? Poverty, Vulnerability and Migration Choice Workshop*. Geneva, IMISCOE A2/DRC Sussex on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
- Commonwealth Secretariat (2003). *Best Practice: Report of the Expert Group on Strategies for Combating the Trafficking of Women and Children*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat: Human Rights Unit.
- Cordell, D., et al. (1996). *Hoe and Wage: A Social History of a Circular Migration System in West Africa*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Corrin, C. (2004). *Local Particularities – International Generalities: Traffic in Women in Central and South Eastern Europe*. European Consortium for Political Research. Copenhagen: Politics Department, Glasgow University.
- CPL (2000). *Appel à Entrer en Resistance contre L'Europe Proxeneté*. Montrouge: Movement Du Nid.
- Crago, A. (2003). *Unholy Alliance*. Alternet.org. <[www.alternet.org/rights/15947](http://www.alternet.org/rights/15947)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Crane, K. (2001). 'Italian haven offers hope to trafficked women', *The Christian Science Monitor* 1 November. <[www.csmonitor.com/2001/1101/p7s2-woeu.html](http://www.csmonitor.com/2001/1101/p7s2-woeu.html)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Crouse, J. (2003). *The Scourge of Sexual Trafficking: America's Other War and Its Coalition of Willing Combatants*. Washington, D.C.: Concerned Women for America.
- Crow, G., et al. (2004). 'Informed Consent and the Research Process: Following Rules and Striking Balances', Paper presented at the 'Sociological Challenges: Conflict, Anxiety and Discontent', British Sociological Association Conference, University of York, University of Southampton.
- Daily Reports (2006). 'In the courts: U.S. policy requiring overseas HIV/AIDS groups to condemn commercial sex work violates free speech, district judge rules', *Daily Women's Health Policy*. Washington, D.C.: Daily Reports.
- Daly, C. (2001). 'Anti-trafficking policies and programs in Nepal may infringe on women's rights', *Population Briefs* 7(4): 1, 8.
- Davies, J. (2001). *Experiences of Rehabilitation: Foreign and Albanian Trafficked Women, Trafficking in Albania*. Korce: Morava Foundation.
- Davies, J. (2003). 'What is wrong with fighting sexual exploitation?', *South Asian Trafficking List-serve*.
- Daywalka (2006). *Trafficking and HIV/AIDS*. Kathmandu: The Daywalka Foundation.
- Dear, G. (1996). *Violence and the Codependency Model. International Victimology: Selected papers from the 8th International Symposium*. C. Sumner, M. Israel, M. O'Connell and R. Sarre. Canberra: Australian Institute of Criminology.
- Dear, G. & C. Roberts. (2002) 'The relationships between codependency and femininity and masculinity', *Sex Roles: A Journal of Research* 46(5-6): 159-165.
- De Jong, C. & R. Gardner (eds.) (1981). *Migration Decision Making: Multidisciplinary Approaches to Micro-level Studies in Developed and Developing Countries*. New York: Perfa-mon.
- Delacoste, F. A. (1987). *Introduction: Sex Work: Writings by Women in the Sex Industry*. San Francisco: Cleis Press.
- Derks, A. (2000). 'From white slaves to trafficking survivors notes on the trafficking debate', The Centre for Migration and Development Working Paper Series.
- De Soto, H., et al. (2005). *Roma and Egyptians in Albania*. Tirana: World Bank.
- De Soto, H. & I. Gedeshi. (2002). *Dimensions of Romani Poverty in Albania*. Budapest: European Roma Rights Center.
- De Soto, H., et al. (2002). *Poverty in Albania*. Tirana: The World Bank.
- De Stoop, C. (1992). *Ze Zijn Zo Lief, Meneer*. Amsterdam: Uitgeverij Kritik.

- DG-J&HA (2005). *EU Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings and the Sexual Exploitation of Children*. Brussels: DG Justice and Home Affairs.
- Dholakia, L. (2003). *Column 1119: Adding Albania to the White List*. London: Hansard.
- Diamantopoulou, A. (2001). *Poverty to Slavery: The Misery Behind the Fantasy*. Information event on trafficking in women. Brussels: DG Employment and Social Affairs.
- Dobash, R. E. & R. P. Dobash (1987). 'Violence towards wives', in *Coping with Disorder in the Family*, J. Orford (ed.), 169-193. Kent: Croom Helm.
- Dobriansky, P. (2005). 'Fighting human trafficking, major commitment of Bush administration', *Morocco Times*, Rabat. 14 June. <[www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/48724.htm](http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/48724.htm)>. [Accessed 7 July 2006].
- Dóczy, B. (2003). 'Consuming money'. *Budapest Sun*, Budapest. 5 June.
- Doezema, J. (2000a). 'Loose women or lost women? The re-emergence of the myth of "white slavery" in contemporary discourses of "trafficking in women"', *Gender Issues* 18(1): 23-50.
- Doezema, J. (2000b). *Sex Slaves and Discourse Masters: The Historical Construction of 'Trafficking in Women'*. Research Outline Seminar, IDS, University of Sussex.
- Doezema, J. (2002). 'Who gets to choose? Coercion and consent and the UN trafficking protocol', in *Gender, Trafficking and Slavery*, R. Masika (ed.), 20-28. London: Oxfam.
- Doole, C. (2001). 'Albania blamed for human trafficking: Gangs use Albania to lure women into prostitution', *BBC news online*. 17 April. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/europe/1281816.stm>> [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Dudgeon, O. (2005). 'Women "sold for sex and raped" Court told Albanian traffickers duped two Lithuanians', *Yorkshire Post*. York. 20 September. <[www.yorkshiretoday.co.uk/ViewArticle2.aspx?SectionID=55&ArticleID=1194984](http://www.yorkshiretoday.co.uk/ViewArticle2.aspx?SectionID=55&ArticleID=1194984)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Dunn, A. (2006). 'In the anteroom of hell: Adam Dunn interviews Victor Malarek on his book, *The Natashas*', *Cobrapost News Features* 6 January.
- Durham, M. E. (2000). *High Albania: A Victorian Traveller's Balkan Odyssey*. London: Phoenix.
- Dushi, A. (2006). 'Vëllezërit e shumëkërkuar qëllonjë mbi policinë', *Shekulli*. Tirana. 21 July. <[www.shekulli.com.al/index.php?page=lajmedite&newsID=98638](http://www.shekulli.com.al/index.php?page=lajmedite&newsID=98638)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- EC (2001). *Trafficking in Women, The Misery Behind the Fantasy: From Poverty to Sex Slavery: A Comprehensive European Strategy*. Brussels: European Commission.
- EC (2003). 'Setting up a consultative group, to be known as the "Experts Group on Trafficking in Human Beings"', L 79/25 EN. *Official Journal of the European Union*. Brussels: European Commission.
- The Economist* (2005). 'Illegal immigration: Decapitating the snakeheads'. 6 October. <[www.economist.com/displaystory.cfm?story\\_id=E1\\_QQRRGVP](http://www.economist.com/displaystory.cfm?story_id=E1_QQRRGVP)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Ehrenreich, B. & A. Hochschild (eds.) (2003). *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. London: Granta Books.
- Eichenberger, J. (2003). *Combating Trafficking of Women and Children in South Asia*. Manila: Asian Development Bank.
- El-Cherkeh, T., E. Stribu, et al. (2004). *EU-Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe*. Hamburg: Hamburg Institute of International Economics.
- Elsie, R. (2001). *A Dictionary of Albanian Religion, Mythology, and Folk Culture*. New York: New York University.
- Empower (2003). 'A report on the Human Rights violations women are subjected to when "rescued" by anti-trafficking groups who employ methods using deception, force and coercion', T. A. S.-W. *Forum*. Bangkok: Empower.



- Engbersen, G. & J. Van der Leun (1998). 'Illegality and criminality: The differential opportunity structure of undocumented immigrants', in *The New Migration in Europe*, K. Koser and H. Lutz (eds.), 199-223. London: Macmillan Press.
- EuroPAP (2000). 'The European Network Final Report 1998-2000', London: Europap.
- Europol (2004a). *Trafficking Human Beings for Sexual Exploitation in the EU: A Europol Perspective*. The Hague: Europol.
- Europol (2004b). *What is Europol's Mandate*. The Hague: Europol. October 2004. <[www.europol.eu.int/index.asp?page=faq&language=>](http://www.europol.eu.int/index.asp?page=faq&language=>). [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Fals-Borda, O. (1969). *Subversion and Social Change in Colombia*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Fals-Borda, O. & M. Rahman (1991). *Action and Knowledge: Breaking the Monopoly with Participatory Action Research*. Cinep.
- Farley, M. (2003). *Prostitution, Trafficking and Traumatic Stress*. Binghamton: Haworth Maltreatment and Trauma Press.
- FdlE (1999). *The Shame of the French State in Exploiting Trafficked Women*. Lyon: Femmes de L'Est. <[www.friends-partners.org/partners/stop-traffic/1999/1307.html](http://www.friends-partners.org/partners/stop-traffic/1999/1307.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Feingold, D. (2005). 'Human trafficking', *Foreign Policy* September/October: 22-28.
- Fekete, L. (2001). *The Emergence of Xenophobia*. IRRNN. <[www.irr.org.uk/2001/september/akooooo1.html](http://www.irr.org.uk/2001/september/akooooo1.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Feldman, E. (1967). Prostitution, the alien woman and the progressive imagination 1910-1915'. *American Quarterly* 19(2): 192-206.
- Fielding, D. (2006). *Interview with Deborah Fielding: Poppy Project Frontline*. <[www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/slaves/needs/finding.html](http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/slaves/needs/finding.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Fishka, M. (2005). *House-to-House Awareness Raising with Rural Girls and Women Regarding Gender Issues and Knowledge of Potential Victims of Trafficking*. CAAHT 2005 Annual Conference, Sheraton Hotel, Tirana, Albania, Institute for Gender Applied Policies.
- Flamm, M. (2003). 'Exploited, not educated: Trafficking of women and children in South-east Asia', *UN Chronicle*.
- Foucault, M. (1991). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. London: Penguin.
- Foucault: M. (1993). *The Archaeology of Knowledge and The Discourse on Language*. New York: Barnes and Noble.
- Foulkes, I. (2005). "Trafficking hits "alarming" level", *BBC news online*, Geneva. 16 September. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/4253252.stm>>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Fraser, N. (1989). *Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: Continuum.
- Friebel, G. & S. Guriev (2002). *Human Trafficking and Illegal Migration*. Moscow: New Economic School and CEFIR.
- Friedlin, J. (2004). 'Debate roars over anti-trafficking funds', *Women's News* 16 April. <[www.womensnews.org/article.cfm/dyn/aid/1792](http://www.womensnews.org/article.cfm/dyn/aid/1792)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- FTS (2006). *Introduction to Modern Slavery*. Washington, D.C.: Free the Slaves.
- Futo, P. & M. Jandl (eds.) (2004). *2003 Year Book on Illegal Migration, Human Smuggling and Trafficking in CEE*. Vienna: International Centre for Migration Policy Development.
- GAATW (1999). *Human Rights in Practice: A Guide to Assist Trafficked Women and Children*. Bangkok: GAATW.
- Galiana, C. (2000). 'Trafficking in Women: Working Paper', in *Civil Liberties Series*, A. Subhan (ed.). Brussels: DG-Research European Parliament.

- GAO (2006). *Human Trafficking: Better Data, Strategy, and Reporting Needed*. Washington, D.C.: United States Government Accountability Office.
- Gery, Y. (1999). 'The Dark Side of Europe: Women for Sale', *Le Monde Diplomatique*, Paris. February. <<http://mondediplo.com/1999/02/15women>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Ghosh, B. (1998). *Huddled Masses and the Uncertain Shores: Insights into Irregular Migration*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Law International.
- Giammarinaro, M. (2002). *Trafficking in Women and Girls*. Glen Cove: UN expert group on trafficking in women and girls.
- Gilmore, T., et al. (1986). 'Action based modes of inquiry and the host-researcher relationship', *Consultation* 5(3): 161.
- Gradin, A. (1996). *Presentation on Trafficking in Women*. Conference on Trafficking in Women, European Commission.
- Granovetter, M. (1973). 'The Strength of Weak Ties', *American Journal of Sociology* 78(6): 1360-1380.
- Grillo, R. D. (1985). *Ideologies and Institutions in Urban France: The Representation of Immigrants*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hammersley, M. & P. Atkinson (eds.) (1995). *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. London: Routledge.
- Harrison, D. (2005). 'I was raped and beaten. I lost the will to run away', *Daily Telegraph*, London. 13 November. <[www.telegraph.co.uk/news/main.jhtml?xml=/news/2005/11/13/nprosi3.xml](http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/main.jhtml?xml=/news/2005/11/13/nprosi3.xml)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Harvey, O. (2005). 'Passport gangsters nailed', *The Sun*, London. 15 October. <[www.thesun.co.uk/article/0,,2-2005470529,00.html](http://www.thesun.co.uk/article/0,,2-2005470529,00.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Hatziprokopiou, H. (2003). 'Albanian migrants in Thessaloniki, Greece: Processes of economic and social incorporation', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 29(6): 1033-1059.
- Hayek, F. (1944). *The Road to Serfdom*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Healthlinks (2000). *Beyond Medical Interpretation: Developing an ICM Program*. Seattle: University of Washington. <[http://healthlinks.washington.edu/clinical/ethnromed/icm/icm\\_prog.html](http://healthlinks.washington.edu/clinical/ethnromed/icm/icm_prog.html)>. [Accessed July 2003].
- Heskin, A. & R. Heffner (1986). 'Learning about bilingual, multicultural organising', *ISSR Working Papers* 2(7). Los Angeles: Institute for Social Science Research, UCLA.
- Hindu (2002) 'Sex workers stand up for their rights', *The Hindu*, Delhi. 10 May. <[www.hindu.com/2002/05/10/stories/2002051006690400.htm](http://www.hindu.com/2002/05/10/stories/2002051006690400.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Home Office (2003a). *The Main Provisions of the Sexual Offences Act*. London: Home Office. October 2004.
- Home Office (2003b). *White List: Press Release*. London: Home Office. <[www.jcwi.org.uk/archives/ukpollcy/ho\\_17june03.pdf](http://www.jcwi.org.uk/archives/ukpollcy/ho_17june03.pdf)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Home Office (2006). *Tackling Human Trafficking: Consultation*. London: Home Office.
- Horowitz, M. (2006). 'Right abolitionism', *The American Spectator*. <[www.spectator.org/dsp\\_article.asp?art\\_id=9370](http://www.spectator.org/dsp_article.asp?art_id=9370)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- HRF (2002). 'Two-way solution to trafficking. Cross-border cooperation and enforcement of the law are the main gaps in efforts to check the problem', *Human Rights Features* 5(October-December).
- HRW (2000). *Owed Justice. Thai Women Trafficked into Debt Bondage in Japan*. New York: Human Rights Watch.
- HRW (2002). *U.S. State Department Trafficking Report Missing Key Data, Credits Uneven Efforts*. New York: Human Rights Watch.
- HRW (2006). *Campaign against the Trafficking of Women and Girls*. Washington, D.C.: Human Rights Watch.

- HSTC (2005). *Distinctions Between Human Smuggling and Human Trafficking*. Washington, D.C.: The Human Smuggling and Trafficking Centre at the U.S. Department of State.
- Hughes, D. (2000). 'The "Natascha" trade: The transnational shadow market of trafficking in women', *Journal of International Affairs* Spring.
- Hughes, D. (2002a). *The 2002 Trafficking In Persons Report: Lost Opportunity for Progress 'Foreign Government Complicity in Human Trafficking: A Review of the State Department's 2002 Trafficking in Persons Report'*. Washington, D.C.: House Committee on International Relations.
- Hughes, D. (2002b). *The Demand: The Driving Force of Sex Trafficking*. The Human Rights challenges of globalisation: The trafficking in persons. Honolulu: University of Hawaii.
- Hughes, D. (2006). 'The new abolitionist movement', *National Review Online* 26 January. [Accessed July 2006].
- Hughes, D. & C. Roche (eds.) (1999). *Making the Harm Visible*. CATW. <[www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/mhvtoc.htm](http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/mhvtoc.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- ICMPD (1999). *The Relationship between Organised Crime and Trafficking Aliens*. Vienna: International Centre for Migration Policy Development (Secretariat of the Budapest group).
- IFAD (2006). 'Rural poverty in Albania', IFAD, *Rural Poverty Portal*. <[www.ruralpovertyportal.org/english/regions/europe/alb/index.htm](http://www.ruralpovertyportal.org/english/regions/europe/alb/index.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- IFRC (2005). 'The most vulnerable: Human trafficking', *The Bridge*. <[www.ifrc.org/docs/pubs/insight/bridge-spring05.pdf#search=%22The%20most%20vulnerable%3A%20human%20trafficking%20bridge%22](http://www.ifrc.org/docs/pubs/insight/bridge-spring05.pdf#search=%22The%20most%20vulnerable%3A%20human%20trafficking%20bridge%22)>. [Accessed July 2006]
- IHRC (2000a). *Delegate Briefing Notes for the October Protocol Meeting*. Vienna: IHRC.
- IHRC (2000b). *Recommendations and commentary Art 1-3*. Vienna: Human Rights Caucus.
- Illiria, J. (1999). *I Don't Sell My Body Anymore Because I Can Sell Drugs*. Devoll: Morava Foundation. <[www.harmreduction.org/pubs/news/summer01/illiria.htm](http://www.harmreduction.org/pubs/news/summer01/illiria.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- ILO (1930). *Convention (No. 29) Concerning Forced Labour*. Geneva: ILO. <[www.unhcr.ch/html/menu3/b/31.htm](http://www.unhcr.ch/html/menu3/b/31.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- ILO (1999). *C182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention*. Geneva: ILO. <[www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/ratification/convention/text.htm](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/ratification/convention/text.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- ILO (2000). *A Process-Based Approach to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women*. Bangkok: ILO-IPEC.
- ILO (2001). *Labour Migration and Trafficking within the Greater Mekong Subregion: Proceedings of Mekong Subregional Experts Meeting and Exploratory Policy Paper*. Bangkok: ILO-IPEC.
- ILO (2002a). *Micro-Finance Interventions: Tools to Combat the Worst Forms of Child Labour including Trafficking*. Bangkok: ILO-IPEC.
- ILO (2002b). *Non-Formal Education and Rural Skills Training: Tools to Combat the Worst Forms of Child Labour including Trafficking*. Bangkok: ILO-IPEC.
- ILO (2003a). *Trafficking in Human Beings*. Geneva: ILO. <[www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.DOWNLOAD\\_BLOB?Var\\_DocumentID=1871](http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.DOWNLOAD_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=1871)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- ILO (2003b). *Trafficking of Women and Girls Booklet 6. Preventing Discrimination, Exploitation and Abuse of Women Migrant Workers*. Geneva: ILO.
- ILO (2005). 'Designing trafficking research from a labour market perspective', *International Migration* 43(1).

- IMADR (1998). *Strengthening the International Regime to Eliminate the Traffic in Persons and the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others*. Tokyo: IMADR.
- Inglis, C. (2003). *Australia Unveils Initiative to Stop Human Trafficking*. Washington, D.C.: Migration Policy Institute.
- INSTAT (2003). *Women and Men in Albania*. Tirana: INSTAT.
- INSTAT (2004). *Gender perspectives in Albania*. Tirana: INSTAT.
- Interpol (2002). *Albania: Ages for legal purposes*. Lyon: Interpol.
- Interpol (2006). *Trafficking in human beings*. Lyon: Interpol. <[www.interpol.int/Public/THB/default.asp](http://www.interpol.int/Public/THB/default.asp)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- IOM (1995). *The Growing Exploitation of Migrant Women from Central and Eastern Europe*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (1996). 'Trafficking in women to Italy for sexual exploitation', *Migration Information Programme*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (1998). *Research on the Awareness among Hungarian Girls of Trafficking Risks*. Budapest: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2001a). 'New IOM figures on the global scale of trafficking', *Trafficking in Migrants Bulletin* 23. International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2001b). *Victims of Trafficking in the Balkans*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2002a). *Return and Reintegration Project Situation Report (Kosova)*. Prishtina: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2002b). *You Pay for a Night: She Pays with Her Life, Forced Prostitution=Slavery: There is No Choice*. IOM Kosova. <[www.iom.ipko.org/Counter\\_trafficking/you\\_pay\\_3.htm](http://www.iom.ipko.org/Counter_trafficking/you_pay_3.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- IOM (2003a). *Albania: Return and Re-Integration: Assistance to Victims of Trafficking*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2003b). 'Targeting myths and misconceptions about irregular and regular migration'. *Quarterly bulletin*. Tirana: Public Information Office of International Organization for Migration.
- IOM (2004). *Changing Patterns and Trends of Trafficking in Persons in the Balkan Region*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration. Counter-Trafficking Service.
- IOM (2005). 'Data and research on human trafficking: A global survey', *International Migration* 43(1).
- IOM (2006). *Promoting Safe Migration and Preventing Human Trafficking in Albania*. Tirana: International Organization for Migration. <<http://iomtirana.org.al/index.php?faq=project11>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- IOM and ICMC (2001). *Research Report on Third Country National Trafficking Victims in Albania*. Tirana: Inter-Agency Referral System Project for Return and Reintegration Assistance to Victims of Trafficking. <[www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/albania\\_trafficking\\_report.pdf](http://www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/albania_trafficking_report.pdf)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- IOM and ICMC (2002). *2nd Research Report on Third Country National Trafficking Victims in Albania*. Tirana: Inter-Agency Referral System Project for Return and Reintegration Assistance to Victims of Trafficking.
- IOM Rome (2002). *Social Profiles of Trafficked Albanian Women Returned to Albania by IOM Rome*. Albanian Migration and New Transnationalisms. Brighton: Sussex University, Sussex Centre for Migration Research.
- Irish Ex (2006). 'Scottish students flying into prostitution: Gardaí', *Irish Examiner*. Dublin. 5 May. <[www.irishexaminer.com/breaking/story.asp?j=181691218&p=y8y69y924&n=181691978](http://www.irishexaminer.com/breaking/story.asp?j=181691218&p=y8y69y924&n=181691978)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Irwin, M. (1996). "'White' slavery as metaphor (anatomy of a moral panic)", *The History Journal* V. San Francisco: San Francisco State University.

- James, J. (1978). 'The prostitute as victim', in *The Victimisation of Women*, J. Chapman and M. Cates (eds.). Beverly Hills: Sage.
- Jandl, M. (2005). 'The Development-Visa Scheme: A proposal for a market-based migration control policy'. *Global Migration Perspectives*. Vienna: International Centre for Migration Policy Development: No. 36.
- Jardine, H. (2006). *Remarks of U.S. Consul General Henry V. Jardine on U.S. Efforts to Combat Trafficking in Women and Children*. Delhi: US Embassy India.  
<<http://calcutta.usconsulate.gov/07apr2006.html>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Jeannel, J. (1868). *De la Prostitution dans les Grandes Villes au Dix-neuvième Siècle et de l'Extinction des Maladies Vénériennes*. Paris: J.B. Baillière.
- Jeffries, S. (1997). *The Idea of Prostitution*. Melbourne: Spinifex.
- Kane, J. (2005). *Child Trafficking – The People Involved: A synthesis of findings from Albania, Moldova, Romania and Ukraine*. ILO-IPEC.
- Kempadoo, K., J. Sanghera & B. Pattanaik (2005) *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives On Migration, Sex Work, And Human Rights*. Boulder: Paradigm Books.
- Kangaspunta, K. (2003). 'Mapping the inhuman trade: Preliminary findings of the human trafficking database', *Forum on Crime and Society* 3.
- Karaiskaki, T. (2001). 'The modern slave trade: Forced prostitution', *Kathimerini English Edition*, Athens. 27 December: 12-27.
- Kasl, C. (1990). *Women, Sex, and Addiction*. New York: Harper Perennial.
- Katro, J. & L. Shamani (1999). *Prostitution and Trafficking of Women in Albania*. Tirana: Women in Development Association.
- Kelly, E. (2005). 'Lifestyles and integration of Albanian women in Bologna', in *The New Albanian Migration*, in R. King, N. Mai and S. Schwandner-Sievers (eds.), 29-64. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.
- Kelly, L. (2002a). *From Rhetoric to Curiosity: Urgent Questions from the UK about Responses to Trafficking in Women*. Stop the Traffic symposium. Melbourne: RMIT.
- Kelly, L. (2002b). *Journeys of Jeopardy: A Review of Research on Trafficking in Women and Children in Europe*. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- Kelly, L. (2005). "'You can find anything you want" A critical reflection on research on trafficking within and into Europe', *International Migration* 43(1): 235-265.
- Kempadoo, K. & J. Doezema (eds.) (1998). *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Re-definition*. New York: Routledge.
- Kempadoo, K., et al. (eds.) (2005). *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered*. London: Paradigm Publishers.
- Kemper, R. & J. Rollwagen. (1995). 'Urban Anthropology', in *Encyclopedia of Cultural Anthropology*, D. Levinson and M. Ember (eds.). Lakeville: American Reference Publishing.
- Khan, S. (1999). 'Albania: road to nowhere', USA. *ABC News*. <[www.abc.net.au/foreign/stories/s415381.htm](http://www.abc.net.au/foreign/stories/s415381.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- King, R. (2003). 'Across the sea and over the mountains: Documenting Albanian migration', *Scottish Geographical Journal* 119(3): 283-309.
- King, R. & K. Barjaba (2005). 'Introducing and theorising Albanian migration', in *The New Albanian Migration*, R. King, N. Mai and S. Schwandner-Sievers (eds.), 1-29. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.
- King, R. & N. Mai (2004). 'Albanian immigrants in Lecce and Modena: Narratives of rejection, survival and integration', *Population Space and Place* 10(6): 455-478.
- King, R. & J. Vullnetari. (2003). 'Migration and development in Albania'. *Working Paper C5*. Falmer: Development Research Centre on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty, University of Sussex.

- King, R., et al. (1998). 'A migrant's story: From Albania to Athens', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 24(1): 159-175.
- King, R., et al. (2003). *Exploding the Migration Myths*. London: The Fabian Society/Oxfam.
- King, R., et al. (2005). *The New Albanian Migration*. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.
- Kinnell, H. (2003). *Why Feminists Should Rethink on Sex Workers' Rights*, NSW and Info-shop. <[www.infoshop.org/inews/stories.php?story=03/05/20/6503511](http://www.infoshop.org/inews/stories.php?story=03/05/20/6503511)>. [Accessed 23 May 2004].
- Kirby, P. (2005a). 'Hidden victims of Albania's mafia', *BBC Radio 4's Crossing Continents*, London. 5 October. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/crossing\\_continents/4309454.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/crossing_continents/4309454.stm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Kirby, P. (2005b). 'Life in the shadow of the mafia', *BBC Radio 4's Crossing Continents*, London. 5 October. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/crossing\\_continents/4309454.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/programmes/crossing_continents/4309454.stm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Koinova, M. (2000). *Minorities in Southeast Europe: Roma of Albania*. Athens: Centre for Documentation and Information on Minorities in Europe – Southeast Europe (CE-DIME-SE).
- Korce TV (2003). 'Wanted hairdressers for local business'. *Korce TV Channel*, Albania.
- Korce TV (2004). 'Seamstresses needed for local business'. *Korce TV Channel*, Albania.
- Koser, K. (1997). 'Social networks and the asylum cycle: The case of Iranians in the Netherlands', *International Migration Review* 31(3).
- Koser, K. (2000). 'Asylum policies: Trafficking and vulnerability', in *Perspective on Trafficking of Migrants: International Migration* 38(3), journal offprint, R. Appleyard and J. Salt (eds.).
- Koser, K. (2001). 'The smuggling of asylum seekers into Western Europe: Contradictions, conundrums', in *Global Human Smuggling: Comparative Perspectives*, D. Kyle and R. Koslowski (eds.), 58-74. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Kosic, A. & A. Triandafyllidou (2003). 'Albanian immigrants in Italy: Migration plans, coping strategies and identity issues', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 29(6): 997-1015.
- Kosztolanyi, G. (1999). 'A green light to red-light districts: Recent developments in regulating prostitution in Hungary', *Central European Review* 1(22).
- Kvale, S. (1996). *Interviews: An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. London: Sage.
- Kyle, D., & R. Koslowski. (eds.) (2001). *Global Human Smuggling: Comparative Perspectives*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Laczko, F. (2002). *Human Trafficking: The Need for Better Data*. Washington, D.C.: Migration Policy Institute. 2004. <[www.migrationinformation.org/feature/print.cfm/ID=66](http://www.migrationinformation.org/feature/print.cfm/ID=66)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Laczko, F. (2005). 'Introduction. Data and research on human trafficking: A global survey', *International Migration* 43(1): 5-16.
- Langum, D. (1994). *Crossing over the Line: Legislating Morality and the Mann Act*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- LaShawn, J. (2003). *Letter to Colin Powell on the Trafficking in Persons Report 2003*. Washington, D.C.: Human Rights Watch.
- Lawson, A. (2004). 'Agencies "exploit" South Asian workers', *BBC news online South Asia desk*, London. 1 September. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south\\_asia/3618352.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/3618352.stm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Lazaridis, G. (1996). 'Immigration to Greece: A critical evaluation of Greek policy', *New Community* 22(2): 335-348.

- Lazaridis, G. (1999). 'The helots of the new millennium: Ethnic Greek-Albanians and 'Other' Albanians in Greece', in *Into the Margins: Migration and Exclusion in Southern Europe*, F. Anthias and G. Lazaridis (eds.), 105-121. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Lazaridis, G. (2000). 'Filipino and Albanian women migrant workers in Greece: Multiple layers of oppression', in *Gender and Migration in Southern Europe: Women on the Move*, Anthias, F. and G. Lazaridis (eds.), 49-79. New York: Berg.
- Le Figaro* (2000). 'Prostitution à Lyon: La guerre des trottoirs', *Figaro Rhones-Alpes*, Lyon. 5 February.
- Le Monde* (2000). 'Filles esclaves venues de l'Est', *Le Monde*, Paris. 30 November.
- Le Progrès* (1999a). 'La prostitution à Lyon', *Le Progrès*, Lyon. 23 December.
- Le Progrès* (1999b). 'Prostitution: Loi de la rue, loi de la jungle', *Le Progrès*. Lyon. 22 December.
- Legardinier, C. (2000). 'La prostitution', *Temoignage Chretien*. 1 June.
- Leigh, C. (1997). 'Inventing sex work', in *Whores and Other Feminists*, J. Nagle (ed.). New York: Routledge.
- Leigh, C. (2003). *Prostitution Law Reform: Defining Terms*. San Francisco: Prostitutes' Education Network. <[www.bayswan.org/defining.html](http://www.bayswan.org/defining.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Lempp, K. & A. Mansbrugge (1999). 'Cultural mediation in the public health service', *Health, Migration, Sex Work: The Experience of TAMPEP*. Amsterdam, TAMPEP: 215-254.
- Lesko, V. (2003). *Vera Lesko's Anti-Slavery Award acceptance speech*. London, Anti-Slavery International. <[www.anti-slaveryinternational.org/homepage/antislavery/award/verasppeech2003.htm](http://www.anti-slaveryinternational.org/homepage/antislavery/award/verasppeech2003.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Lesko, V. (2005a). *Assistance and Reintegration Work with Women and Girls from Minority Communities*. CAAHT 2005 Annual Conference, Sheraton Hotel, Tirana, Albania, Institute for Gender Applied Policies.
- Lesko, V. (2005b). *The Girls and the Trafficking*. Vlore: The Vatra Centre.
- Lesko, V., et al. (2004). *Shoqeria Shqiptare Perballe Sfidave te Trafikut te Grave dhe Vajzave*. Tirana, ISOP.
- Lesthaeghe, R. (2000). 'Europe's demographic issues: Fertility, household formation and replacement migration'. *Expert Group Meeting On Policy Responses To Population Ageing And Population Decline*, New York, 16-18 October, United Nations Secretariat, Population Division, Department of Economic and Social Affairs.
- Levchenko, K. (1998). 'New Ukrainian Law Against Trafficking in Women', Kiev: Stop-Traffic list-serve.
- L'Humanité* (2000). 'L'Exploitation au bout du fil', *L'Humanité*, Paris. 10 April.
- Limanowska, B. (2004). *Trafficking In Human Beings in South Eastern Europe*. Geneva: UNICEF.
- Londe, F. (2001). 'Eastern Europe exports flesh to the EU: The Natasha trade', *Le Monde diplomatique* (English-language online edition), Paris. December. <[www.uri.edu/arts-ci/wms/hughes/ukraine/eeeu.htm](http://www.uri.edu/arts-ci/wms/hughes/ukraine/eeeu.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Longo, P. (2004). 'Defending the term sex-work'. S. W. list-serve, NSWP. <<http://archives.hst.org.za/stigma-aids/msg00277.html>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Lorisika, I. & B. Peeters (2003). *ECHO Manual: Project Cycle Management*. Brussels: ECHO.
- Lynch, S. (2005). 'New U.S. policy requires Gfatm and Pefpar recipients to sign loyalty oath against sex workers'. Geneva: Health Gap. <[www.healthgap.org/press\\_releases/05/051705\\_HGAP\\_PR\\_USG\\_SWP\\_gfatm.html](http://www.healthgap.org/press_releases/05/051705_HGAP_PR_USG_SWP_gfatm.html)>. [Accessed January 2009].
- Lyon Capitale (2000). 'Proces des proxenetes Albanais', *Lyon Capitale*. Lyon. 29 November.
- Lyon Mag* (1999). 'Des prostituées Lyonnaises lancet une petition contre les filles de l'Est', *Lyon Mag* December.

- Lyon Mag* (2000). 'Une grande manifestation de prostituées à Lyon', *Lyon Mag* November.
- Lyon Mag* (2001a). 'Les filles de L'Est relèvent la tête', *Lyon Mag* January.
- Lyon Mag* (2001b). 'Texte de la petition envoyée au Procureur', *Lyon Mag* January.
- MAHR (1996). *Domestic Violence in Albania*. Minneapolis: Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights.
- Mai, N. (2001a). "Italy is beautiful": The role of Italian television in the Albanian migratory flow to Italy', in *Media and Migration: Constructions of Mobility and Difference*, R. King and N. Wood (eds.), 95-109. London: Routledge.
- Mai, N. (2001b). 'Transforming traditions: A critical analysis of the trafficking and exploitation of Albanian girls in Italy', in *The Mediterranean Passage Migration and New Cultural Encounters in Southern Europe*, R. King (ed.), 258-278. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.
- Mai, N. (2002). 'Myths and moral panics: Italian identity and the media representation of Albanian immigration', in *The Politics of Recognising Difference: Multiculturalism Italian Style*, R. Grillo and J. Pratt (eds.), 77-95. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Mai, N. (2003). *Between Losing and Finding Oneself: The Role of Italian Television in the Albanian Migration to Italy*. DPhil thesis. Sussex Centre for Migration Research. Brighton: University of Sussex.
- Mai, N. & S. Schwandner-Sievers (2003). 'Albanian migration and new transnationalisms', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 29(6): 939-949.
- Maiti Nepal (2004). *Surveillance for the Prevention of Trafficking*. Kathmandu: Maiti Nepal. <[www.friendsofmaitinepal.org/html/survey.htm](http://www.friendsofmaitinepal.org/html/survey.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Malarek, V. (2004). *The Natashas*. London: Vision.
- Maltzahn, K. (2003). *Puongtong Simaplee: The Death of a Trafficked Woman in Villawood*, Project Respect. <[www.projectrespect.org.au/resources/simaplee.pdf](http://www.projectrespect.org.au/resources/simaplee.pdf)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Marshall, P. (2001). *Globalisation, Migration and Trafficking: Some Thoughts from the South East Asian Region*. Globalisation. Kuala Lumpur: UNIAP.
- Marshall, P. & S. Thatun (2005a). 'Miles away: The trouble with prevention in the Greater Mekong Sub-Region', in *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered*, K. Kempadoo, J. Sangera and B. Pattaniak (eds.), 43-65. London: Paradigm Publishers.
- Marshall, P. (2005b). 'Raising our own awareness', *Asia-Pacific Population Journal* 20(3): 143-163.
- Martin, P., et al. (2002). 'Best practice options: Albania', *International Migration* 40(3): 103-118.
- Marzloff, P. (2000). 'Proxenetes Albanais: lourdes peines requises contre les précurseurs', *Le Progrès*. Lyon. 9 November.
- Massey, D. (1993). 'Theories of international migration: A review and appraisal', *Population and Development Review* 19(3): 431-466.
- Massey, D. & F. Riosmena (2004). *The New Economics of Return Labor Migration?: A Test on the Determinants of Return for Latin Americans in the U.S.* Boston: Population Association of America.
- Massimiliano, T. (2000). *Intercultural Eterobiography as Mediation Practice: Autobiography and Eterobiography in Researching the Life and Work of a Cultural Mediator*. Bologna: Department of Sciences of Education University of Bologna.
- Mathieu, L. (1996). *Cabiria: Elements d'Evaluation et de Reflexion apres Deux Ans et Demi de Fonctionnement*. Lyon: Les Traboules.
- Mathieu, L. (2000). *The Emergence and Failure of Prostitutes' Social Movements*. 28th joint session of workshops ECPR conference, Copenhagen.



- Mathieu, L. (2001). 'An unlikely mobilisation: The occupation of Saint Nizier church by the prostitutes of Lyon', *Revue Francaise de Sociologie* 42: 107-131.
- Mathieu, L. (2003). 'The Emergence and Uncertain Outcomes of Prostitutes' Social Movements', *European Journal of Women's Studies* 10(1): 29-50.
- Mathilde (2003). *La Prostitution A Lyon Et Dans Ses Faubourgs Dans La Premiere Moitie Du 19eme Siecle*. Paris: Feministes.net. <[www.feministes.net/prostitution\\_lyon.pdf](http://www.feministes.net/prostitution_lyon.pdf)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- McCarthy, J. & M. Zald (1997). 'Resource mobilisation and social movements: A partial theory', *Journal of Social Issues* 27: 81-104.
- McCauley, A. (1998). *Sexual Trafficking of Women and Children: Issues and Options for USAID*. Arlington: Health Technical Services USAID.
- McGill, C. (2003). *Human Traffic: Sex Slaves and Immigration*. London: VISION Paperbacks.
- McGivering, J. (2005). 'Trafficked to the West', *BBC news online*, Lithuania. 9 July. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/programmes/from\\_our\\_own\\_correspondent/4663841.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/programmes/from_our_own_correspondent/4663841.stm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- McIntyre, A. (1997). *Making Meaning of Whiteness: Exploring Racial Identity with White Teachers*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- McIntyre, D. (1984). 'Domestic violence: A case of the disappearing victim', *Australian Journal of Family Therapy* 5 (4): 249-258.
- MDI (2002). *No to the Prostitution Victims. But What Can They Do?* Tirana: Media Diversity Institute.
- Melzer, E. (2005). 'Trafficking in politics: Bush's strong rhetoric on sex slavery masks policy failures'. In *These Times*. <[www.religiousconsultation.org/News\\_Tracker/trafficking\\_in\\_politics.htm](http://www.religiousconsultation.org/News_Tracker/trafficking_in_politics.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Miriam, K. (2005). 'Stopping the traffic in women: Power, agency and abolition in feminist debates over sex trafficking'. *Social Philosophy* 36(1): 1-17.
- Monzini, P. (2004). *Migrant Smuggling via Maritime Routes*. Rome: Centro Studi di Politica Internazionale.
- Moore, B. (2000). *Migrant Sex Workers from Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union: The Canadian Case*. Toronto: Centre for Applied Social Research, University of Toronto.
- Morin, E. (1971). *Rumour in Orleans*. New York: Pantheon.
- Nagarajan, R. (2005). 'US accuses NGO of "trafficking"', *Hindustan Times* 29 September. <[www.hindustantimes.com/news/181\\_1504660,00050001.htm](http://www.hindustantimes.com/news/181_1504660,00050001.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- NATFP (1979). *North American Task Force on Prostitution*. New York: North American Task Force on Prostitution. <[www.bayswan.org/NTFP.html](http://www.bayswan.org/NTFP.html)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- NCJW (2005). *National Council of Jewish Women Rallies at United Nations to Call for End to Human Trafficking*. New York: NCJW.
- NCSU (2006). *Ethnographic Research*. Raleigh: North Carolina State University.
- Nir, O. (2004). 'U.S. official does "God's Work": Eradicating slavery', *Forward* 7 May. <[www.forward.com/main/article.php?ref=nir200405051053](http://www.forward.com/main/article.php?ref=nir200405051053)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Noble, R. (2001). *Opening address of Interpol General Secretary*. 16th Asian Regional Conference. Bangkok: Interpol. <[www.interpol.int/Public/ICPO/speeches/20010220.asp](http://www.interpol.int/Public/ICPO/speeches/20010220.asp)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Norad (1999). *The Logical Framework Approach*. Oslo: NORAD.
- Norwood, R. (1985). *Women Who Love Too Much*. London: Pocket Books.

- Nugent, H. (2005). 'Illegal migrant jailed for sex-slave ring', *The Times*, London. 23 February. <[www.timesonline.co.uk/article/04484-1496658,00.html](http://www.timesonline.co.uk/article/04484-1496658,00.html)>. [Accessed July 2006]
- O'Brien, R. (2001). 'Um exame da abordagem metodológica da pesquisa ação' ['An Overview of the Methodological Approach of Action Research'], in *Teoria e Prática da Pesquisa Ação [Theory and Practice of Action Research]*, R. Richardson (ed.). João Pessoa: Universidade Federal da Paraíba.
- O'Connell, C. (1996). 'Plight of France's Sans-Papiers gives a face to struggle over immigration reform', in *The Human Rights Brief*. Washington, D.C.: Washington College of Law, The Centre for Human Rights and Humanitarian Law.
- ODIHR (2003). *Assessment Trip to Albania on Trafficking in Children from Roma and Egyptian Communities*. Tirana: ODIHR CPRSI, 16-21 June.
- OMCTIP (2003). *The U.S. Government's International Anti-Trafficking Programs*. Washington, D.C.: Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.
- O'Neill Richard, A. (1999). *International Trafficking in Women to the United States; A Contemporary Manifestation of Slavery and Organised Crime*. DCI Exceptional Intelligence Analyst Program. Washington, D.C.: Centre for the Study of Intelligence.
- Orgocka, A. (2005). 'Albanian highly skilled women in the US', in *The New Albanian Migration*. R. King, N. Mai and S. Schwandner-Sievers (eds.), 139-153. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.
- OSCE (2002). *Declaration on Trafficking in Human Beings*. Porto: OSCE.
- OUP (1998). *Albanian English Dictionary*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Overs, C. and P. Longo (1997). *Making Sex Work Safe*. London: NSWP and AHRTAG.
- Oxman-Martinez, J., et al. (2005). 'Canadian policy of human trafficking', *International Migration* 43(4): 7-32.
- Papapanagos, H. & P. Sanfey (2002). *Albanian Emigration: Intentions Versus Actual Behaviour*. Strasbourg: European Bank for Reconstruction and Development.
- PBS (2004). *Dying to Leave*. Washington, D.C.: Educational Broadcasting Company. <[www.pbs.org/wnet/wideangle/shows/dying/map\\_albania.html](http://www.pbs.org/wnet/wideangle/shows/dying/map_albania.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Pearson, E. (2001). *Human Rights and Trafficking in Persons Handbook*. Bangkok: GAATW.
- Pearson, E. (2002). 'Half-hearted protection: What does victim protection really mean', in *Gender, Trafficking and Slavery*, R. Masika (ed.), 56-60. London: Oxfam.
- Pheterson, G. (1996). *The Prostitution Prism*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Phinney, A. (2001). *Trafficking of Women and Children for Sexual Exploitation in the Americas*. Washington, D.C.: Inter-American Commission of Women of the Organization of American States and the Women, Health and Development Program of the Pan American Health Organization 2001.
- Piguet, E. (2006). *Migration et Travail Décent*. Poverty, Vulnerability and Migration Choice Workshop. Geneva: IMISCOE A2/DRC Sussex on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty.
- Plant, R. (2003). *Trafficking in Destination Countries: The Forced Labour Dimensions*. ILO symposium on trafficking in human beings, Tokyo: International Labour Organization.
- Plant, R. (2004). *The Labour Dimensions of Human Trafficking. Alliance against Trafficking in Persons*. Vienna: International Labour Organization.
- Popova, D. (2006). *Service Providers with Women Migrants who Sell Sex*. Love, sexuality and migration workshop, University of Sussex, IMISCOE C8.
- Poppy (2004). *Basic Referral Information*. London: Eves Housing Association.

- Portes, A. (1997). *Globalisation from Below: The Rise of Transnational Communities*. Princeton: Princeton University.
- Pritchett Post, S. (1998). *Women in Modern Albania*. Jefferson: McFarland.
- ProProject (2005). *Albania: Trafficking Routes*. Washington, D.C.: Protection Project.
- PRSP (2000). *Albania: Interim Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Tirana: PRSP.
- Rajavi, M. (2003). *Urgent Appeal to Save Maryam Rajavi*. Toronto: Disabled Women's Network Ontario.
- Raufer, X. & S. Quéré (2000). *Une Menace pour l'Europe. La Mafia Albanaise*. Lausanne, Favre. <[www.balkans.eu/article2762.html](http://www.balkans.eu/article2762.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Raven, M. 1994. 'Codependency: Fact or Artefact?', in *Proceedings of the 1994 APSAD National Conference: Alcohol, Drugs and the Family*, J.W. Toumbourou (ed.), 191-196. Melbourne: Australian Drug Foundation.
- Raxhimi, A. (2004). 'Albania's Human Trafficking Tragedy', *Balkan Reconstruction Report*. Tirana. 19 January. <[www.tol.cz/look/BRR/article.tpl?IdLanguage=1&IdPublication=9&NrIssue=1&NrSection=1&NrArticle=11473](http://www.tol.cz/look/BRR/article.tpl?IdLanguage=1&IdPublication=9&NrIssue=1&NrSection=1&NrArticle=11473)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Raymond, J. (2004). *Ten Reasons for Not Legalizing Prostitution and a Legal Response to the Demand for Prostitution*. CATW. <<http://action.web.ca/home/catw/readingroom.shtml?x=32972>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- RCP (2003). *First Annual Report on the Victims of Trafficking in SEE*. Belgrade: Serbia Regional Clearing Point SPfSEE OSCE.
- Reilly, B., et al. (2005). *Who is Most Likely to Migrate From Albania?* DRC on Migration, Globalisation and Poverty. Brighton: University of Sussex.
- Renton, D. (2001a). *Child Trafficking in Albania*. London: Save the Children. <[www.wcc-coe.org/wcc/what/jpc/echoes/echoes-20-06.html](http://www.wcc-coe.org/wcc/what/jpc/echoes/echoes-20-06.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Renton, D. (2001b). *Summary: Child Trafficking in Albania*. London: Save the Children. <[www.wcc-coe.org/wcc/what/jpc/echoes/echoes-20-06.html](http://www.wcc-coe.org/wcc/what/jpc/echoes/echoes-20-06.html)> [Accessed July 2006].
- Richter-Malebotta, M. (2000). *Italy: From a Country with Traditional Emigration to a Country with Mass Immigration, What is the Role of the Cultural Mediator?* Roskilde: Roskilde University. <[www.educ.ruc.dk/phd/eng/courses/papers/dubrovrc.html](http://www.educ.ruc.dk/phd/eng/courses/papers/dubrovrc.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- RoA (1991). 'Civil Code of the Republic of Albania', *National Gazette*. Tirana: Republic of Albania.
- RoA (1995). 'Criminal Code of the Republic of Albania (No. 7895, January 1995, as amended by Law n. 8733 of January 2001)', *National Gazette*. Tirana: Republic of Albania.
- RoA (2004). 'Loi n 9188 du 12 février 2004 portant amendements et compléments à la loi n 7895 du 27 janvier 1995 portant Code pénal', *National Gazette*. Tirana: Republic of Albania: 541-544.
- RoA (2005). *Albanian National Strategy for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings: Strategic Framework and National Action Plan: 2005-2007*. Tirana: Government of Albania. [www.caaht.com/resources/NationalStrategy\\_2005-7\\_ENGLISH.pdf](http://www.caaht.com/resources/NationalStrategy_2005-7_ENGLISH.pdf).
- Roberts, A. (1996). 'The trade in drugs and wildlife', *Animals' Agenda* 16(5): 34-35.
- Robinson, M. (1999). *Breakdown of Borders*. IAF conference on trafficking in women: Breakdown of borders. Copenhagen: UNHCR.
- Rocha, J. (2005). 'Gangs target South America's wildlife', *BBC news online*, Brasilia. 18 July. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/americas/1445885.stm>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Ross, R. (2000). 'French police raid Scientology's Paris offices: Report', *Yahoo News* 1 June. <[www.rickross.com/reference/scientology/scien221.html](http://www.rickross.com/reference/scientology/scien221.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].

- SAARC (2002). *SAARC Convention on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Women and Children for Prostitution*. Kathmandu: SAARC.
- Sabates-Wheeler, R., et al. (2003). *Migration and the Poverty Transition in Albania*. Brighton: University of Sussex.
- Sabates-Wheeler, R. & H. Waddington (2003). *T3: How Does Poverty Affect Migration Choice*. Brighton: IDS.
- Salt, J. (2000). 'Trafficking and human smuggling: A European perspective', in *Perspective on Trafficking of Migrants: International Migration* 38(3), journal offprint, R. Appleyard and J. Salt (eds.).
- Salt, J. & J. Hogarth. (2000). 'Migrant trafficking and human smuggling in Europe: A review of the evidence', in *Migrant Trafficking and Human Smuggling in Europe*, F. Laczko and D. Thompson (eds.), 11-163. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- Salt, J. & J. Stein (1997). 'Migration as a business: The case of trafficking', *International Migration* 35(4).
- Samorodov, A. (1991). *Labour Mobility in Europe as a Result of Changes in Central and Eastern Europe*. 3rd European regional congress of the international relations association. Bari-Naples: IRA.
- Sampson, S. (1996). 'The social life of projects: Bringing civil society to Albania', in *Civil Society: Challenging Western Models*, C. Hann (ed.), 122-125. London: Routledge.
- Sangera, J. (2005). 'Unpacking the Trafficking Discourse', in *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered*, K. Kempadoo, J. Sangera and B. Pattaniak (eds.), 3-25. London: Paradigm Publishers.
- Scharie Tavcer, D. (2003). 'From Poverty to the Trafficking of Women for Sexual Exploitation: A Study of Causal Factors of Trafficked Women from Moldova', Paper presented at the meeting of Gender and Power in the New Europe: The 5th European Feminist Research Conference, Lund University, Sweden, Max Planck Institute for Foreign and International Criminal Law.
- Schloenhardt, A. (1999). *Organised Crime and the Business of Migrant Trafficking*. AIC Occasional Seminar. Canberra: AIC.
- Shannon, S. (1999). 'Prostitution and the Mafia', in *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex: The New Slave Trade*, P. Williams, (ed.), 119-145. London: CASS.
- Shekulli (2005). 'Albania welcomes US State Department report on human trafficking'. *Shekulli*, Tirana. 4 June. <[http://news.monstersandcritics.com/mediamonitor/article\\_1006098.php/Albania\\_welcomes\\_US\\_State\\_Department\\_report\\_on\\_human\\_trafficking](http://news.monstersandcritics.com/mediamonitor/article_1006098.php/Albania_welcomes_US_State_Department_report_on_human_trafficking)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Shifter, M. (2004). 'Picking a fight with Venezuela', *New York Times* 20 September. <[www.nytimes.com/2004/09/20/opinion/20shifter.html?ex=1253419200&en=1552b96da9538d25&ei=5090&partner=rssuserland](http://www.nytimes.com/2004/09/20/opinion/20shifter.html?ex=1253419200&en=1552b96da9538d25&ei=5090&partner=rssuserland)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Shitty, R. (2000). 'Les Harengs Albanias sont cuits', *Le Progrès*, Lyon. 17 November.
- Singer, P. (2004). 'Outsiders: Our obligations to those beyond our borders', in *The Ethics of Assistance: Morality and the Distant Needy*, D. Chatterjee (ed.), 11-33. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sjoberg, O., et al. (2004). *Cross-Border Migration and Remittances in a Post-Communist Society: Return Flows of Money and Goods in the Korce District, Albania*. New Perspectives on Albanian Migration and Development Conference, Korce, Albania.
- Skeldon, R. (1997). *Migration and Development: A Global Perspective*. Longman Development Studies.
- Smith, J. L. (1997). *Did She or Didn't She? A Study in Covert Prostitution*. Chico: California State University.
- Soderlund, G. (2005). 'Running from the rescuers: New U.S. crusades against sex trafficking and the rhetoric of abolition', *NWSA Journal* 17(3): 64-87.

- Specter, M. (1998) 'Traffickers' new cargo: Naive Slavic women', *The New York Times*, New York. 11 January. <[www.michaelspecter.com/times/1998/1998\\_01\\_11\\_nyt\\_contraband.html](http://www.michaelspecter.com/times/1998/1998_01_11_nyt_contraband.html)>. [Accessed March 2009].
- Stapp, K. (2005) 'Human trafficking report blames the usual suspects', *IPS New York* 9 June. <[www.ipsnews.net/interna.asp?idnews=29014](http://www.ipsnews.net/interna.asp?idnews=29014)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Stark, O. (1984). 'Migration Decision Making', *Journal of Development Economics* 14: 251-259.
- Stark, O. (1999). *Altruism and Beyond, An Economic Analysis of Transfers and Exchanges Within Families and Groups*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Stark, O. & D. E. Bloom (1985). 'The new economics of labor migration', *The American Economic Review* 75(2): 173-178.
- STC (2003). *SAARC Trafficking Convention*. Kathmandu: Save the Children. <[www.savethechildren.net/nepal/key\\_issues/traffsaarc.html](http://www.savethechildren.net/nepal/key_issues/traffsaarc.html)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Steinfatt, T., et al. (2003). *Measuring the Number of Trafficked Women and Children in Cambodia Part I*. The Human Rights Challenge of Globalisation in Asia-Pacific-US. The Trafficking in Persons. Honolulu: University of Miami.
- Sternberg, S. (2005). 'White House changes tune on AIDS groups working overseas', *USA Today* Washington, D.C. 6 September. <[www.usatoday.com/news/washington/2005-06-09-us-aids\\_x.htm](http://www.usatoday.com/news/washington/2005-06-09-us-aids_x.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Strada, L. (1996). *One Year La Strada: Results of the First Central and East European Program on Prevention of Traffic in Women*. Amsterdam: STV.
- STT2 (2003). *Fact Sheet: Trafficking in Women and Children*. Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission.
- Sullivan, B. (1995). 'Rethinking prostitution', in *Transitions: New Australian Feminisms*, B. Caine & R. Pringle (eds.), 184-197. Sydney: Allen and Unwin.
- Takieddine, Z. (2000). 'Lost Hope', *Al-Ahram Weekly* 30 March-5 April. <<http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2000/475/in2.htm>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- TAMPEP (1997). 'TAMPEP Final Report 1997'. Amsterdam: TAMPEP International Foundation.
- TAMPEP (1999). *Migrant Prostitution: Roles and Responsibilities of the Cultural Mediator*. Amsterdam: TAMPEP International Foundation.
- Tapissier, D. (2001). 'Amicale du Nid: Les filles de L'Est sont avant tout des victimes', *Le Progrès*, Lyon. 5 February. <[www.leprogres.fr](http://www.leprogres.fr)>. [Accessed 30 July 2006].
- Thomson, M. (2001). 'Italy's porous borders', *BBC News Online*, London. 19 September. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/1552715.stm>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Thorpe, N. (2006). 'Trafficking stories: Speaking to traffickers, victims and victims turned trafficker'. *BBC Radio 4 From our own Correspondent*, London. 6 December. <[http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/programmes/from\\_our\\_own\\_correspondent/](http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/programmes/from_our_own_correspondent/)> [Accessed July 2006].
- Topi, A. (2004). *ILO Against Human Trafficking in Albania*. Budapest: ILO SRO-Budapest Bulletin. <[www.ilo.org/public/english/region/eurpro/budapest/info/bul/04-1/2004\\_05.htm](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/eurpro/budapest/info/bul/04-1/2004_05.htm)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Toynbee, P. (2003). 'Sexual Dealing'. *The Guardian*, London. 9 May. <<http://society.guardian.co.uk/comment/column/0,7882,952379,00.html>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Triantafillou, P. & M. Nielsen (2001). 'Policing empowerment: The making of capable subjects', *History of the Human Sciences* 14(2): 63-86.
- Tyldum, G. & A. Brunovskis (2005). 'Describing the unobserved: Methodological challenges'. *International Migration* 43(1):17-34.

- UN (1995). 'Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, chapter I, resolution I, annex II, paragraph 122', Paper presented at the meeting of the Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing.
- UN (2001). *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime*. Geneva: UN.
- UN (2003). *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. Geneva: UN.
- UNECE (2004). *Trends in Europe and North America: The Statistical Yearbook of the Economic Commission for Europe 2003*. Geneva: UNECE.
- UNECE (2005). *Albanian Statistics*. Tirana: UNECE and INSTAT.
- UNESCO (2000). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women, its Causes and Consequences: On Trafficking of Women*, E/CN.4/2000/68. Geneva: UNESCO.
- UNESCO (2004). *Trafficking Statistics Project*, D. Feingold (ed.). Bangkok: UNESCO. <[www.unescobbk.org/culture/trafficking/ev.asp?ev=83&id=86](http://www.unescobbk.org/culture/trafficking/ev.asp?ev=83&id=86)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- UNHCHR (2002). *Recommended Principles and Guidelines of Human Rights and Human Trafficking*. Geneva: UNESCO.
- UNICEF (2000). *Mapping of Existing Information on Domestic Violence in Albania*. Tirana: National Committee of Women and Family.
- UNICEF (2003). *How Prevalent is Domestic Violence in Albania?* Tirana: UNICEF. <[www.unicef.org/albania/media\\_1046.html](http://www.unicef.org/albania/media_1046.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- UNICEF (2005). *Winning Child Support and a Happier Life*. Tirana: UNICEF. <[www.unicef.org/albania/reallives\\_1642.html](http://www.unicef.org/albania/reallives_1642.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- UNICRI (2001). *Anti-Trafficking Project Proposal Bangladesh*. Turin: United Nations Inter-regional Crime and Justice Research Institute.
- UNIO (2004). *United Nations and Europol Expand Partnership against Organized Crime*. Vienna: UNIO. <[www.unis.unvienna.org/unis/en/pressrels/2004/uniscp472.html](http://www.unis.unvienna.org/unis/en/pressrels/2004/uniscp472.html)> [Accessed July 2006].
- UNODC (2004). *What if the Victim Consents? Can Children Consent?* Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. <[www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking\\_victim\\_consent.html](http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking_victim_consent.html)>. [Accessed 25 July 2006].
- UNODC (2006a). *Trafficking in Human Beings*. Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. <[www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking\\_human\\_beings.html](http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking_human_beings.html)>. [Accessed 25 July 2006].
- UNODC (2006b). *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*. Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. <[www.unodc.org/pdf/traffickinginpersons\\_report\\_2006-04.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/traffickinginpersons_report_2006-04.pdf)>. [Accessed 25 July 2006].
- UNPD (2000). *Replacement Migration: Is it a Solution to Declining and Ageing Population?* Executive Summary. New York: United Nations Population Division.
- USCA (2003). *Leadership Against HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria Act of 2003* 22 U.S.C.A. § 7631(f). Washington, D.C.: 22 U.S.C.A. § 7601 et seq.
- US DoL (2002). *Albania: Government Policies and Programs to Eliminate the Worst Forms of Child Labor*. Washington, D.C.: US Department of Labor, Bureau of International Labor Affairs.
- US DJ (2004). *Anti-Trafficking News Bulletin 1(9)*. Washington, D.C.: US Department of Justice.
- US SD (2000). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Washington, D.C.: US Department of State.
- US SD (2003). *Trafficking in Persons Report 2003*. Washington, D.C.: US Department of State. <[www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/21275.htm](http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2003/21275.htm)>. [Accessed 25 July 2006].
- US SD (2005a). *U.S. To Deny Aid to Five Countries Under Anti-Trafficking Act*. Washington, D.C.: US Department of State.
- US SD (2005b). *Trafficking in Persons Report VI. Special Cases*. Washington, D.C.: Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.

- US SD (2005c). *T-1 Victim of a Severe Form of Trafficking in Persons*. Washington, D.C.: INA Section 101(a)(15)(T)(i) 8 CFR 214.11.
- Van Hear, N. (1998). *New Diasporas: The Mass Exodus, Dispersal and Regrouping of Migrant Communities*. London: UCL Press.
- Vargas, C. (2000). 'Cultural Mediation for Refugee Children: A Comparative Derived Model', *Journal of Refugee Studies* 12(3): 284-306.
- Varouhakis, M. (2002). *Trafficked women are victims*. Athens: Kathimerini and Centre for Research on Globalisation.
- Victor, J. (1998). 'Moral panics and the social construction of deviant behavior: A theory and application to the case of ritual child abuse', *Sociological Perspectives* 41(3): 541-565.
- Vital-Durand, B. (2000). 'A Lyon c'est prostituees de l'Est qui: Cassent le metier', *Libération*, Paris. 25 January.
- Viviano, F. (1999). 'Crest of a human wave: Illegal immigrants flood Albania to be smuggled across Adriatic', *San Francisco Chronicle* 12 February. <[www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?file=/chronicle/archive/1999/02/12/MN68469.DTL](http://www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?file=/chronicle/archive/1999/02/12/MN68469.DTL)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Watt (2000). *Congressional Record: September 14, 2000 (House)*. Washington, D.C.: US Congress [Page H7628-H7631].
- Waugh, L. (2006). *Selling Olga: Stories of Human Trafficking and Resistance*. London: Orion Books.
- WCAR (2001). 'Written Submissions to be Included in the Recommendations of the Asia Pacific Experts' Seminar', Paper presented at the meeting of the World Conference Against Racism, Bangkok, Thailand.
- Weitzer, R. (2005). 'The growing moral panic over prostitution and sex trafficking', *The Criminologist* 30(5).
- Weitzer, R. (2006). 'Moral crusade against prostitution', *Society* 43(3): 33-38.
- Widgren, J. (1994). 'Multilateral Co-Operation to Combat Trafficking in Migrants and the Role of International Organisations', Paper presented at the meeting of the 11th IOM Seminar International Responses to Trafficking in Migrants. Geneva: ICMPPD.
- Wight, E. (2006). 'Death of a Hostess', *Time* 9 September. <[www.time.com/time/asia/news/magazine/0,9754,108848,00.html](http://www.time.com/time/asia/news/magazine/0,9754,108848,00.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Wijers, M. (1998). *European Developments and International Strategies to Prevent and Combat Trafficking in Women*. Colombo: Trafficking in Women, Colombia.
- Wijers, M. & L. Lap-Chew (1999). *Trafficking in Women, Forced Labour and Slavery-like Practices in Marriage, Domestic Labour and Prostitution*. Utrecht: STV; GAATW.
- Wijers, M. & M. van Doorninck (2002). 'Only rights can stop wrongs: A critical assessment of anti-trafficking strategies', Paper presented at the meeting of the EC-IOM Stop Conference. Brussels: IOM.
- Wiles, R., et al. (2004). 'Informed consent and the research process', Paper presented at the ESRC Research Methods Festival, University of Oxford, University of Southampton.
- Williams, M. (ed.) (1999). *Soul Survivors*. London: X Press.
- Williams, P. (ed.) (1999). *Illegal Immigration and Commercial Sex: The New Slave Trade*. London: CASS.
- Williamsen, E. (2006). 'A safe return for victims of trafficking', in *Forced Migration Review*, T. Morris & M. Couldrey (eds.), 30-31. Oxford: Refugee Studies Centre.
- Wilson, F. (1991). *Sweaters: Gender, Class and Workshop Production in Mexico*. London: Macmillan.

- Windborne, J. (2003). *From Emergency to Development Media: The Impossible Metamorphosis of Project Spear In Albania*. Department of Media, Journalism and Film, Southwest Missouri State University.
- Windmill (2005). *Wedding Traditions*. Athens: Windmills. <[www.windmillstravel.com/article.php?id=7&destination=12&destinationtype=island](http://www.windmillstravel.com/article.php?id=7&destination=12&destinationtype=island)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- WLRI (2003). *Family Code of Albania Law Number 9062 Adopted May 8, 2003* (Unofficial English Translation). Tirana: Women's Legal Rights Initiative, Chemonics International Inc.
- WLRI (2004). *Marriage and Family Your Rights and Obligations*. Tirana: Women's Legal Rights Initiative. <<http://usaidalbania.org/proxy/Document.108.aspx>>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Wong, A. (2002). *Local Law Enforcement and the Implementation of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000*. *Hawaii Conference on Trafficking in Persons*. Honolulu: Polaris Project.
- Wood, G. (2006). *Select Committee on Home Affairs Additional Written Evidence 23*, Memorandum submitted by Merseyside Police. London: House of Commons.
- Woodruff, B. (2001). 'Sex Slavery: Albanian Girls Kidnapped, Devoured Into a World of Prostitution'. *ABC News* Washington, D.C. 22 May. <[http://abcnews.go.com/sections/wnt/WorldNewsTonight/albanian\\_sexslavery\\_010521.html](http://abcnews.go.com/sections/wnt/WorldNewsTonight/albanian_sexslavery_010521.html)>. [Accessed 25 July 2006].
- World Bank (1997). *Albania Growing Out of Poverty. Report No. 15698-ALB*. Europe and Central Asia Region, Human Resources Operations Division Country Department II.
- World Bank (2005). *Albanian Living Standards Measurement Survey*. Tirana: World Bank and INSTAT. Albanian Living Standards Measurement Survey.
- Xhudo, G. (1996). 'Men of purpose: The growth of Albanian criminal activity', *Transnational Organized Crime. Frank Cass Journal* 2(1): 1-20.
- Young, A. (2000). *Women Who Become Men: Albanian Sworn Virgins*. Oxford: Berg.
- Zakaryan, V. (2005). 'The Promise of a Fairy Tale Life Draws Women to Dubai', *IJA* 17 October. <[www.hetq.am/eng/society/0510-dub.html](http://www.hetq.am/eng/society/0510-dub.html)>. [Accessed July 2006].
- Zalisko, W. (2003). *Russian Organized Crime, Trafficking in Women, and Government's Response*. New York: PMC International.



*Other IMISCOE titles*

*IMISCOE Research*

Rinus Penninx, Maria Berger, Karen Kraal, Eds.

*The Dynamics of International Migration and Settlement in Europe:  
A State of the Art*

2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 866 8)

(originally appearing in IMISCOE Joint Studies)

Leo Lucassen, David Feldman, Jochen Oltmer, Eds.

*Paths of Integration: Migrants in Western Europe (1880-2004)*

2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 883 5)

Rainer Bauböck, Eva Ersbøll, Kees Groenendijk, Harald Waldrauch, Eds.

*Acquisition and Loss of Nationality: Policies and Trends in 15 European  
Countries, Volume 1: Comparative Analyses*

2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 920 7)

Rainer Bauböck, Eva Ersbøll, Kees Groenendijk, Harald Waldrauch, Eds.

*Acquisition and Loss of Nationality: Policies and Trends in 15 European  
Countries, Volume 2: Country Analyses*

2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 921 4)

Rainer Bauböck, Bernhard Perchinig, Wiebke Sievers, Eds.

*Citizenship Policies in the New Europe*

2007 (ISBN 978 90 5356 922 1)

Veit Bader

*Secularism or Democracy? Associational Governance of Religious Diversity*

2007 (ISBN 978 90 5356 999 3)

Holger Kolb & Henrik Egbert, Eds.

*Migrants and Markets: Perspectives from Economics and the Other  
Social Sciences*

2008 (ISBN 978 90 5356 684 8)

Ralph Grillo, Ed.

*The Family in Question: Immigrant and Ethnic Minorities in  
Multicultural Europe*

2008 (ISBN 978 90 5356 869 9)

Corrado Bonifazi, Marek Okólski, Jeannette Schoorl, Patrick Simon, Eds.  
*International Migration in Europe: New Trends and New Methods of Analysis*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 5356 894 1)

Maurice Crul, Liesbeth Heering, Eds.  
*The Position of the Turkish and Moroccan Second Generation in Amsterdam and Rotterdam: The TIES Study in the Netherlands*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 8964 061 1)

Marlou Schrover, Joanne van der Leun, Leo Lucassen, Chris Quispel, Eds.  
*Illegal Migration and Gender in a Global and Historical Perspective*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 8964 047 5)

Gianluca P. Parolin  
*Citizenship in the Arab World: Kin, Religion and Nation-State*  
2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 045 1)

Rainer Bauböck, Bernhard Perchinig, Wiebke Sievers, Eds.  
*Citizenship Policies in the New Europe: Expanded and Updated Edition*  
2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 108 3)

#### *IMISCOE Reports*

Rainer Bauböck, Ed.  
*Migration and Citizenship: Legal Status, Rights and Political Participation*  
2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 888 0)

Michael Jandl, Ed.  
*Innovative Concepts for Alternative Migration Policies:  
Ten Innovative Approaches to the Challenges of Migration in the 21st Century*  
2007 (ISBN 978 90 5356 990 0)

Jeroen Doomernik, Michael Jandl, Eds.  
*Modes of Migration Regulation and Control in Europe*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 5356 689 3)

Michael Jandl, Christina Hollomey, Sandra Gendera, Anna Stepien,  
Veronika Bilger  
*Migration and Irregular Work in Austria. A Case Study of the Structure  
and Dynamics of Irregular Foreign Employment in Europe at the Beginning  
of the 21st Century*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 8964 053 6)

Heinz Fassmann, Ursula Reeger, Wiebke Sievers, Eds.  
*Statistics and Reality: Concepts and Measurements of Migration in Europe*  
2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 052 9)

*IMISCOE Dissertations*

Panos Arion Hatziprokopiou  
*Globalisation, Migration and Socio-Economic Change in Contemporary Greece: Processes of Social Incorporation of Balkan Immigrants in Thessaloniki*  
2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 873 6)

Floris Vermeulen  
*The Immigrant Organising Process: Turkish Organisations in Amsterdam and Berlin and Surinamese Organisations in Amsterdam, 1960-2000*  
2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 875 0)

Anastasia Christou  
*Narratives of Place, Culture and Identity: Second-Generation Greek-Americans Return 'Home'*  
2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 878 1)

Katja Rušinović  
*Dynamic Entrepreneurship: First and Second-Generation Immigrant Entrepreneurs in Dutch Cities*  
2006 (ISBN 978 90 5356 972 6)

Ilse van Liempt  
*Navigating Borders: Inside Perspectives on the Process of Human Smuggling into the Netherlands*  
2007 (ISBN 978 90 5356 930 6)

Myriam Cherti  
*Paradoxes of Social Capital: A Multi-Generational Study of Moroccans in London*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 5356 032 7)

Marc Helbling  
*Practising Citizenship and Heterogeneous Nationhood: Naturalisations in Swiss Municipalities*  
2008 (ISBN 978 90 8964 034 5)

Jérôme Jamin

*L'imaginaire du complot: Discours d'extrême droite en France et aux Etats-Unis*

2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 048 2)

Inge Van Nieuwenhuyze

*Getting by in Europe's Urban Labour Markets: Senegambian Migrants' Strategies for Survival, Documentation and Mobility*

2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 050 5)

Nayla Mourkabel

*Sri Lankan Housemaids in Lebanon: A Case of 'Symbolic Violence' and 'Every Day Forms of Resistance'*

2009 (ISBN 978 90 8964 051 2)